Title
Book Review: Yvonne Seale, *Bigamy and Christian Identity in Late Medieval Champagne*

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4m52b5hr

Journal
UCLA Historical Journal, 26(1)

ISSN
0276-864X

Author
Seale, Yvonne

Publication Date
2015

Peer reviewed

Bigamy and Christian Identity in Late Medieval Champagne is a successful example of how a small number of primary sources—in this case, bigamy prosecutions in fifteenth-century Troyes—can be usefully exploited by the medieval historian. Sara McDougall uses the surviving records of the officality of Troyes to argue that there was a crisis of marriage in the later Middle Ages which was a precursor to how marriage would come to be debated and reshaped during the Reformation.

This is not a new argument, but whereas scholars such as Steven Ozment have theorized that this crisis was due to the Catholic Church’s espousal of celibacy or to the challenge which clandestine marriage posed to parental and ecclesiastical control over the institution, McDougall seeks a different origin. She posits instead that this crisis arose because Church-approved marriage had become so desirable that people were willing to commit bigamy, to conceal that they had abandoned their spouse or falsely claim that they had been widowed, in order to retain the benefits of the institution. McDougall also argues that other scholars working on late medieval and early modern marriage, such as Natalie Zemon Davis in her influential micro-history of a sixteenth-century bigamy case, The Return of Martin Guerre, have put too much weight on the concept of identity as an explanatory tool. McDougall admits that “distortions of identity” (135) mattered to late medieval Europeans, but argues for the primacy of Christian identity, rather than a concern with imposture, in explaining their vehement opposition to bigamy. Marriage was “always ideally a singular and exclusive event” (19) for medieval Christians, designed to resemble the two-in-one-flesh union of Adam and Eve and the symbolic marriage of Christ with the Church. By distorting earthly marriage, bigamists challenged this symbolism on a fundamental level.

After a short introduction setting out the book’s goals, the body of the text is divided into five chapters. The first looks at the legal, theological and cultural contexts of marriage in medieval Christian Europe. The second and third form a pair, examining the gendered differences in the treatment of bigamous men and women, who seem mostly to have come from middling families. Men were

© 2015 Yvonne Seale. All rights reserved.
punished more frequently and more severely for bigamy than were women and more publicly—many were exposed on the ladder leading to the town scaffold before they were imprisoned. Women mostly escaped with a fine. McDougall argues that this was because for a man to enter into a bigamous relationship was for him to repudiate his role as a responsible patriarch, to abjure the model set out for him by the self-denying St Joseph; for a woman to enter a bigamous marriage, however, was more tolerated because it was considered natural for a woman, by reason of the infirmity of her sex, to seek male headship. The fourth chapter examines the reasons why people may have committed bigamy; the sources do not allow us to know the motivations of most of those prosecuted, but McDougall suggests that affective bonds or financial considerations were the most likely ones. The fifth chapter discusses why civil and ecclesiastical authorities prosecuted bigamists, and in particular why they regarded bigamy as a crime on a par with heresy and violent assault. In particular, she considers the men who made up the bishop’s court, men who were trained in theology or canon law at Paris and Orléans, and traces the origins of the moralizing rhetoric which they used when prosecuting bigamists. She sees in their words an overwhelming desire for what they regarded as proper Christian social order. After the brief conclusion, which summarizes the book’s argument through the lens of the concept of Christian identity, there is a useful appendix of selected transcriptions of bigamy cases from a register of the officiality.

McDougall skillfully combines a close reading of the legal records with an awareness of the broader historical and cultural context—the inhabitants of fifteenth-century Champagne lived in a region ravaged by the Hundred Years’ War, affected by plague and economic change and local political troubles; their ways of thinking about the world were shaped by their exposure to sermons, scripture, and literature. Her work is highly comparative, contrasting marriage disputes in Troyes with similar cases across a swathe of Western Europe. If the officiality of Troyes was unusual in the zeal with which it pursued bigamists during the fifteenth century, then it is a clear harbinger of the conflicts over marriage which would occupy so many during the Reformation. While perhaps McDougall could have contrasted Christian marriage with Jewish and Muslim marriage in medieval Europe, or considered more how the wishes and expectations of the non-bigamous partner may have influenced the bigamous partner into marrying in public, her work undoubtedly demonstrates the centrality of marriage to Christian identity by the late Middle Ages.

Yvonne Seale

*University of Iowa*