Title
Volume I: A Musical Analysis of Three Settings of the Twenty-third Psalm, Volume II: Breathing &amp; Where Shadow Chases Light

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3cr414bn

Author
Fruchtman, Aaron

Publication Date
2013

Peer reviewed|Thesis/dissertation
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
RIVERSIDE

Volume I
A Musical Analysis of Three Settings of the Twenty-third Psalm

Volume II
Breathing
&
Where Shadow Chases Light

A Thesis submitted in partial satisfaction of the degree requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
in
Music
by
Aaron J. Fruchtman
August 2013

Thesis Committee:
Dr. Timothy Labor, Chairperson
Dr. Byron Adams
Dr. Walter A. Clark
The Thesis of Aaron J. Fruchtman is approved:

_________________________________

_________________________________

_________________________________

Committee Chairperson

University of California, Riverside
Acknowledgements

My deepest thanks and respect to my committee: Dr. Walter A. Clark, Dr. Byron Adams, and Dr. Timothy Labor – thank you for pushing me to do my best work. Thank you to my wife, Poppy, for her editorial advice, love, and support.
# Table of Contents

**Volume I**

I. Stanford: *The Lord is My Shepherd* ............................................................... 2

II. Vaughan Williams: *The Pilgrim’s Progress* .................................................. 15

III. Bernstein: *Chichester Psalms* Movement II ............................................. 22

Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 35

Bibliography ............................................................................................................. 38

Appendix 1 ................................................................................................................. 39

Appendix 2 ................................................................................................................. 42

**Volume II**

Text ............................................................................................................................. ii

*Breathing* .................................................................................................................. 1

*Where Shadow Chases Light* ................................................................................. 13
List of Musical Examples

Fig. 1.1 – Bedřich Smetana, *Má vlast*, Mvt. 2, mm. 1-4........................................2

Fig. 1.2 – Ludwig Van Beethoven, *Symphony No. 6*, Mvt. 5, mm. 1-5..................2

Fig. 1.3 – Vaughan Williams, *The Lark Ascending*, mm. 5-9.................................3

Fig. 1.4 – Table of verses in Stanford’s setting of *The Lord is My Shepherd*........4

Fig. 1.5 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 1-6............4

Fig. 1.6 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 12-17............5

Fig. 1.7 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 71-74............6

Fig. 1.8 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 74-78.............7

Fig. 1.9 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 110-118........8

Fig. 1.10 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 183-85........10

Fig. 1.11 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 188-89........11

Fig. 1.12 – Charles Villiers Stanford, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 200-201........11

Fig. 1.13 – Tonal areas in Stanford’s setting of *The Lord is My Shepherd*.............13

Fig. 2.1 – Ralph Vaughan Williams, *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, mm. 1-3.................17

Fig. 2.2 – Ralph Vaughan Williams, *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, mm. 20-21...............19

Fig. 2.3 – Ralph Vaughan Williams, *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, mm. 42-43...............20

Fig. 3.1 – Claudio Monteverdi, *Possente spirto* from *L’Orfeo*, mm. 47-48............24

Fig. 3.2 – Tonal Table of *Chichester Psalms* Mvt. II...........................................24-5

Fig. 3.3 – Leonard Bernstein, *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, m. 1...........................25

Fig. 3.4 – Serial analysis of *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, mm. 1-11......................27

Fig. 3.5 – Tone row from serial analysis of *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, mm. 1-11...27
Fig. 3.6 – Leonard Bernstein, *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, mm. 31-2.........................28

Fig. 3.7.1 – Leonard Bernstein, *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, mm.3-7..........................30

Fig. 3.7.2 – Leonard Bernstein, *Chichester Psalms*, Mvt. II, mm.55-7.........................30
The Twenty-third Psalm of David, as ordered in English translations of the Bible, portrays God as a shepherd leading his flock. The psalm is influential in Jewish and Christian traditions. King David, to whom Jews traditionally ascribe authorship of Psalm twenty-three, was himself a shepherd, which gives this specific text added resonance for worshippers. Christians identify Jesus as the “Good Shepherd” from the Gospel of John.\(^1\) This song of praise is also part of the Jewish weekly liturgy. Jews and Christians associate Psalm twenty-three with funerary rites, and its recitation is designed to engender spiritual comfort. The first line of the psalm, “The Lord is my shepherd”, is also its colloquial title.

Over centuries, dozens of composers have created choral or vocal settings of this psalm, including Johann Sebastian Bach, Anton Bruckner, Franz Schubert, Herbert Howells, Randall Thompson, and Samuel Adler, with each composer contributing his own aesthetic, religious, and mystical sentiments. The musical settings of the Twenty-third Psalm by three English-speaking twentieth-century composers – Charles Villiers Stanford, Ralph Vaughan Williams, and Leonard Bernstein – are particularly compelling in this regard due to their use of text painting, motivic development, harmony, meter, and emphasis or omission of biblical verses.

\(^1\) John 10:1-21
Chapter 1: Stanford: *The Lord is My Shepherd*

Sir Charles Villiers Stanford’s (1852-1924) anthem *The Lord Is My Shepherd*, for mixed choir (SATB) and organ, was published by Novello and premiered at Trinity College chapel on May 7, 1886. The setting begins in 6/8, a meter associated with physical movement. The inherent motion of the meter is likely used by Stanford to signify the soul’s spiritual journey from life to death. In addition, 6/8 is also a common pastoral trope used to represent flowing water. Bedřich Smetana tone paints the Moldau River in the second movement of *Má vlast*, with its gentle ripple depicted by a solo flute (fig. 1.1) and its swells portrayed by full orchestra. Ludwig van Beethoven begins the fifth movement of his Symphony No. 6 (in F Major) in 6/8 with a folk-like theme, which the composer referred to as the *Shepherd’s Hymn* (fig. 1.2). Similarly, Vaughan Williams’s *The Lark Ascending* is in 6/8 and is filled with pastoral signifiers, including solo violin trills that imitate bird calls (fig. 1.3). As Raymond Monelle explains, “it seems that the common pastoral meter in 12/8 or 6/8, may be associated with the playing of the

---

Abruzzi shepherd who descended to Rome at Christmastime; that, indeed the siciliana itself may be no more than a refinement of the music of the pifferari.”

**Figure 1.3. Vaughan Williams, *The Lark Ascending*, mm. 5-9**

Stanford places the anthem in the key of F major, perhaps another pastoral tradition. The first movement of Beethoven’s aforementioned *Pastoral Symphony* is also in F major. Likewise, the setting of Psalm twenty-three by Ralph Vaughan Williams (analyzed later in this essay) begins on an F major chord and is rooted in a major mode (F Mixolydian). Composer Emil Pauer states, “the key in music is what color is in painting… F major reflects peace, joy, religious sentiment, or passing regret.” In addition, two important signifiers of the pastoral are the shepherd’s recorder and hunting horn, both often tuned in F. While Stanford is not as explicit in his pastoralism as Vaughan Williams, he uses applicable rural musical elements in setting this psalm about a shepherd.

---


5 The Psalms discussed in this thesis can be found in their entirety in Appendix 1.
Fig. 1.4. Table of verses in Stanford’s setting of *The Lord is My Shepherd*:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verse</th>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Vocal Texture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7-17</td>
<td>The Lord is my shepherd…</td>
<td>Homophonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>16-40</td>
<td>He shall feed me…</td>
<td>Homophonic &amp; Polyphonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>41-74</td>
<td>He shall convert my soul…</td>
<td>Homophonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>79-166</td>
<td>Yea, though I walk…</td>
<td>Homophonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>167-183</td>
<td>Thou shalt prepare a table…</td>
<td>Homophonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>183-224</td>
<td>But Thy loving kindness…</td>
<td>Polyphonic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 (2nd 1/2)</td>
<td>224-241</td>
<td>For Thou art with me…</td>
<td>Homophonic w/ embellishment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The six-measure organ introduction, in two parallel phrases (fig. 1.5), firmly defines the key of F major with root motion in the pedal part and a diatonic melody in the upper voice. The inner voices contain three stepwise descending parallel sixths that are applied later motivically in a contrasting harmonic and dramatic manner and might be viewed as a spiritual movement motive. The choir enters in m. 7 with a homophonic chorale texture, confirming the key of F major with a IV - I₆- IV₆ - V₇ - I progression.

Mm. 12-14 repeat the first verse, this time ending on the dominant. The first verse is divided in half, with “The Lord is my shepherd” sung by full choir, and the second half, “therefore can I lack nothing,” by sopranos. The first section of the verse contains mainly stepwise motion, while the soprano line leaps down a sixth (from F to A) and then a seventh (D to E) on the word “lack.” This orchestrationally exposed leap is dramatic and
emphasizes the text by personalizing the soprano statement and separating it from the chorale texture.

Stanford’s setting of the second verse spans twenty-five measures (mm. 16-40) in which the texture becomes slightly contrapuntal. The basses enter on a C with “He shall feed me,” followed by tenors, altos, and sopranos, respectively. Stanford fills the accompaniment of verse two (specifically in mm. 16-28) with a transformed version of the spiritual movement motive in the right hand part of this passage (fig. 1.6). By

**Figure 1.6. The Lord is My Shepherd, mm. 12-17**

![Image](image1.png)

eliminating the lilting offbeat eighth notes from the motive of descending sixths, Stanford reduces the sense of motion and accent, consequently enhancing the comforting vision evoked by the text. The soprano line in mm. 19 and 29 suggests proud faith in its leaps of ascent. The spiritual movement motive is reduced to a single melodic line in the bass of the organ and inverted (now ascending) in mm. 29-31. Then, in m. 40, G major is prepared with a $V_66/\text{♭VII}$ (C major) - Ger$_{65}$ - I$_{64}$ (G major) progression in the organ, while the a cappella choir sings verse three (at a dynamic of piano), “He shall convert my soul.” This rare moment without the organ highlights the choral text and evokes a particularly restrained and sacred moment of hope.

---

6 The organ plays in all measures but twelve out of 241.
The harmonic progression during the words “for his Name’s sake” (mm. 70-73) is $\text{ii}^6_4$ ($A^\circ$), Ger.65, to a dominant D pedal, over which the organ reprises material closely derived from the spiritual movement motive (fig. 1.7). Stanford ends verse three with a cadence in G minor (m. 74). The vocal texture and melodic contour of this verse’s last Figure 1.7. The Lord is My Shepherd, mm. 71-74

four words foreshadow the subsequent verse and its musical material. On the word “Name’s,” the choir unites on a two-octave D holding it over three measures before resolving by leap to the tonic on the word “sake.” The long-held octaves perhaps convey hope that the “Name” will provide comfort, as mentioned in earlier verses, but the combination of a descending leap to the brief utterance of “sake” with a G minor chord suggests a questioning of the afterlife.

The transitional section from mm. 74-78 (fig. 1.8) further expands the spiritual movement motive. In mm. 1-6, the organ right hand leaps to consonant intervals while the left-hand part gently steps down in parallel sixths. In this section, the material metamorphoses into a canon at the octave, with a slightly quicker melodic line that starts with four notes descending stepwise, before rising a half step, and then leaping down a fourth. In this way, the motive transforms from an optimistic and consonant pastoral affect to one that is ominous and dissonant, preparing listeners for the next verse.
In the opening of verse four (mm. 79-91), Stanford uses a striking octave for the words, “Yea, though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death.” The canon from the transition continues in both hands of the organ while the melodic contour of the choral melody (soprano) slowly descends on the words “valley of the,” before making two dramatic descending leaps during “shadow of death” (a fifth, and then a sixth). The accompanimental descending motive and downward shape of the melody thus paint the soul’s journey through shadowy darkness. The words (mm. 91-98 – “I will fear no evil”) convey hope. Stanford continues the octave texture during “I will”, and focuses attention on the word “fear” through a short melismatic four-part voicing of a V7 (E♭7) chord. The organ part is reduced to a generally rising stepwise pedal line (mm. 92-97) below a stepwise chorale texture that concludes on a V chord (E♭ major) in m. 98. In mm. 74-91, the monophonic right hand organ part illustrates the soul’s loneliness through the “valley of the shadow of death,” while the left hand organ texture thickens.

A four-measure transition (mm. 99-102) using the canonic version of the spiritual movement motive modulates to C minor for a second statement of the fourth verse. In m. 103, the choir returns to octaves and the organ part continues in the new key. Then a dramatic change in accompaniment occurs at m. 110, when the organ strikes a D pedal with a thickly voiced Ger42 (on F♭) in the new key of A♭ minor (fig. 1.9). In m. 112, the
organ pedal and right-hand chord continue to hold, while the left hand doubles the choir’s melody. The choir’s voice leading in mm. 110-119 contains dramatic leaps on the words, “shadow of death.” Stanford unveils his musical metaphor in this phrase. The harmony Figure 1.9. *The Lord is My Shepherd*, mm. 110-118

shifts from C minor to A♭ minor (m. 107), and then features six measures of a German augmented sixth chord (mm. 110-115), followed by seven measures of the German augmented sixth chord of F major (mm. 116-122). The interval of a minor sixth, is the element for modulation away from the tonic. Stanford’s progressions in the other verses mainly follow common harmonic functional succession such as found in the circle of fifths. However at this pivotal verse, Stanford structures his harmonies based on the sixth, suggesting that the interval contains significant meaning for the composer in this composition. The harmonies in mm. 104-110 are constructed in a scheme with a root a minor sixth above the previously stated chord: C minor (m. 104) - A♭ minor (m. 106) - F♭ major. This chord progression instills a mystical meaning behind the minor sixth structure. For Stanford, the chromatically saturated harmonies represent shadowy darkness, or at least, a loss of control that compels the believer to pray. The sustained
notes in the organ and the octave choir create a cold sonority, emphasizing the lonely and apprehensive soul’s passage through gloom.

This darkness disappears after the second statement of “I will fear no evil,” and a return to the key of F major (mm. 123-128) at a dynamic of piano. The melodic contour climbs on a high A (m. 148) for the first sopranos during another rare a cappella moment with the word “rod.” Mm. 152-166 repeat, “comfort me”, three times. All three vocal settings are harmonically consonant and end on the tonic: ii - iii₆ - I₆₄, I₆₄ - I₆₄ - I₆₄, and vi₇ - ii₄₃ - I₆₄. In the wake of a section that explored disparate harmonic progressions and employed an organ pedal alteration (a consonant F and a dissonant E), this harmonic stability, combined with the text, suggests a confirmation of faith. Stanford returns to F major, but includes this dissonance in the organ to represent the soul gaining wisdom through experience. Stanford’s harmonic vocabulary cannot return to an unadulterated F major tonality – much as a mortal soul cannot regain a state of grace.

M. 167 features a double bar line and a change to common time after the previous F major chord. This metrical change is important both dramatically and musically. Stanford shifts from the lilting phrases of the first three verses and the sinking crisis of verse four to a more predicable anthem-like statement in the fifth verse. The soul has followed the shepherd through “green pastures,” “waters of comfort,” and the “valley of the shadow of death.” The soul no longer needs to travel because it is with the Lord. The fifth verse (mm. 167-182), in the relative key of D minor, is sung solely by male voices. The voices sing stridently at forte, “Thou shalt prepare a table before me against them that trouble me: Thou anointest my head with oil and my cup shall be full.” The organ
writing is less florid and more sporadic. At m. 183 (another double bar), the harmony modulates into the parallel key of D major for verse six, initially sung only by the sopranos. This orchestrational change highlights the feminine side of God through “kindness and Thy mercy.” The theme is stated alone because it contains several melodic fragments that become motivically important, and the listener must first become familiar with them before Stanford can repeat, vary, and transform them throughout the rest of the verse. The two elements that become crucial are a stepwise pattern, reminiscent of Baroque ornamentation, and a leaping arpeggiated melody (fig. 1.10).

**Figure 1.10. The Lord is My Shepherd, mm. 183-85**

Starting in m. 192, Stanford contrapuntally develops the original soprano melody in a manner that would have been familiar to Anglican listeners accustomed to hearing both chorale and canon in the same work. As such, Stanford elaborates the idea of comfort implied by the text with an expression of contentment in the form.

At m. 192, the basses enter with one measure of the original soprano melody (m. 183) before adopting a supporting role. The tenors enter one measure later (m. 193) with an additional layer of counterpoint. Then the altos enter an eighth note after the tenors with another statement of the soprano melody at the original pitch level. Lastly, the sopranos contribute another layer of counterpoint, one measure after the altos with a melody related to both the original soprano melody and the tenor line (m. 193), at an interval of a fourth above (D). The organ keyboard part doubles the choral parts over
extended pedal tones. The canon-like pattern of delayed entrances continues in mm. 197-199, this time in the order: tenor, alto, soprano, and bass. In m. 200 the soprano regains the main melody (and the contrapuntal writing is halted) with the interrupted repeated note theme (fig. 1.11). While the sopranos sequence this theme a fourth higher

**Figure 1.11. The Lord is My Shepherd, mm. 188-89, Interrupted motive**

(m. 201), the alto and tenor rhythms are augmented (eighth notes turn to quarter notes), the altos at a fifth below (D), and the tenors a sixth below the altos (F♯). Stanford assigns the basses a rhythmically augmented version of the repeated note theme but they begin one measure after the altos and tenors (fig. 1.12).

**Figure 1.12. The Lord is My Shepherd, mm. 200-201, Rhythmic augmentation**

A ii (g minor) - V⁰⁷ (C⁰⁷) - I (F major) cadence reestablishes the key of F major in mm. 203-204. The text from verse six is repeated, and the counterpoint continues for three more measures before a return to the homophonic chorale texture in m. 207. In mm. 211-213 the “interrupted” repeated note theme is canonically stated by each voice two beats after the other: tenor stating the theme first (C), then alto a fifth above (G), then soprano an octave above (C), and lastly the bass an octave below (C). In mm. 208-221
Stanford emphasizes secondary dominants with a six-chord progression, which does not conclude with a modulation; instead he eventually confirms the original key of F major.

In mm. 234-236, the harmonic rhythm slows with a final statement of the words “comfort me,” sung through a ii\(^7\) (g minor\(^7\)) - V\(_2\) (C\(^7\)) - iii\(_6\) (a minor) - I (F major) progression. The sopranos sing an unprepared 9-8 suspension over the tonic chord. The organ doubles the vocal suspension, and continues with a chain of three more unprepared suspensions: IV 6-5, V/IV 9-8, and IV 6-5. The composition is complete (and resolved) at m. 236, but Stanford continues with a sublime extension. The E\(\flat\) in m. 238, which changes the function of the F major chord to a dominant, is surprising because listeners expect to hear the chord as the tonic. However, this unexpected reharmonization is consistent with Stanford’s desire not to return to an uncomplicated version of F major after the dark journey through verse four. The final measures resolve with a plagal cadence, which suggests an unspoken Amen at the end of the piece.

Fig. 2.4, at the beginning of this chapter, demonstrates the form of the composition and the importance Stanford places on certain verses. The disproportionate size of the fourth verse\(^7\) reveals two insights into Stanford’s compositional and philosophical beliefs. The fourth verse is approximately located at two-thirds (the golden section) through the piece. Additionally, verse four provides the crucial two elements of the Twenty-third Psalm: the “shadowy” journey and the “comfort” of knowing God is “with me.” The comforting element is likely the purpose of Stanford’s setting as he

---

\(^7\) Roughly 43% of the setting utilizes text from verse four.
enlarges verse four and reiterates themes and text from the second half of verse four at the end of the composition.⁸

**Figure 1.13. Tonal areas in Stanford’s setting of The Lord is My Shepherd:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
<th>Key</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-28</td>
<td>F Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29-35</td>
<td>B♭ Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-40</td>
<td>G Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41-63</td>
<td>G Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64-73</td>
<td>C Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74-101</td>
<td>G Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102-106</td>
<td>C Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>107-115</td>
<td>A♭ Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>116-166</td>
<td>F Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>167-182</td>
<td>D Minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>183-203</td>
<td>D Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204-241</td>
<td>F Major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 1.13 illustrates the unusual tonal journey of Stanford’s setting and, with the text, articulates the form. The significance of the interval of a sixth to Stanford’s overall message is crystallized in this overview. In mm. 104-110, Stanford emphasizes root motion by the interval of a sixth. In the broader proportion of the overall tonal areas, key areas also progress by this interval of a sixth. During the second statement of verse four (mm. 102-106), Stanford returns to C minor. In m. 107, Stanford modulates to A♭ minor, the key furthest removed from the original key of F major, and a sixth above C minor. This distant tonality perhaps implies that the “valley of the shadow of death” is spiritually detached from the Lord. Stanford continues to modulate by sixth to the key of

---

⁸ Stanford has greater textual freedom in an anthem as opposed to an Anglican liturgical setting.
F major for the comforting second half of verse four, “for Thou art with me.” This intervallic superstructure implies that the message of verse four is sharply incongruous with the composer’s understanding of the other five verses. Is evil only temporary, while hope and kindness are enduring?

Stanford’s setting of the Twenty-third Psalm reinforces the concept of God as the provider of shelter, and though we may pass through dark and mournful times, His “kindness and mercy” (repeated four times by Stanford) will “comfort” those in need of solace. The organ represents faith in Stanford’s setting of the consoling psalm. The choir is not metaphorically independent; it requires the organ, similar to religious adherents seeking an invisible partner in their faith. The organ represents a shepherd walking next to the soul, portrayed by the choir. Another look at fig. 1.4 demonstrates the varied vocal textures in verses two and six. Perhaps polyphony is a metaphor for acquiring knowledge in life. While most of the setting is homophonic, the texture gains wisdom through the journey of life. As the setting progresses, the complexity of the material increases through the use of counterpoint, rhythmic variation, and harmonic schemes demonstrating the soul’s journey towards the infinite. Traditional sacred music devices – such as chorale settings, polyphony, and emphasis on the plagal cadence – provide musical reassurance to the mournful listener.
Chapter 2: Vaughan Williams: *The Pilgrim’s Progress*

Ralph Vaughan Williams (1872-1958) created his setting of the Twenty-third Psalm in Act IV, scene ii of his “morality”9 *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, which was premiered at the Royal Opera House, Covent Garden on April 26, 195110. This setting appeared originally in a one-act opera from 1921-22, *Shepherds of the Delectable Mountains*, which was incorporated into the longer *The Pilgrim’s Progress*. The work is based on John Bunyan’s allegory of the same name, one of the most influential books of English Christian theology. Before the First World War, Vaughan Williams was an atheist. As his second wife, Ursula Wood, stated, he “later drifted into a cheerful agnosticism: he was never a professing Christian.”11 Composing music for a morality might seem peculiar for Vaughan Williams who comfortably set texts by Walt Whitman, William Shakespeare, A.E. Housman, and Dante Gabriel Rossetti. However, Nathaniel G. Lew explains the cultural, if not religious significance of this work to the English people and Vaughan Williams in particular: “Even to nineteenth-century readers with little sympathy for a narrative of salvation and the triumph over sin the book offered a nostalgic picture of the English country life of the seventeenth century and was an accessible literary link to the tradition of religiosity which so many otherwise secular

---

9 Vaughan Williams referred to this musical work as a morality, not an opera.
Britons (still) hold dear.”\textsuperscript{12} Indeed, he took liberties with the libretto and transformed the allegory into a more universal narrative, declaring, “I want the idea to be universal and apply to anybody who aims at the spiritual life whether he is Xtian, Jew, Buddhist, Shintoist or 5\textsuperscript{th} Day Adventist.”\textsuperscript{13}

This setting has two interesting textual peculiarities. First, the soprano and shepherds sing the psalm while the Pilgrim sings text from Bunyan’s 	extit{Pilgrim’s Progress} concurrently and in response. Second, Vaughan Williams omits verse five\textsuperscript{14} from the psalm setting entirely. There is always meaning behind a composer’s alteration of a text or libretto, whether it be philosophical, spiritual, or – occasionally – for prosody’s sake. This raises the question of why Vaughan Williams alters and omits some of the text. First, the soprano sings the psalm as the voice of an off-stage bird, which the main character, the Pilgrim, questions – “What is it that makes that melodious note?” – referring to the soprano’s song. Even the birds and nature praise God in Bunyan’s allegory. Second, the omitted verse consists of these lines: “Thou preparest a table before me in the presence of mine enemies: thou anointest my head with oil; my cup runneth over.” Vaughan Williams omits the text depicting triumph over one’s enemies, instead focusing solely on the comfort found in God.

Vaughan Williams’s music for this short setting (43 measures) is tonally accessible. The movement begins in 6/8 but freely alternates with 9/8, occasionally 3/4,

\textsuperscript{12} Byron Adams and Robin Wells. 	extit{Vaughan Williams Essays} (Aldershot, Hants: Ashgate, 2003), 176.
\textsuperscript{13} Michael Kennedy, 	extit{The Works of Ralph Vaughan Williams} (London: Oxford University Press, 1964), 313.
\textsuperscript{14} Verse Five of the Twenty-third Psalm: Thou shalt prepare a table before me against them that trouble me: Thou anointest my head with oil, and my cup shall be full.
and, for one measure, 2/4. Vaughan Williams uses these meters for the same reasons Stanford sets his text in 6/8—they provide movement both musically and spiritually. The music is tonally situated in F major, as the key signature and F major chord that opens the piece indicate. However, as often found in Vaughan Williams’s compositions, his tonalities are rarely so simple. After the initial F major chord, the main accompaniment motive is stated (fig. 2.1). This motive (hereafter referred to as the heavenly pattern) is in

Figure 2.1. The Pilgrim’s Progress, mm. 1-3

the Mixolydian mode and its gesture of rapidly ascending notes in a harp-like fashion captures a heavenly sentiment. Vaughan Williams evokes the theatrical association between harps and the celestial sphere. Stylistically, Vaughan Williams sets the music in an English pastoral mood, as the themes are influenced by folk songs and contain simple orchestration. Stanford’s musical message found in the augmented sixth in his setting of the psalm is mirrored by Vaughan Williams’s insistent Lydian arpeggios reflecting heavenly ascent. The left hand of this heavenly pattern comprises five notes: F, G, A, C, and E♭—thus creating an anhemitonic pentatonic scale with Mixolydian inflections. Meanwhile, the right hand condenses the soprano melody into an accompanimental pattern harmonized in thirds.

In m. 5, an A♭, a nonharmonic tone, weaves into the heavenly pattern through modal interchange and briefly entering the Dorian mode: bIII (A♭ major), bVII (E♭
major), I (F major), and returning to F Mixolydian. In m. 9 (verse two), the right hand shadows the soprano and plays a D that is outside of the pentatonic scale but a part of the Mixolydian mode. The D is also a seventh in the Eb major chord stated at the beginning of the measure. This chord leads back to a slightly modified version of the heavenly pattern, starting on the dominant, C, instead of F. After two repetitions of the heavenly pattern (mm. 12-13), the music returns to F Dorian with the A♮ becoming an A♭ for verse three (m. 14). This change in harmony is required as the First Shepherd sings an A♭ while describing the “solitary places” that add to the pastoral landscape. Through the first three verses, the vocalists’ melodic contour is characterized by ascending stepwise motion with infrequent consonant leaps. An ascending scalar passage reaches the melodic high point in m. 17, with the words “leadeth me in the paths.” Then, as the verse concludes with “of righteousness for his name’s sake,” the tonality returns to F Mixolydian.

This Mixolydian tonality is brief, as verse four’s (m. 20) darkness descends and the harmony modulates again; the B♭ becomes B♮ and modulates to D Dorian.\(^\text{15}\) The descending melodic contour of the soprano’s part on the following words, “Yea, though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death,” sounds appropriately somber, but not nearly as threatening as Stanford’s settings of this verse.

\(^\text{15}\) One could argue that the music modulates to F Lydian but the repeated D bass notes in mm. 20-21 lead me to believe that it is D Dorian.
Figure 2.2. *The Pilgrim’s Progress*, mm. 20-21

![Musical staff with notes](image)

The heavenly pattern’s melodic contour does not change in this shadowy fourth verse (fig. 2.2). Instead, Vaughan Williams retains the ascending pattern and changes the mode, allowing this wanderer to confidently walk through darkness, as eventually peace will be found. In m. 26, a G major chord directs the tonality back to F Mixolydian, during the words “thy rod and thy staff comfort me.” Three new characters, shepherds, enter and create a contrapuntal response that supplements the vocal texture and repeats the words uttered by the soprano. The crucial fourth verse is the only one to receive a contrapuntal treatment.

In m. 31, the four voices climax on an E♭ major chord, with a high G in the soprano; the texture is briefly similar to that of Stanford’s chorale-like anthem. During the words, “surely goodness and mercy shall follow me all the days of my life.” Vaughan Williams builds texture and climaxes on a positive emotional moment in the psalm. In m. 32, a bVII (E♭ major) progresses to a long F pedal that is held until the last measure of the setting. The tonality remains in F Mixolydian for the remainder of the section, except for one chord in m. 36 that introduces an A♭, when the third Shepherd sings, “the Lord.” This brief i7 (F minor7) hints at F Dorian, causing the listener to question the composer’s intention. This is possibly a musical commentary on Vaughan Williams’s belief in “the Lord,” as he is hinting at a more dissonant mode. Additionally this a musical device that
will allow F Mixolydian to sound fresh and interesting for the remaining six measures of the setting?

Verse five is omitted and verse six commences with the soprano and shepherds concluding verse four. Mm. 39-42 provide a long melismatic passage from the soprano and three shepherds on the concluding word of the phrase, “I will dwell in the house of the Lord for ever.” Underneath the melisma, the orchestra undulates between F major and E♭ major over the sustained F pedal. This alternating pattern concludes on a I64 chord (F major). Then, a solo violoncello emerges from the orchestra and voices, with an ascending melodic line that uses all but one of the pitches (E♭) from F Mixolydian. The contour and solo statement definitively portray a soul climbing to heaven (fig. 2.3).

![Figure 2.3: The Pilgrim's Progress, mm. 42-43](image)

An accented pizzicato note in the upper strings confirms our celestial arrival and concludes the setting.

Vaughan Williams exploits pastoralism in his setting of the Twenty-third Psalm, like Stanford, but uses different signifiers to depict his message, employing the pentatonic scale in addition to the Mixolydian and Dorian modes. William Kimmel states, “As was noted in connection with pentatonic folk melodies in general certain characteristic figures recur again and again in Vaughan Williams’s melodies… I do not mean to infer that Vaughan Williams consciously inserted such figures into his melodies in order to secure a folk quality, but I would rather point out those features of his melodic
style which give it a definitely pastoral quality.”

Vaughan Williams’s consonant harmonic vocabulary represents the innocence of the deceased. Wilfrid Mellers states that, “mystery is inherent in the fact that… the melodic formula is the acoustically ‘innocent’ pentatonic scale.”

---


Chapter 3: Bernstein: Chichester Psalms Movement II

Dean Walter Hussey of Chichester Cathedral commissioned Leonard Bernstein (1918-1990) to compose a work for choir and small orchestra for the 1965 Southern Cathedrals’ Festival held in Chichester, England.\(^\text{18}\) Dr. Hussey wrote to Bernstein about the commission, “It is not really possible to have a full symphony orchestra for reasons of space and expense and the fact that the combined strength of the three Cathedral Choirs is about 70 to 75 (all boys and men)…. I hope you will feel quite free to write as you wish and will no way feel inhibited by circumstances. I think many of us would be very delighted if there was a hint of ‘West Side Story’ about the music.”\(^\text{19}\) Chichester Psalms was composed during a 1964-1965 sabbatical leave from the New York Philharmonic, as Bernstein’s “conducting schedule had left him little time for composition.”\(^\text{20}\) Chichester Psalms is scored for three trumpets in B♭, three trombones, timpani, percussion, two harps, strings, mixed choir (or male choir\(^\text{21}\)) and boy soloist. The composer additionally created a reduction of the orchestral score for boy soloist, mixed choir, organ, harp, and percussion.\(^\text{22}\)

Chichester Psalms is perhaps Bernstein’s most tonally straightforward composition. Bernstein biographer Humphrey Burton notes, “Chichester Psalms, two

---


\(^\text{21}\) Originally Bernstein intended the choral part to be sung by male voices only; however, as this composition entered the main choral repertoire, it is most commonly sung by mixed voices.

\(^\text{22}\) While this alternate version is commonly performed, this essay will focus on the original orchestration.
years later, is almost defiantly tonal throughout.” The overriding goal of this psalm is to provide comfort to the bereaved, which is mirrored by accessible and tender music in the first half of the composition. Bernstein composed a poem to explain his thoughts about the tonal language in *Chichester Psalms*.

And then I came up with Chichester Psalms,
These psalms are a simple and modest affair,
Tonal and tuneful and somewhat square,
Certain to sicken a stout John Cager
With its tonics and triads in E-flat major.
But there it stands – the result of my pondering,
Two long months of avant-garde wandering—
My youngest child, old fashioned and sweet.
And he stands on his own two tonal feet.  

Bernstein struggled with the avant-garde concert world that surrounded him but was content to compose a solidly tonal work.

Movement II of *Chichester Psalms* begins in 3/4, a meter associated with movement, and employed for similar reasons as Stanford and Vaughan Williams. Bernstein’s setting is in the original biblical language, Hebrew, and is transliterated into a Latin-derived alphabet. The first thirty measures (parts A & B) are sparsely orchestrated with a boy soloist, two harps, triangle, and suspended cymbal. The thin orchestration helps to establish a peaceful mood and conjures up the biblical setting where the young boy, David, the psalmist, composed verse with his *kinnor*, an ancient Semitic lyre. In addition, the orchestration is practical; Harp 1 strikes chords while Harp 2 provides assistance to the boy soloist by doubling his part. Lastly, Bernstein was a theatrical

---

24 Ibid., 346.
composer and understood the symbolic connection between an upward harp glissando, accompanied by a cymbal swell, and the dramatic vision of the heavenly afterlife. A similar orchestration and concept is found in Act Three of Claudio Monteverdi’s *L’Orfeo*. In the recitative, *Possente spirto*, Orpheus seeks to convince Charon to allow him to search for Eurydice in Hades. His dramatic plea contains three verses. In verse one, Orpheus offers Charon flattery and is accompanied by two violins. In verse two, Orpheus requests sympathy and is accompanied by two cornets. In verse three, Orpheus expresses hope of meeting Eurydice again in paradise and is accompanied by two harps playing an ascending figure (fig. 3.1). Bernstein follows this dramatic tradition of associating heaven with ascending harps.

**Figure 3.1. Possente spirto from L’Orfeo, mm.47-48, Harp I & II**

![Possente spirto from L’Orfeo, mm.47-48, Harp I & II](image)

**Figure 3.2. Tonal Table of Chichester Psalms, Movement II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure Numbers</th>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Text: Ps.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-18</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A major</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 1-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D major to A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-32</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>major</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 3 &amp; 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-47</td>
<td>A\textsuperscript{1}</td>
<td>A major/minor</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D major to A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48-63</td>
<td>B\textsuperscript{1}</td>
<td>major</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 4 &amp; 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64-72</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>Ps. 2: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73-80</td>
<td>C\textsuperscript{1}</td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>Ps. 2: 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C minor to A\textsuperscript{b}</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81-91</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>major</td>
<td>Ps. 2: 2-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92-101</td>
<td>C\textsuperscript{1}</td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>Ps. 2: 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{26} The complete libretto for Possente spirto can be found in Appendix 2.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>102-119</th>
<th>A &amp; C$^1$</th>
<th>A major/minor</th>
<th>Ps. 2: 4 &amp; 23: 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D major to A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120-135</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>major</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>136-146</td>
<td>B &amp; C$^1$</td>
<td>A minor/C major</td>
<td>Ps. 23: 6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The opening arpeggiated chord (fig. 3.3) sounded by harp 1 contains the following pitches: E, A, D♯, E, A, and E. While much of Movement II follows the

**Figure 3.3. Chichester Psalms, Mvt. II, m. 1, Lydian chord.**

...tonality of A major, as indicated by the key signature, this first chord contains a D♯ that implies A Lydian (and will be referred to as the Lydian chord). The ancient Greeks viewed the Lydian mode as one imparting optimism and happiness. According to Plato, “as our citizens are to be temperate, we may also banish convivial harmonies, such as the Ionian and pure Lydian.”

Bernstein pontificated about the modes during his Young People’s Concerts, “Do you hear the Lydian note? Only this time it’s not a funny note, but a strange piercing note that seems to come from a faraway place. And that’s only natural, because these modes do come from faraway places like the Middle East and Eastern European countries like Greece, Bulgaria, Finland, Russia, Poland.”

---

musicians may not have used these modes in King David’s time, Bernstein associates the Lydian mode with elements of the exotic, mysterious, and religious. Derek Scott lists several key elements of the exoticist’s devices: “Lydian or Phrygian inflections… percussion (especially tambourine, triangle, cymbals, and gong); and emphatic rhythmic figures on unpitched percussion (such as tom-toms, tambourine, and triangle).”

Orchestral exoticism is found here, given that the triangle is only struck in conjunction with the Lydian chord in this movement.

Bernstein follows the theatrical awakening of the opening two-measure Lydian chord with verse one of the Twenty-third Psalm in A major, with an angular, bluesy melody, in the boy soprano part. Harp 1 strikes dyads in the left hand that are doubled an octave higher in the right hand. These dyads, combined with the melodic line of the tenor and harp 2, form the following harmonic progression in the first phrase (mm. 3-10): I₆/₄ - V₂/ii - ii₆/₄ - V₆/₅/♭VII - bVII₆/₄ - V₇ - I - V₆/₄ - V₄/₃. There is a surging through dissonance in this back-and-forth progression. The dyads in Harp 1 create the following intervals (mm. 3-10): P₄, A₄, P₄, D₅, P₅, D₅, P₅, P₄. There is a constant flow between consonant and dissonant harmonies, perhaps implying that life’s journey is full of triumphs and obstacles. The two-octave range is compact, dense, and full of possibilities. Although the construction follows a functional harmonic progression, a serialized analytic approach is also possible (fig. 3.4).

30 P = Perfect, A = Augmented, D = Diminished
Bernstein does not generate an intentionally triadic-based dodecaphonic row as Berg does in his *Violin Concerto*. However, with this serialized analytic method, one is aware of the high chromaticism and the missing F♯ (fig. 3.5), which would be the twelfth note of a dodecaphonic row. Perhaps the omission of the F♯ is intentional and important, as Bernstein is excluding a primary pastoral signifier in the pastoral opening of the second movement. Bernstein suppresses this pitch until the ferocious second section, fifty measures later.

Dean Hussey requested a hint of *West Side Story* in this composition, which is apparent in m. 6 with the introduction of a blue note in the soloist’s melody. The blue note is, in this case, a C♯ in A major/Lydian. The A section concludes with a restatement of the Lydian chord (mm. 17-18) that serves as a sectional bookend. The B section begins
(m. 19) in the subdominant key of D major for the statement of verse three. Harp 1 introduces a descending arpeggiated pastoral gesture and outlines the following progression: I$_{64}$ (D Major) - iii$_6$ (F# minor) - vi (B minor) - V$_{64}$/V (E Major). This progression facilitates the modulatory return to A major (m. 27) and the statement of verse four at the beginning of the A$^1$ section (m. 31). This section is identified as A$^1$ due to its similar melodic relationship to the original A section, but the accompanimental orchestral figures and harmonic progressions are varied. The consecutive melodic pairing of B# and C# (fig. 3.6), in harp 2 and violas, obfuscates A major. At first, the listener is unsure whether the tonality rests in A

**Figure 3.6. Chichester Psalms, Mvt. II, mm. 31-2, viola**

major or A minor. Mm. 31-32 contain two A major/minor chords, and is followed by cadences on I (m. 42) and i (m. 46). Similar to the Stanford and Vaughan Williams, Bernstein makes a compositional and metaphorical statement during the fourth verse of the Psalm. However, Bernstein’s message is more concealed. The ambiguous nature of the A major/minor chord begs the question. Are we unsure of Bernstein’s thoughts or conceivably, is Bernstein unsure about his own thoughts on God and the afterlife?
This fluctuation between major and minor constructs a hybrid scale utilizing features of A major (Ionian), A Blues, and A Lydian. In m. 32, the choir enters for the first time in this movement. The sopranos are divided in two parts, and sing the fourth verse in canon (at the unison) one measure apart. Bernstein’s canonic statement tone-paints the soul’s journey through the shadowy valley of death with this echo-like contrapuntal technique. In addition, the composer instructs that the comes voice shall sing in a “quasi echo” and at a softer dynamic, adding acoustical dimension to this valley.

Bernstein delayed the choir’s entrance until this pivotal verse and applied a canonic treatment to the voices. The harmonic vocabulary increases in complexity, but the choir repeats the melodic material from the A section (in canon).

In m. 46, two glockenspiels accompanied by a swell from the suspended cymbal strike a 3-note (D#, A, E) version of the Lydian chord, signaling the end of the A¹ section. A four-note anacrusis in m. 47 begins a canon at the interval of a minor third between the sopranos and altos, at a distance of two beats. In m. 55, the boy soloist reenters with a restatement of verse one; however the melodic contour and intervals have changed from the original A section. The melody leaps upward by a perfect fifth, followed by a whole-step descent on the word Adonai. Two more upward whole steps complete the phrase on roi, or “is my shepherd.” In figures 3.7.1 and 3.7.2, the two melodies are displayed consecutively, demonstrating the shrinking intervals, perhaps preparing the listener for the next section’s rage.
In mm. 60-63, the strings and harps continue with peaceful, flowing lines with a progression in A Major: I – vi – IVM7 – V7. While the Trumpet 3 and Trombone 1 hold a tonic pedal over the four-bar progression. In mm. 61-64, the sopranos and altos conclude their consequent phrase of verse one. The pastoral setting is shattered in m. 64 with three fortissimo blasts of a dissonant triad (A, B, C) from the brass and upper strings. This is the beginning of the C section and the Second Psalm of the bible. The previously unheard men’s voices declare in a loud shout, “Lamah! Lamah!, Why! Why!” The meter changes to the marching *alla breve* and is accompanied by Bernstein’s instructions to play *allegro feroce*. *Lamah* is the first Hebrew word from the Second Psalm, and asks, “Why do the nations rage?” Bernstein juxtaposes a comforting psalm against one that is severe and wrathful – submit to God or perish. In m. 66, the men’s voices, strings (played quasi *sul ponticello*), and percussion suddenly revert to pianissimo but with continued intensity. Perhaps these soft yet piercing staccato lines represent voices of the ghosts of the Holocaust. Unlike the more obvious Holocaust references from Lamentations found in Bernstein’s Symphony No. 1 *Jeremiah*, Movement III, there is no evidence of a link between this music and the Holocaust.
In m. 73, two more ferocious blasts from the orchestra signal the beginning of the C\textsuperscript{1} section. Concurrently a canon starts between the basses and tenors at the interval of an octave and a distance of two beats. The melody is triadic and simple but rhythmically active, with eighth notes that are also doubled in the xylophone. The canon lasts until m. 80, when it is interrupted by another orchestral blast. This thickly orchestrated triad (B, C, E\textsubscript{b}) functions as a pivot chord to c minor and the beginning of the D section and verse two of Psalm Two (in m. 81). In mm. 80-84, the canon is abandoned for a forte declaration of, “The kings of the earth set themselves, and the rulers take counsel together.” In mm. 84-90, the Hebrew word yahad, meaning “together”, is repeated thirteen times by the tenors in the new key of A\textsubscript{b} major. The two-syllable word repeatedly oscillates between an octave A\textsubscript{b} and G (a half step). The A\textsubscript{b}, b6 in the key of c minor, emphasizes the dissonant note on the strong beat while the consonant G falls on the weak beat. The loud, repetitive rhythms and dissonance are reminiscent of Stravinsky’s primitivism found in Le Sacre du printemps. Bernstein uses this method only briefly in this movement, but it functions dually. First, it interrupts the eight-bar phrases that consume the pastoral melodies. Secondly, perhaps Bernstein is lecturing the audience on social responsibility. The primitivist setting of the word “together” reminds one to be fearful of the growing mob. Beneath this tenor ostinato, the basses complete verse two, shadowing the rhythm of the tenors.

In m. 93-101, the men’s voices sing verses three and four in canon at the interval of an octave at the distance of two beats. In m. 102, a hybrid formal section combines
parts A & C¹ and signifies the return to the original key of A major. The sopranos and altos return with melancholic melodic material derived from the A section in a canon at the unison at the distance of one measure. The women’s voices are in a piano echo, while the basses and tenors continue with the melody from B and the rhythm of D. This contrast highlights the gentle feminine versus the violent masculine in conflict, much as the characters in Psalm Two rage against God.

In m. 120, the boy soloist returns with the final sixth verse of the Twenty-third Psalm. The soloist is accompanied by Harp 1, similar to the orchestrational treatment in mm. 3-30. This time, however, the trumpets and trombones double (at the unison) each of the harps’ notes. Despite the melodic reprisal by the soloist, Bernstein is demonstrating a loss of innocence through his harsher orchestration. Additionally, the harmony is in D major, the subdominant of the original A major. Finally, in m. 126, Bernstein modulates back to A major through a V-I progression.

The last formal section of the movement is a hybrid of B and C¹. In m. 136-146, the sopranos and altos hold the final syllable of *eh-sar*, lack, for eleven measures on a tonic A. They are doubled an octave above by the violins. Underneath this tonic, the violas, cellos, and solo first trumpet play the staccato, jagged melody from section C. A final three-note solo in the bass drum confirms Bernstein’s message of innocence contaminated and possibly a lack of hope in humanity. His pain at the end of this movement makes this sacred music sincere.

The Lydian chord analyzed at the beginning of this chapter requires further investigation. As mentioned previously, the chord was used as a formal bookend between
sections and as a theatrical device. The Lydian chord also functions harmonically – but as a tonic, dominant, or both? In m. 1, the “awakening” occurs, and the chord functions as a tonic leading to a mystical environment, but the tritone leads to an A major chord, the actual tonic of the movement. In m. 17, the second statement of the Lydian chord is equally ambiguous. It sounds like a tonic as it completes the A section coming from a IV₆₄ chord, though it is also a pivot chord to D major. In m. 46, a reduced version of the chord, without any doublings, appears in the Harp 1 and glockenspiel and again functions both as a tonic and pivot chord to D major. That is the last occurrence of the Lydian chord in this movement. It does not return later to delineate formal sections or as a conclusion of the mystical movement. The musically expected return of the Lydian chord does not occur in mm. 128-135, when the boy soprano reprises melodic material from the A section. Bernstein’s message of innocence lost supersedes formal device expectations.

Bernstein is a composer who embodies American musical and social values. Bernstein synergizes segments of Copland’s Americana, Vaughan Williams’s soft pastoral, and dance band-inspired jazz. Bernstein uses jazz for several reasons. Jazz is the quintessential American musical style; therefore, like Vaughan Williams employing folk music in his symphonies, Bernstein uses jazz as a folk influence in his musical language. With Chichester Psalms, Bernstein uses a Hebrew text but imparts a non-denominational message. The musical content is not overtly Jewish. Bernstein’s Dybbuk, Hashkivenu, or Simchu Na all contain more traditionally Jewish melodies and modes. The Lydian inflections are exotic and mysterious but not specifically Jewish. The reasoning is twofold. First, Bernstein was commissioned by a church figure to compose music for an
Anglican audience. Second, in a post-Holocaust world, Bernstein aimed to provide comfort by utilizing multiple dogmas, in the hope of inspiring a shared positive human message.
Conclusion

The Twenty-third Psalm offers mourners solace in their hour of despair. The psalm affords composers an opportunity to confirm the meaning of the text or question its inherent wisdom. The three twentieth-century composers analyzed in this essay share musical signifiers and techniques, while providing varying expressive interpretations of the text’s meaning.

All three composers relate to the rustic poetry of the shepherd David and manipulate musical pastoralism in their own compositional style. Stanford sets the psalm in F major and 6/8 meter to associate the text with expected musical depictions of nature. He poetically departs from tradition and creates a mystical pastoralism with his intervallic message implying faith in the afterlife. Vaughan Williams produces the most traditionally authentic pastoral signifiers: 6/8 meter, F major tonality\(^{31}\), and an ascending harp line metaphorically lifting the soul to heaven. Bernstein uses the literary pastoralism of the psalmic setting as a point of departure but is not as naturally authentic with the signifiers as the two British pastoralists. Bernstein uses flowing lines and upward harp glissandi but the pastoralism is a veneer.

These three composers approach tonality in varied ways. Stanford tonally anchors his setting, which relies on an intervallic superstructure to provide a deeper level of interpretation to the text. Vaughan Williams’s setting is modally anchored in Mixolydian and a hybrid Mixolydian-pentatonic scale, with occasional forays into Lydian, Dorian

---

\(^{31}\) F major is alternated with several modal inflections listed in chapter 3.
and Ionian. Bernstein’s setting is tonally situated but significant emphasis is placed on the Lydian chord that functions structurally, dramatically, and harmonically.

Each composer responded to the text in disparate ways. Stanford is direct and his overriding superstructure adds a mystical significance to the setting. Vaughan Williams is perhaps the most direct, allowing the audience to decide the meaning and validity of the psalm on their own. Bernstein’s text setting is the most complicated. His sincere pastoral signifiers are consistent with the psalm’s message of comfort, however the peaceful mood is juxtaposed with the insertion of verses one through four of Psalm Two. Bernstein’s textual additions express doubt in humanity and perhaps divinity as well.

All three composers varied the vocal textures of their settings. Stanford’s setting of this anthem is mainly homophonic with brief polyphonic digressions to emphasize the text. Vaughan Williams’s first twenty-eight measures are antiphonal between the soprano and the Pilgrim. In the remaining fifteen measures, three shepherds accompany the soprano and add to the pastoral mood. In Bernstein’s Chichester Psalms, the boy soprano sings the verses accompanied by harps and strings, while the choir’s texture is mainly canonic with brief homophonic sections.

In a psalm focused on hope and solace, all three composers musically gravitated towards the pivotal fourth verse. Rabbi Miriyam Glazer in her commentary on the Psalms explains, “To walk ‘in the valley of the shadow of death’ is to be human. Perhaps we are aware of it only when we are ill, only when our well-being is threatened.” These three dramatically savvy composers are certainly “aware of it” and create their musical

metaphors to accompany the crucial verse. The Twenty-third Psalm provides hope to mourners and opportunity to composers.
Bibliography


Appendix 1

Stanford sets *The Lord is My Shepherd* from the Common Book of Prayer:

The Lord is my shepherd, therefore can I lack nothing,

He shall feed me in a green pasture, and shall lead me forth beside the waters of comfort.

He shall convert my soul, and shall bring me forth in the paths of righteousness, for His Name’s sake.

Yea, though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death, I will fear no evil: for Thou art with me, Thy rod and Thy staff comfort me.

Thou shalt prepare a table before me against them that trouble me: Thou anointest my head with oil, and my cup shall be full.

But Thy loving kindness and Thy mercy shall follow me all the days of my life, and I will dwell in the house of the Lord forever.

Vaughan Williams sets *The Lord is My Shepherd* in his morality *The Pilgrim’s Progress*:

The Lord is my Shepherd, therefore can I lack nothing.

He maketh me to lie down in green pastures he leadeth me beside the still waters.

He restoreth my soul he leadeth me in the paths of righteousness (sic.) for his name’s sake.

Yea, though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death, I will fear no evil, for thou art with me, thy rod and thy staff they comfort me.
Surely goodness and mercy shall follow me all the days of my life and I will dwell in the house of the Lord forever.

Pilgrim: What is it that makes that melodious note?

It is our country birds, they sing these notes in the Spring when the flowers appear and the sun shines warm and then you may hear them all day long they make the woods and groves and the solitary places desirous to be in.

They fill the air with their melodious sounds.

**Bernstein sets a transliteration of the Hebrew Twenty-third Psalm:**

Adonai ro-i, lo ehsar.

Bin’ot deshe yarbitseini,

Al mei m’nuhot y’nahaleini,

Naf’shi y’shovev,

Yan ‘heini b’ma’aglei tsedek,

L’ma’an sh’mo.

Gam ki eilech

B’gei tsalmavet,

Lo ira ra,

Ki Atah imadi.

Shiv’t’cha umishan’techa
Hemah y’nahamuni.
Ta’aroach l’fani shulchan
Neged tsor’rai
Dishanta vashemen roshi
Cosi r’vayah.
Ach tov vahesed
Yird’funi kol y’mei hayai,
V’hav’ti b’veit Adonai
L’orech yamim.

Psalm 2 verses 1-4, transliteration:
Lamah rag’shu goyim
Ul’umim yeh’gu rik?
Yit’yats’vu malchei erets,
V’roznim nos’du yahad
Al Adonai v’al m’shiho.
N’natkah et mos’roteimo
V’nahlichah mimenu avoteimo.
Yoshev bashamayim
Yis’hak, Adonai
Yil’ag lamo!
Appendix 2

_Possente spirto_ from Claudio Monteverdi’s _L'Orfeo:_

Possente spirto, e formidabil nume,
Senza cui far passaggio a l’altra riva
Alma da corpo sciolta in van presume,

Powerful spirit and fear-inspiring god,
without whom to take passage to the other bank
a soul, freed from the body, presumes in vain,

_Ritornello (2 violins)_

Non viv’ io, no, che poi di vita è priva
Mia cara sposa, il cor non è più meco
E senza cor com’ esser può ch’io viva?

I do not live, no, since when, deprived of life,
was my dear bride, my heart was no longer with me,
and without a heart how can it be that I live?

_Ritornello (2 cornets)_

A lei volt’ ho il cammin per l’aer cieco,
A l’inferno non già, ch’ovunque stassi
Tanta bellezza, il paradiso ha seco.

To her I have made my way through the dark air,
not yet to Hades, for wherever there is
such beauty there is paradise with it.

Ritornello (2 harps)
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
RIVERSIDE

Volume II

Breathing
&
Where Shadow Chases Light

A Thesis submitted in partial satisfaction
of the degree requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Music

by

Aaron J. Fruchtman

August 2013

Thesis Committee:
Dr. Timothy Labor, Chairperson
Dr. Byron Adams
Dr. Walter A. Clark
This is my delight,
thus to wait and watch at the wayside
where shadow chases light
and the rain comes in the wake of the summer.

Messengers, with tidings from unknown skies,
greet me and speed along the road.
My heart is glad within,
and the breath of the passing breeze is sweet.

From dawn till dusk I sit here before my door,
and I know that of a sudden
the happy moment will arrive when I shall see.

In the meanwhile I smile and I sing all alone.
In the meanwhile the air is filling with the perfume of promise.
Ooh...
Adagio $q = 69$

This is my de-light thus to wait and watch at the way-side
where shadow

This is my de-light thus to wait and watch at the way-side
where shadow

This is my de-light thus to wait and watch at the way-side
where shadow

This is my de-light thus to wait and watch at the way-side
where shadow
and the rain comes in the wake of the summer
and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer

and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer

and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer

and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer

and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer

and the rain comes in the wake of the summer the summer the summer
from unknown skies, messengers with tidings
greet me and speed a-

messengers with tidings messengers with tidings
from unknown skies, greet me and speed a-

messengers with tidings messengers with tidings
known skies, greet me

messengers with tidings messengers with tidings
known skies, greet me
long the road the road. My heart, my heart, my heart
my heart

The road the road. My heart, my heart, my heart is glad with-in,
and the breath and the breath of the passing breeze is sweet, is

the breath and the breath passing breeze sweet, is sweet,

the breath and the breath passing breeze sweet, is sweet,
from dawn till

sweet, is sweet, is sweet.

from dawn till

sweet, is sweet, is sweet.

from dawn till

sweet, is sweet, is sweet.

from dawn till

accel. a tempo

D

mf

dawn
till

B.

pp

from dawn till

accel. a tempo

D

pp

dawn
till
dusk   till dusk

I sit here before my door and I know

that of

molto rit.  poco più mosso
a sudden the happy moment shall arrive when I shall see Mmm...
In the meanwhile I smile and I sing
Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.

Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.

Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.

Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.

Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.

Mmm... In the meanwhile the air is filling with perfume.