Correlation Between Precision Gravity and Subsidence Measurements at Cerro Prieto

Author
Zelwer, R.

Publication Date
2010-01-15

Peer reviewed
MEXICAN-AMERICAN COOPERATIVE PROGRAM
AT THE CERRO PRIETO GEOTHERMAL FIELD

CORRELATION BETWEEN PRECISION GRAVITY AND
SUBSIDENCE MEASUREMENTS AT CERRO PRIETO

R. Zelwer and R. B. Grannell
Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory, University of California
Berkeley, California 94720
California State University at Long Beach
Long Beach, California 90840
October 1982

A Joint Project of

COMISION FEDERAL DE ELECTRICIDAD
Mexico

Coordinadora Ejecutiva de Cerro Prieto
Apto Postal No. 3-036
Mexicali, Baja Calif, Mexico
and P.O. Box 238
Calexico, CA 92231

DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY
Division of Geothermal Energy
United States of America

Coordinated by
Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory
Earth Sciences Division
University of California
Berkeley, California 94720

Operating for the U.S. Department of
Energy under Contract Number
DE-AC03-76SF00098
DISCLAIMER

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government nor any agency Thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof.
DISCLAIMER

Portions of this document may be illegible in electronic image products. Images are produced from the best available original document.
CORRELATION BETWEEN PRECISION GRAVITY AND SUBSIDENCE MEASUREMENTS AT CERRO PRIETO

R. Zelwer and R. B. Grannell
Earth Sciences Division
Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory
University of California
Berkeley, California 94720

October 1982

NOTICE
PORTIONS OF THIS REPORT ARE ILLEGIBLE. It has been reproduced from the best available copy to permit the broadest possible availability.

This work was supported by the Assistant Secretary for Conservation and Renewable Energy, Office of Renewable Technology, Division of Geothermal and Hydropower Technologies of the U. S. Department of Energy, under Contract No. DE-AC03-76SF00098.
CORRELATION BETWEEN PRECISION GRAVITY AND SUBSIDENCE MEASUREMENTS AT CERRO PRIETO

R. Zelver 1 and R.B. Grannell 2

1 Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory, University of California
Berkeley, California 94720
2 California State University at Long Beach
Long Beach, California 90840

ABSTRACT

Precision gravity measurements were made in the region of the Cerro Prieto geothermal field at yearly intervals from 1977 to 1981 to assess the feasibility of using gravity to determine subsurface reservoir changes with time. Among these changes we sought to determine the extent of mass recharge in response to the continued production of fluids from this field.

Changes in ground and subsurface elevation were observed throughout the region for the period of observation. Results indicate that the largest changes observed were the result of the Magnitude 6.1 (Caltech) Victoria earthquake of 8 June 1980. The epicenter of this earthquake was located 25 km southeast of the field on the Cerro Prieto Fault, which bounds the field to the southwest. Subsidence of up to 55 cm was measured east of the power plant, in the region between the northern end of the Cerro Prieto Fault and the southern end of the Imperial Fault. This area has been postulated to be the site of an active spreading center or pull-apart basin, and has been characterized by a high level of seismic activity during the last 10 years.

Minor subsidence and small related gravity changes for the period preceding the Victoria earthquake suggest that in spite of large fluid production rates, the reservoir is being almost completely recharged and that a measurable increase in subsurface density may be taking place.

The results of measurements of horizontal ground sections made in this area are discussed in relation to the gravity and subsidence observations.

INTRODUCTION

The extraction of large amounts of fluids from liquid-dominated fields can cause ground subsidence, with attendant damage to surface installations. Such subsidence has occurred in areas where extensive exploitation of petroleum and ground water has taken place. Widespread subsidence has also been observed in the liquid-dominated geothermal fields of New Zealand (Stillwell et al., 1976), and to a lesser extent at the vapor dominated Geysers field in northern California (Isherwood, 1977).

Drawing from the experience with the New Zealand geothermal fields, the Comisión Federal de Electricidad de México (CFE), together with the Dirección General de Estudios del Territorio Nacional (DETEHNL) (Garcia, 1978), undertook a program of first order leveling surveys. The purpose of this program was to measure changes in surface elevation in the Mexicali Valley region, including the Cerro Prieto field. Within the immediate region of the field itself, CFE staff also instituted a second order leveling program to monitor local elevation changes.

Among the activities of a joint cooperative program between CFE and the U. S. Department of Energy (DOE) to study of the Cerro Prieto field, initiated in 1977, was a precision gravity monitoring program (Chase et al., 1978; Grannell et al., 1979, 1981a, 1981b, 1982). These observations were carried out in conjunction with CFE's second-order leveling surveys. Also, as part of this cooperative program, horizontal distance measurements were made by the U. S. Geological Survey (USGS) (Massey, 1981).

The use of precise gravity measurements as a tool to monitor water depletion in liquid-dominated geothermal reservoirs was proposed and demonstrated by Hunt (1970, 1977). This approach is based on the supposition that changes in the value of gravity over time can be interpreted in terms of elevation changes and phase changes and/or transport of subsurface fluids, other factors remaining unchanged (Isherwood, 1977).

The gravity measurements at Cerro Prieto had three primary objectives. The first was to make repetitive measurements over time, which, when combined with second order leveling surveys, would provide information about changes in the subsurface with time. The second objective of the gravity measurements was to produce a Bouguer gravity map of the field (Chase et al., 1978; Grannell et al., 1981a). The third objective was to assess field and data reduction procedures. This report deals only with the temporal gravity and elevation changes.

SETTING

The Cerro Prieto field is located in the Mexicali Valley, which is part of the Salton Trough, an area which is tectonically one of the most active in the world. Significant subsidence (3.5 cm/year (Lofgren, 1979)) due to natural causes has been measured in the Imperial Valley north of the U. S.-Mexican border. These elevation changes are related to the tectonic activity responsible for the formation of the trough. In the vicinity of the Cerro Prieto field, the Mexicali Valley is crossed by major en-echelon strike-slip faults of the San Andreas Fault system.
The heat source for the Cerro Prieto field is thought to be associated with a spreading center located between the en-echelon strike-slip Cerro Prieto and Imperial Faults (see Figure 1), as postulated by Lomnitz et al. (1970) and Elders et al. (1972), in accordance with observations of fault-bounded basins found in the Gulf of California (Elders, 1979).

FIELD MEASUREMENTS

Four sets of precision gravity observations were made on an annual basis using La Coste and Romberg G-type gravity meters. The measurements were made during the winter months of 1977-78, 1978-79, 1979-80, and 1980-81. Details on the data acquisition, reduction, and error analysis can be found in Olse et al. (1978), and Grannell et al. (1979, 1981a, 1981b, 1982).

Sixty stations were established over an area of approximately 500 km² centered on the Cerro Prieto geothermal field (Figure 2). The stations consisted of permanent concrete monuments with deep footings and flat tops, large enough to accommodate the gravimeter. The same monuments were used for the second order leveling surveys carried out at approximately annual intervals by CFE.

The looping technique of station occupation was used for the gravity measurements. Occupation of the base was followed by occupation of several stations, followed by a return to the base (Grannell, 1982). Each station was occupied from 2 to 4 times in separate loops, and during each occupation, a minimum of 4 readings were made. Median standard deviations of base-to-station differences ranged from 7 to 15 microgals. Standard measurement errors for an individual year were about 8 microgals at the 95% confidence level. Precision of observed changes between two years was about 12 microgals. Changes in gravity exceeding 15-20 microgals were clearly significant. To establish the conformance factor and lag time necessary for making tidal corrections, tidal gravity was monitored on the Cerro Prieto Volcano for a period of three days.

Ground elevation measurements were made using standard first- and second-order leveling surveys carried out at approximately annual intervals. The first order leveling surveys covered an area of the Mexicali-Imperial Valleys extending from south of the geothermal field to north of the U.S. border so that it is tied to benchmarks of USGS first order leveling networks (de la Peña, 1981a). The second order surveys were limited to the immediate area of the production field and were carried out in conjunction with the gravity measurements, using the same monuments (de la Peña, 1981b).

GRAVITY CHANGES AND GROUND MOTIONS WITH TIME

The most important gravity and surface elevation changes appeared as a result of the 9 June 1980 Victoria earthquake (described below). Figure 2 shows a contour map of the changes in gravity between 1979-80 and 1980-81, that is, before and after the Victoria earthquake. The observed increase in gravity indicates that subsidence took place. Most of the changes occurred east of the Cerro Prieto Fault. The contours suggest even greater subsidence to the southeast, in a region of intense aftershock activity following the Victoria earthquake (Wong and Fraz, 1981). Figure 3 shows the corresponding changes in elevation obtained from second order leveling surveys before
Figure 3. Surface elevation changes (in mm) between 1979 and 1981.

The Victoria earthquake had a magnitude of 6.1 (Caltech) and an epicenter near the village of Guadalupe Victoria, about 25 km southeast of Cerro Prieto. This event occurred near the northwest end of the Cerro Prieto Fault (Wong and Fraz, 1981), which bounds the geothermal field to the southeast and ends at the Cerro Prieto Volcano. Between the southeast end of the Imperial Fault and the northwest end of the Cerro Prieto fault are a series of tectonic features including a series of normal faults roughly perpendicular to the Cerro Prieto-Imperial fault pair called the Volcano Paplt System. A crustal spreading center is believed to be located in this area. According to Wong and Fraz (1981), the main event of this earthquake excited aftershocks in several pre-existing nests at the northwestern end of the Cerro Prieto Fault, in the southeastern portion of the area shown in Figures 2 and 3. No significant aftershock activity took place in the neighborhood of the main event. The pattern of aftershock activity was interpreted by Wong and Fraz (1981) to be related to the higher subsurface temperatures and the spreading center located between the ends of the Imperial and Cerro Prieto Faults.

In the vicinity of the Cerro Prieto field the earthquake caused fissures on the surface, as well as the ejection of ground water and formation of small sand volcanoes. A second order leveling survey was performed over part of the net covered by the previous first order surveys indicating subsidence of up to 55 cm in places (de la Peña, 1981a). These effects were attributed to local liquefaction of unconsolidated sediments.

The pattern of gravity changes for the two years preceding the earthquake is not as clear. The magnitude of the gravity changes was very close to the precision level of the measurements. Grannell (1982) performed a careful analysis of the data for those years and concluded that there is an elliptical-shaped region, shown in Figure 4, where positive changes in gravity exceed the 95 percent confidence level of the measurements. The region agrees roughly with the location of the production area in the field; its major axis is aligned with the NW-SE direction of the dominant strike-slip faults in the region.

The first order leveling survey, which crossed the production region along a single line parallel to the railroad track, showed there was some subsidence between 1977 and 1979, with a maximum of 7.5 cm near the Cerro Prieto power plant. Elevation changes between 1977 and 1979 observed by the second order leveling surveys showed a subsidence pattern (Figure 5) that is similar in shape to the one following the Victoria earthquake, but of much lower magnitude. It is worth noting that there is good overlap between the region of greatest subsidence of Figure 5 and the region of significant gravity changes mapped by Grannell (Figure 4). However, the magnitude of the gravity and elevation changes do not seem to
assume a value of 2.1 gm/cm³ for the density of the unconsolidated sediments, the computed gravity increases match the observed changes very well. This means that the subsidence induced by the Victoria earthquake can account for the largest changes in gravity observed during the study period.

The pattern of seismicity observed in this area from 1971 to 1980 indicates significant small earthquake and aftershock swarm activity in the region between the northern end of the Cerro Prieto Fault and the southern end of the Imperial Fault (Albores et al., 1978; de la Pen, 1981a; Wong and Pres, 1981; Majer and McEvilly, 1981). This region includes the portion east of the Cerro Prieto Fault in the area under study. In view of the geometries associated with other pull-apart basins located between en-echelon faults in the Gulf of California to the south (Elders, 1979), which are characterized by depressions located between the ends of transform faults, it seems reasonable to expect the region under study to show evidence of similar subsidence. According to Elders (1979), continued sedimentation of this area by the Colorado River is the main factor that has kept a more noticeable topographic depression from forming.

One of the main objectives of the present study was to assess the usefulness of precision gravity measurements made in conjunction with accurate leveling to measure subsurface changes in response to geothermal production. We were especially interested in whether it was possible to determine the extent of recharge to the reservoir. In order to do this, we examined the observed gravity and elevation changes for the period preceding the Victoria earthquake.

From 1977 to 1979, prior to the earthquake, there was only a slight increase in gravity accompanied by very slight subsidence - in fact, the increase in gravity exceeds what would be expected on the basis of the observed subsidence. This pattern of subsidence and gravity change does not match the behavior observed at either Wairakai or the Geysers fields.

At Wairakai, another liquid-dominated field, the amount of subsidence has been much greater, exceeding 15 feet in places (Stillwell, 1976). On the basis of similar gravity and surface elevation measurements, Hunt (1970, 1977) estimated that in the early years of production, recharge to the reservoir amounted to about 10 percent of the production volume, increasing to about 85 percent in later years. Large pressure drops were observed in the reservoir, although pressure has stabilized in recent years. The thermodynamic and hydrogeologic characteristics of that reservoir are such that production led to the formation of an extensive steam zone or cap in the reservoir (Grant et al., 1981). Hunt (1970, 1977) showed that after correcting for elevation changes, there was a correlation between the zone of gravity decrease and the limits of the field, with the maximum gravity decreases observed near the main well field. This suggests that this is the region of greatest water depletion.

Figure 5. Surface elevation changes (in mm) observed between December 1977 and March 1979.

Horizontal surface motions were measured by the USGS at repeated intervals with two networks of horizontal control using electronic distance measuring instruments (Massey, 1981). Movements of up to 6–7 cm towards the center of the field were observed during 1978–1979. However, after that period and until the time of the Victoria earthquake, this motion towards the center of the field seemed to have ceased. No movement resulting from fluid extraction was evident outside the production area. An analysis of the horizontal deformation associated with the Victoria earthquake showed that deformation produced by fluid extraction was either not observed or was masked by earthquake related changes (Lisowski and Prescott, 1982).

**DISCUSSION**

The clear correlation between the patterns of subsidence and gravity increases following the Victoria earthquake suggests that tectonic forces are the dominant cause of subsidence in the region. In fact, if we apply a free air correction using the observed elevation changes and

Figure 5. Surface elevation changes (in mm) observed between December 1977 and March 1979.
A gravity and elevation monitoring program had also been established at The Geysers field (Isherwood, 1977), a vapor-dominated geothermal field in northern California characterized by minimal natural recharge. Figure 6 shows that over a three year period there were decreases in both gravity and elevation. This would suggest that there has been a net loss of mass or little recharge. If there was 100 percent recharge, a decrease in elevation or subsidence would have been accompanied by an increase in gravity.

In light of the above, the best explanation that can be advanced for the observed gravity increases and related subsidence at Cerro Prieto is that there must be close to 100 percent recharge of the producing aquifers to replace the extracted fluids. If there had been little recharge, the observed mass extracted (of the order of 75 x 10^6 tons), together with the observed subsidence would have resulted in a gravity decrease.

Support for widespread recharge of the reservoir comes from many sources. Dipole-dipole resistivity monitoring over the same period of time (Wilt and Goldstein, 1981, 1982) noted an increase in resistivity over the central portion of the reservoir, suggesting inflow of fresher Colorado River-originated water. Theoretical calculations by Whitcomb in Grannell et al. (1981b) also show that if there were no replacement or recharge, the gravity decrease would have been quite large and easily measurable. Geochemical measurements have shown a sharp decline, to about one half the original value, in the concentration of chlorides in the central portion of the reservoir, also suggestive of fresh water inflow (Fausto et al., 1981). Grant et al. (1981) showed that no generalized steam zone has formed which would be indicative of a large net mass loss due to lack of replacement of the extracted fluids.

As a result of production there has been some drawdown, i.e., loss of pressure, in the reservoir. Figure 7 shows the behavior of downhole pressure as a function of time for some typical wells. Although the pressures declined rapidly in the early years, they seem to have stabilized in the most recent years (Goyal et al., 1981). The data seem to indicate a trend toward an equilibrium condition which might suggest that during the time in which our measurements were made, the rate of mass loss to the reservoir is approximately balanced by a natural recharge rate of similar magnitude. Analysis of water level and production data indicates that the natural recharge to the western part of the field is of the order of 2500 tons/hr (M. J. Lippmann, 1982, personal communication).

The lack of continued horizontal motion at Cerro Prieto described above can also be used as an argument for full recharge. In contrast, similar measurements made at Wairakei (Grimsrud et al., 1978) showed horizontal motions of the order of tens of centimeters as a result of production and accompanying the large subsidence occurring there.

The fact that the measured increase in gravity prior to the Victoria earthquake is greater than expected on the basis of subsidence suggests that in addition to full recharge of the reservoir, an increase in density may have taken place in recent years in response to production. Several mechanisms could account for this increase. One of these could be the rapid densification of sediments due to mineral precipitation produced by local boiling associated with production. Densification is the main cause for the Bouguer anomaly observed in the region of the geothermal field. This process may have accelerated as a result of production.

Another, an perhaps more likely, cause of a density increase is the recharge of the reservoir by cooler and denser waters. Using a two-dimensional gravity modeling computer program we examined the effect of recharge by cooler waters into a body whose dimensions correspond roughly to the a (upper) reservoir in Cerro Prieto. The results are shown in Figure 8. The calculated
gravity values were obtained by assuming the body
to have 25 percent porosity and that its intersti-
tial waters, having some initial temperature and
density, were completely replaced by the cooler
waters, all at 100 bars pressure.

The model gives some idea about the effect of
recharging the reservoir with cooler water. For
instance, if 280°C water is replaced by 260°C
water there will be a maximum gravity increase of
30 microgals, which is of the same order of magni-
tude as the observed gravity increases. This tem-
perature drop is very close to those actually
observed in the field (Fausto et al., 1981). If
280°C water is replaced by 100°C water, the gravity
increase would be much greater, of the order of
170 microgals. If, on the other hand, all the
fluids were extracted from the rock pores (i.e.,
no recharge) and there was no compaction,
would be a gravity decrease of around 1000 micro-
gals.

Although the effects of salinity change on
fluid density were not investigated, they are
expected to be of significantly lower magnitude
than those resulting from temperature changes.

These ideas should be viewed with a certain
amount of caution on two grounds. First, tectonic
activity may affect the ground motions in the
vicinity of Cerro Prieto so strongly that perhaps
all the changes we have observed are only a
reflection of this activity. Secondly, the period
of observation has been relatively short.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Simultaneous measurements of gravity and sur-
face elevation changes at the Cerro Prieto geother-
mal field over a four-year-period have shown
that they were primarily produced by tectonic
activity in the area. The seismic patterns of
change in gravity and elevation suggest that the
reservoir is being almost completely recharged as
production continues. The data also suggests that
a density increase is taking place in the reser-
voir region.

Given the relatively short duration of this
monitoring study, it is recommended that addi-
tional measurements be made in the years to come,
perhaps at two year intervals rather than at
yearly intervals as in the past. Also, more pre-
cise quantitative analysis should be made to
better characterize the processes occurring in the
Cerro Prieto geothermal system, such as the extent
of fluid recharge and the likely densification
mechanisms.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We want to thank the Comisión Federal de
Electricidad for the leveling data and for their
invaluable assistance in the field. This work was
supported by the Assistant Secretary for Conserva-
tion and Renewable Energy, Office of Renewable
Technology, Division of Hydrothermal and Hydro-
power Technologies, of the U. S. Department of
Energy under Contract No. DE-AC03-76SF00098.

REFERENCES

Albores L., A., Reyes Z., C. A., Brune, J. N.,
Gonzalez G., J., Garciilazo H., L., and Suárez
V., F., 1978, Estudios de Sismicidad en la
Región del Campo Geotérmico de Cerro Prieto,
in Proceedings, First Symposium on the Cerro
Prieto Geothermal Field, Lawrence Berkeley
Laboratory, LBL Report 7098, pp. 227-239.

Chase, D. S., Clover, R. C., Grammell, R. B., Leg-
egwee, R. M., Eppink, J., Tarkan, D. W., and
Goldstein, H. E., 1978, Precision Gravity
Studies at Cerro Prieto, Proceedings, First
Symposium on the Cerro Prieto Geothermal
Field, Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory, LBL

dela Peña L., A., 1981a, Resultados de los Estu-
dios de Nivelación de Primer Orden Realizados
en el Valle de Mexicali y en el Campo de
Cerro Prieto, Proceedings, Third Symposium on
the Cerro Prieto Geothermal Field, Lawrence
Berkeley Laboratory, LBL report 11967, pp.
281-289.

Dela Peña L., A., 1981b, Table of Elevation of
Benchmarks used in the Gravity Surveys.
Unpublished CFE report.

Elgers, W. A., Rex, R. W., Haidav, T., Robinson,
P. T., and Blehler, S., 1972, Crustal Spreading


