Title

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3sj933vg

Journal
UCLA Historical Journal, 2(0)

ISSN
0276-864X

Author
Philips, John

Publication Date
1981

Peer reviewed
MacKendrick has grappled valiantly with the problem of imposing order on the mass of material at his command. Of the various approaches possible—thematic, geographical, chronological—he has attempted to combine the last two. The book is cast in a regional framework, dealing in turn with Tunisia, Libya, Algeria, and Morocco. Within each of these sections the material is discussed in part chronologically, in part site by site. The result, useful for quick reference, nevertheless makes for difficult reading, the text sometimes dissolving into a series of disconnected vignettes. Such obstacles might have been overcome, and the impression of a descriptive encyclopedia avoided, by the use of a more thematic approach.

This is a sound and generally well-balanced work of scholarship with few surprises. The reviewer's eyebrows rose, however, in connection with MacKendrick's handling of the supposed voyage of Hanno to West Africa. MacKendrick apparently continues to believe the authenticity of this picturesque fable. He concedes "Hanno's story contains so many puzzles and so many fearsome wonders that some scholars think it was deliberately intended to put Carthage's rivals off the scent" (p. 14). But there is no indication that this tale has been debunked by Germain in a famous article where he describes the Periplus of Hanno as "for three quarters at least a mediocre literary exercise whose sources, many of them also literary, are sometimes recognizable" ("Qu'est-ce le péril ble d'Hannon?" Hesperis, 1957). MacKendrick's bibliography ignores this paper, and also fails to notice Mauny's equally well-known article on the impossibility of navigation to West Africa in classical times ("La navigation sur les côtes du Sahara pendant l'antiquité," Revue des Etudes Anciennes, 1955).

Despite this small aberration, MacKendrick's work will give pleasure to the reader. It is spiced with wit and shrewd observations. This is a convenient and valuable work of reference, attractively produced and, at the price, something of a bargain in these inflationary days. For scholars and students whose interests lie in classical North Africa, it is to be recommended.

Tim Garrard
University of California, Los Angeles


It is with pleasure that one welcomes the return to print of an important, classic work, first published in 1966. It is certainly the best work in English on the subject and deserves to be on the shelf of any Africanist or Islamicist, even in this new, attenuated form. Fourteen of the original nineteen chapters of the first edition are reprinted here (omitting essays by Froelich, Ceulemans, Stevenson, Baxter, and Hodgkins). Except for the essay by Froelich, those omitted deal with areas marginal to Islam in tropical Africa (e.g. the Congo, Ghana, etc.). Since the papers were all presented to the now-famous 1964 Fifth International African Seminar at Ahmadu Bello University in Zaria, Nigeria, which considered the question of Islam in tropical Africa, there could be no question of printing papers not originally presented in 1964.
Nevertheless, no criteria have been given for dropping some papers while including others.

The first edition contained essays in either French or English, with a summary in the other language for those who read only one of the two languages. In this edition all the French articles have been translated into English. To the reader who cannot read French, the change is a felicitous one. Thus the book is more likely to be adopted as a textbook at American universities, where bilingualism of any sort is uncommon.

Although the introduction is substantially unchanged, the editor has not ignored the many changes in both African and Islamic studies since 1966. On pages 96-98 there is an updating of the original bibliography. Although not intended to be exhaustive, it is a useful and welcome addition to the book. Its only shortcoming is that too little attention has been given to the recent works in both English and French by West Africans themselves. The new preface also identifies several aspects of African Islam which need further investigation by both Islamicists and Africanists. These include the interaction between Islamic and traditional law in Africa, and the influence of Islam on African nationalism.

This book does contain most of the biases for which Islamic studies recently have been criticized by Edward Said (Orientalism, 1980). It is not hard to recognize bias in statements like that in one article:

Among the universalistic religions, Islam is distinguished by its emphasis on war as a means of spreading the Faith. Where likely to succeed, such war is a duty for the Faithful, and it was largely due to the zealous prosecution of this profitable duty by its adherents that Islam spread as far and fast as it did (p. 213).

But there is another bias in Islamic studies, shared even by Said, which this book, by its very nature, cannot share. Most Islamic surveys done in the West ignore the existence of Islam in tropical Africa. For example, the publishers of the famous Encyclopedia of Islam have published A Historical Chart of the Muslim World (Ibrahim Gomaa, 1972) claiming to illustrate the political control of the Muslim world throughout history. This chart includes Ceylon, the Balkans, trans-Syr-darya, Spain, Sardinia, Corsica, and Sicily. Yet the Republic of the Sudan is the only Subsaharan territory shown. Such long-Islamic areas as Somalia, Bornu, the inland Niger delta and even Arab Mauritania are ignored. Even radicals in Islamic studies such as Said carelessly assume that Egypt is not part of Africa (Orientalism, p. 35), perpetuating the racist attempt to divide "African" from "Islamic" studies. Said often attacks racism in Western scholarship, but his only target is anti-Arab racism.

Lewis's book is to be praised for its all-too-rare attempt to integrate our understandings of Islam and Africa. The several essays discuss the dynamics of Islamicization and the social effects of spreading Islam within tropical Africa. They contribute to our understanding of both Islam and Africa. Most important of all, they show that Islam is an African religion and that Africa has had profound impacts on Islam.

The habitual racist schizophrenia of Islamic studies has unfortunate side effects other than perpetuating the stereotype that there is no Islam south of the Sahara. Academics often assume that the study of African Islamic societies can contribute nothing to the understanding of other Islamic societies. For example, a 1978
survey of women in Islam, edited by Lois Beck and Nikki Keddie (Women in the Muslim World), spends considerable space discussing the status of Muslim women in China. Yet Nigeria, with approximately 50 million Muslims, does not even appear in the index! The struggle for women's suffrage in northern Nigeria, as well as the legacy of the teachings of Usman dan Fodio, have raised major questions about the nature of women's rights under Islam, and have contributed to the stirring of Islamic feminism.

Although not the subject of any specific study, Lewis considers the relation of women to Islam in tropical Africa. He shows how matrilineality in a society may actually help to spread Islam, though Islamic influence often results in a shift from matrilineal to patrilineal inheritance (p. 48). He even shows an instance where women convert to Islam to preserve their economic independence (p. 50). This is not to say that African Islam is not sexist, but if more Islamicists were to read Lewis's book, our understanding of the potentialities of Islam would be increased, and facile generalizations could be avoided.

The criticisms made here of Orientalist scholarship should not be seen as personal attacks, but rather as illustrating a point about the discipline and its traditions. Modern scholars are victims of the prejudice of their predecessors. Without a conscious effort to overcome the white racist bias of the discipline, scholars will continue to make the same mistakes.

This bias was not, of course, part of the heritage of classical Islam itself. The respect given black African intellectuals by their Muslim contemporaries is a matter of English language record since at least the publication of Edward Wilmot Blyden's Christianity, Islam and the Negro Race (1888). Even the non-specialist can see, for example in Joel Rogers's World's Great Men of Color (1947), that many famous Muslims in all periods have either been from Africa and black themselves, or of black African descent, including some of the greatest classical Arab thinkers and writers. One of the most famous, known in the West as al-Jahiz, wrote a work in the ninth century entitled "On the Superiority of the Black Race over the White."

Although it was not the purpose of the seminar that gave rise to this book to examine the influence of Africa in the wider Islamic community, the editor recognized the importance of tropical Africa as "one of the major Islamic areas of the world" (p. 1). Islamicists can no longer ignore Africa. African Islam is both long-established and rapidly spreading. Islamicists must become familiar with African Islam, and this book is a good place to start.

John Philips
University of California, Los Angeles

Heresy and Authority in Medieval Europe: Documents in Translation.

Edward Peters has edited a reader of sixty-four translations which document over a millenium of heresy. This is an immense span of time and Peters condenses a major portion of it, representing the third to ninth centuries with an introductory chapter of eight