The relationship between Mexican American cultural values and resilience among Mexican American college students: A mixed methods study

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2gd718qt

Journal
Journal of Counseling Psychology, 60(4)

ISSN
0022-0167

Authors
Morgan Consoli, ML
Llamas, JD

Publication Date
2013-10-01

DOI
10.1037/a0033998

Peer reviewed
The Relationship Between Mexican American Cultural Values and Resilience Among Mexican American College Students: A Mixed Methods Study

Melissa L. Morgan Consoli and Jasmin D. Llamas

Online First Publication, August 19, 2013. doi: 10.1037/a0033998

CITATION

The current study investigated the role of cultural values in the resilience of Mexican American college students. Utilizing mixed methodology, 124 self-identified Mexican American college students were asked to complete an online survey, including a demographic questionnaire, the Resilience Scale, Mexican American Cultural Values Scale, and 2 open-ended questions concerning overcoming adversity and cultural values. As hypothesized, Mexican American traditional cultural values (Familismo, Respeto, Religiosidad, and Traditional Gender Roles) predicted resilience, with Familismo accounting for the majority of the variance. Consensual qualitative research (Hill, Thompson, & Nutt Williams, 1997) was used to identify emergent domains and themes within the open-ended question responses. Traditional Mexican American Value themes included Familismo, Ethnic Identity, Religiosidad, Perseverance, and Respeto. Results highlight the important role that certain Mexican American cultural values play in providing strength for overcoming adversities.

Keywords: resilience, Mexican American, college students, cultural values, mixed methodology

The Mexican American population makes up approximately 10% of the U.S. population, 66% of Latino/as in the United States, and is the fastest growing Latino/a subgroup (U.S. Census Bureau, 2010); yet, only 6% of Mexican Americans obtain a bachelor’s degree (U.S. Census Bureau, 2004). Latina/o college students report higher levels of academic, financial, and personal stress than White students (Quintana, Vogel, & Ybarra, 1991), as well as experiencing unique challenges such as acculturative stress, discrimination, and an unwelcoming campus climate, which can negatively impact academic performance, self-confidence, and college completion (Nuñez, 2009; Rodriguez, Mira, Myers, Morris, & Cardoza, 2003). Less information has been garnered regarding the strengths that may help counteract these negative influences, although many Mexican Americans display well-being despite adversities (Alegria et al., 2008; Morgan, 2007).

Cultural values are a significant part of Mexican American identity and serve as protective factors for Mexican Americans (Germán, Gonzales, & Dumka, 2009). Adherence to cultural values remains intact regardless of acculturation level (Rueschemberg & Burial, 1989) and has been linked to positive outcomes for adolescents, such as increased academic engagement (Gonzales et al., 2008), prosocial behaviors (Knight, Cota, & Bernal, 1993), and help-seeking behavior (Ramos-Sanchez, 2009). These positive behaviors can be seen as indicative of resilience; however, cultural values have not been directly examined as predictors of resilience.

Many Latino/a adolescent students find themselves needing to adapt to the mainstream culture while also maintaining ties with the culture of origin; this in turn may cause pressures to live by certain ethnic standards at home while also experiencing pressures to conform at school and in the broader community (Padilla, 2006). As it has been suggested that certain values may promote positive outcomes, it is important for cultural values to be studied when trying to understand a Mexican American college student’s ability to be resilient.

Mexican American Cultural Values and Resilience

Cultural values play a large part in the everyday lives of many Mexican Americans (Cardoso & Thompson, 2010; Mendez-Negrete & Saldana, 2004). Although some research on cultural values has been conducted under the umbrella term Latina/o, there are distinct cultural beliefs, values, and behaviors among subgroups, making it important to determine specific propensities in the adaptive behavior of these different, yet related cultural groups.

Traditional Mexican American cultural values include familismo (familism), the traditional gender roles of machismo and marian-
ismo, religiosidad (religiosity), and respeto (respect). 

Research has indicated negative correlates of cultural values, such as respeto being associated with increased problem behaviors in U.S. society (Pantin, Schwartz, Sullivan, Coatsworth, & Szapocznik, 2003) and familism associated with substance abuse (Unger et al., 2002); however, less research has been conducted on cultural values and positive outcomes (Gonzalez, Fabrett, & Knight, 2009).

Familismo is the cultural value most studied with relation to positive outcomes. It includes the belief that family is fundamental and takes precedence over individual needs (Losada et al., 2010). Among adolescents, familismo has been found to be a significant source of inspiration during adversity, a contributor to academic motivation and self-esteem, and encourages the desire to repay parents for sacrifices made in immigrating to the United States (Ong, Phinney, & Dennis, 2006; Parra-Cardona, Bulock, Imig, Villaruel, & Gold, 2006). Additionally, it is a source of support and guidance in difficult times (Germán et al., 2009) and has been found to be the most important contributor to life satisfaction among Mexican American youth (Edwards & Lopez, 2006).

Religiosidad, or the belief in a greater power and prayer, often takes the form of Catholicism in Latino/a cultures (Gloria & Pereyoy, 1996). It has been found to be protective against mental health issues in college students (Granillo, 2012) and to be a source of hope and resilience in Mexican immigrants to the United States (Morgan Consoli et al., 2011).

Respeto is respect and deference paid to an individual’s position, including different family members. It includes suppression and discouragement of negative feelings toward parents and extended family members, and particularly male figures in authoritarian atmospheres (Comas-Diaz, 1985). Respeto also encompasses being respectful in intimate relationships and is a necessary ingredient for harmonious interpersonal relations (Welland & Riber, 2008).

Familismo, respeto, and religiosidad together have been linked to positive outcomes such as academic engagement (Germán et al., 2009), and the related constructs of interpersonal support and faith have been found to help Mexican Americans deal with adversities in their lives (Morgan, 2007; Cardoso & Thompson, 2010). Although some of the cultural values have been linked and seen as protective factors, more clear ties to resilience have not been fully described, let alone established.

Traditional Mexican American gender roles have commonly been linked to negative outcomes such as increased suicide in women and increased substance abuse in men (Alegria & Woo, 2009). Machismo includes men’s leadership roles and feelings of responsibility toward family as well as a newer conceptualization including caballerismo, or family loyalty and chivalry (Arciniega, Anderson, Tovar-Blank, & Tracey, 2008). Marianismo serves as the complement to machismo, with women possessing humility, nurturance, familial devotion, and spiritual superiority (Kulis, Marsiglia, & Hurdle, 2003), and has more recently been conceptualized to include other values such as simpatia (avoiding conflict and maintaining harmony in relationships) and respeto (discussed more below) (Castillo, Perez, Castillo, & Ghosheh, 2010). Although historically associated with more negative outcomes (Moreno, 2007), some of the more recently recognized traditional gender role behaviors may actually lead to more positive outcomes that help in overcoming adversity—a matter worth studying.

The overall purpose of the current, exploratory study was to examine the relationship between Mexican American cultural values and resilience in college students. Specifically, the following research questions were addressed: (a) What cultural values do Mexican American college students describe as contributing to their ability to overcome adversity? (b) How do Mexican American cultural values relate to resilience? and (c) Do traditional Mexican American cultural values (familismo, traditional gender roles, religiosidad, and respeto) predict resilience?

To address these research questions, a QUAN + QUAL mixed methods design (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2011) was used, in which quantitative and qualitative data collection occurred simultaneously, and all data were given equal weight. An advantage of mixed methods design is complementarity, a function of triangulation, in which different phenomena are addressed by different research questions, that is, using quantitative and qualitative methods to provide greater depth and breadth in investigation of a phenomenon than could be gained from a single method (Greene, 2007). The purpose is not convergence or confirmation across data, but a “jigsaw” fitting together of the data to form a more complete picture (Erzberger & Kelle, 2003). Qualitative research was used to address the first two research questions exploring cultural values that Mexican American college students felt contributed to overcoming adversity, whereas quantitative methodology examined cultural values as predictors of resilience.

Method

Researchers

The principal investigator, a female Counseling Psychology faculty member, identifies as having mixed identity (Mexican, Scottish, Irish). The secondary investigator, a female doctoral student in Counseling Psychology, also identifies as having mixed identity (Mexican, Salvadoran). Both investigators began the research project believing that resilience is a potential in all individuals and that cultural variables play a role in its manifestation.

Participants

Participants were 124 self-identified Mexican/Mexican American, English-speaking public university students from a central California university (n = 37, or 30% men and n = 87, or 70% women). Twelve percent were first generation (born outside the United States), 73% second generation (parents born outside the United States), 11% third generation (grandparents born outside the United States), 3% fourth generation (great grandparents born outside the United States), and 1% fifth generation (great-great grandparents born outside the United States). Participants ranged from freshman to graduate students (21% freshman, 19% sophomores, 24% juniors, 25% seniors, and 11% graduate students), age 18–47 (M = 21.02, SD = 3.89).

Procedure

Participants were recruited through the university’s campuswide e-mail system. Recruitment e-mails briefly described the study and

---

1 Spanish terms are used except when a study explicitly used the English word.
participant rights, and requested voluntary participation. Criteria for participation required self-identifying as Mexican American, being 18 or older, and speaking English. Students clicked on a link to access a secure website and begin the survey, indicating their consent to participate. Online data collection was used to reach large numbers of students using a familiar medium. All participants completed the entire questionnaire and were entered into a raffle to win one of two $50 gift cards. Human subjects approval was obtained from the university’s Internal Review Board.

Instruments

Demographic questionnaire. This self-report questionnaire was created by the researchers for the purposes of this study and used to obtain age, gender, generational status, and class standing from the participants.

Resilience Scale. The Resilience Scale (RS; Wagnild & Young, 1993) is a 25-item scale, measuring individual resilience as defined by positive personality characteristics that enhance individual adaptation and predict quality-of-life satisfaction. RS items are positively worded, and responses are on a Likert-type scale ranging from 1 (agree) to 7 (disagree), with higher scores indicating higher levels of resilience. RS scores have been highly correlated with measures of morale, life satisfaction, and depression (Wagnild & Young, 1993). Test–retest correlations range from .67 to .84 (p < .01). The RS has been recommended in studies with adolescents (Ahern, Kiehl, Sole, & Byers, 2006) and used with young adult Mexican American women (Lindenberg et al., 2002) and Latino/a college students (Llamas & Morgan Consoli, 2012). Internal reliability estimates for these studies ranged from .72 to .95. Reliability for this study is in Table 1.

Mexican American Cultural Values Scale. The Mexican American Cultural Values Scale (Knight et al., 2010) is a 50-item scale, measuring individual resilience as defined by positive personality characteristics that enhance individual adaptation and predict quality-of-life satisfaction. RS items are positively worded, and responses are on a Likert-type scale ranging from 1 (agree) to 7 (disagree), with higher scores indicating higher levels of resilience. RS scores have been highly correlated with measures of morale, life satisfaction, and depression (Wagnild & Young, 1993). Test–retest correlations range from .67 to .84 (p < .01). The RS has been recommended in studies with adolescents (Ahern, Kiehl, Sole, & Byers, 2006) and used with young adult Mexican American women (Lindenberg et al., 2002) and Latino/a college students (Llamas & Morgan Consoli, 2012). Internal reliability estimates for these studies ranged from .72 to .95. Reliability for this study is in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subscale</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Resilience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Family Support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Family Obligation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Family Referent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Respect</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Religion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Gender role</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td>144.47</td>
<td>23.65</td>
<td>18.51</td>
<td>15.74</td>
<td>27.91</td>
<td>19.34</td>
<td>8.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>15.30</td>
<td>4.32</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>5.86</td>
<td>9.57</td>
<td>3.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliability (α)</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.97</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < .05. ** p < .01.
effects of family obligation, support, referent, and religion, traditional gender roles accounted for an additional 1% of the variance in resilience ($\Delta R^2 = .01$), $\Delta F(1, 117) = 1.30, p > .05$ (see Table 2).

**Qualitative Analysis**

All participants provided responses to the two open-ended questions. Responses ranged from one sentence to multiple paragraphs. Researchers followed consensual qualitative research (CQR) methodology (see Hill et al., 2005; Hill, Thompson, & Nutt Williams, 1997) to analyze the responses until all data were discussed and categorized. A coding scheme was created reflecting all emergent themes. Cross-analysis was then completed by both members to improve trustworthiness. CQR labeling terminology was used to delineate the frequency of categories identified (see Table 3). The coded data were reviewed by an external auditor (a Caucasian, female, Counseling Psychology faculty member with multicultural and CQR experience). Feedback was incorporated into the coding scheme.

Six domains emerged from analysis of participants’ responses: Familismo, Ethnoc Identity, Religiosidad, Gender Roles, Perseverance, and Respeto. Familismo was coded when participants referred to their family as an important aspect of their lives that helped them through difficult times. Exemplary quotes included: “I think family unity is a very strong value that influences how I deal with problems. . . . Their support in hard times is very important to me, and their opinion weighs greatly when making decisions” and “Being Mexican, when I have a personal problem, I talk to family, and they give me advice. Their advice is very important, and I value it above friend’s opinions.”

Ethnic Identity was coded when a participant discussed how he or she identified ethnically and how it was a factor in overcoming adversity. Quotes describing the role of ethnic identity included: “I take strength from my heritage because that is an element inescapably represented to me by my family members and other people from similar cultural backgrounds” and “My identity says a lot about who I am. . . . I am extremely proud to say that I am Mexican American, and that because of my identity I have learned to get up from the many times people have put me down.”

The domain of Religiosidad was defined as the belief in or worship of a superhuman power and/or practice or activities associated with this belief. Illustrative quotes included: “My being Catholic, I try to pray when I get into new things I have never tried before,” “I try to turn to God when I am troubled and I want to try to turn to Him more than just when I need Him,” and “Always believe in God, pray with faith!”

Several participants discussed their views on Gender Roles, in general and in a family context, and how they affected dealing with adversities. For example, “. . . I need to be a man by taking control and not exhibit any form of feminine emotions such as crying. I need to be firm on my decisions and refrain from any acts that would seem . . . like a woman” and “Since I am the oldest child . . . I have responsibility to show everyone the right path to be successful and happy . . . .”

Perseverance entailed participants persisting despite the difficulties they faced. Exemplary quotes included: “Mexican American identity influences how I deal with problems in ways that reflect values of the Mexican culture. It is one that advocates ambition, determination, and constant struggle to overcome” and “To be Mexican American is to know there are many problems in this world but no matter what to never falter and keep going. In my family, even if we can’t walk, we find a way to crawl.”

Respeto was characterized by the benefit of having regard for others, particularly family and elders. Examples included: “Having been raised in a family that teaches to respect elders or else I would be punished with a belt or slap to the face. This helps me to deal with difficult people . . . because I was taught to respect people . . .” and “I feel that because I am Mexican American I have more respect for my family.”

Some participants who had moderately high to high resilience indicated no relation between their cultural values and their ability to overcome problems, but nevertheless referred to helping factors that encompassed possible cultural beliefs or values. For example,
“I don’t see a connection at all. I solve my problems through sheer willpower and God’s assistance” and “I don’t believe that me being Mexican American influences how I deal with problems. Always work hard, family is important.”

Discussion

In the current study, we explored the role of Mexican American cultural values in resilience. A unique contribution of the study was that quantitative and qualitative methodologies were used simultaneously to interpret the data. An additional value is that this study focused exclusively on Mexican American college students, rather than the umbrella population of “Latinos/as.” Although the study does not propose essentialism in the interpretation of findings about Mexican American individuals, it is helpful to information about how individuals who identify with a specific ethnic group and cultural values overcome adversities, and how they see this as relevant or not.

Complementarity of Findings

The quantitative and qualitative findings in this study fit together to provide additional support for the role of cultural values in resilience, a previously underexplored area. For example, in the current study, familismo was a strong predictor variable of resilience as well as a predominant qualitative theme that was discussed as a means for overcoming adversity (typical response). The importance of familismo to Mexican Americans has been well documented (Santiago-Rivera, Arredondo, & Gallardo-Cooper, 2002) as has its utility in helping adolescents cope with academic challenges (Morgan Consoli et al., 2011). It therefore makes sense that this cultural value would be predictive of resilience, but it is important that counseling psychologists recognize the broad array of meanings that this cultural value can have, from nostalgia for home or the past, to connection with family, to help in decision making (Smith-Morris, Morales-Campos, Castañeda Alvarez, & Turner, 2013). This study helped to highlight ways in which familismo is helpful for obtaining resilience.

Respect/respeto and religiosidad/religiosidad, although not uniquely significant predictors of resilience, were nevertheless discussed (variant responses) in answer to the open-ended questions. Perhaps this indicates that respecto and religiosidad, although valued by Mexican Americans, are not singularly necessary ingredients to overcoming adversity and instead may be a part of the process involved, that is, helpful but not necessary. In particular for Mexican American college students, as the U.S. higher education system is often reflective of more mainstream cultural values, respeto and religiosidad may not be necessary, or at least not required for succeeding in this environment.

Traditional gender roles did not correlate with resilience or serve as a unique predictor of resilience, and only a few participants (rare response) discussed valuing traditional gender roles and finding them helpful in dealing with problems. This may be explained by findings that behaviors inconsistent with traditional cultural gender roles, such as leaving the family to go to college, may lead to change of values with the acculturative aspects of attending college (Phinney & Flores, 2002). Research has shown that women (70% of our sample) who adhere to traditional roles are less likely to attend college (Cardoza, 1991), and those who do may exhibit behaviors inconsistent with traditional gender role values (Buriel & Saenz, 1980). Holding traditional gender role values may therefore actually be incongruent with resilience for Mexican American college student participants in this study.

Additional qualitative domains emerged from participant responses that help to identify important factors in resilience. For example, Perseverance was mentioned often in the open-ended question responses (typical response). Study participants felt that to “keep going” was both a cultural variable and a necessary factor in their ability to overcome adversities. This finding could be related to a Mexican cultural phenomenon, perhaps best captured by the word aguantar in Spanish, which means to “endure” or “hold up.” This cultural value may stem from Native American culture, in which one seeks to accept nature, not to fight it (Shorris, 2001). Continuing to endure in the face of adversities reflects the very definition of resilience, which suggests that perseverance may be a key cultural value in resilience for these Mexican American college students.

A few participants (rare response) also described Ethnic Identity and Pride as important values contributing to resilience. Research has documented positive relationships between ethnic identity and well-being across a variety of ethnically diverse samples (Umana-Taylor, 2004). An important distinction differentiates ethnic identification (i.e., the label with which a person chooses to identify) and ethnic identity (i.e., the “broader social and psychological process associated with the meaning invested in ethnic identification”; Quintana & Scull, 2009, p. 84). Given this distinction, participants who discussed ethnic identity may or may not have lives that reflect the broader social and psychological processes associated with the term itself. Additionally, research has shown that different individuals may have different ethnic identity pathways that lead them to different meanings for the ethnic identities (Syed, Azmitia, & Phinney, 2007). More detailed questioning is needed to determine the level of ethnic identification and the meanings for his or her ethnic identity that each individual possessed.

Despite most participants indicating how traditional Mexican American values helped them overcome adversity, it is interesting to note that some participants discussed their resilience as having nothing to do with their ethnic identities. It appears that these Mexican American college students were not always aware of identity issues or that their ethnic awareness has decreased with acculturation and/or education, as has been suggested to occur (Arbona, Flores, & Novy, 1995). Additionally, perhaps their ethnic identifications did not encompass the broader implications of ethnic identity. In other words, even though they technically identified as Mexican American, they may not have fully integrated this sense of identity into their sense of self (Quintana & Scull, 2009), creating the possibility of being ethnically identified with Mexican American culture, but not being psychologically identified with the cultural values affiliated with Mexican American culture.

Implications for Practice

The growing number of Mexican American college students necessitates consideration of what can best help them to overcome adversities. The current study suggests that for counseling psychologists working with these students, adherence to overall tra-
ditional cultural values must first be assessed. In particular, the presence and value of family is of sizable importance and would need to be explored and considered as a possibly valuable resource. Additionally, the value of perseverance could be investigated as a strength, focusing on what familial and cultural messages have been received surrounding this value and how it may help in the college setting. Finally, some of the participants indicated valuing religiosidad, ethnic identity, respeto, and traditional gender roles, indicating that these areas may be worth exploring in working with other Mexican American college students as individual sources of strength. Within-group differences should also be taken into consideration, as education and college attendance, acculturation and enculturation, as well as level of ethnic identification may affect some of these values. Some students may not be as aware of identity and cultural issues as others, necessitating an exploratory approach by those working with them.

Limitations and Future Directions

Several limitations exist within the study. First, the current sample included more females than males. This could have affected the reporting of values. Another possible limitation was that the wording of the qualitative questions may have inadvertently explored problem solving rather than overall resilience. Problem solving may be a part of resilience, but not necessarily represent the entire process. Future questioning could include more pointed attempts at capturing specific aspects of resilience, such as problem solving. Additionally, qualitative answers often included broader topics than the quantitative items, which could be explored in future studies by including more scales or more focused qualitative questions.

Future studies might have a larger sample size, enabling further integration of mixed methodological results. For example, quantitative results might be stratified by people who mentioned a particular variable in the open-ended response, and then that group was analyzed quantitatively. Finally, participants in this study have likely already had to embrace mainstream U.S. values to some extent as they were socialized into the university. Future studies could look at Mexican American community members to see whether the same results are found. Additionally, investigating parental acculturation and identification with Mexican American values as a variable that might affect children’s ethnic identification (Bernal, Knight, Ocampo, Garza, & Cota, 1993) and examining biculturalism, which is a correlate of better adaptive processes (Coatsworth et al., 2005), as possible mediating factors for cultural adaptation (Gonzales et al., 2009) is recommended. These variables may account for additional variance not explained by the cultural variables.

Some findings may be predicated on the levels of identity development of the participants. For example, many individuals “rejected” discussion of cultural values affecting their lives, stating that they were unique individuals or that culture had nothing to do with who they are. This valuing of autonomy countered the traditional value of fatalism, which indicates that control is outside of oneself (Cuellar, Arnold, & Gonzalez, 1995). However, theory suggests that changes produced by cultural processes may be dependent on the developmental stage of the individual (e.g., Knight, Jacobson, Gonzales, Roosa, & Saenz, 2009). Furthermore, research by Gloria and Kurpis (1996) highlights the possibility that students may change or hide their racial/ethnic values in order to feel accepted within the university environment. A future direction may be to examine identity development and perceptions of the university environment with regard to cultural values and resilience to determine the presence of mediation or moderation.

References


Received September 30, 2012
Revision received June 14, 2013
Accepted June 28, 2013