Title
San Francisco Toilets     [Streets: Old Paradigm, New Investment]

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3hm154r2

Journal
Places, 11(2)

ISSN
2164-7798

Author
Rose, Evan

Publication Date
1997-07-01

Peer reviewed
San Francisco Toilets

In 1969, the city of San Francisco issued a bold request for proposals, seeking a company to install and maintain public toilets on city sidewalks. While such facilities are increasingly common in Europe, they are unheard of in U.S. cities. Moreover, San Francisco decreed that it could not afford to pay for the amenity it desired. Instead, the company that operated the toilets would be authorized to erect advertising on the street.

JCDecaux USA, the winning bidder, proposed putting up 4.5 advertising kiosks for each toilet. For years, cities have had privately managed bus shelters underwritten by ads. In San Francisco, some of this advertising was already on self-stand- ing kiosks along Market Street. What made this deal different was the number of kiosks Decaux proposed and the considerable size of each one. Many San Franciscans did not like the idea of giving the public right-of-way for advertising, no matter what the public benefit. There was concern about the scale and character of the kiosks; many people felt they would be too tall, block views and demeans the city's jealously guarded sense of place. (The kiosks are 14 to 17 feet tall, depending on their "hat," and roughly four feet in diameter. The toilets have a floor plate of five by eight feet and are about eight feet tall.) There was considerable doubt about the long-term viability of the project; would the toilets really be taken care of? And some people felt the deal was not fair: Decaux could make a considerable profit on the advertising; shouldn't the city share the windfall?

Decaux offered a standard toilet design and two kiosk designs, each with newsstands and public art designed specifically for San Francisco. The toilet design was reviewed and modified to meet accessibility requirements and aesthetic considerations. The kiosks were reviewed, too, for they were referred to as "public service kiosks" on which there would be three panels, two for advertising and one for designation by the city. The city decided that two-thirds would be used to replace unsightly newspaper stands and the rest for public art.

The placement of the elements also required scrutiny; each proposed location was subject to a public hearing. The planning and public works departments, with other city agencies, developed design and placement guidelines to facilitate the installation of the toilets and kiosks while preserving citywide pedestrian goals. For
the downtown area, the guidelines were integrated with a streetscape design plan that was being developed concurrently.

The toilets have been installed throughout the city, but the kiosks are concentrated downtown, especially along Market Street. For advertisers, this concentration makes sense, but to many people, the kiosks have become the dominant design element on the street. This concern was mitigated somewhat by the quality of the design, although some designers in town were thrilled by the neo-Victorian motif (the city rejected the contemporary design it was offered).

The installation of twenty toilets and ninety advertising kiosks, which took about a year, has been a guarded success. The toilets are used frequently, by everyone from tourists to the homeless. The maps on the toilet structures seem popular, too. However, the newstand kiosks seem underutilized and the public art component has been underwhelming, primarily due to lack of city funds. The most controversial detail was Doremus's attempt to install a few rotating kiosks, which were quickly removed at the city's insistence.

Some people will always be opposed to change in San Francisco, but it became apparent the general reaction to this initiative seems favorable. There is a sense that the vendor has delivered as promised, and that a well-designed, well-maintained streetscape is a fair trade for the presence of more advertising. In fact, the city is investigating whether the city should increase the number of toilets and exploring other street furniture improvements, including some soon-to-be-installed kiosks designed by Norman Foster, a tantalizing technological solution to the vexing problem of proliferating newsstands.

When one encounters a kiosk, there is a sense of surprise, then a feeling of recognition, since the kiosks have become familiar elements of the streetscape. One only wishes that each kiosk could be more localized, with more space for information about local history or activities. Instead of encasing newsstands, they might include bulletin boards, neighborhood maps or information terminals. At least it would be good to see a wider variety of ads, and ads that relate to local businesses, not only national marketing campaigns.

— Rob W. Doremus