Learning on the Move: Mobile Educational Programs for Displaced Global Citizens

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/11w6q5k1

Author
Thornton, Abigail Margaret Elaine

Publication Date
2014

Peer reviewed|Thesis/dissertation
Learning on the Move:
Mobile Educational Programs for Displaced Global Citizens

A thesis submitted in partial satisfaction
of the requirements for the degree Master of Arts
in Education

by

Abigail Margaret Elaine Thornton

2014
ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS

Learning on the Move:
Mobile Educational Programs for Displaced Global Citizens

by
Abigail Margaret Elaine Thornton
Master of Arts in Education
University of California, Los Angeles, 2014
Professor Carlos A. Torres, Chair

Utilizing a dual analytical framework of forced displacement from above and a growing contemporary condition of ‘placelessness’ from below, I attempt to demonstrate the efficacy of building mobile and cross-border educational networks to reach people who have been dislocated from their communities of origin due to rapid economic restructuring across the globe. The implications that such ‘placelessness’ have on the educational movement indicate a need to create a mobile educational platform in order to reach the growing number of displaced global citizens currently left out of most educational initiatives. The results of this initial study, which focuses on migrant assistance shelters in Tijuana, Mexico, are significant due to the constraints on our current understanding of education, and how those understandings are challenged by increasingly mobile populations who require a different approach to meet their educational needs. There also exist connections to developing transnational social movements, as non-formal educational programs tied to these new social movements provide a much-needed platform to push for policy and education that more adequately meet their needs.
The thesis of Abigail Margaret Elaine Thornton is approved.

Teresa L. McCarty

Richard Desjardins

Carlos A. Torres, Committee Chair

University of California, Los Angeles

2014
This is dedicated to my mother, who met the struggles of life with an enduring smile and grace. Love and miss you always.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT OF THE THESIS .................................................................................................................. ii
COMMITTEE PAGE ................................................................................................................................. iii
DEDICATION PAGE ................................................................................................................................. iv

I. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................................................. 1
   Tijuana’s Location and Changing Demographics .................................................................................. 3
   Problem Statement ................................................................................................................................. 6
   Research Questions ............................................................................................................................... 9
   Significance ............................................................................................................................................. 9
   Study Limitations ................................................................................................................................. 11

II. LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................................................................... 12
   Sociology of Migration ........................................................................................................................... 13
   Transnationalism ................................................................................................................................... 14
   Rethinking Migration Flows .................................................................................................................. 14
   Forced Migration or Choice Migration ................................................................................................... 15
   Economic Restructuring Leading to Intensified Globalization ......................................................... 15
   Transnational Democracy and an Emerging Global Civil Society ..................................................... 17
   Popular Education in Displaced Contexts ............................................................................................. 18
   Conclusions ........................................................................................................................................... 20

III. POLICY REVIEW ......................................................................................................................................... 20
   When the Border Sealed ......................................................................................................................... 21
   Recent Changes in Mexican Immigration Policy ................................................................................ 22
   International Human Rights Frameworks ........................................................................................... 24

IV. A DUAL ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK: GLOBALIZATION FROM ABOVE AND PLACELESSNESS FROM BELOW ................................................................................................................................. 25
   Limitations to this Analytical Framework ........................................................................................... 27
   New Ideas about Place, Space, and Belonging ....................................................................................... 28

V. EDUCATING PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE: NEW IDEAS MOVING FORWARD ............................... 30
   IDEPSCA Day Labor Centers and Popular Adult Education in Los Angeles ................................... 30
   Mobile Voices Project ........................................................................................................................... 31
   Santa Ana City Jail in California as a New Educational Space ......................................................... 33
   Santa Ana Cultural Center and Developing Cross-Border Information Networks ........................... 35
   Returning to the City of Tijuana ........................................................................................................... 38
      Challenges ........................................................................................................................................ 38
      Opportunities ...................................................................................................................................... 39
   New Cross-Border Social Movements and Links to Education ........................................................ 39

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS ................................................................................................................................ 41
   Mexico’s Adult Education Policy ........................................................................................................... 41
   International Educational Policy and the Education for All Framework ........................................... 43
   Rethinking Binational Relationships ................................................................................................... 45

VII. CONCLUSION ........................................................................................................................................... 47

III. REFERENCES ............................................................................................................................................... 50
I. INTRODUCTION

People are moving across the globe on an unprecedented scale. So how does that movement fit into their educational hopes, dreams, and opportunities? This thesis is an initial exploration of the relationship that exists between migratory processes, global economic processes, and the growing presence of what has been sometimes referred to as global civil society. As the debate continues on how best to provide educational opportunities for all the world’s citizens, new avenues to reach those currently at the margins could be found through working with developing transnational social movements. One glaring omission it seems so far in this conversation has been that education for everyone is only considered viable for people who are fixed in place. Yet given the historically unprecedented increased mobility of millions, the lack of meaningful educational opportunity has a serious consequence for those who are required to be on the move.

What proceeds is a discussion less about what education is today, and more about what it needs to become tomorrow. Jason Hart (2008) refers in his work to people directly living the impact of contemporary global economic restructuring as displaced persons, or *displacees*. For the interests of my own work in the following chapters, I will adopt this description and suggest to expand it to refer specifically to displaced global citizens, as I think it most adequately details the nature of the phenomenon we are facing today. This description allows us to more clearly see that we are talking in actuality about many different groups of people, be it refugees, internally displaced persons, or migrants unauthorized in another country, that fall under the same category as forcibly displaced, yet at the same time
defined as global citizens according to international human rights frameworks, and are thus entitled to certain rights, including the right to an education. In this thesis, for the most part, I will be referring to them as a collective whole. Given the consistent rise in the number of people being displaced either internally or externally, be it from natural disasters, environmental devastation, civil wars, international conflict, acts of terrorism, economic deprivation, starvation, famine, or lack of legal status, the outcome remains the same. People who are increasingly forced to be on the move are unable to be provided with access to an education. While this thesis focuses primarily on the provision of adult educational programs in transitional contexts, much of this discussion is also applicable to children, who find themselves also increasingly displaced and forced to be in sometimes a perpetual state of transit.

When discussing the specific nature of the phenomenon that is occurring in Mexico around forced displacement, for the sake of this thesis I will focus primarily on those who find themselves somewhere along the spectrum in transit within the country. First, there are people who are migrating north from other countries of origin, typically on course to a location somewhere within the United States. Second, there is a group of people that is more recent, that is being deported back to Mexico from the United States in increasing numbers since 2009. The latest estimates detail that nearly 2 million undocumented immigrants have been deported from the U.S. since the beginning of the Obama Administration (Vicens, 2014). Ultimately what both groups have in common is that they are part of a growing worldwide population that is living in a somewhat permanent state of transition, where home is an elusive concept and identity becomes both increasingly fluid and therefore much more complex. There is also a similarly growing discourse in the literature about this burgeoning
transnationalism, and what it means to belong in two places at once, while at the same time somehow not quite belonging to anywhere.

I begin my research inquiry with the intention of exploring ways that migrant assistance shelters in Tijuana act as conduits for social action and change through the creation of alternative educational spaces as a way to provide more than just emergency assistance to those in need. Tijuana is a particularly appropriate place to situate this research because of its strategic location along the U.S.-Mexico border, where there is a significantly large population on the move through this border city. Shelters throughout the city provide people with access to information and the opportunity to engage in dialogue with one another and with members of the community that host them that could ultimately lead them to find more resources and better educational and employment opportunities in their struggle as people in transition in Mexico. Not only do these new programs offer valuable information to people both migrating north and those recently deported, but it is useful to explore the potential of how they could also later develop into more established curricula, potentially in partnership with local educational organizations and government agencies. Tijuana therefore becomes the focus of my research questions, but the connections between what is happening in Tijuana and in many other places also bears relevance to this inquiry.

**Tijuana’s Location and Changing Demographics**

Tijuana is significant to the research questions explored in this proposal for many reasons. A border city adjacent to the United States located roughly 20 miles south of San Diego, Tijuana is now a city of over 3 million by some estimates, with much of that growth being attributed to the arrival of migrants and people who have been recently deported from the
United States ("Tijuana, BC, Mexico", 2011). Under the U.S. Federal Secure Communities Program that was expanded from a pilot to a national program by U.S. President Barack Obama in 2013, increasingly local and state law enforcement agencies have been required to provide Immigration and Customs Enforcement (otherwise referred to as ICE) with fingerprints and other identifiable information on those for whom they have data available ("Secure Communities: A Fact Sheet", 2011). This has led to a dramatic increase in recent years in the number of undocumented immigrants who have been taken into custody by ICE and later deported. The impact of these daily deportations has been significant across the city of Tijuana. Estimates run anywhere from 200 to 800 people being deported each day into the Mexican state of Baja California, and Mexico’s National Institute of Migration (or INM) reports average repatriation numbers in 2011 and 2012 at 411 and 359 people per day, respectively (INM Statistics Report, 2012). The biggest international border crossing in Mexico is the San Ysidro Point of Entry (POE), also known as the busiest land border crossing in the world (Becker & Armendariz, 2012). In order to put this in a more local perspective, as Los Angeles is approximately three times the population of Tijuana, if we were to imagine 1,200 people arriving on the Santa Monica Pier every morning over the last few years, we might be able to start to comprehend the dramatic effect this massive relocation has had on this border city (Tijuana Workforce Report, 2010). As information has been gathered on people who have been found to be undocumented in the United States, increasingly they have been detained and ultimately deported, the majority back to Mexico where they have had little if any previous relationship. To illustrate the problem of deportation, thousands of young children were brought into the United States, in particular during the 1990s as mass waves of immigrants from Mexico arrived in the U.S. largely due to economic reasons (Alba, 2010; Weisbrot, Lefebvre, & Sammut, 2014). Subsequently,
many of these children were brought up, went to school, and ultimately became young adults, all while living without official documentation that would allow them to lawfully reside in the country. Years later, many are being deported or in some cases deciding to return voluntarily due to limited economic and educational opportunities in the United States.

The other face of persons on the move in Mexico is that of the migrant traveling north attempting to reach the border of the United States, often staying at migrant assistance shelters scattered throughout the country along the journey. According to Wendy Vogt, one of the few anthropologists who has studied the experiences of migrants traveling through Mexico, “most of the world’s migrants do not simply board a 747 jet plane and land in their ‘receiving community’ hours later. On the contrary, migrants may live in a liminal state of transit for weeks, months or even years as they attempt to cross national borders, earn cash, secure shelter, eat and make incremental movements towards their destination” (Vogt, 2012, p. 7). Vogt in her statements says something I think quite surprising for many who may have assumed that migrants are in transit for only a short period of time on their way from one location to another. In reality the truth is far more complex, thus we are talking about a significantly large population, likely not just in Mexico but in various regions throughout the world, that is in a constant state of marginalization and flux (González-Murphy, 2009). Given this almost permanent state of transit, access to certain legally-guaranteed rights and protections agreed upon by Mexico in different international accords, such as the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, becomes elusive at best. Included among these more recently legally guaranteed rights is the right to access to an education as a migrant in transit in Mexico (González-Murphy & Koslowski, 2011).
As my research seeks to demonstrate, there is much about this phenomenon of displacement and subsequent movement that needs to be investigated. It is also important to understand how such a population in constant motion is being left out of current educational debates, and therefore what ideas and programs would need to be considered in order to ameliorate this situation. Lastly and perhaps most importantly, what potential do such programs have to link to existing transnational social movements and what effect would that have on shaping both our concepts of place and subsequently public policy? As many communities increasingly have members who have been displaced by larger political and economic realities, it is not necessarily a big jump to make when considering that ways to connect displaced communities with communities of origin through intermediaries such as educational spaces at non-governmental organizations could have a direct impact on the success of new social movement building across borders, and subsequently on the degree of influence these non-state actors could have upon development and policy within both the United States and Mexico.

**Problem Statement**

World migration is at an all-time high. According to the most recent numbers from the World Bank, there are over 214 million people today who are living in a country other than the one in which they were born (World Bank, 2010). That is roughly 3.15% of the world’s current population, and projections indicate that this number will only continue to grow, as there has been an increase of over 37% in just the last two decades alone (UN Population Division, 2009). Of those located outside of their country of origin, estimates are that anywhere between 15 to 20% (or 30 to 40 million) are unauthorized to reside in their host country, and arguably thus require special consideration given their more vulnerable position
(Papademetriou, 2005). Furthermore and something that should also merit some attention, recent estimates have the number of those internally displaced at approximately 33 million people, with an additional 16.7 million refugees and 1.2 asylum-seekers pending adjudication (UNHCR, 2013). Therefore given that the total number of both internally and externally displaced people is now roughly 265 million worldwide (and 91 million of those in vulnerable status positions in their host countries), it stands to reason that educational opportunities for this more mobile population need to be urgently considered¹.

Specifically in Mexico, which has increasingly become the de-facto home for migrants in transit and recently repatriated Mexicans being returned from the United States, according to statistics from Mexico’s National Migration Institute (INM in Spanish), at least 140,000 migrants cross the southern Mexican border every year on their journey north (INM, 2012). Some non-governmental organizations however estimate that number to be more accurately between 300,000 to 400,000 per year (Mendez Lugo, 2013; Moreno, 2011). Increasingly, a significant amount of the world’s population, regardless of their specific impetus to do so, is migrating within their country or moving to another country altogether. Despite this worldwide trend in global migration however, there are correspondingly very few mechanisms in place in countries experiencing the full brunt of this like Mexico that provide support for those traveling the country unauthorized. Historically and until very recently, Mexico was classified primarily as a sending country, which meant that most migration was

¹ Based on most recent statistics from the United Nations Population Division and the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), there are anywhere between 30 to 40 million unauthorized migrants currently living or transiting through a host country. In addition, there are an estimated 51.2 million other forcibly displaced persons, both inside their countries of origin and in host countries. The total number therefore of those living in this more vulnerable state could be as high as 91.2 million, or approximately 30% of the total population currently living outside of their home country or internally displaced (265 million).
out-migration to another country. Increasingly, however, the trend has been complicated as more people particularly from Central American countries have traversed Mexico in attempts to land further north. Mexico has now been reclassified as primarily a transit country for migrant populations, and has also become one of the top countries experiencing such a phenomenon in the world (González-Murphy & Koslowski, 2011). Increasingly, those who are on the move in Mexico are not authorized to be there, creating additional vulnerabilities along the trail.

Of the few safety nets available, there are migrant assistance shelters run by church and humanitarian assistance groups in various locations throughout the country that attempt to provide some degree of support. While this assistance is limited, increasingly these shelters work to provide more than just basic services of food, housing, and medical care. For example, some shelters regularly assist people with reaching family members via free phone calls and by having access to the internet with email and skype calls, and by providing educational workshops and programs on knowing your rights in the country in order to give people important legal and medical information. There seems to be an explicit attempt to provide people with the resources and information they may need in order to have more choices available to them. I argue that through the expansion of workshops, talks, life-skills, literacy and language classes at shelters such as those in Tijuana, a group of mostly adults heretofore essentially being counted as absent from the conversation on education could potentially be given a place at that table. In Tijuana and potentially other similarly situated border cities, there is increasingly an opportunity to provide an educational program tailored to the needs of populations forced to be on the move.
Research Questions

As record numbers of people find themselves in permanent transit in Mexico, the question arises, what can meaningful education look like for those forced to be in transit? Migrant assistance shelters are transformed into not only new hubs of information and resources, such as assisting in basic needs, but also increasingly into sources of information and an alternative means of education. These new gathering points for people displaced and on the move are challenging and potentially altering the idea of what non-formal education can mean for this growing transnational community. How can a migrant assistance shelter in Mexico be transformed into an important educational space for lifelong learning, and at the same time become a critical component of a growing transnational social movement supporting the rights of forcibly displaced persons? How can these programs then become key to the development of cross-border alliances that are able to push for policy changes and greater overall inclusion of this community, both in terms of education but also in employment? How can such programs support displaced people on both sides of the border? Finally, how does the creation of such programs specifically along the U.S.-Mexico border lead to the opportunity to influence policy decisions both in their respective national contexts but also in the metropolitan region of San Diego - Tijuana? These are some of the important questions that look for answers in the pages that follow. To address these questions, I will review some of the recent literature on the sociology of migration, the developing research on transnationalism and their new social movements across borders, and notions of an emerging global society. From there I will review more recent changes in immigration policy in the United States and Mexico, and follow with a framework for reading current global processes and their impacts on people’s decisions to migrate. Lastly there will be a
discussion of some new approaches to non-formal education and reaching those outside of the classroom, and how those approaches can inform future educational direction in border cities like Tijuana.

**Significance**

Exploring ways to develop alternative educational programs for people oftentimes in a permanent state of displacement is potentially useful in filling the gap that exists in the conversation today around how to provide education to all of the world’s citizens. With current initiatives from multilateral organizations such as UNESCO and UNICEF attempting to provide primary education to the majority if not all of the people of the world, while an ambitious goal, it is also an achievable one I would suggest if done in partnership with grassroots and other non-governmental groups on the ground. National governmental entities can also be a part of this outreach, as existing educational programs run by the Mexican government and also federally-funded educational initiatives in the U.S. can work to connect with non-governmental groups that may not have the resources but they do have the members. Local people are often the most capable of reaching those who are least connected to existing formal networks and possibly in transit, and thus can contribute significantly to the objectives of both national and international organizations in providing educational possibilities to all. I suggest that the beginning of a complementary plan of action towards achieving education for all emanating from below can start to take shape and work in conjunction with national and international agencies to begin to more accurately address educational needs in this more globalized context.
Study Limitations

While the findings here have potential implications for developing educational models also useful in other, mobile contexts with displaced populations, the limitations are also various. First, the obvious concern is a population that is inherently mobile does not necessarily lend itself to participation in a meaningful educational program. I think this has been a more traditional assumption, however I intend to take the opportunity here to explore different ways to approach this problem. I suggest that it is not necessarily that the problem lacks a solution, but more that we lack the right perspective in order to see it. Second, in order to consider how any type of mobile educational project could translate into skills and knowledge that could be useful to students in these programs, given the circumstances, is indeed a significant challenge. What skills do people need, when, and how would they be of benefit to them once a program has been concluded? Who also ultimately determines these needs? These questions would need to be seriously considered, and likely on a case-by-case basis in different locations where different educational and economic priorities might take precedence over others.

To conclude, there are many questions and potential pitfalls to developing this type of education beyond what we typically think of as education today. However, I suggest that we are merely at the starting point in our attempts to analyze these newer trends in alternative educational practices, and also how to understand them as part of a larger strategy to reach those who are not necessarily accessible through more formalized structures and institutions. By analyzing new educational ideas in this thesis and teasing out what could be of value in the context of a migrant assistance shelter in Tijuana, I will attempt to see the possible connections between the different contexts that could lead to a larger reading of the pattern,
and how education in these dislocated contexts could eventually point to a viable strategy for greater inclusion in the educational movement for all today. Lastly, my hope is that this will only be the beginning of further research in this area, including my own in the years to come.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

To begin this conversation, it is important to cover some of the most important works and ideas discussed in the sociology of migration, and then I will move to the direct connection between mass global migration today and the intensification of interconnected global processes, or what is commonly referred to as globalization, and add to the discussion on the growing transnational community and subsequent social movements developing as a response to this massive economic restructuring on a global scale. Lastly I will bring in some of the key scholars and their ideas around education, in particular for the purposes of this discussion around adult education, and some new ideas about what education needs to become in this twenty-first century for marginalized and displaced people throughout the globe in order to truly meet the imperatives of a movement towards education for all peoples.

In reviewing the literature, there are many powerful concepts meriting discussion in order to demonstrate the progression of ideas and the possibility of what is to come. Initially, an overview of the sociology of migration literature demonstrates that immigration throughout human history is not a new phenomenon (Castles & Miller, 2003). For the purposes of this conversation, however, the focus is on more contemporary immigration phenomenon, and in particular for the last approximately thirty years, which also coincides to a great extent with the rise and intensification of worldwide economic relations, the
globalization of labor (Sassen, 1999), and subsequent global economic restructuring. In addition this became a time of intensification of several other processes, such as in technology and transportation, however for the purposes of this study, the focus will be primarily on the connection between the unprecedented movement of people with minimal resources at their disposal (as either migrants, deported persons, refugees, or internally displaced persons) and the rapid intensification of economic development from the top that will from here be referred to as economic globalization.

**Sociology of Migration**

Alejandro Portes is a leading scholar of the contemporary history of migration studies, its inherently data-driven culture, and the future trends in the field as migration patterns become increasingly complex and affect more and more of the world (Portes, 1997). At the time of this writing, contemporary immigration phenomena was still arguably in its more nascent stages. Despite that, it seems Portes was very adept at foreseeing the challenges and opportunities in the field coming down the road. For the purposes of this research, I will focus on one trend in particular that Portes specifically highlighted as becoming increasingly important, that of the growing importance of transnational ties and transnational community development, essentially seen as a consequence of increased economic globalization restructuring (1997). While his arguments are not overtly political in nature, his description of macro-economic processes spurring increased migration, and the effect that would have on a growing transnationally conscious community was critical to the development of this field.
Transnationalism

As transnationalism and transnational community development has become a very tangible outgrowth of increased global migration patterns, it is first important to highlight how much of Portes’ predictions in fact have come to pass almost a generation later. Increasingly there has been extensive research on the development of transnational networks and communities as a direct response to mass migration in the Americas, and the direct effects this experience has had on families in particular (Abrego, 2011; Dreby, 2012). One key difference that was noted in more recent literature on transnational migration is that theoretically the focus has shifted, and instead of focusing on immigrant assimilation, as Portes also mentioned, gradually the literature shifted to focus on how the development of unequal global structures have directly contributed to the separation of families across national borders, and has attempted to study the impacts economic globalization have had in particular at the local level (Dreby & Adkins, 2010). This growing concern about how certain policies have had a direct and oftentimes negative impact on families as they become increasingly separated is important in developing a critical analysis of what is happening at the family and community level, but I would like to see this discussion extend to talk about how transnational class-consciousness, if given the right application, has the potential to develop into a strong movement both critical of active policy separating communities and thus displacing people from their lives, and also able to develop proposals for some much-needed solutions.

Rethinking Migration Flows

There needs to be a reconceptualization of the process of migration itself as not necessarily a linear experience, from here to there, and that demonstrates how the reality of
this movement is much more complex. Subsequently, the impact of these more complicated migration experiences is breaking down traditional family relations and developing a growing transnational identity and experience that needs to be further explored. Much of the literature on migration examines a linear progression of migration from departure to arrival, integration, and finally assimilation, without examining the transit migratory process in its own right, and how people in transit can be marginalized through this experience for often long periods of time (Vogt, 2012). This marginalization and limited access to support networks and therefore to educational and employment opportunities can have a significant negative impact on people while they are in this sometimes prolonged state of movement.

**Forced Migration or Choice Migration**

Lastly related to migration is the somewhat active discussion as to whether or not the decision to move is a choice or a necessity. As Stephen Castles (2003) noted, “forced migration – including refugee flows, asylum seekers, internal displacement and development-induced displacement – has increased considerably in volume and political significance since the end of the Cold War. It has become an integral part of North–South relationships and is closely linked to current processes of global social transformation” (p.13). Castles would argue that much of the movement of people we see today is borne of necessity, and is an exercise of limited individual agency based on their particular set of circumstances and severe lack of opportunity; however, there is still a lively debate around this aspect of the discussion that is in disagreement with this point of view because of a failure or unwillingness to see the larger macroeconomic processes at work. To determine when displacement is a choice, particularly when discussing economic motivations, is something that is much more complex to conclude uniformly, and would also require a much more
nuanced discussion about rationale choice theory and other concepts that are outside the realm of this current research. Suffice it to say however that there are arguments supporting both sides in the literature, and for these specific purposes, the answer is to a large degree irrelevant, as regardless of true motivation and degree of agency, the fact still remains that a significant number of people are displaced and lacking access to many human rights while in transit.

**Economic Restructuring Leading to Intensified Globalization**

As more of the conversation has turned to the discussion on how much these top-level economic decisions have contributed to many people’s displacement from their communities of origin, we see that a conversation about the sociology of migration and one about economic restricting under globalization are no longer mutually exclusive, if they ever were. According to Marcelo Suárez-Orozco, migration at such an accelerated pace in recent decades is undeniably and intricately connected to rapid economic globalization (2001). Ronaldo Munck (2002) also refers to our current era of economic restructuring form the top as the “new great transformation”, making a reference to Polanyi’s description of the economic revolution that took place as a response to the Industrial Revolution (Polanyi, 1944). This newly intensified, next step in the process of economic restructuring on a global scale has essentially transformed the lives and prospects of people throughout the world. This has also led to the increased displacement of much of the world’s people, and poses questions on how to collectively respond in order to ensure their continued presence in these larger processes.
Transnational Democracy and an Emerging Global Civil Society

One of the many responses to this top-down economic restructuring under the current intensified phase of economic globalization may be the growing networks within what is sometimes referred to as global civil society (Falk, 1998). Sometimes this is also referred to as the globalization-from-below (Appadurai, 2001). There has also been more discussion on the development of transnational social movements and organizations as a potential response to these contemporary circumstances. Mundy & Murphy (2001) offer an in-depth analysis of the history of international non-governmental organizations (or INGOs) that have increasingly formed the foundation for transnational social movements (or TSMs).

“[M]ounting literature on globalization and the changing nature of international relations has provided convincing evidence that an increasingly strong and complex array of international nongovernmental actors and new nongovernmental organization (NGO) forms is emerging.” (Mundy & Murphy, 2001, p. 85). What could this explosion of growth in civil society organizations mean in relation to economic globalization and also to the development of larger, global governing structures? As these authors argue and I would concur, as gradually non-state actors become more involved in political processes and decision-making, they are also becoming increasingly involved in the conversation over who has educational access. I would venture to say that this is an extremely positive and necessary development as a potentially direct response to some of the negative effects of top-down globalization, and offers some new opportunities from the grassroots perspective on how to develop viable educational strategies that may not be realistically implemented exclusively from the top.

I also want to mention some more recent theories in the literature around the idea of transnational democracy, or the theory of extended democratic systems beyond current
nation-state boundaries. According to Tony McGrew in his article “Transnational Democracy: Theories and Prospects”, these ideas come as a response to the recognized limits of existing national systems in the 21st century, in particular when it comes to the needs of those such as migrants who find themselves existing within such systems but with limited ability to exercise any political or other, human rights (McGrew, 2002). In addition, there is increasing evidence in the literature today that transnational social movements and new, more global forms of civil society have also emerged as a response to increased globalization, with the understanding that education will also have to change shape in order to accommodate these rapid changes (Mundy & Murphy, 2001). With the emergence of these more democratic global governance structures, there is also then a push for extending political, legal, and other human rights to those often not being protected either locally or nationally inside the existing formal system. Displaced people by and large are being left out of the nation-state paradigm and are cut off from existing support structures due to nation-state boundaries and oftentimes, such as in the case of the U.S.-Mexico relationship, due to increasingly restricted immigration policies.

**Popular Education in Displaced Contexts**

Last to add to this conversation yet possibly most fundamental to it, is how part of a transnational response to increased economic restructuring under globalization could also potentially include new educational responses and opportunities? In a growing post-national context, which does not necessarily denote the fall of the nation-state but quite possibly in many respects simply to its reconfiguration, and in particular with respect to education access, a new educational concept needs to be put into place. Therefore as roughly four percent of the world’s population becomes increasingly mobile and rootless, and of those
now approximately thirty percent are either forcibly displaced or migrating without authorization, it could be argued that their education should be correspondingly mobile to attempt to meet their needs. Paulo Freire once talked about utilizing popular education methods as the key to the \textit{conscientization} of a people, in particular those people who have been historically marginalized (2003). The people who were marginalized by the nation-state in the time of Freire may have by and large been citizens, and mostly in this research I am discussing people who are dislocated from their national contexts, however arguably the situation is virtually the same. People who have been effectively and almost uniformly disempowered through their displacement are people I would suggest that would be most to benefit from a comprehensive popular education program similar to the model Freire espoused. The key difference is the increased mobility, but as we will see in one of the upcoming examples of this new sort of education beyond, that technology can potentially be a crucial part of the answer to solve that.

Arguably as the nation-state moves out of education, there are two real options available. According to Carlos Torres (2002), either education becomes increasingly influenced by market forces, as we have seen play out on more stages in different countries as of late, or it becomes an opportunity for enhanced democracy across borders. Clearly we can no longer exclusively discuss formal education as a means to reach many of the world’s citizens, and in particular those who have been forcibly displaced and are sometimes permanently on the move. Urgently the focus needs to shift, to expand our notions of education to include non-formal programs and practices, in particular literacy and job training along with other area-specific knowledge, and to recognize them as being an equally compelling and necessary part of the 21st century’s educational answer. As a critical
component of that, lifelong learning ideas need to be included as integral to a more holistic approach that also recognizes the necessity for learning beyond the more traditionally accepted age and formalized classroom.

Conclusions

As demonstrated in this review of the literature, education can therefore become part of a multi-layered response for people displaced within the growing international division of labor, and provide avenues of engagement in what would clearly have to be a more non-traditional classroom, if even within a physical space at all. In the context of a migrant assistance shelter in Tijuana, while there exists a physical space, the limited time people are able to stay in the shelter becomes part of how their educational program would in large part have to take place outside of the confines of that space. Yet as more people become connected even after leaving these spaces, the potential to extend beyond to a much larger and active organism via growing transnational advocacy networks and organizations, also present as possible avenues for engagement, action and change.

III. POLICY REVIEW

Changes in both U.S. and Mexican immigration policy in recent years, while not uniformly the same, have both effectively created an increasingly hostile climate for people who lack the legal status to reside in either country. In addition, increasingly new types of people have been added to the list of those who have been displaced, in particular since Mexico has become predominantly a country for people in transit, thereby making the overall situation of clandestine movement in Mexico even more dangerous as transnational criminal
organizations linked to drug trafficking, sex trafficking, and human smuggling have grown more powerful and thus made being on the move in Mexico without papers much more perilous (ACLU, 2009). Given this radicalized climate, and despite recent advancements in migration law in the country, arguably even more people in Mexico have been forced further underground, making them increasingly vulnerable to systematic violence along the entire migrant route, and I suggest therefore makes them even more in need of educational intervention.

**When the Border Sealed**

In 1994 under U.S. President Bill Clinton, the United States Border Patrol implemented the initial phase of Operation Gatekeeper, a federally-funded initiative aimed at curtailing unauthorized immigration into the United States from Mexico through at the time its primary points of entry, specifically its major cities such as Tijuana-San Diego and Ciudad Juárez-El Paso. With the implementation of Operation Gatekeeper, the border became even more airtight, as millions of dollars and thousands more border patrol agents were brought to the border in order to curtail further illegal border crossings (Nevins, 2002). One of the effects of this was that many people migrating began to shift into less populated areas, such as the Sonoran desert in northern Mexico and Arizona, which led to a significant increase in deaths of people attempting to reach the border (ACLU, 2009). It also led to a much less publicized effect on many immigrant families, as people found ways to adjust to this new border enforcement strategy. One of the adaptations was that as the border sealed, increasingly people decided to remain on the U.S. side of the border, and attempt to bring other family members to be with them, since visiting and being able to return looked less and less like a realistic option. Essentially over time the sealing of the U.S.-Mexico border
created the immigrant rights crisis that the United States is facing today. Gradually more families moved to and grew up in the U.S., regardless of citizenship status, and with recent changes in immigration policy leading to mass deportations on an unprecedented scale, more people are part of the growing transnational community, and many more of them now are in a state of forced displacement.

**Recent Changes in Mexican Immigration Policy**

On the other side of the border, Mexico has experienced quite a different history in terms of its immigration policy and history. Historically an out-migration country, responsible in the last few decades for the vast majority of foreign-born immigrants living in the U.S., in recent years Mexico has been transformed from a sending country into a receiving one of those attempting to reach either the United States or Canada (González-Murphy & Koslowski, 2011). However something that is unique to Mexico is that it is now receiving both from the United States via increased repatriation of citizens who had previously left in previous waves of emigration, and it is also simultaneously receiving increasing numbers of migrants from the south, mostly from the Central American countries of Guatemala, El Salvador, and Honduras. Arguably Mexico is in a challenging and unique position with respect to its growing transient population.

Until 2008 in Mexico it was a crime punishable by fine or prison to be found undocumented in the country, or to assist people in such circumstances (Alba, 2010). This is part of the explanation as to why the religious community has historically played a more central role in the development of migrant assistance shelters, and only more recently since the change to the law have humanitarian and other activist groups been able to actively
participate in the growing migrant rights movement in the country. In addition to the changes in the Law of Population of 1974 to decriminalize undocumented migrants in 2008, in 2011 another dramatic change was enacted that not only guaranteed the protection of migrants’ human rights, but also included the right for those without legal status in the country to have access to education (González-Murphy & Koslowski, 2011). This becomes a highly relevant piece of legislation from the perspective of this thesis, as it not only finally put Mexico’s national laws in better alignment with international treaties of which it is a signatory (such as the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, signed in 1999 and put into effect in 2003), but it has also dramatically opened up a space for providing access to education for those typically not being accessed.

Despite the fact that being an undocumented person in Mexico is no longer considered a crime and increasingly human rights fall under not only international but national protection as well, there still remains a pervasive climate of insecurity and danger that seems unique to displaced, unauthorized persons traveling through the country. Considering this significant danger, it becomes even more essential in this context to have strategic locations along the most traveled migrant routes in order to access people traveling north and also those who are returning from there due to their repatriation. It is in these access points, usually which consist of migrant assistance shelters, where there exists the potential to bring the educational initiatives from above to meet with the real-time assistance and developing programs from below to arrive at a potential tipping point in education for marginalized persons in Mexico.
International Human Rights Frameworks

From the perspective of international human rights, the law is arguably all too clear. In 1948 as a direct and concerted response to the atrocities committed during World War II, the international community under the guidance of the United Nations drafted the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, for the first time establishing an international framework to respect and guarantee certain basic rights for all the people of the world (United Nations, 2009). This Declaration became the first of many subsequent international accords and treaties created to help increase protections for those most vulnerable to other global forces at work, the least of which not being global economic restructuring. Increasingly as more of the world’s population has been forced to be on the move, the United Nations has responded accordingly with different and more nuanced calls to respect human rights and enforce their protection. A more contemporary example is the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, which went into effect in 2003. Mexico was one of the last signatories of this international agreement, however until 2011 there still lacked any substantial national legislation that aimed to protect migrants in the country. This was a glaring example of the disconnect between international and national interests, motivations and quite possibly capabilities, as given the national context of migration in Mexico, the political will was simply lacking for almost a decade to increase protections for migrants living in and traveling the country.

In the context of education, these international protections and increased coordination with national laws only assist in developing the environment necessary in order to forge critical partnerships to reach the most vulnerable. It might be noted, however, that the United States still has yet to sign on to that particular international convention protecting migrant
workers, which is another important consideration in building viable programs across their border. As education, both formal and non-formal, continues to be by and large determined within the nation-state that is increasingly incapable of providing what is needed on their own, again an imperative emerges for a dramatic shift in the existing paradigm.

IV. A DUAL ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK: GLOBALIZATION FROM ABOVE AND PLACELESSNESS FROM BELOW

"Wir riefen Arbeitskräfte und es kamen. (We asked for manpower and we got human beings.)" - Swiss writer, Max Frisch

The world is not the same as it was a generation ago. Of that we can be certain. I am part of a generation that is now heralded to be the last to remember a childhood without the influence of the internet, one of the hallmarks of the age of globalization that we are now all a part of. Within a generation, we have also seen sweeping change with respect to economic integration and restructuring, as advances in technology and transportation have enabled such a transformation. Increasingly, the world’s economy has become more integrated and de-territorialized. This latter point is also a direct result of this historical movement of people, in particular from South to North, that has reshaped nations within that same generation.

Global Economic Restructuring and its Relationship to Global Migration

In order to fully understand how these rapid changes have contributed directly to such global movement and displacement, it is important to understand their symbiotic relationship. Utilizing the framework of globalization in order to understand how migration has become unprecedented in today’s world, looking at migration through this lens it becomes clear that
with massive, worldwide economic restructuring has come the need for increased movement (Suárez-Orozco, 2001). Looking at the theory of late capitalism and globalization, arguably as economic globalization processes have intensified, they have also realigned and restructured themselves, which has caused massive shifts across the globe the least of which was in people’s patterns of stability and movement. According to the United Nations Convention on Migrants’ Rights, convened in 2003, “International migration has become an intrinsic feature of globalization” (United Nations, 2005). Even according to the highest international bodies, it is becoming increasingly necessary to link the human rights framework to the phenomenon of migration, and also delineate the reasons such a phenomenon of this scale is occurring in the first place.

According to David Harvey (1989), globalization and its subsequent “flexibilization” of the global workforce has been a direct response by labor to the restructuring of the dominant, capitalist system. This economic restructuring across the globe has led to the development of an international division of labor, and I would argue that this is a form of violence in many respects, and has been the primary factor that has pushed millions to migrate at much more rapid rates, in order to respond to the global flexibility that capital has acquired. As people are increasingly pushed into migratory networks and into forging new existences in unknown terrains and in States where they are likely to have limited or possibly no legal rights, the questions of democracy and access to basic, human rights also emerge.

Using this theory of global economic restructuring as a partial lens through which to analyze the current situation of mass displacement through immigration, it also offers opportunities for response on a more global scale. Essentially, education of any kind under the effects of globalization requires an understanding of the opportunities available under its
influence, and while there are clearly factors limiting accessibility, addressing the need for education on the move for people on the move is potentially one avenue towards a solution.

**Limitations to this Analytical Framework**

While current top-down economic processes are clearly in play, there are also many reasons that utilizing such a framework to analyze immigration and education today is problematic. First, since it is a purely deductive approach, it limits the argument of individual and even community-level agency and opportunity for varied response. The answer to this I contend will be partially satisfied in the following chapter revealing the different case studies that I will use to test the validity of these claims. Moreover, while it is most definitely the case that local responses vary widely, I would suggest that the restrictions being placed upon them from above are more or less the same. That being said, it is not so much the response that is being viewed as uniform, but rather the impetus that compels each of these communities to respond for the most part in fact is.

Another limitation to the use of this framework relates specifically to those displaced persons at least not directly forced to move due to the pressures of economic globalization. In the case of undocumented people being deported from the United States, clearly the motivation is much more political than economic. The terms of displacement are by no means uniform for everyone, and the causes are sometimes varied, however the outcome of “placelessness” is what becomes central here, and thus leads to the second part of my theoretical framework that lends itself critically to this discussion.
New Ideas About Place, Space, and Belonging

If we are arguably beyond the nation-state in certain respects, in a sense of “post-geography” if you will (Bauman, 1998), then in regards to educational practice and theory, it may be a plausible consideration to move beyond physical borders and implement cross-border educational programs where applicable, extend programming and schools to be explicitly inclusive of non-citizens of a nation-state, and move wherever deemed necessary with people who find themselves inevitably on the move.

According to Arturo Escobar (2001), “placelessness” has become the essential feature of the modern condition (Escobar, 2001, p. 140). If lack of place is indeed the new, contemporary condition for many in an increasingly globalized world, and if we are to assume that education for all people is indeed a priority, then would it not follow that education without a fixed place needs to be discussed and possibly implemented?

Using the framework of ‘placelessness’ or non-fixed-ness as an important tool to view the situation from the ground, it also begs the question that also our very concepts of place, space and belonging are increasingly up for reconsideration. According to Marcelo Suárez-Orozco (2001), understanding our place on the global stage is strongly related to the issue of belonging, and in these times our very identities have been perceptibly fragmented. No longer are we people either from this location or from that one, but increasingly we are people from both this place and that one. As our sense of identity, space, and belonging become new questions, our very notion of what is education needs to be reconsidered fundamentally. For example, what does an educational program on citizenship mean to an undocumented Guatemalan teenager living in the U.S. with relatives who are not her parents? Arguably it would be experienced quite differently by a Mexican national living in his country’s capital.
An important ramification of this is also, without place, where do we locate our struggle, and for the sake of this research, where do we locate our educational programs? Are we required to develop new concepts of place and belonging as a direct response to the reordering of our lives under economically-influenced globalization? One suggestion is that such ´placelessness´ acts as a rupture, that while initially traumatic, also contains within it the opportunity for new concepts of place and belonging to emerge. Within these moments of rupture we can potentially find new levels of consciousness, and subsequently opportunities for collective action from below.

With every push downward by top-down economic forces shaping people´s lives, there is a subsequent dislocation that disrupts, and sometimes sends communities and even ways of life into shock. As Naomi Klein has argued and that could be useful to some degree in this analysis, essentially shock therapy has been used in communities as diverse as Chile, Iraq, and New Orleans in order to bring about rapid economic restructuring (Klein, 2007). I would like to go further and suggest that it is in these moments, essentially of dislocation, where there also exists the opportunity for a new response from the ground-level, in this case potentially in the form of transnational social movements that support and attempt to protect the human rights of migrants and other dislocated, displaced people in a state of permanent movement, and possibly shock, inside of Mexico. In other words, the dislocation both literal and figurative can also act as an opportunity for re-conscientization, or renewed awakening of a fundamental critical consciousness that would lend itself directly to the transformation of this world. Essentially, we are in a moment of opportunity, and expanding educational networks on the ground to reach those most in need becomes a critical component in shifting the larger global conversation, to no longer be dominated by and large by economic decision-
making, but to include a greater conversation on democracy and the development of transnational civil society and governance as well.

V. EDUCATING PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE: NEW IDEAS MOVING FORWARD

What follows are three separate alternative educational approaches that are analyzed using the aforementioned analytical framework, in order to understand the value of each program, and how it potentially informs the development of alternative popular adult educational programs in locations along the Mexican migrant trail, and more specifically for this discussion, within migrant assistance shelters along the border in Tijuana. Each of these approaches has a different set of variables worth assessing here, and while none is exactly what is developing within the Mexican migrant shelters, each one arguably provides some insight into how education for those most marginalized is having to change shape in order to reach people who have been displaced in our current world reality.

IDEPSCA Day Labor Centers and Popular Adult Education in Los Angeles

The Instituto de Educación Popular del Sur de California, or Institute of Popular Education of Southern California (IDEPSCA), is a not-for-profit immigrant rights and education center founded in 1984 when a group of concerned students and parents came together to confront issues of inequality that they were facing in the community (IDEPSCA, 2014). With “reading reality to write history” as one of the organization’s mottos, IDEPSCA
focuses on empowering immigrant Los Angeles workers through the use of adult popular education programs, inspired by the original work of Paulo Freire.

**The Mobile Voices project**

In the spring of 2008, a group of researchers from the University of Southern California partnered with IDEPSCA to develop an exploratory educational program to promote greater civic engagement and digital inclusion for day laborers in the Los Angeles area. Their goal was to see how the use of mobile phone technology could potentially create a mobile storytelling popular education project that could empower workers in their daily lives. They began by surveying 58 workers at IDEPSCA´s day labor centers in order to gauge their normal communication practices. From the survey results they found that the vast majority had mobile phones and used them for different purposes, yet did not know how to use many of the features available. Many workers knew how to use them to take pictures, for example, however most did not know how to upload their content online, and 98% did not know how to use a computer but wanted to learn (Bar et al., 2009). What followed was a weekly series of workshops over the course of several months where researchers from USC, IDEPSCA staff, and members of the day labor centers came together to share information about technology and discuss best practices. Upon conducting interviews four months into the program, workers related that they saw the Mobile Voices project as an alternative media channel that empowered them to tell their own stories (Bar et al., 2009, p. 6). This increased civic engagement and visibility through the more adept use of social media and technology helped them counter how they were portrayed in the mainstream media, something mentioned at the international level as a critical factor in shifting peoples´ perceptions of immigrants (International Organization for Migration, 2011). Through increased use of their
mobile technology, these worker-students found new ways to engage in the public sphere, and they essentially took control of their own narrative and were able to directly challenge the one disseminated through more mainstream channels. One example mentioned by the researchers was of a hunger strike in downtown Los Angeles a few months after the project was initiated as a response to “broken immigration laws” (p. 6). At the event, day laborers used their phones to upload testimonies and photos from participants onto the Mobile Voices website in order to help exchange information and build a sense of solidarity with one another. Essentially, this program can be seen as a model of popular adult education fostering greater inclusivity, increased conscientization, and empowerment in worker’s day to day lives.

Mobile Voices utilizes newer technology in order to conduct a horizontally-led educational program that is simultaneously able to be on the move. The most critical parts of this particular learning process, it could be suggested, seem to exist outside the confines of the physical classroom at the center. This innovative approach applies current trends in ICT to immigrant workers’ realities on the move. There is some degree of assumption that this group of participants is by and large in a fixed location, given they live and work in Los Angeles, however even their status as temporary day laborers indicates that their situation is by no means stable. I highlight this to also refer back to the increased flexibilization of workers throughout the world, which arguably means the risk of being removed from place is high, in particular for immigrant workers without formal employment agreements. This educational initiative merits attention for the purposes of this study as it demonstrates that due to technology advancements, increasingly education and empowerment can be on the
move, something that is becoming critical as more people are no longer fixed in one location, or even in one nation-state.

The Santa Ana City Jail in California as a New Educational Space

Another new approach to education for those being marginalized and unable to participate in more formal educational networks occurs in Santa Ana, California, in the city jail which has become a self-proclaimed leader in new ideas around education for those being detained there. For several years, the city of Santa Ana has had a contract with ICE and agreed to house undocumented immigrants temporarily while awaiting deportation, usually back to Mexico. Given Santa Ana is within southern California, this also typically meant deportation to Tijuana.

The first time I learned of the special agreement between ICE and the Santa Ana City jail was when I was talking with people at a shelter in Tijuana. It was expressed that there was a very real need to relay information to those who were about to be deported about what they would need to do once they were repatriated back to Mexico. Later I researched the jail in Santa Ana and discovered that, unlike many other detention facilities, in particular those that act as temporary way stations for immigrants prior to being deported, this jail actively developed partnerships with legal and educational organizations in order to provide this type of support to its residents. The jail offers GED preparation courses and tests for high school equivalency, in addition to many vocational and computer/technology courses ("Inmate Education", 2014). With respect specifically to its undocumented population, housed in a separate yet adjacent facility, the jail currently works with non-profit legal aid groups in order to host weekly legal/now your rights workshops for detainees in order to understand their legal situation in the U.S. and potential visas they could apply for.
I find the programs currently being offered at the Santa Ana jail relevant for several reasons. First, they demonstrate that non-formal educational practices increasingly need to extend beyond typical notions of where education can take place. Increasingly it has been accepted that education does not only occur within the formal classroom, as adult education programs in particular demonstrate, however typically those non-formal arrangements occur in worker centers, offices of non-profit organizations, and in community centers. As education is forced to continue to change to access the most inaccessible, non-formal arrangements begin to emerge in even less traditionally accepted places, such as within the walls of a jail or prison. Second, the jail’s program providing workshops to those being detained pending deportation is another interesting step towards providing some type of educational service to a group severely lacking that service and very much in need of it. While currently Santa Ana jail offers only legal advice and workshops in order to show people how to more effectively navigate the system, there is arguably potential to extend this program to include much more.

There are, however, also many controversies surrounding these programs at the jail that are important to mention. First, there is the charge that such programs, while costing approximately $5 million county-wide (including four other locations), have yet to demonstrate the effectiveness of reducing recidivism rates (Hernandez, 2013, para. 3). Critics claim this is a hefty price tag for educational programs that have yet to prove they are effective at rehabilitating inmates. Second, the jail itself has been under increasing scrutiny in the community, particularly after signing the contract with ICE to house undocumented immigrants prior to their deportation. In a city like Santa Ana, where approximately 70% of
the community is of Latin American descent, and of that by some estimates roughly half are undocumented, the community understandably feels under attack (ACLU 90, 2014).

Ultimately, while these educational programs demonstrate efforts arguably in good faith to provide marginalized people, both documented and undocumented, with the means to better their life opportunities with educational programs and courses on life skills, it is also important to mention the sensitivity of the situation given the mass deportation of large numbers of this community.

**The Santa Ana Cultural Center and Developing Cross-border Information Networks**

Another useful example that demonstrates how education is changing shape in order to reach those most in need of it is also found again in the city of Santa Ana, but this time in the form of building power through sharing information across borders. In the case of the Centro Cultural de Santa Ana (or Santa Ana Cultural Center), a growing cross-border immigrant solidarity movement is taking shape today. My last example is this group, that includes both published material on the work they have been doing in the community of Santa Ana, and extends to include some primary source material that was generated from a recent town hall meeting, where the invited guests were advocates, volunteers and staff from the Casa Madre Asunta women and children’s migrant assistance shelter in Tijuana.

In early May of 2014, I was invited to attend an event called Keep Our Families Together, part of a campaign on the part of both the Centro Cultural of Santa Ana and the Casa Madre Asunta to raise awareness within the local Santa Ana community about the increased danger of deportation and what rights people would have if they ultimately faced imminent deportation. Under the federally mandated Secure Communities Program that
went into full effect nationwide in January of 2013, communities like the one in Santa Ana were feeling the effects. In 2012, immigration authorities had identified and deported 6,700 people in Orange County alone (Orange County May Day Coalition, 2013). Organizers decided the event was critical to impart this information to the community, primarily to understand what their legal rights would be if they were deported once they arrived in Tijuana. Of paramount concern was providing parents with the legal information necessary while still on the U.S. side of the border in order to not lose custody of their children. To say that the event was a success would likely be an understatement.

One of the pivotal moments of the night was when the legal advisor for the Casa Madre Asunta shelter presented on the legal ramifications of being deported if one’s children ended up in the hands of the State (in this case, in the United States). Under the Family Reunification Plan (United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement, 2013), there were many requisites that a parent once deported had to comply with in order to retain custody of their children in Mexico. The lawyer went on to describe in detail the amount of time and money the entire process can take, including the requirement to take parenting classes, attend psychological wellness meetings, be tested for drugs and alcohol, and have a place to live and a job indicating the ability to provide for the children once back in their custody. Most in the audience seemed shocked at the labyrinth of requirements that they would be required to fulfill in such a scenario, and a very intense and lively discussion followed the final presentation. A representative from the Mexican consulate was also in attendance, and took the opportunity to speak to the concerned audience about their need to prepare, like in any emergency such as in the event of an earthquake, for their possible deportation. While some may comment on the incredulousness of much of what was said, ultimately the most
significant conclusion to this event was that it had in fact happened, and this time on the U.S.
side of the border.

In my several experiences now working as a volunteer in shelters in Tijuana, I have
had the opportunity to hear many discussions about the importance of women who are
vulnerable to deportation who are still in the United States learning of the difficulties in
obtaining custody of their children in Mexico once they are deported. In a mood of
frustration, organizers and essentially educators have expressed the need to communicate this
pertinent information across the border, so as to help ameliorate the situation for women who
have found themselves in the unfortunate situation of being deported back to Mexico. In this
particular event, an opportunity for education across borders, education that is likely critical
to the families of many in the Santa Ana area, became available through the efforts of two
NGOs, one in the U.S. and another in Mexico coming together to determine how best to
educate this transnational population deeply affected by current U.S. deportation policy.

This particular example provides yet another valuable insight into the potential power
of cross-border solidarity and social movement building. Given the increased power of the
United States to deport undocumented people, and thereby rendering them displaced and
again on the move, educational workshops and events such as this one that took place in
Santa Ana become essential for providing people with important information that will allow
them to most effectively advocate for themselves in what could be considered a worst case
scenario of deportation. This provides a somewhat sobering example of the impact of
education being offered to those who are the most mobile in our society, and therefore it
could be argued, are also the most vulnerable.
Returning to the City of Tijuana

How do the findings from these alternative educational approaches, viewed through the theoretical framework presented, potentially inform similar programs and their development in a migrant assistance shelter in Tijuana, and what would then be the implications beyond the programs themselves and their potential connections to transnational advocacy networks? Another equally pertinent question that remains is if a moving educational program can truly exist for a moving population, if and how would it then be implemented? How viable would an educational program in movement be for people who are also in a sometimes constant state of movement, and how can such programs also directly contribute to the goals of lifelong learning?

Currently there are five different migrant assistance shelters in the city of Tijuana. Of those, two are run by the Scalabrini Missionaries and have been part of the city’s social justice landscape for over a generation. In their women and children’s shelter, Casa Madre Asunta, there are many educational offerings, from know your rights workshops ranging from legal rights to parental rights, human trafficking, and how to find employment in Tijuana. People who stay at the shelter typically are allowed a stay of a maximum of twelve days, and one question to be considered is after that time how many of the women and children remain in the city. This question is critical when considering their potential affiliation with transnational networks, and merits further exploration in the field.

Challenges

One of the key challenges to developing a mobile educational program in the Tijuana shelters is the temporary amount of time that people are allowed to reside there. However,
while this is definitely on its face a challenge, when looking at the example of the centers in the Canary Islands, one thing researchers found was that youth remained in contact with people from the center after they had left, and acted as a necessary social connection in an otherwise unfamiliar environment. Given that it is again possible that many displaced people will remain in the Tijuana area for some amount of time, all the more is there an opportunity for shelters to maintain open contact with former residents, and therefore act as a de facto organizing space for both educational initiatives and possible political action.

Another challenge to the implementation of such a program at the migrant assistance shelters is a lack of documentation and therefore legal protection, both for migrants from another country and also for recently repatriated Mexicans. This can lead to increased vulnerability and also severely limit employment opportunities and other means to establish place and stability, however increased assistance in this area has also been noted in the shelters in order to further empower its temporary residents and help them get more solidly on their feet.

**Opportunities**

One key finding is that the expansion of existing workshops and other educational programs can potentially provide a much-needed educational component for residents while staying at one of the shelters. Aside from critical know your rights training, in particular when it comes to cases of child custody and legal rights for citizens and non-citizens residing in Mexico, opportunities to link educational programs with area employment opportunities is potentially significant. Given that arguably many residents, if faced with the inability to cross into the United States, will likely attempt to stay in close proximity to the border, then
finding employment opportunities in Tijuana becomes critically important, and thus an educational program that can fill the gap could become essential.

In regards to increased connections between the shelters in Tijuana and other popular education groups in the U.S., developing stronger ties and fostering binational educational programs can also lead to the potential strengthening of a strong transnational social movement advocating for the rights of its members, be they considered citizens of the U.S., of Mexico, or elsewhere. By contributing to the growth of a large, transnational network to bring greater awareness and subsequently pressure to policymakers on both sides of the border, these alternative educational programs become central to the work moving forward to create opportunity and a new sense of place in the struggle against endemic displacement.

New Cross-border Social Movements and Links to Education

Much of the work IDEPSCA has done to create empowering popular educational programs for immigrant workers also demonstrates how this educational component built over the long-term into an organization’s grassroots strategy to push for changes at the policy level can make an impact and be crucial in order to build a strong immigration rights movement in Los Angeles. Links between groups such as IDEPSCA with other groups on the Mexican side of the border also become more likely, as both sides become increasingly transnational in nature. As partnerships extend beyond the universities and gradually to other NGOs working to support the rights of displaced persons, it is not at all beyond the realm of the possible that cross-border coalitions and partnerships will grow and strengthen in response to this growing problem.
In addition, the non-governmental organizations from both community and religious groups involved in educating people in Santa Ana through non-traditional spaces also opens up the possibility to connect such events to larger educational projects tied directly to these groups. As examples continue to proliferate in the United States of predominantly immigrant worker centers and advocacy groups explicitly developing educational approaches to growing membership bases, and using the educational arm of their organizations to disseminate information about relevant events in both the local and more global communities that connect them, their membership bases become increasingly active in the political arena, which arguably has had a noticeable impact on politics across the U.S. in recent years. If it is possible to extend an educational program in Tijuana, in close association with these kinds of worker centers like IDEPSCA, effectively we have a transnational educational movement that could complement a larger burgeoning social movement that we are seeing grow today across borders.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

Mexico’s Adult Educational Policy

While many migrants in transit are still being left out of the educational offerings in Mexico, the country’s Department of Public Education (Secretaría de Educación Pública, or SEP in Spanish), still faces the challenge of providing adequate programs for its own citizens, and has been largely unsuccessful to date in its attempts through the INEA, or National Institute on Adult Education, to increase the number of adults it serves in its current educational programs for adults. The INEA, while increasing efforts in the United States to access its citizens in order to provide elementary school educational programs, literacy and
testing services through its Plaza Comunitaria Literacy Program (Medina, 2013, para.4), still continues to face serious challenges in reaching those adults who could benefit from these same programs back home. Interestingly, the focus seems to be on citizens living outside of Mexico than on those living inside of it.

According to the Pew Hispanic Research Center in 2010, 52% of those of Latino descent living in the United States have not completed high school. The number of those who are natively from Mexico is unknown, yet 2000 Mexico census data indicates that 53% of its population has not completed intermediate schooling, roughly the equivalent to high school in the United States (Medina, 2013, para. 2). Given that correlating statistic, it does make sense in some respects that the Mexican educational system would attempt to provide additional educational opportunities and certification to its residents living outside of the country. However, given the lack of similarly robust programs attempting to reach those still living within Mexico, questions arise as to why. The problem is that there has been limited penetration of these educational programs within the adult communities in Mexico, and thus they have also been less effective in the national context. Furthermore, INEA´s literacy and other programs are virtually nonexistent in migrant communities in the country. This is arguably in large part due to political relationships around the issue of migration between the U.S. and Mexico that relate back to the historical waves of emigration Mexico experienced, particularly in the 1990s. The issue of immigration has typically been a contentious one between these two neighbors, where often the critique on the Mexican side has been for the United States to offer more support to its Mexican-born population. However, now that the issue has become more complex and Mexico now has a migrant-displaced persons dilemma.
of its own, it would be remiss for government agencies like the INEA to not develop a strategy for reaching this population and providing similar educational opportunities.

Part of the challenge is being able to reach this moving community, however that problem is easily solved if migrant assistance shelters, with seventy located throughout the country, are seen as alternative educational spaces, and not just as temporary shelters for migrants in transit. By partnering directly with such non-governmental organizations, the Mexican educational system could support these alternative educational frameworks only just beginning to come into place, and therefore directly support many in the growing mobile population in Mexico with its currently existing programs. This can be a reason why public-private partnership in order to reach this displaced population via non-formal educational arrangements with non-governmental organizations could be beneficial in bringing more people living in limbo in Mexico out of the shadows, and therefore could potentially mitigate the level of structural and daily violence that migrants in particular in Mexico confront regularly as they move through the country.

**International Education Policy and the Education for All Framework**

From the global perspective, now more than ever there is a push toward greater educational access and completion of primary education. For example, UNESCO’s Education for All Initiative provides a global educational framework for providing quality, basic education for both adults and children (UNESCO, 2013). This framework allows for increased investment in the region and therefore more educational programming in order to reach higher literacy rates and to provide a basic education, in particular to those who have historically had limited access.
At the World Education Forum in Dakar in 2000, the Education for All Framework for Action was created. The EFA Framework had six primary goals as its objectives. 1. Early childcare and education. 2. Universal primary education. 3. Youth and adult skills development. 4. Adult Literacy. 5. Gender parity and equality. 6. Quality of education. There is also an emphasis on leaving no one behind in the latest global monitoring report (UNESCO, 2014). This framework laid out in Dakar was a concerted call to governments to rid disparities in particular to access to education for children – particularly girls, working children, refugees, those displaced by war and disaster, and children with disabilities (UNESCO, 2002). The focus for the purposes of this thesis is on those displaced by war and disaster, because I would like to suggest that migrants and other displaced persons not necessarily fitting neatly within these above categories should also be served by this important international framework. Furthermore, as increasingly migrants in transit are themselves children, there is even more of a necessity to reach this population through any means necessary, including through the provision of less traditional educational programs by those groups with the most direct access to them.

According to the most recent global monitoring report released by UNESCO, *Teaching and Learning: Achieving Quality for All*, “it is vital to track progress towards education goals for the most disadvantaged groups after 2015, and to put policies in place that maintain and accelerate progress by redressing imbalances” (UNESCO, 2014). While the primary focus of such reports is on adult literacy and universal primary and lower-secondary school access, which is targeted at the development of adequate capacity in the formal education arena, there seems a glaring omission by explicitly stating that the most
marginalized and disadvantaged need to be assisted, while continuing to not include migrants in these analyses.

Education for All could explicitly emphasize goals to include adults in its aim to provide a basic education for all world citizens. Adult literacy (Goal #4 in the framework) is important but not adequate, and while there is potential to develop programs focusing on building adult skills (Goal #3), there needs to be a more concerted effort on the ground level to reach those who have virtually no access to these basic programs, regardless of status in the host country. One of the proposed ways to do that will be to reach out beyond the currently existing, formalized frameworks and educational spaces that do exist, and to other, still untapped potential points of interaction with some of the world’s most inaccessible. Some of those points exist within these migrant assistance shelters that are increasingly linked to transnational networks and international non-governmental organizations (INGOs).

Rethinking Binational Relationships

As Mexico continues to align its national immigration laws with its international treaty obligations, and particularly with the recent inclusion of education as one of the basic rights for migrants in transit, there is an opportunity to explicitly provide a space for migrants in the educational conversation in the country. Alternatively in the United States, which more recently relies on a strategy of enforcement, incarceration and deportation with respect to its undocumented population, there are now opportunities to partner with both governmental and non-governmental groups in Mexico that are working on educational platforms accessible to those who have been forcibly displaced. Of special consideration are those who were raised in the United States, but due to lack of legal status are increasingly
being deported back to Mexico. As of yet the Mexican government has no clear strategy of assimilation, including access to education, for those who are returned to their country of birth.

One recommendation aside from location sites for possible educational projects for people on the move is to create direct partnerships between recently repatriated Mexicans and migrants coming from other countries on their journey north through Mexico through a combined educational strategy aimed at providing both groups with a meaningful opportunity. Given that both literacy and lack of high school completion are significant problems in the migrating community, and that typically those returning to Mexico from the U.S. have a higher degree of educational attainment, there is a suggestion that the two could work together in supporting new educational projects. There is also a need for those returning to Mexico to be provided with ways to validate their studies from the U.S. and be given the proper certification in order to be more effectively assimilated into Mexican society and no longer be vulnerable to continued displacement.

By increasing pressure on policymakers in both U.S. and Mexican governments to support and fund the development of innovative educational programs at non-traditional sites for this transit and vulnerable population, the likelihood that these displaced global citizens can find more meaningful place in this world will only increase. This type of support would provide the growing displaced community of Mexico with an invaluable measure of support in securing a more stable and productive place in society.
VII. CONCLUSION

Simply because a person is forced by circumstance to leave home behind, due to natural disaster, physical coercion, or lack of economic opportunity, should not also mean having to leave behind the right to find a productive and fulfilling place in this world. I hope this research will benefit those who are being left to fall between the cracks of today´s world, where economic globalization has benefitted some but also forced many into the margins of political and civic life. Despite this rupture, there has been a correspondingly strong response from civil society and from nation-states themselves that are now host to many people who have been displaced by this rapid restructuring. This is clearly a situation of crisis where there has yet been little opportunity at these points of contact along the Mexican migrant trail, or as Wendy Vogt (2012) refers to them as the “depots”, to process or discuss collectively what has happened, or to have any type of additional services beyond the basics required in an emergency-type situation. The emphasis so far for the most part has been on this emergency, short-term assistance, and there has been little discussion subsequently in the literature of anything beyond that, but clearly the tide is turning.

Mobile and when necessary cross-border educational programs need to be at the center of a larger and more inclusive strategy for nation-states in their discussion about what education needs to be in this twenty-first century. For the displaced global citizens of today, whose numbers continue to increase at an alarming rate, programs reaching beyond the confines of community centers and classroom walls simply cannot come fast enough. The scale of the problem is urgent. These displaced communities have been designated by international law to retain certain rights such as to an education, yet in the actualization of such rights, to date they are in name only. As national governments such as in Mexico
attempt to gradually bridge the divide between national laws and international treaties, there is some hope that eventually avenues will be found to connect these laws to realities on the ground. As migrants are now entitled to an education equivalent to their citizen peers, this is arguably the perfect moment to suggest partnerships and programs that could be most readily accessible and relevant to them.

Global governance is an idea that in theory and in practice requires new social movement actors, and in particular transnational movements, to be actively engaged in the political conversation in order to ensure effective democratic practice and strengthened democratic institutions. Part of the answer it could be argued does not exist within the confines of the nation-state, as this growing transnationalism can attest; therefore a cross-border, collective response becomes essential in order to move state actors into effective positions to advocate for supportive educational policy measures that are beneficial on both sides of the border. For the purposes of this thesis, policy that is beneficial to displaced persons and provides them with alternative avenues to education becomes critical to ensure an effective global strategy of education for all.

In short, the challenge along the U.S.-Mexico border will not be solved by any top-down policy prescriptions that are not actively informed by those on the ground working in non-governmental organizations with more direct access to those currently existing outside of the more formal educational networks. These solutions also will likely not come from one government or nation-state alone. What it requires is a much more comprehensive strategy that will also challenge previous notions about nation-state sovereignty and autonomy. The potential to help us get to the future where education can be a reality for more than just those who are privileged enough to be able to stay in place.
Adult popular education, when provided, can lead to a **conscientization** and empowerment, allowing people to strategize ways to deal with improving their situation together. This is where transnational social movements and increased membership within them becomes critical, as they build power collectively across and over borders in order to push for increased visibility and allocation in developing new and adaptable non-formal educational systems that meet contemporary needs. What we are talking about here is beyond education – schooling - as we typically know it. Education is a tool, a means to an end that when calibrated correctly can be used for greater inclusion and equity for people who due to current global trends have little choice but to learn while on the move.
VIII. REFERENCES


Inmate Education: Behind the walls of the Santa Ana jail, constructive and rehabilitative programs are taking place for incarcerated inmates. (2014). Retrieved from Santa Ana Jail website at [http://www.ci.santa-ana.ca.us/pd/inmateeducation.asp](http://www.ci.santa-ana.ca.us/pd/inmateeducation.asp)


Moreno, R. (2011, October 14). Migration through Mexico discussion with director of SEJEMI. Mexico City, Mexico. Personal interview.


