UC Irvine UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

North Siberian Lakes: A Methane Source Fueled by Pleistocene Carbon

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/277895b1

Journal

Science, 277(5327)

ISSN

0036-8075

Authors

Zimov, SA Voropaev, YV Semiletov, IP <u>et al.</u>

Publication Date

1997-08-08

DOI

10.1126/science.277.5327.800

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

Peer reviewed

North Siberian Lakes: A Methane Source Fueled by Pleistocene Carbon

S. A. Zimov, Y. V. Voropaev, I. P. Semiletov, S. P. Davidov, S. F. Prosiannikov, F. S. Chapin III,* M. C. Chapin, S. Trumbore, S. Tyler

The sizes of major sources and sinks of atmospheric methane (CH₄), an important greenhouse gas, are poorly known. CH₄ from north Siberian lakes contributes ~1.5 teragrams CH₄ year⁻¹ to observed winter increases in atmospheric CH₄ concentration at high northern latitudes. CH₄ emitted from these lakes in winter had a radiocarbon age of 27,200 years and was derived largely from Pleistocene-aged carbon.

The highest concentration and greatest seasonal amplitude of atmospheric CH₄ occurs at 65° to 70°N. Concentrations are highest in March to April and lowest in summer (1). Photochemical oxidation of CH₄ contributes to the low summer levels (2) but does not explain why the seasonal amplitude of atmospheric CH_4 is twice as high in the Northern as in the Southern Hemisphere, given large summer effluxes from North American bogs and tundra (3, 4) and modest CH_4 fluxes from Siberian wetlands (5). Between August and April, 5.8 Tg (1 Tg = 10^{12} g) of CH_4 accumulate in the atmosphere north of 60°N (6). Highlatitude winter fluxes measured in a muskeg and a peatland were only 10 to 12% of the annual total (4, 7), an insufficient flux to explain a winter maximum in atmospheric CH₄. Here we provide evidence for a large winter CH₄ source from Siberian lakes.

In the Pleistocene, most of the northern Siberian plains were unglaciated and accumulated ~400,000 Tg of organic C in sediments (8) (mainly derived from plant roots), similar to the total C in the terrestrial biosphere (9). These sediments contained abundant ice (40 to 70% of soil volume) (10–12), which began melting during the Holocene to form thermokarst (thaw) lakes that now make up ~30% of the landscape. These lakes migrated across the north Siberian plains during the Holocene (10), releasing to the atmosphere an average of 170 to 220 g C m⁻² year⁻¹, including ~16 g CH₄ m⁻² year⁻¹; we esti-

Y. V. Voropaev and I. P. Semiletov, Pacific Oceanographic Institute, Far-East Branch, Russian Academy of Sciences, Vladivostok, Russia.

F. S. Chapin III and M. C. Chapin, Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720–3140, USA.

S. Trumbore and S. Tyler, Department of Earth System Sciences, University of California, Irvine, CA 92697–3100, USA.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail fschapin@socrates.berkeley.edu.

mate that half of this CH_4 was derived from Pleistocene C (13). Siberian lake sediments produce CH_4 bubbles in lakes throughout the year (14), particularly near shores with active erosion. During winter, the bubbles form koshkas, which are flat bubbles of CH_4 in lake ice separated by ice films that periodically sublimate and release CH_4 to the atmosphere. In areas where CH_4 ebullition (bubbling) is most active, channels through the ice remain open all winter.

To evaluate the significance of this source, we incubated Pleistocene sediments from an eroding lakeshore with lake water. The yield was $65 \pm 3 \text{ mg CH}_4 \text{ g}^{-1}$ sediment at 15°C (mean \pm SE, n = 3) over 12 months, equivalent to 5% of the C originally present in the soil; $26 \pm 2 \text{ mg CH}_4 \text{ g}^{-1}$ were emitted at 3.5°C , and $19 \pm 2 \text{ mg CH}_4 \text{ g}^{-1}$ were emitted at 0°C. These data indicate that the C in Pleistocene sediments is sufficiently labile to support methanogenesis and that, although methanogenesis is temperature-sensitive, it occurs at substantial rates at 0° to 3.5°C .

To determine whether methanogenesis in lake sediments is currently fueled by Pleistocene-aged organic matter, we measured stable and radiocarbon isotopes of CH₄ emitted by ebullition from two representative thaw lakes near Cherskii, Republic of Sakha (Yakutia), Russia (69°N, 161°E). CH₄ collected from these lakes in winter (April) had an average ¹⁴C age of 27,200 years (Table 1). This age indicates that Pleistocene sediments deposited 20,000 to 40,000 ¹⁴C years ago (11) contributed 68 to 100% of CH_4 flux from these lakes. In contrast, CH_4 emitted in the summer (July) had an average ¹⁴C age of 9,200 years, indicating that Pleistocene C fueled 23 to 46% of summer methanogenesis and thus that more CH₄ was produced in the younger surface sediments, which are warmer in summer than winter (10). Thus, about half of current annual methanogenesis is fueled by Pleistocene C. In contrast, CH₄ from Alaskan lakes was only 200 years old (15) because Alaska lacks extensive Pleistocene sediments.

The δ^{13} C value of CH₄ collected from Siberian lakes was -71 to -73 (Table 1). This value is less than that produced in summer by Alaskan tundra lakes ($\delta^{13}C$ = -61 ± 2 (15) or North American wet tundra ($\delta^{13}C = -66$ to -63) (15, 16). These values imply that the Siberian winter-collected CH4 was not as oxidized as in these other environments, or that there was an isotopic difference in substrate or a different pathway of methanogenesis (17). The hydrogen isotopic composition of the CH_4 was variable, but most samples from the Siberian lakes were low ($\delta D = -370$), indicative of a biotic source for CH_4 , low oxidation rates in the water column, and CH_4 production by fermentation (17, 18).

We measured CH_4 ebullition fluxes from two thaw lakes using large funnels suspended beneath the ice (19). CH_4 fluxes were generally highest from October to January (Fig. 1), when deep sediments had their annual thermal maximum (10). Fluxes were highly variable within a season; fluxes were highest at

Table 1. Isotopic data for CH_4 collected from sediments in two thaw lakes in Pleistocene sediments in the Kolyma lowlands. Results are given as percent modern C, or 100 times the ratio of ${}^{14}C/{}^{12}C$ in the sample divided by the ${}^{14}C/{}^{12}C$ ratio in 1895 wood (corrected for ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$ differences) (27, 28).

Lake no.	Lake depth (m)	$\delta^{13}C$	¹⁴ CH ₄ age	Modern C (% of CH ₄ -C)	δD
			Summer		
13	5	-69.5	*	*	
	7	-69.6	11,731 ± 360	23.2 ± 1.0	
	10	-71.8	8,330 ± 240	35.3 ± 1.0	
	10†	-72.1	8,370 ± 180	35.1 ± 0.8	
	10†	-	8,330 ± 100	35.3 ± 0.4	
Average:		-70.8 ± 0.7	$9,200 \pm 800$	32 ± 3	
			Winter		
13	2	-75.1	*	*	-169
	10	-80.0	38,000	0.2	-430
14	4†	-72.7	$28,670 \pm 850$	2.8	-479
	4†	-	$27,230 \pm 730$	3.4	_
	10	-65.3	$15,000 \pm 150$	15.3	-391
Average:		-73.3 ± 3.1	$27,200 \pm 4700$	5 ± 3	-370 ± 70

*Not determined. †Subsamples analyzed separately

S. A. Zimov, S. P. Davidov, S. F. Prosiannikov, North-East Scientific Station, Pacific Institute for Geography, Far-East Branch, Russian Academy of Sciences, Republic of Sakha, Yakutia, 678830 Cherskii, Russia.

Table 2. Summary of CH_4 fluxes from Siberian lakes during times of increasing (August to April) and decreasing (May to July) atmospheric CH_4 , based on values presented in the text.

Flux	Area (% of lake)	Area-averaged CH_4 flux (g CH_4 m ⁻² year ⁻¹)		
component		May-July	August–April	Annual
Ebullition flux				
Lake center*	80	0.3	1.0	1.3
Lake shore*	20	1.0	3.1	4.1
Overflow	100	0	0.5	0.5
Diffusion	100	0.5	0.4	0.9
Lake total (g CH₄ r	m^{-2} year ⁻¹)	1.8	5.0	6.8
Siberian total (Tg	CH₄ year ⁻¹)	0.5	1.5	2.0

*Averaged over the entire lake area. Ebullition flux near the lake shore is a conservative estimate that does not include CH_4 released through koshkas.

times of low atmospheric pressure, as in north temperate lakes (20). The average CH_4 ebullition flux in centers of lakes (80% of the lake area) was $4.7 \pm 2.3 \text{ mg CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ day}^{-1}$ (90 measurements). Near eroding lake shores, fluxes were so high that they frequently overturned the collection funnels; the flux (2 cm^3) min^{-1} , n = 25; 90% CH₄) emitted from open holes in the ice (300 ha⁻¹) was 56 mg CH_4 m^{-2} day⁻¹. In addition to open holes, there were koshkas (400 to 1000 ha^{-1}) containing 1 to 100 liters of 50% (25 to 75%) CH_4 (n = 8) that vent CH_4 several times each winter and provide an additional unquantified CH₄ source. Sediments in these lakes released 22 g $CH_4 m^{-2}$ (38 ± 12 liter m⁻² of 80% CH_4 , n = 3) in September, when we disturbed the sediments (15), but <5 g CH₄ m⁻² a month later. This large CH4 release over 1 month provides independent evidence for a large CH₄ ebullition flux.

 \dot{CH}_4 can also move to the atmosphere in winter in overflow, when the weight of winter snow pushes the ice below the equilibrium water level of the lake. The CH_4 concentration in overflow water decreases from 1.7 mg CH_4 liter⁻¹ (21) to <0.01 mg CH_4 liter⁻¹. The 30 cm of overflow that typically accumulate on lakes of the forest zone would thus release 0.52 g of dissolved CH_4 m⁻² year⁻¹.



Fig. 1. Time course of CH_4 flux from the center of a thaw lake near the forest-tundra border 100 km south of the Arctic Ocean near the Kolyma River Valley (69°N, 161°W) in northern Siberia (19).

The average summer diffusive flux measured in 19 lakes along a climate transect inland from the Arctic Ocean was 7.6 \pm 1.4 mg CH₄ m⁻² day⁻¹ (60 measurements) (21), a value similar to that in Alaskan lakes (6.8 \pm 1.3 mg m⁻² day⁻¹) (22). The 19 lakes had 3.1 \pm 0.7 mg m⁻² of dissolved CH₄ in March, indicating that winter accumulation of CH₄ is typical of north Siberian lakes.

We estimate the total annual flux of CH₄ for the lakes in our study region to be at least 7 g CH₄ m⁻² year⁻¹ (Table 2), \sim 50% of the potential flux we estimated (16 g CH_4 m⁻² year⁻¹) from regional C inputs to lakes. Approximately 75% of this flux occurs in winter. If these fluxes are typical of Siberian lakes, these lakes would emit $\sim 1.5 \text{ Tg CH}_4$ in winter (2 Tg CH₄ annually). This is small relative to global sources (18) but is 25% of the highlatitude winter accumulation of CH4 in the atmosphere. If high-latitude warming trends (23) continue, thawing of permafrost would increase, and methane flux from Siberian thaw lakes would act as a positive feedback to climate warming.

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- I. Fung *et al.*, *J. Geophys. Res.* **96**, 13033 (1991).
 M. A. K. Khalil and R. A. Rasmussen, *ibid.* **88**, 5131
- (1983).
- 3. W. S. Reeburgh and S. C. Whalen, *Ecol. Bull.* **42**, 62 (1992).
- S. C. Whalen and W. S. Reeburgh, *Global Biogeo*chem. Cycles 6, 139 (1992); *ibid.* 2, 399 (1988).
- V. A. Samarkin, E. M. Rivkina, E. A. Bocharnikova, in Methane Biogeochemistry in Arctic Marsh Soils, D. A. Gilichinsky, Ed. (Russian Academy of Sciences, Pushchino, Russia, 1992); T. R. Christensen, S. Jonasson, T. V. Callaghan, M. Havström, J. Geophys. Res. 100D, 21035 (1995).
- The atmosphere north of 60°N has about 380 Tg CH₄ [8% of the total global atmospheric CH₄ pool of 4800 Tg (*18*)] and increases during winter by 1.5% (25 ppb) (*1*), amounting to 5.8 Tg.
- 7. N. B. Dise, Biogeochemistry 17, 71 (1992).
- We estimate that 400,000 Tg C accumulated in Pleistocene loess from soil volume (1 × 10⁶ km², 40 m depth) (10, 11) and C density (1 g cm⁻³ of soil × 1.08 ± 0.04% organic C; n = 46 sites throughout Siberia; 0 to 50 m depth) (12).
- D. S. Schimel, Global Change Biol. 1, 77 (1995).
 S. V. Tomirdiaro, Lessovo-ledovaia formatsia Vostochnoi Sibiri v pozdnem pleistotsene i golotsene (Nauka, Moscow, 1980).
- 11. Y. K. Vasil'chuk, Izotopno kislorodnyi sostav podzem-

nykh l'dov (Soveta po kriologii zemli Rosiiskoi Akademii Nauk i Severo-Vostochnogo nauchno proizvodstvennogo Kompleksa Ekotsentr, Moscow, 1992), vol. 1.

- S. V. Gubin, Paleograficheskie aspekty pochvoobrazovanila na primorskoi nizmennosti severa lakutii (Akademiia Nauk, Institut Pochvovedeniia i Fotosintesisa, Pushchino, Russia, 1987).
- 13. We estimate 120 g C m^{-2} year⁻¹ input of Pleistocene C to lakes, assuming that 400 kg C m⁻² were initially in Pleistocene sediments (8) and that $0.3 \times 10^6 \text{ km}^2$ of lakes (24) migrated across 90% of the plains during the last 10,000 years (10). We estimate Holocene C input to lakes assuming that the erosion rate for lakes 1 km² in area is 0.5 to 1.0 m year⁻¹ (10) (that is, 0.05 to 0.1% of lake area) and that the lakes receive 100 kg m⁻² organic C from vegetation (3 to 10 kg m⁻²), peat (0 to 200 kg m⁻²), soil (7 to 30 kg m⁻²), and upper 3 m of permafrost $(20 \text{ to } 60 \text{ kg m}^{-2})$ $(10, 11, 25) = 50 \text{ to } 100 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ of}$ lake area. We do not know the contribution of in-lake production plus dissolved organic C inputs to CH₄ fluxes, so we used values measured in Alaskan oligotrophic tundra lakes lacking major erosional inputs: 0.7 g CH₄ m⁻² year⁻¹ (22). If 5 to 10% of this C input were converted to CH₄ in anaerobic sediments (26), this would vield an annual flux of ~16 (9 to 23) g CH₄ m⁻² year-
- S. A. Zimov and S. M. Govorushko, *Mate. Glatsiol. Issled.* 37 (1979).
- C. S. Martens, C. A. Kelley, J. P. Chanton, J. Geophys. Res. 97D, 16689 (1992).
- P. D. Quay, S. L. King, J. M. Lansdown, W. O. Wilber, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles* 2, 385 (1988); M. Wahlen *et al.*, *Science* 245, 286 (1989).
- M. F. Whiticar, E. Faber, M. Schoell, *Geochim. Cos*mochim. Acta **50**, 693 (1986).
- R. J. Cicerone and R. S. Oremland, *Global Biogeo*chem. Cycles 2, 299 (1988).
- 19. We measured CH₄ flux in conical 8-m² plastic traps anchored beneath the ice surface, which funneled CH₄ bubbles into collection flasks. Samples were collected every 0.5 to 10 days, depending on flux. Fluxes from seven other chambers in two lakes were similar to those shown but gave incomplete seasonal data due to winter ice damage. Water depth was 10 m. CH₄ content of recently produced bubbles was >80% CH_{4} , as determined (±1% accuracy) by gas chromatography (GC). Each sample was analyzed on both a TSVET-530 and a Shimadzu 14A GC with a thermal conductivity detector and a flame ionization detector, respectively. We used data from the thermal conductivity detector if CH₄ concentration was >1%; otherwise, we used data from the flame ionization detector. By running all samples through both detectors, we cross-calibrated the two analytical methods. CH₄ concentration of samples that remained in collection flasks >24 hours declined due to diffusion into the water column. In these cases, we estimated CH_4 content as 0.8 \times gas volume.
- 20. M. D. Mattson and G. E. Likens, *Nature* **347**, 718 (1990).
- 21. We sampled 19 lakes in June, August, September, and March along a climate gradient (4° to 12°C July mean temperature) from the Arctic Ocean to boreal forest (68° to 70°N) in the Kolyma Lowland for dissolved CH₄ at 1-m-depth intervals through the water column. Lake depth and sediment types were representative of north Siberian lakes. Samples were analyzed for CH₄ within 24 hours (19). We used the boundary-layer model and meteorological assumptions of Kling et al. (22) to estimate diffusive flux during ice-free months when atmospheric CH₄ was increasing (August to September) or decreasing (June to July) based on measurements of surface-dissolved CH4 concentration in June, August, and September. Data are available to Science Online subscribers at www.sciencemag.org
- G. W. Kling, G. W. Kipphut, M. C. Miller, *Hydrobiologia* 240, 23 (1992).
- W. L. Chapman and J. E. Walsh, *Bull. Am. Meteorol.* Soc. **74**, 33 (1993); K. R. Briffa, P. D. Jones, F. H. Schweingruber, S. G. Shiyatov, E. R. Cook, *Nature* **376**, 156 (1995).
- S. E. Mostakhov, in Mezhdunarodnaia conferentsiia po merzlotovedeniiu, Podzemnye vody kriolitosfery, N. I. Tolstikhin, Ed. (lakutskoe Knizhnoe Izdatel'stvo, lakutsk, Russia, 1973), vol. 5.
- K. Van Cleve and V. Alexander, *Ecol. Bull.* 33, 375 (1981); E. Gorham, *Ecol. Appl.* 1, 182 (1991); G. L.

Michaelson, C.-L. Ping, J. M. Kimble, *Arct. Alp. Res.* **28**, 414 (1996).

- J. D. Hamilton, C. A. Kelly, J. W. M. Rudd, R. H. Hesslein, N. T. Roulet, *J. Geophys. Res.* 99D, 1495 (1994).
- M. Stuiver and H. Polach, *Radiocarbon* **19**, 355 (1977).
- 28. Samples were collected directly into glass serum vials from ebullition flux (15). Before analysis, water was added to vials to maintain high internal pressures, the sample was shaken vigorously to get dissolved CH_4 out of

solution, each sample was transferred to a 6-liter stainless steel container with a syringe, and analytical grade-zero air was added. CH₄ was separated from each sample and combusted. A subsample of the resulting CO₂ was analyzed for ¹³C/¹²C by mass spectrometry, and the remaining CO₂ was catalytically reduced to graphite (29), and its ¹⁴C/¹³C values measured by atomic mass spectrometry at the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory.

29. S. C. Tyler, J. Geophys. Res. 91, 13232 (1986); D. C.

Sizes and Ages of Seamounts Using Remote Sensing: Implications for Intraplate Volcanism

Paul Wessel

Satellite altimetry was used to identify and characterize Pacific intraplate seamounts. The gravimetric amplitudes of seamounts appear to be related to the age difference between the sea floor and seamounts; by inverting this relation, pseudo ages can be obtained for undated seamounts. These pseudo ages imply that excursions in seamount volcanism generally correlate with times of formation of large oceanic plateaus.

The Pacific plate may support more than 50,000 seamounts taller than 1 km, yet \sim 50% of these undersea volcanoes are uncharted because of sparse bathymetric coverage (1, 2). Even fewer (<1%) have been sampled for radiometric dating (3), making assessment of temporal fluctuations in intraplate volcanism uncertain. Because electromagnetic sensing devices cannot penetrate the oceans, we are unable to image the sea floor remotely and instead must rely on surface ships equipped with sonar. At the present rate of data acquisition, complete bathymetric coverage may take centuries. However, the density contrast between seawater and the sea floor basalt gives rise to gravity anomalies. These minute variations in Earth's gravitational pull cause seawater



Fig. 1. Theoretical VGG over an isostatically compensated seamount of radius *R* and height *H* (14). The amplitude v_0 and zero-crossing distance *d* are the two clearest characteristics of the anomaly.

to be attracted to seamounts, leading to a sea surface (which approximates the geoid) whose shape reflects these underlying feaLowe, C. A. Brenninkmeijer, S. C. Tyler, E. J. Dlugkencky, *ibid.* **96**, 15455 (1991); J. S. Vogel, *Radiocarbon* **34**, 344 (1992).

 We thank G. W. Kling, W. S. Reeburgh, M. S. Torn, and M. Wahlen for constructive criticism and the Russian Fund for Fundamental Research, the International Science Foundation, and U.S. Department of Energy for financial support.

10 April 1997; accepted 30 June 1997

tures (4). Thus, since the early 1980s, satellite altimetry has provided broad coverage of the sea surface or geoid undulations (5). Early attempts to map the seamount distribution were largely limited by the coarseness of the satellite coverage [the typical track spacing was >100 km (6)], and many seamounts went undetected. Because seamounts are typically much smaller than 100 km, it was difficult to estimate what part of the seamount had been traversed by the satellite, leading to large uncertainties in estimates of seamount height and diameter (7).

Recently, the U.S. Navy declassified its Geosat satellite altimetry, which has been combined with the European Space Agency



Fig. 2. Equal-area Hammer projection showing all 8882 seamounts found on the Pacific plate; the sizes of crosses reflect the VGG amplitudes. Blue crosses are small seamounts (30 to 60 Eötvös units, generally <2.5 km tall), red crosses are large seamounts (>120 Eötvös units, generally >3.5 km tall), and green crosses are of intermediate size. The Eltanin fracture zone is indicated.