Title
The Politics of Knowledge in Youth Education about Reproductive Health in Tanzania

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/65n7541n

Author
Ivanova, Olga

Publication Date
2015

Peer reviewed|Thesis/dissertation
The Politics of Knowledge
in Youth Education about Reproductive Health
in Tanzania

A dissertation submitted in partial satisfaction of the
requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy
in Applied Linguistics

by

Olga Ivanova

2015
ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION

The Politics of Knowledge
in Youth Education about Reproductive Health
in Tanzania

by

Olga Ivanova
Doctor of Philosophy in Applied Linguistics
University of California, Los Angeles, 2015
Professor Katrina Thompson, Co-Chair
Professor Marjorie Harness Goodwin, Co-Chair

This dissertation offers a sociocultural linguistic perspective on the politics of knowledge in development work in an economically challenged post-colonial context by exploring discourses emerging in semi-formal education about reproductive health in rural Tanzania. The questions about knowledge value in such contexts have been mainly addressed from the macro-perspective of state policies, globalization, and debates on neo- and post-colonialism. From this perspective, knowledge, or rather global and local knowledges, are treated as given entities in an ongoing struggle with one another. Applying a micro-perspective of research on talk-in-interaction, this dissertation suggests that knowledge, its forms and values, are instead situated in a dynamic, mutually constituting relationship. This project adds to the growing body of literature
on knowledge appropriation and offers an insight into the ongoing creation of a “third space” (Bhabha, 1994; Higgins, 2011; Kramsch, 1993) or a “third culture” (Useem & Useem, 1967) in the intersection of traditional ideologies about language, sex, and gender and the “enlightenment discourse” (Higgins, 2010b, p. 70) of Western biomedical rationalism.

Building on the idea that language is an essential component of knowledge and that talk is a form of social action, this dissertation explores linguistic choices and discursive norms as a medium and an outcome of knowledge appropriation. By scrutinizing language use in two main contexts of development work, namely training sessions for future educators and teaching sessions conducted by the educators for the target population provided by non-governmental organizations (NGOs), this dissertation addresses the following questions: 1) how epistemic status and authority is co-constructed in interaction; 2) how the shared understanding of knowledge needs is created; and 3) how the knowledge needs are addressed. This research finds that NGOs create a novel site for socialization into sexuality and gender by licensing for transgressing discursive prohibitions, which, however, may or may not translate in changing sexual behaviors or ideologies about sexuality and gender. Instead, the acquisition of a development register becomes a significant learning outcome. Students and educators are socialized into recognizing a particular vocabulary, interactional practices, and language ideologies as a valuable asset and a commodity.
The dissertation of Olga Ivanova is approved.

John Heritage

Charles Goodwin

Paula A. Tavrow

Marjorie Harness Goodwin, Committee Co-Chair

Katrina Thompson, Committee Co-Chair

University of California, Los Angeles

2015
DEDICATION

I dedicate this dissertation to my parents,

Lidia Evgenyevna Ivanova and Anatoliy Ivanovich Ivanov

who give me the courage to move forward.

Лидии Евгеньевне и Анатолию Ивановичу Ивановым
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Figures .................................................................................................................. viii
Transcription Conventions .......................................................................................... ix
Abbreviations .................................................................................................................. x
Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................... xi
VITA ................................................................................................................................. xiii

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .............................................................................. 1
  1.1 Language and education in Tanzania ................................................................. 3
     1.1.1 Country profile .......................................................................................... 3
     1.1.2 Swahili language ....................................................................................... 3
     1.1.3 Education and language ........................................................................... 4
  1.2 Reproductive health in East Africa ..................................................................... 6
  1.3 Youth and reproductive health in Tanzania ....................................................... 7
  1.4 Reproductive health education .......................................................................... 8
  1.5 Talk in reproductive health education ............................................................... 10

## CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ....................................................... 12
  2.1 The politics of knowledge .................................................................................. 12
  2.2 Theory behind youth-centered interventions .................................................... 14
  2.3 Limits in reproductive health education ............................................................. 15
  2.4 Knowledge appropriation ................................................................................. 20
  2.5 Language as a form of social action .................................................................. 21

## CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY ............................................................................ 29
  3.1 Qualitative methods rationale .......................................................................... 29
  3.2 Ethnographic fieldwork ..................................................................................... 30
  3.3 Observed organizations .................................................................................... 31
  3.4 My positionality ................................................................................................ 32
  3.5 Data analysis ..................................................................................................... 35

## CHAPTER 4: THE POLITICS OF KNOWLEDGE IN NGO TEACHING ..................... 37
  4.1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 37
  4.2 Theoretical background ................................................................................... 39
  4.3 Training sessions for Tanzanian and American educators ............................... 42
     4.3.1 Constructing ideal teaching-translating situation .................................. 43
  4.4 Resources of gaze and body for turn-taking in multilingual co-teaching .......... 51
     4.4.1 Gaze and mutual orientation ................................................................... 52
     4.4.2 Intonation ................................................................................................ 56
     4.4.3 Misleading linguistic cues ................................................................ ...... 60
     4.4.4 Touch .................................................................................................... 64
  4.5 Failed transitions .............................................................................................. 68
4.6 Structural grounds for unequal epistemic status ........................................... 74
4.7 Space for conflict ......................................................................................... 78
4.8 Benefits of co-teaching ............................................................................... 81
4.9 Conclusion ................................................................................................. 85

CHAPTER 5: LANGUAGE SOCIALIZATION AND SEXUAL DESIRE .................. 86
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 86
5.2 Puberty in school- and NGO-curricula ..................................................... 87
5.3 Puberty and the body: emphasis on negative changes............................... 94
  5.3.1 ‘Weird places’: puberty for primary school students ......................... 94
  5.3.2 Puberty for secondary school students .............................................. 102
5.4 Puberty and the mind ............................................................................... 106
  5.4.1. Emotions for primary school students ............................................ 106
  5.4.2 Feelings for secondary school students and young adults ............... 111
5.5 Unequal need for sex and its implications............................................... 118
  5.5.1 Hisia kali sana ‘very strong desire’: Male desire .............................. 118
  5.5.2 Hisia tofauti ‘different desire’: Female desire .................................. 126
  5.5.3 Sex as a danger for girls ..................................................................... 130
5.6 Conclusion: Desire and agency ............................................................... 133

CHAPTER 6: DISCOURSES OF SEXUALITY AND PREVENTION ................ 135
6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 135
6.2 From desire to sex: constructing a negative image of sexuality ............... 136
6.3 Sex in talk: changing discursive norms ................................................... 139
6.4 Prevention methods .................................................................................. 145
  6.4.1 Calendar method ............................................................................... 146
  6.4.2 Absence of the ABC message .......................................................... 151
6.5 Elimu ni Nguvu ‘Knowledge is Power’ .................................................... 155
  6.5.1 A surrogate for prevention methods ............................................... 155
  6.5.2 Testing as prevention ....................................................................... 160
6.6 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 163

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION ........................................................................ 167
7.1 The politics of knowledge in action ............................................................ 167
7.2 Development talk as a ritualized interaction ............................................. 169
7.3 Manufacturing the knowledge needs .......................................................... 170
7.4 Language as a commodity ........................................................................ 170
7.5 Language as a lens to knowledge needs .................................................... 172

BIBLIOGRAPHY ......................................................................................... 174
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Ungrammatical Writing in NGO Posters</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Tanzanian Educator Attending to American Educator</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Tanzanian Educator Addressing Students</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Mutual Positioning of Educators</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Recognition of Possible Turn Completion</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Turn Completion with Eye Gaze</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Body Orientation when Changing Turns</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Teaching Poster Demonstrating Immune System Biology</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Embodied Attempt of Repair</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Miscoordination in Co-teaching</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11</td>
<td>Touch as Resource in Turn-taking</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.12</td>
<td>Unavailability of Touch for Turn-taking</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.13</td>
<td>American Educator Demonstrating Condom</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>Tanzanian Educator Doing Reported Speech</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>NGO Educators in a Primary School Setting</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Tanzanian NGO Educator Managing Classroom</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>NGO Drawings of Youth Undergoing Puberty</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Schoolbook Image of Youth Undergoing Puberty</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>NGO Drawings of Male and Female Bodies</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Portraying Discomfort from Abstinence for Men</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Poster “Elimu ni Nguvu” ‘Education is Power’</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TRANSCRIPTION CONVENTIONS


JOHN: Speaker's name. All names are pseudonyms.

?: Unidentifiable speaker.

?JOHN: Probable speaker.

(0.2): Length of pauses in seconds and tenth seconds.

[ The point of overlap.

(word) The best guess of a stretch of talk which was difficult to hear.

(( )) Unintelligible stretch of talk, one sign per one syllable.

((gaze)) Extralinguistic information.

WORD Increased amplitude.

word Sound lengthening.

wor- Word cut-off.

(h) Pulse of laughter.

= Latching, absence of a discernible silence between turns or within a turn.

. Falling intonation.

? Rising intonation.

, Continuing intonation.
ABBREVIATIONS


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONSEC</td>
<td>consecutive, interpropositional relation “so what” (-ka-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP</td>
<td>positive copula (ni)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMPH</td>
<td>emphatic interjection (Ndiyo; ndo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNO</td>
<td>gnomic (generic) aspect (hu-; -ga)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INT</td>
<td>interrogative particle (je)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRJ</td>
<td>interjection (eh; ehe:)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEG</td>
<td>negative copula (si)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PL</td>
<td>plural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRF</td>
<td>perfect tense (-me-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRS</td>
<td>present tense (-na-)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCPR</td>
<td>reciprocal (-ji-; -ana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL</td>
<td>relative prefix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIM</td>
<td>simultaneous taxis, interpropositional relationship (-ki-)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation is the final stage of a long journey through space and time, and I am grateful to have not been alone. First, I would like to thank my family. My parents’ unconditional love and self-sacrifice allowed me to pursue college education, a luxury that they did not have. With their own example they taught me how to be curious about the world, persistent at work, and resilient in times of uncertainty. I could never go this far if I had no place to return. I am grateful to Mick Smith for going with me through the ups and downs of the doctoral program, for joining me in my life across the continents, and for finding time to enjoy the moment.

I would like to express my deep appreciation to the professors from my Alma Mater, Alexander Yuryevich Zheltov and Ekaterina Georgievna Andreeva. They explained to me the value of intellectual endeavors, helped me in search of my own voice, and showed me the teacher who I once want to become. I am thankful for their support and friendship that lasts through years and distance.

I owe much to my committee. I am thankful to Katrina Daly Thompson for her generosity in sharing her knowledge about East Africa, her encouragement for critical engagement with language and culture, and her invaluable advice on teaching and research. Her feedback on my writing was always not only very thorough, but also insightful and stimulating for furthering my research. I am thankful to Candy Goodwin for her warm support. Her research on talk as a form of social action and on emotions as a socially displayed stance inspired me to conduct my ethnographic fieldwork. I was very fortunate to meet Paula Tavrow during my first quarter at UCLA. Her outstanding research, passionate teaching, and kind mentoring helped me in developing this research. I am honored to be a student of Chuck Goodwin and John Heritage. It
is from Chuck that I learned to understand talk as a collaborative achievement of interaction participants, to notice the body as an essential means of communication, and to appreciate context. In Chuck’s discourse lab I found the most exiting forum for intellectual exchange and growth. I am fortunate that it was John who introduced me to conversation analysis and ethnomethodology as a research paradigm and a method. His sense of humor, insightful comments and the genuine interest to my work inspired me in my research.

I would also like to thank all the organizations, educators, students, and community members in Tanzania who welcomed my research. I could not have had a safe, productive and such a life-changing experience in Tanzania without the friendship of Barbara Fischer and Johnson Gabriel Kiwango.

Lastly, this research was possible thanks to the generous support provided by the UCLA Dissertation Year Fellowship, the UCLA Graduate Division Non-resident Tuition Grants, and the Harry and Yvonne Lenart Graduate Research Travel Fellowship.
VITA

2009  M.A., Institute of Asia and Africa, Hamburg University, Germany

2006  B.A., Faculty of African and Oriental Studies, St.-Petersburg State University, Russia Magna Cum Laude

2014–2015  Dissertation Year Fellowship
           Graduate Division
           University of California, Los Angeles

2014–2015  Graduate Peer Advisor
           Career Center
           University of California, Los Angeles

2012–2013  Harry and Yvonne Lenart Graduate Research Travel Fellowship
           Humanities Division
           University of California, Los Angeles

2010–2014  Teaching Assistant/Associate/Fellow
           Elementary and Intermediate Swahili
           Department of Applied Linguistics
           University of California, Los Angeles

2011–2014  Teaching Associate/Fellow
           Departments of Applied Linguistics
           University of California, Los Angeles

2011–2014  ESL Teaching Associate/Fellow
           Department of Writing Programs
           University of California, Los Angeles

2011–2014  Russian Instructor and Curriculum Development Center for World Languages
           University of California, Los Angeles

2011  Teaching Assistant Coordinator
       Department of Writing Programs
       University of California, Los Angeles

2010  German Instructor
       Goethe-Institut
       Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
2007–2009  Postgraduate Fellowship  
  German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD)

2007–2008  Swahili Instructor  
  Faculty of African and Oriental Studies  
  St. Petersburg State University, Russia

2004–2005  Academic Excellence and Leadership Award  
  The Vladimir Potanin Foundation

PUBLICATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS


xv
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

I selected Tanzania for this study based on my research interests in East Africa and an internship experience at the German cultural center (Goethe-Institut)\(^1\) in Dar es Salaam in 2010. At that time I was introduced to the work of large development organizations subcontracted by European governments and the life of the expat community, unfolding primarily in air-conditioned offices, lounges of four-star hotels, and guarded mansions rented on tax-payers’ money. As an unpaid intern and also because of my Russian nationality and fluency in English, German, and Swahili, I had a chance to observe the expat life rather than be fully integrated into it. After participating in policy-planning meetings and reviewing development projects, I noticed striking incongruity in the activities of development organizations and my knowledge about culture and society in East Africa. In particular, I became interested in a countrywide initiative for setting up peer education about reproductive health in public schools; the initiative was sponsored by the governments of Germany and Sweden, and implemented by the Ministry of Education of Vocational Training in Tanzania. I had colleagues and personal acquaintances working on this project who expressed some interest in my doing follow-up research.

Later, when I began teaching Swahili in an American university, I learned from my students another perspective on development work based on their experience as volunteers in East Africa. In comparison to workers of large governmental and nongovernmental organizations, these volunteers had little understanding about the ideologies behind policy

\(^1\) Goethe-Institut is the Federal Republic of Germany’s cultural institute, active worldwide. The main task of Goethe-Institut is to promote the study of German as a second language and encourage international cultural exchange (https://www.goethe.de/en/uun.html). Goethe-Institut is a governmental organization, funded by the German Ministry of Foreign Affairs; additional funds are generated through German courses tuition fees. Currently there are 160 Goethe-Institutes in 94 countries.
making, and yet they had hands-on experience in development work from interacting with local people. They were building orphanages and wells, teaching English and mathematics to primary school students, and lecturing to local youth and adults about HIV/AIDS. Watkins, Swidler, and Hannan (2012, p. 291) suggested the term “butterflies” for this type of development workers and small-scale organizations—in contrast to “behemoths,” that is, large international development institutions. Based on my experience with “behemoths” and “butterflies,” I noticed that despite all the differences, they equally disregard language as an essential factor that shapes local cultures and impacts development efforts. The “butterfly” volunteers, however, displayed some change in this attitude, thus their motivation to study Swahili after returning to the U.S. My interest in the social life of language and knowledge about the socio-historical context in East Africa helped me formulate my initial research question—what happens in youth education about reproductive health in Tanzania and how speaking one or another language affects interaction in this context.

This dissertation is a report about my search for an answer. I will first introduce background information about Tanzania and its languages. I will then outline the relevance of reproductive health education worldwide and in East Africa in particular. In Chapter 2, I will introduce my theoretical framework followed by my methodology of data collection and analysis in Chapter 3. Chapters 4, 5, and 6 present my analysis of interactional practices and discourses that I identified as particularly relevant in relation to the transfer of knowledge about reproductive health and prevention methods.
1.1 Language and education in Tanzania

1.1.1 Country profile

Tanzania is a country in East Africa with the population of 35mln people (UNESCO, 2011, p. 102). Tanzania is a united republic that was formed in 1964 after the independence of the coastal state of Zanzibar and the continental Tanganyika. The newly formed republic was supported ideologically and financially by the Soviet Union. This fact explains the significant differences in socio-economic and cultural development of Tanzania from the geographically, ethnically, and historically similar Kenya. Until the dissolution of the Soviet Union in the 1990s, Tanzania was ruled by the single socialist party, with the first president Julius Nyerere as the author of the socialist doctrine called *ujamaa* ‘familyhood’ (Nyerere, 1968). The politics of *ujamaa* and its main principle of self-reliance guided all aspects of life, including the focus on agriculture, the organization of health system, education, and the national policy on language and ethnic groups.

The country is a home of approximately 120 ethnic groups; the majority speaks Bantu languages; there are also speakers of Cushitic, Nilotic, and Khoisan languages (Higgins, 2009, p. 22). Following the Soviet ideology, Nyerere had the goal to build a nation of Tanzanians. Language ideology and the organization of boarding school system were the main tools in shaping the new Tanzanian person whose identity has little to do with the ethnic belonging.

1.1.2 Swahili language

Linguistically, Swahili is a Bantu language from the Niger-Congo macro family. The language is closely genetically related to other widely spoken languages in East
Africa, including Kikuyu, Haya, Luganda. As other Bantu languages, Swahili has agglutinative structure; nouns are divided into noun classes based on their morphosyntactic features and semantics. Syntactic relationships are marked through verbal prefixes that are placed in subject-verb-object order. In comparison to most Bantu languages, Swahili is not a tonal language. Word stress always falls on the pre-last syllable; the syllable structure is open.

From the historical perspective, Swahili—the mother tongue of a small ethnic group residing on the Indian Ocean coast and islands in Kenya, Tanzania, and Malawi—was selected as the official language of the nation (Blommaert, 1996, pp. 246–247; Higgins, 2009, pp. 22–23). The language is the mother tongue of a small coastal Muslim population; up to 50% of the Standard Swahili vocabulary has Arabic origin. Swahili and its dialects have a long history as a lingua franca in East Africa. The Swahili people were at power during the Oman rule in the 18th century. When in the 19th century the territory of Tanzania became a part of German East Africa, the colonial administration invested in the language standardization for administrative and missionary purposes. The language script was changed from Arabic to Latin, and during the British rule, Swahili remained the languages of administration.

1.1.3 Education and language

Tanzanian educational system is built in accordance with the socialistic nation-building goal of the *ujamaa* program (Higgins, 2009, p. 25–28; Stambach, 2000). The schooling consists of primary and secondary education. Primary school is seven years long, culminating with the countrywide examination which results determine the access to the secondary school. The secondary school is four to six years long; following the
British system, the classes are called Form I to Form VI. The access to primary school is free of charge, resulting in literacy rates up to 80% in both genders (UNESCO, 2013). The rates of progression to secondary education are 39% for boys and 34% for girls (UNESCO, 2013, p. 102) which shows that the gender-based disparity becomes more visible on this level. There are a few reasons for this low and unequal progression rates, including the tuition fee that in most cases includes the room and board costs, and also the low proficiency in English (cf. Billings, 2011; 2013). In primary school the language of instruction is exclusively Swahili. Until the educational reform in Tanzania in 2015, Swahili in secondary school remained only as a subject, and all instruction and examinations were conducted in English. Students struggled with this transition from one language to another, and relied on memorization for performing during examinations. Not only students, but also teachers struggled with English as the language of instruction. Through the unified schooling, Swahili remains the language of the people that was “never strongly associated with a particular culture” (Blommaert, 1996, p. 252). After the turn to market-based economy in 1990s, English rapidly gains prestige and socio-economic value in Tanzania (Billings, 2011, 2013; Higgins, 2009).

Schooling and language ideologies are of central importance for the research on educational public health interventions implemented in Tanzania by foreign and local educators. This dissertation addresses the question about how these interventions fit into the existing social organization and what communicative means are employed for the information transfer.
1.2 Reproductive health in East Africa

Recent studies show that the sub-Saharan region is characterized by the lowest life expectancy rates and the highest rates of deaths caused by HIV/AIDS compared to other world regions (WHO, 2012, pp. 8083). In a report on the current state of reproductive health in the world, Glasier, Gülmezoglu, Schmid, Garcia Moreno, and Van Look (2006, p. 1597) show that in developing countries, after being underweight, unsafe sex is the second most prevalent risk factor leading to disease, disability, and death. In comparison, the two main risk factors in the developed world are tobacco consumption and high blood pressure. Unsafe sex causes transmission of infections which are sometimes fatal, and unwanted pregnancies leading to unsafe abortion, with women and children being most affected by these dangerous outcomes. The poor state of reproductive health and family planning services has a dramatic negative impact on the workforce dynamics that increases poverty, hunger, and social instability (Jacobstein, Bakamjian, Pile, & Wickstrom, 2009).

For youth in sub-Saharan Africa, unplanned pregnancy and sexually transmitted diseases, including HIV/AIDS, are among the main preventable negative health conditions (De Cock, Mbori-Ngacha, & Marum, 2002; Lamptey, Johnson, & Khan, 2006; UNICEF, 2012; WHO, 2012). In the face of the rapid population growth, decreasing resources, and HIV/AIDS epidemics, youth comprise the most vulnerable group of the world’s population in urgent need of services supporting their sexual and reproductive health (Channon, Matthews, & Falkingham, 2010; Dupas, 2011; Jacobstein et al., 2009; Lamptey et al., 2006; Lloyd, 2010; Malarcher, 2010). According to Channon et al. (2010, p. 83), “the sheer size of the populations now moving into their childbearing years is a challenge which can strain many health systems, as this
generation will give birth to the largest population increment the world has ever seen.” Indeed, adolescents constitute 23% of the population in sub-Saharan Africa with 28% of women giving birth before the age of 18 years (UNICEF, 2012, p. 133). Adolescents’ fertility rate with 117 per 1000 girls aged 15-19 years in sub-Saharan Africa is higher by far than elsewhere in the world (WHO, 2012, p. 167).

HIV/AIDS rates are equally alarming. The estimated HIV/AIDS prevalence among the population aged 15-49 years in sub-Saharan Africa is 4.8%, while in Eastern and Southern Africa it is as high as 7.1% (UNICEF, 2012, p. 103). The level of comprehensive knowledge\(^2\) of HIV/AIDS among youth aged 15-24 years in sub-Saharan Africa is as low as 35% among men and 26% among women; only 55% of young men and 33% of young women used a condom at last higher-risk sexual intercourse (UNICEF, 2012, p. 103).

1.3 Youth and reproductive health in Tanzania

Tanzania, one of the largest East African countries, is directly affected by these negative demographic and epidemiological trends: according to UNICEF (2011, p. 6), Tanzania is among the countries in sub-Saharan Africa that has the largest number of 15-24 year old people with new HIV infections. Within the country, prevalence rates vary dramatically, from 14.7% in Iringa to 0.6% in Zanzibar (NBS Tanzania, 2011, p. 35). The recent HIV/AIDS and Malaria Indicator Survey shows that the percentage of 15-19-year old girls who tested positive for HIV/AIDS is 3.9%, which is more than two times higher than 1.7% for boys at the same age (UNESCO, 2013, p. 103). Due to economic factors, girls are especially vulnerable to negative

\(^2\) This report is based on the Measure DHS Online Tools that defines comprehensive knowledge of HIV/AIDS as knowing about “two ways to prevent AIDS,” namely using condom and reducing the number of sexual partners, and rejecting three misconceptions,” for example, that a healthy looking person cannot be infected by HIV (http://www.measuredhs.com/hivdata/ind_detl.cfm?ind_id=36&prog_area_id=4).
outcomes of unplanned pregnancies and illegally preformed abortions (Chalamila et al., 2006; Matasha et al., 1998; Msamanga, & Moshiro, 1998; Mwakagile et al., 2001; Obasi et al., 2001; Silberschmidt & Rasch, 2001; Tengia-Kessey, Todd et al., 2004; Urassa, Moshiro, Chalamilla, Mhalu, & Sandstrom, 2008).

The fact that in Tanzania 10-25 year old people constitute 30% of the population (NBS Tanzania, 2006) has a twofold implication for the development of the country. On the one hand, this demographic situation creates a problem for the distribution of resources, which are limited by the poor state of the economy and relatively small proportion of working-age adults. On the other hand, the existence of a large youth population opens an opportunity for improving the workforce dynamics in the country by addressing preventable social ills, including unplanned pregnancies and STIs.

1.4 Reproductive health education

The need of effective reproductive health programs is persuasively argued by recent research demonstrating that in developing countries governmental family planning initiatives have a direct positive impact for reducing fertility, but also for preventing HIV/AIDS (Malarcher, 2010; Robinson, 2011). The governmental system of social welfare support is, however, poorly developed in the region, and local health systems rely heavily on outside donors (WHO, 2012, p. 142). The subject of reproductive health in particular “has failed to capture broad support from the donor community” primarily because “sexual and reproductive health is not only about disease, but also about a collection of related health and human-rights issues and many people are still confused about what it consists of” (Glasier, Gülmezoglu, Schmid, Garcia Moreno, & Van Look, 2006, p. 1604). The United Nation’s Population Fund uses the definition of reproductive health as “a responsible, satisfying and safe sex life” together
with “the capability to reproduce and the freedom to decide if, when and how often to do so” (United Nations, 1994). This definition suggests that a bio-physically attested healthy state of one’s reproductive functions is only one of the factors contributing to the person’s sexual wellbeing. Public health research demonstrates that bio-physical factors that contribute to unsatisfactory reproductive health are less prominent than the societal ones, for example, the ability to make free and responsible choices about one’s sexual life belong to the domains of culture, economics, and politics (Ashford, 2001; Glasier, Gülmezoglu, Schmid, Garcia Moreno, & Van Look, 2006; Malarcher, 2010).

Many programs for youth education about reproductive health have the goal to restructure the present social order and impose certain cultural and behavioral practices, and thus can be characterized as top-down interventions that are designed to address the identified and perceived knowledge needs. The ideas of gender equality and reproductive rights promoted by organizations that are supported by financially dominant international organizations, such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, are a subject of post- and neo-colonial debates (Altbach, 1971; Blum, 2009; Wickens & Sandlin, 2007; Young, 1990). Such behaviors as abstinence, HIV/AIDS testing, or condom use among people engaging in risky sexual behavior, are highly valued and actively promoted within the discourse of globalization by public health officials, policy makers, and NGO activists. These practices, however, may be often inherently foreign to target societies. Indeed, in many parts of Africa, open talk about sexuality, especially within unmarried gender mixed groups, is considered taboo (e.g. Fuglesang, 1997; Thompson, 2011a, 2011b). Educational interventions, therefore, are designed to break this taboo by enabling participants to verbally reflect on sexual and emotional relationships, and to evaluate them.
1.5 Talk in reproductive health education

In this dissertation, I draw attention to discursive practices that emerge in youth-centered education about reproductive health Tanzania. Watkins et al. (2012) in their review on literature about development work point out that there is little research about “the specificities of the context and the implementation practices—that is, about what actually happened” (p. 89). This dissertation draws attention to discursive practices that emerge in youth-centered education about reproductive health Tanzania. Talk in interaction is central to such development campaigns: first, it is the major teaching tool with which the knowledge about reproductive health is being transferred; secondly, its content covers linguistic and communicative skills which students can use for talking about taboo topics with peers and adults, negotiate safe sex with their partners, and request help from medical professionals. Thus when participating in youth-centered education programs about reproductive health, students are forced to break the taboo and negotiate social and moral norms regarding sexuality. Through introducing students to new discursive practices, educational development campaigns create a context where “different kinds of culturally specific subjectivities come into being” (Kulick & Schieffelin, 2004, p. 351).

The process of these transformations can be approached productively from the perspective of language socialization. Most research about socialization of youth into sexually aware subjects in East Africa focuses on traditional institutions, such as group initiations and marriage. Few studies mention that current political and socioeconomic changes relocate practices of socialization into sexual ideologies and norms from traditional institutions to modern schools and mundane peer interactions. This dissertation focuses on youth education about reproductive health as a rich site to study the role of language in the construction of sexual ideologies and norms through the discursive practices that are designed to socialize its
participants into sexually aware, socially and discursively empowered subjects.
CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This chapter outlines the theoretical framework that I apply for analyzing talk-in-interaction in reproductive health classes. First, I discuss the problem of the politics of knowledge that is relevant for the informational goals of educational campaigns in development work. I will explain the public health rationale behind such youth-centered interventions and how program design is affected by local cultural norms and socio-economic environment. I will then turn to a critical perspective on public health campaigns and present qualitative, ethnographically informed research that points out the complexity of cultural processes involved in the process of knowledge transfer. In this process, the new, global knowledge and the old, local knowledge become mutually transformed, and language is a crucial medium and also a tangible outcome of these transformations. Through the review of the literature on knowledge appropriation, I will demonstrate that research on language use in reproductive health campaigns can provide relevant insights on the politics of global and local knowledge. Finally, I will discuss the literature on language use in East Africa, and in Tanzania in particular, to situate talk in reproductive health campaigns as a novel and still understudied site where the traditional discursive normatively is actively challenged.

2.1 The politics of knowledge

Youth education about reproductive health has a long history of political attention and ideological debates across the world. Traditional and modern educational practices, formal and informal, center on the most intimate aspects of individuals’ lives in the attempt of controlling them. Questions about who can decide which knowledge is acceptable for the society and appropriate for the age and gender of the target population, and who can judge what beliefs and intimate practices should be forbidden is, therefore, an essential question of power distribution
(Bujra, 2007; Weiler, 2009). Foucault (1984) argues that knowledge and power are linked intrinsically; in development work, the mutually defining attributes of knowledge and power determine the value of promoted practices and define the ideology of social norm and good (Weiler, 2009). Public health campaigns, including modern youth education about reproductive health, belong to the realm of development. These campaigns exist because the institutions that implement them have the power to assess the current state of affairs and the resources to attempt to change this state according to externally negotiated beliefs about health and normality.

The World Health Organization (WHO) is the world leading institution with such power; the WHO (1946) defines health as “a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being, and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity.” This definition focuses not only on the objective, biomedical parameters of one’s body, but also on the essentially relative ideal of “social well-being.” Along with other international funding institutions, such as the United Nations (UN), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV and AIDS (UNAIDS), the WHO entitles itself with the power to determine what social order to consider satisfying or what as requiring a change (cf. Cooper & Packard, 1997, pp. 21–23). Within the sociology of knowledge, institutions are indeed identified as the primary force that imposes on individuals the evaluations of knowledge as either true or false beliefs (Goldman, 2009). Public health campaigns, therefore, intervene in the existing social order for adjusting it to the externally set ideals and goals. As Cooper and Packard (1997, p. 19) argue, “development is fundamentally about changing how people conduct their lives.” The politics of knowledge and the notion of true and false beliefs become issues of central relevance in regard to development campaigns for sexual and reproductive health as they are
tightly linked to culture-specific ideologies of gender and the normativity of sexual practices, including talk about sex (e.g. Milburn, 1995; Parker, 2001; Tavrow, 2010).

2.2 Theory behind youth-centered interventions

When defining education about sexual and reproductive as the distribution of “age-appropriate, culturally relevant and scientifically accurate information” about sexuality and gender for reducing risks and vulnerabilities causing infection with STIs, including HIV, unwanted pregnancy, and sexual abuse, the UNESCO seeks to promote the universal ideal of health as a human right (UNESCO, 2009, p. 2). Within this ideology, youth education about reproductive health is a non-medical top-down intervention for knowledge and behavior change. The Health Belief Model and Social Cognitive Theory provide a theoretical grounding for such educational campaigns (Bandura, 2001; U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2005). The Health Belief Model suggests promoting bio-medical knowledge along with individual motivation for avoiding or changing behaviors that lead to health concerns. Similarly focusing on the possibility for behavioral change based on individuals’ “sense of personal agency or self-efficacy” (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2005, p. 20), Social Cognitive Theory expands the attention from individual to intra-personal behaviors and suggests to provide the target population with knowledge and skills to perform the desired behavior “even when faced with obstacles” (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2005, p. 20). Research around the world attests that sexuality education based on these theories may result in such positive changes as the delay of sexual debut, reduction of the number of sexual partners, and increasing condom use (UNESCO, 2009, p. 13). These research findings are then used as the justification for continuous efforts for implementing of sexual and reproductive health education for youth (Channon et al., 2010; UNESCO, 2009, 2011, 2012, 2013; UNICEF, 2011).
In a cross-cultural evaluation of cost-effectiveness of sexuality education programs, Kivela, Ketting and Baltussen (2011) point out that such interventions are most effective when fully integrated into school program. They state, however, that due to the socio-cultural context in some areas, including East Africa (Kenya), “extracurricular, stand-alone programmes are the only ones that may currently be possible” (p. 12). Attempts to adjust the universal guidelines to local norms regarding talk about sex-related issues are reflected, for example, in the titles of these programs that range broadly from ‘sex education’, to ‘sexual education’, ‘family life education’, and ‘HIV/AIDS awareness’ (e.g. Irvin, 2000). For instance, the title ‘family life education’ indicates that some information about reproductive health is considered appropriate only for married people; in comparison to that, ‘HIV/AIDS awareness’ programs often focus exclusively on educating the target population about bio-medical aspects of HIV transmission. Although within the ideology of international development the access to modern information about reproductive health is considered a component of human rights, comprehensive educational programs about sexuality are rather rare.

2.3 Limits in reproductive health education

Educational programs about reproductive health fall generally in two types: on the one hand, risk avoidance programs with the “Abstain, Be faithful, use Condom” (ABC) message, and on the other hand, risk reduction programs providing comprehensive education on a variety of family planning methods and sexual health overall (Dupas, 2011). A quantitative study comparing risk avoidance with risk reduction interventions in Kenya showed that there is a significant positive impact associated with the latter, especially for female students (Duflo, Dupas, & Kremer, 2014; Dupas, 2011). In this study, the risk avoidance program promoting abstinence among middle and secondary school students was designed and implemented by the
Kenyan Ministry of Education. The risk reduction program was developed by a non-governmental organization (NGO); the main goal here was to demonstrate to the students the danger of engaging in a sexual activity with older and economically attractive partners and to explain why same-age sexual partners are associated with lower risk of HIV infection (Dupas, 2011, p. 2). Follow-up evaluations based on self-reported surveys registered an increase of premarital sexual activity among the students from schools that participated in the NGO-led program. Despite the increased sexual activity, there were fewer cases of unwanted adolescent pregnancies in these schools in comparison to schools with the abstinence-only program. Dupas (2011, p. 29) summarizes her study by arguing that “the sexual behavior of teenagers is responsive to information,” and suggests that educators change ideologies toward prevention methods and provide young people with an opportunity to make responsible choices about their intimate lives.

The results of this study from Kenya are comparable with finding from research on adolescent pregnancies, abortions, and STI transmission among young adults in Tanzania (Plummer et al., 2008; Silberschmidt & Rasch, 2001; Urassa et al., 2008). A study from rural Mwanza, Tanzania, demonstrated that although premarital sex and abortion are extremely stigmatized in the society, most young people are sexually active by the age of 15 (Plummer et al., 2008, p. 283; cf. Plummet & Wight, 2011). The knowledge about family planning methods among the rural youth in most cases is negligible, and herbal and ash solutions are used as traditional contraceptives, which inevitably leads to unwanted pregnancies, adverse health and social outcomes (cf. Marchant et al., 2004; Mushi et al., 2007).

Similarly to the state of knowledge in rural areas, in a study in the urban setting of Dar es Salaam Silberschmidt and Rasch (2001) showed, for example, that among 15-19 year old girls
the understanding about contraceptives is inadequate. This study also revealed that strict religious norms regarding abstinence before marriage do not predict delay of sexual activity and unwanted pregnancy. Among 51 participants recruited for the study from the post-abortion care patients, 18 (32%) were Christian and 33 (68%) were Muslim; all of them were unmarried and had had illegal abortions.³ Although the respondents knew about a variety of contraceptive methods, their knowledge was “very superficial” (Silberschmidt & Rasch, 2001, p. 1819); in particular they did not know how to correctly and regularly use pills and injectables, and also believed that hormonal contraceptives lead to long-term infertility and poor health overall. These findings indicate the existent ideology about prevention methods suggesting that women are the only responsible party for using contraceptives, and either males or females do not consider condoms as an option.

Other reports based on quantitative research methods show that young people in East Africa are similarly ill-informed about STIs, including HIV, and the prevention methods; for example, most youth in Tanzania are reportedly not able to recognize the symptoms of STIs (Mwambete & Mtaturu, 2006).

A need for comprehensive education about reproductive health in developing countries, including Tanzania, is widely acknowledged by development organizations (Aaro et al., 2006; Barnett, 1997; Fuglesang, 1997; Maswanya, Brown, & Merriman, 2009; McCauley, Salter, Kiragu, & Senderowitz, 1995; Obasi et al., 2006; UNESCO, 2011; UNICEF, 2011). And this is the point where developing countries become a part of the global ideological battlefield. Despite the scientific evidence that comprehensive sexuality education is a successful strategy for

³ In Tanzania abortion is legally permitted only to save a woman’s life (UNESCO, 2013, p. 103).
improving youth’s health around the globe, in most African countries educational efforts bring forward the abstinence-only message. As have been outlined above, in the discourse of international organizations, local ideologies, traditional religious beliefs, and unequal gender roles are regularly mentioned as obstacles for development efforts. Critical research, however, draws attention to the impact of global economic and political processes on the construction of such local ideologies (Higgins, 2010a, 2010b; Jones & Norton, 2010). In their analysis of the ABC program on HIV/AIDS prevention in Uganda, Jones and Norton (2010), for example, provide a historical perspective on condom use in the country and reveal how this prevention method gradually became stigmatized due to the rhetoric of development and African sexuality in the United States. In particular, they trace the history of “the war against condoms” (p. 158) to the “conservative, religious fundamentalism” (p. 158) guiding the funding policy of the United States under the Bush administration.

Indeed, sexuality and reproductive health education in the United States is a subject of ongoing political debates that represent not only the power struggle among political parties, religious organizations, and public health researchers (Doan & Williams, 2008; Irvine, 2002; Kendall, 2013), but also the historical transformation of ideology about age and gender and the attempts of adults to control the youth (Lesko, 2001). Irvine (2002), for example, outlines a historical perspective on “the battles over sex education” in the United States and on the events that brought to life the tropes of “the pregnant teen and the suicidal gay youth” as the beneficiaries of abstinence-only education (p. 109); condoms’ ineffectiveness due to micro-holes (p. 116); sex education as the cause of increased sexual activity among the youth (p. 132); and even sex talk as a form of child molestation (pp. 137–138). Despite the continuous efforts to negotiate an ideologically-unproblematic reproductive health curriculum, or perhaps due to these
efforts, the United States has still the highest rates of unwanted pregnancies among adolescents and STI rates among industrialized countries: by the age of twenty, one in three girls becomes pregnant and one in four teenagers is treated for STIs (Kendall, 2013, p. 1). Meanwhile research from countries that implement school-integrated comprehensive sexuality education demonstrates impressive results in reducing health concerns associated with risky sex behaviors. For example, Estonia after independence from the Soviet Union in the 1990s experienced a dramatic increase of syphilis and gonorrhea among 15-24 year olds; after the implementation of the countrywide curriculum the syphilis infections “almost disappeared” and gonorrhea “decreased more than tenfold” (Kivela, Ketting & Baltussen, 2011, p. 117). Despite the increase of reported sexual activity among the youth in the period 1992-2009, pregnancy and abortion rates decreased in Estonia by 58% and 62% respectively (Kivela, Ketting & Baltussen, 2011, p. 118).

In donor-dependent countries such as Uganda and Tanzania, development organizations have to adjust to the demands of the donors (Watkins et al., 2012, pp. 292–294). Reports that attribute the difficulty of implementation of a comprehensive, school-integrated sexuality education curriculum to local cultural norms, such as the study by Kivela, Ketting and Baltussen, (2011) mentioned earlier, may, therefore, misinterpret the cause-and-effect relationship here. Due to the change in ideology about reproductive health in the early 2000s in the United States, in Uganda development agencies had to re-train their educators to promote abstinence-only in order to secure funding (Jones & Norton, 2007; 2011). These were the very same educators who earlier were supposed to inform the population about the benefits of condom use. Such externally induced changes in ideology about sexual practices cause distrust to development efforts in general and also fail to address the needs of the target population. Jones and Norton (2007; 2010)
with their ethnographic research on sexual practices and ideologies among Ugandan school students demonstrate that for a variety of cultural and especially economic reasons, abstinence is often not a choice for young women. By restricting access to condoms and other contraceptives, policy makers limit life choices of students, particularly females.

2.4 Knowledge appropriation

Qualitative research such as by Johnson and Norton (2007; 2010) brings to light a problem in sexual and reproductive education that goes beyond the question of the scope of the delivered information and draws attention to the discrepancy between knowledge and behavior: sexual health literacy does not translate into safe sexual practices. In contrast to quantitative studies, ethnographic research reveals that young people in sub-Saharan Africa have nowadays a “fairly sophisticated” knowledge about sex and possible sex outcomes (McLaughlin, Swartz, Kiragu, & Mohamed, 2012, p. 73). In response, development organizations propose a life skills curriculum (ARFH, 2000; Dilger, 2003; Peace Corps, 2001). In an analysis of a life-skill training program for NGO-educators in Tanzania, Higgins (2009, p. 69) points out that this curriculum is based on the idea of “rational individualism.” The focus on individual behavioral changes is grounded in the aforementioned Social Cognitive Theory; its assumptions may be incongruent with not only social context, but also with individual psychological experiences of self and the world in non-Western societies. Higgins (2010b, p. 77) brings an example from a training session in Tanzania where a local educator struggles to explain to his audience the concept of empathy as an essential life skill. The participants display understanding only when the educator reframes empathy in terms of a social action and not as a feeling. Anthropological research supports the idea that emotions are essentially a stance rather than feelings; children learn to understand and display emotions relevant to the context of their socialization (Goodwin, Cekaite,
& Goodwin, 2012).

This example demonstrates that knowledge transfer is not a linear, one-directional process; rather, it can be approached as knowledge appropriation where “dominant discourses have been taken over selectively and, sometimes, superficially to facilitate a convenient coexistence with local cultures” (Canagarajah, 2002, p. 248). Watkins et al. (2012, p. 296) note that the problem of development organizations is often rooted in the “paradoxical nature of the altruism itself”: donors impose their understanding of the needs on the target population. Critical scholars of post- and neo-colonialism argue that formal youth education about reproductive health, along with such Western constructs as scientific research methods, evidence-based medicine, or social welfare, alienate people in developing countries from an “active struggle” (eg. Chilisa, 2005, p. 659). The knowledge from the global West, however, still becomes integrated in the local system of norms and beliefs in some way.

Knowledge appropriation is an essential human sense-making practice that inevitably changes not only the understanding of the world by those who receive the knowledge, but also transforms the initial message. Few studies have addressed so far how development campaigns for promoting sexual and reproductive health have been affected by processes of knowledge appropriation and what discourses emerge in response (Higgins & Norton, 2010).

2.5 Language as a form of social action

Talk in interaction is the vehicle of many development educational campaigns. “Talk” is all that NGOs “do all day,” state Watkins et al. (2012, p. 299) in their seminal review of research on NGOs worldwide. Building on the theory of practice and Bourdieu’s notion of habitus, Goodwin (1990) argues that talk "should be at the core of a general theory of human social organization, one that embodies linguistic and cultural competence" (p. 287). Interaction is then
both the setting and the practice through which people organize their social lives, and language is the main tool for shaping this organization. Attention to development interactions, such as seminars, trainings, community events, can help bring to light the unfolding process of knowledge appropriation and negotiation of the social order.

The research paradigm of language socialization (Kulick & Schieffelin, 2004; Schieffelin & Ochs, 1986) offers a comprehensive approach to understanding the role of language in youth-centered education about reproductive health. Schieffelin and Ochs (1986, p. 172) state that the “crucial information concerning the organization of society and local knowledge is conveyed not simply through the content of language but through its grammatical and discourse form as well.” Ochs ([1993] 2005) emphasizes that linguistic resources play an essential role in shaping social identities, which “evolve in the course of social interaction, transformed in response to acts and stances of other interlocutors as well as to fluctuations in how a speaker decides to participate in the activity at hand” (p. 85). Within youth-centered education programs, students are exposed to talk about delicate topics and are encouraged to use novel discursive practices when interacting with educators, participating in discussions with other students, or engaging in role plays (cf. Bujra, 2007, p. 19). The definition of ideology as a semiotic process which “organizes and enables all cultural beliefs and practices as well as the power relations that result from these” (Bucholtz & Hall, 2004, p. 379), emphasizes a transformative and also a preserving role of language in society. Thus the acquisition of formal knowledge about reproductive health and the discursive strategies for verbalizing this knowledge may have direct consequences on the realization, maintenance, and transformation of ideologies about sex and gender.

In sub-Saharan Africa talk about sex is generally considered a taboo. Discursive prohibitions surrounding sex-related issues are well described for the Muslim population in East
Africa, especially for female first-language Swahili speakers in Tanzania and Kenya (eg. Hirsch, 1998; Thompson, 2011b). Encoding sexual messages in the art forms of writings on kanga-clothes, in traditional songs *taarab* and in *fumbo*-puzzles are among the few available media for transgression of discursive taboos (Beck, 2005; Yahya-Othman, 1997;). A Swahili woman is expected not only to avoid talk about sex, but to be silent in general, which Thompson interprets as the result of a societal emphasis on Islamic discretion (Thompson, 2011b, pp. 5–6). The instructions which a bride gets before her wedding is an important traditional institution which socializes Swahili women in this gender role. Offering a historical perspective on sex instructions in Muslim East Africa, Thompson (2011a) suggests that these instructions originate in the traditional pre-Islamic rites of passages, called *unyago* for girls. The traditional puberty rites for boys are called *jando* (cf. Fuglesang, 1997). Instructions in *jando* and *unyago* were provided to the youth at the time of puberty in a gender-segregated group setting. Elements of female initiation practices are integrated in the modern day Islamic wedding preparations on the Swahili coast: here a group of experienced older women instructs a bride mainly about hygiene and strategies for pleasing the husband (Thompson, 2011a, p. 434). A married Muslim woman other than one’s mother may perform the role of a sex instructor for both male and female youth. Regarding the language socialization during pre-wedding preparations, Thompson (2011b, pp. 5–6) points out that the instructions are characterized by the lack of explicit verbalization, use of euphemisms, and the substitution of words referring to sexual organs and sexual practices through body language.

The research about language socialization in gender roles among non-native Swahili speakers in Eastern Africa is scarce. In public health studies there is a tendency to attribute the initiation rites of *jando* and *unyago* for East African societies in general, to idealize them as
traditional sex education (cf. Fuglesang, 1997), and to use them for development interventions in an attempt to gain support from local communities (cf. Erulkar et al., 2004; Irvin, 2000). For example, the Nyeri Youth Health Project implemented in Kenya in 1997-2001 was designed as a “culturally consistent” adolescents’ reproductive health program that was based on the local social concept of atiri, that is, young married adults who are highly respected in the Kikuyu community and traditionally serve as instructors in the rites of passage (Erulkar et al., 2004). The program was grounded in the ecological theory of behavioral change (Hovell et al., 1994), which emphasizes the importance of employing existing infrastructures. During the project, the atiri-counselors were selected and trained to educate youth about reproductive health. The evaluation of the program based on surveys, self-administered questionnaires, and interviews showed such changes in participants’ sexual behavior as increased condom use among boys and a decreased number of sexual partners for both boys and girls. The reported improvement of communicative skills for discussing issues of sexual and reproductive health was another important outcome. Despite these results, the program was characterized by low sustainability due to the fact that the atiri-counselors agreed to fulfill this role only for payment from the external source. It appears that despite the attempts to indexically link development efforts to a local social structure, the local community did not recognize such programs as inherent or authentic.

Historical and ethnographic research from East Africa records significant differences in traditions associated with puberty across ethnic groups. More importantly, research also demonstrates that formal schooling has dramatically changed the social meaning of puberty by reducing its relevance for social organization and shifting the responsibility for educating young people about sexual and reproductive health from traditional institutions (eg. Allen, 2000; Setel, 1999; Stambach, 2000). With the example of Sukuma people from West Central Tanzania, Allen
warns that a call “to return to ‘traditional’ sex education in a community where formal instruction about the facts of life was never a tradition” is mere rhetoric (p. 20). According to Allen (2000), mundane peer interactions are the main context in which knowledge about sexual issues is acquired and shared in Tanzania, especially among adult women. In a similar line of reasoning, Fuglesang (1997) draws attention to the increasing importance of youth peer interactions for the socialization in gender roles. She argues that "peers, not parents, are the most important source of knowledge" and points that this knowledge is limited, distorted by misconceptions and often misleading (p. 1246). Institutionalization of interactions about sexual and reproductive health is the ultimate response of development organizations to changing social structures.

When defining institutional talk, Heritage (2005) argues that “it is fundamentally through interaction that context is built, invoked, and managed, and that it is through interaction that institutional imperatives originating from outside the interaction are evidenced and made real and enforceable for the participants” (p. 109). Few studies address the questions of how institutionalization of youth-centered education about sexual and reproductive health changes ideologies about gender and sexuality in sub-Saharan Africa. Talking meanwhile is the core “technology” used by development organizations in resource-challenged environments; talk is “persistently seen by donors as key to sustainability” (Watkins et al., 2012, p. 299). Conversation analysis offers a productive method for revealing institutional practices, stances, and identities negotiated in these interactions. In particular, conversation analysis allows a systematic approach to the politics of knowledge from the micro-perspective of the turn-by-turn negotiation of the epistemic authority, that is, “the distribution of rights and responsibilities regarding what participants can accountably know, how they know it, whether they have rights to describe it,
Language, its discursive forms, and grammar are powerful resources for conveying specific ideologies or indexing their transformations (Ochs, 1992). In Tanzania, socio-economic transformations are directly reflected in language choice. The selection of Swahili, a native language for a small ethnic group in the coast of East Africa, as a national language of Tanzania is connected to the post-colonial history of the country and the politics of socialistic national building *ujamaa* (e.g. Blommaert, 1996; Legere, 2006). Since this politics was abandoned in the 1990s, English has rapidly increased its role in professional, educational, and mundane interactions (eg. Billings, 2013; Higgins, 2009). The resulting multilingualism can be seen as broader than “the appropriation and incorporation for meaning-making of any and all linguistic resources which come to hand” (Blackledge & Creese, 2010). Higgins (2009) uses Bakhtin’s term *multivocality* “to explore how various languages are voiced (and censured) in multilingual societies in response to centripetal and centrifugal forces” (p. 8). For example, Thompson (2010) in a study on the stylized performance of a Tanzanian rapper who artfully uses standard and non-standard variations of Swahili, as well as Maa and English, shows how language indexes and affirms dominant ideologies of language and ethnicity despite the declared intent of the artist to challenge them.

With regard to development discourse, the indexicality of multilingualism is evident in attempts to adequately translate the essential vocabulary associated with global knowledge. In Tanzania, Swahili has a long history of formal standardization and development initiatives directly controlled by the state (Legere, 2006). Outlining the current language policy in Tanzania, Zaja (2011) states that efforts to craft modern terminology should be “contextually situated and culturally nuanced” and that “language must then be seen both as an asset and a
hurdle that has to be addressed in development intervention and aid evaluation” (pp. 97–111). Zaja (2011) illustrates the challenges of terminology development with the example of the term intervention: he argues that the initial translation into Swahili with the word mwingilio is inadequate because depending on the context it can also mean interference, intrusion, penetration, or assault; in place of mwingilio, the word ufadhi support’ is suggested. Such lexicographic work represents the puristic approach to Swahili as the national language and an active attempt to appropriate lexical items which index ideology and socio-political realia of the Western world. Other studies point out the ongoing process of integration of foreign discourses in Tanzania through code-switching which leads to the creation of “third cultures” and “third spaces” (e.g. Higgins 2009; 2011; Pennycook, 2001); in other words “development aid also makes available to everyone, from elites to villagers, new cosmopolitan vocabularies” (Watkins et al., 2012, p. 304).

Qualitative research that closely attends to language and interactional practices in development education interventions allows insight into “institutions within a society as dynamic rather than static cultural processes” (Goodwin, 1990, p. 287). This perspective is essential for gaining understanding about the politics of global and local knowledge, its transfer and appropriation.

Although Watkins et al. (2012, p. 306) characterize talk as the least sophisticated or effective “technology” available to development organizations, it remains the most ubiquitously used tool in resource-challenged contexts with multiple uncertainties. The role of talk in building symbolic and human capital remains underestimated and understudied. The research paradigm of language socialization and the notion of talk as a form social action build the theoretical framework for responding to the question of how social identities, ideologies about gender roles,
and sexuality are being constructed, negotiated, and transformed by the participants in youth education about reproductive health.
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

In this chapter I will present my rationale for using qualitative methods for collecting and analyzing data on reproductive health education. I will discuss ethnographic fieldwork as the unique method for collecting audio- and video-recordings of talk emerging in interactions among educators and their audience. I will present my field work process, including my positionality, and describe the organizations that agreed to host my project. Finally, I will outline my methods of data analysis, including theory-based transcription, conversation analysis, discourse analysis, and critical discourse analysis.

3.1 Qualitative methods rationale

Research on educational development work in resource-poor contexts has been heavily criticized for its lack of reliability (Milburn, 1995; Watkins et al., 2012). For political and economical reasons, evaluation studies are rarely required by donor organizations; when still conducted, these studies are usually based on self-reported data, including testimonies, interviews, focus group discussions, surveys and questionnaires (Dureya, 1991; Todd et al., 2004; Walden, Mwangulube, & Makhumula-Nkhoma, 1999). There are no guarantees that these data are accurate; for example, in a study on sexual health of primary school students in rural Tanzania, only 39% of girls who had biological markers of sexual activity—that is, who tested positively for sexually transmitted diseases or pregnancy—reported having had sex (Todd et al., 2004, p. 35). Watkins et al. (2012, pp. 300–303) point out that evaluative studies are usually conducted after the intervention, with no baseline data; thus, they cannot adequately reflect cause and effect relationships between development work and the state of knowledge and health in the target population after the intervention has been completed. Counting participants and activities; collecting testimonies from beneficiaries; and involving an external expert
(consultant) to create a report outlining recommendations for future improvement: these are the typical research activities reported in evaluative studies. These methods are heavily criticized as “designed not to evaluate but to create success” (Watkins et al., 2012, p. 303).

Ethnographic research on public health campaigns in developing countries is rather rare (Higgins & Norton, 2010, p. 7). Only a few studies so far have used qualitative methods to understand discourses generated by public health interventions and their influence on socio-cultural processes (e.g. Higgins, 2010a, 2010b; Nnko & Pool, 1997). Higgins and Norton (2010, p. 10) state that “while large sums of money are used year after year to fund educational campaigns that seek to get messages of prevention and behavior change across to high-risk population, little is known about how these messages are communicated or what discourses emerge in response.” The continuing interest from donor organization to youth-centered programs and the identified lack of knowledge about “the specificities of the context and the implementation practices” (Watkins et al., 2012, p. 289), that is, about discursive practices within such programs, indicate relevance of ethnographic methods, especially participant observation, for data collection (Blommaert & Jie, 2010; Duranti, 1994; Goodwin, 1990).

3.2 Ethnographic fieldwork

Ethnographic fieldwork is a type of professional initiation; it is characterized by uncertainties and requires from the researcher curiosity, alertness, and adaptability (cf. Scheyvens & Storey, 2003). The fieldwork I conducted for this dissertation is typical in this sense. My original research proposal was focused on peer education programs about sexual and reproductive health in Tanzania. I selected the method of participant observation for data collection. Prior to the fieldwork, I identified the organizations that promoted peer education in
Tanzania and established initial contact with them. Upon my arrival to the country, I learned that projects and intervention proposals available on the organizations’ websites rarely correspond with the activities that they actually undertake. Thus I broadened my research focus to embrace a wide range of ongoing youth-centered programs about reproductive health.

I collected the data for this research during eight months of fieldwork in Tanzania in the period of August 2012–March 2013. The northwestern city of Arusha and the surrounding rural areas were the main sites for my fieldwork. Interviews with students, educators, schoolteachers, NGO and government representatives enriched my understanding about the context of the observed educational programs. To compare the goals of observed organizations and their relation to the local context, I analyzed the content of program texts and materials, such as curricula, textbooks, magazines, booklets, and promotional videos. Video- and audio-based participatory ethnography of training sessions for future educators, educational sessions for youth and adults, and community events organized by the observed NGOs, as well as writing ethnographic field notes (Emerson, Fretz, & Shaw, 1995) were as the main method for collecting the data.

3.3 Observed organizations

During my fieldwork, I have conducted observations of 10 different NGOs and interviewed representatives of 25 NGOs and governmental organizations. The literature on development organizations worldwide, especially on NGOs, reflects the changing attitudes toward and aspirations about altruist movements. Fischer (1997) describes the rapid growth of

---

4 The fieldwork was supported by Harry and Yvonne Lenart Graduate Travel Fellowship. The study was approved by the UCLA Internal Review Board (IRB 12-000393). The research clearance from the Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology was acquired in October 2012.

5 I explain more about my participation below.
NGO number as an indicator of upcoming positive outcomes of their work, such as building civil society in developing countries, fighting social ills, and creating an opposition to the corrupt state. About a decade later, Watkins et al. (2012) were rather critical when characterizing NGOs as organizations that are deeply involved in the reproduction of a neocolonial industrial social order. They emphasize that uncertainties—about funding, donors’ demands, local environment, or responses from beneficiaries—shape the lives of NGOs: they grow and die randomly, or constantly change their agenda to satisfy donors’ expectations. Attempts to create a typology of NGOs or even merely count the number of NGOs remain futile.

Factors contributing to their institutional uncertainty explain why it is hard to create a comprehensive overview of the organizations observed for this research: the number of their staff members and volunteers, their funding sources and target groups, their planned and actually conducted activities vary significantly. What remains same across the organizations I studied is the ubiquitous employment of the same technique, that is, talk about sex, as the main method for improving sexual and reproductive health in the target population. For this research, the focus is thus not on the organizations themselves, but on talk in interaction facilitated by them. The names of the organizations will remain, therefore, undisclosed. Although my goal is to be critical about the observed development work, I try to avoid criticizing—the examples of communicative success and failure discussed in the following chapter are generalizable to the type of interventions and not reducible to singular instances or to the faults of a particular NGO.

3.4 My positionality

In the field I learned that the way I was perceived by development workers and local people significantly impacted my access to potential research sites. Almost immediately after arriving in Tanzania, I experienced resistance from the main organization that I had envisioned
would host my research. Despite the research permit from the Tanzanian Commission for Science and Technology, the main countrywide non-governmental network of peer education school clubs and the only governmental program for peer education, forbade me to contact or observe student groups that they supervise. The governmental representative eventually informed me that their programs were shut down or hard to find because of the school schedule. Other reasons mentioned were the lack of program sustainability due to funding cuts and high staff turnover. The NGO considered their intervention sites as their “products”; research then was treated as a profit-generating activity for either the organization itself, or the researcher. In the first case, they would have liked an evaluative study that would report a story of intervention success. In my case, that is, as a doctoral student without any affiliation with a donor organization, research had immediate tangible benefits for building academic identity and proving my professional skills. Not able to pay for data access, I had to find alternative research sites.

I began my search from Dar es Salaam, the main political and financial center in Tanzania. I conducted interviews in order to collect information about ongoing programs about reproductive health and also to introduce my research proposal to various organizations. Operating on restricted research funds and because of safety concerns, I had to limit the geography of my research to the area reachable by means of public transportation, preferably during daylight hours. Soon I realized that Dar es Salaam is crowded by intermediate-level organizations whose main activity is grant-writing and subcontracting smaller NGOs for administering training sessions and workshops elsewhere. In interviews with representatives of grass root level NGOs I found that my research time, that is, the period from August to December 2012, was rather unfortunate. First, this is the end of fiscal year and NGOs are busy
preparing reports about completed activities and writing grant applications for the new year. Second, in the year of my fieldwork, the parliament of Tanzania was undergoing elections and debates on the new constitution, so official life was put on hold waiting for decisions regarding development policy and new laws.

Two months after my arrival to Tanzania, I relocated from Dar es Salaam to Arusha where I had contacts with small international NGOs thanks to my Swahili students in the United States. These NGOs were mainly funded by fees paid by volunteers, and therefore, were less affected by the changes in the fiscal cycle and the ongoing transformations of the political system. Although Arusha experiences flood of tourists and short-time volunteers, there are also fewer Western expats who reside for a long period of time than in Dar es Salaam. This raised people’s curiosity toward me and helped me grow my research network, gaining access to valuable research sites.

Over time, I became integrated in the life of the observed NGOs. Because I worked simultaneously with a number of NGOs that were mutually independent, although interconnected through their focus on HIV/AIDS and reproductive health, none of the organization considered me as “belonging” to them. Aware that their support and information were essential to my professional career, I wanted to give something back to them without, however, being influenced by their agenda and the expectation to produce a praising report. I was present at organizational meetings, training sessions, community events, and educational classes. I helped in translation when needed; offered a brief introduction to Swahili language to newly arrived American volunteers, as well as English tutoring to local school children; I taught workshops on technology use and shared my knowledge about funding opportunities for international students abroad. I went to church with NGO staff when I was initiated and joined school graduation
celebrations. Whenever feasible, I conducted video recordings and made photographs; I printed some of the photographs and burnt CDs with video recordings for all participants who wanted to have a copy.

Due to my proficiency in Swahili and also my recognizably non-native English pronunciation, American volunteers and local NGO staff treated me as a third party, not representing any of the “us” or “them” sides. My research focus on language in reproductive health education was understood as a part of my professional training as a Swahili teacher and encountered with enthusiasm: Local NGO workers entertained the idea that more foreign volunteers could speak Swahili; Tanzanians overall expressed pride when finding out that not only do they need to learn a Western language, but also people in the West learn theirs.

3.5 Data analysis

I have collected 57 hours of video and about 220 hours of audio recordings, and began the analysis from the close engagement with the recordings in light of my research questions. Guided by my field notes, I searched for interactional episodes that are typical and prominent for negotiating discursive norms, that is how to talk about intimate issues, what information to treat as appropriate or relevant (cf. Hutchby & Wooffitt, 1998).

I have transcribed the selected episodes using a modified version of the transcription convention suggested by Sacks, Schegloff, and Jefferson (1974). The transcripts used in this dissertation reflect the theory behind my analysis (Ochs, 1979), and thus include notations of non-verbal behavior as an essential component of talk-in-interaction. The transcripts are equipped with an interlinear morphological gloss (Comrie et al., 2008) and English translation in order to allow the reader access to the analysis of linguistic structures. I applied discourse analysis to understand the messages constructed in reproductive health classes, as well as the
grammatically and semantically encoded stances displayed by the speakers (cf. Duranti, 1994; Goodwin, 1990; Goodwin, 2006). I used conversation analysis to reveal how educators and their audience negotiate the morality of knowledge through the sequential organization of the talk and turn design (Pomerantz, 1979/1984, 1986; Sacks, 1995; Sacks et al., 1974; Schegloff, 2007; Stivers, Mondada, & Steesing, 2011). I drew on the principles of critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 1993, 2003) to systematically position the linguistic structures that I found prominent to the historical and socio-cultural context.
CHAPTER 4: THE POLITICS OF KNOWLEDGE IN NGO TEACHING

In this chapter I outline how knowledge value is negotiated through turn-taking in interactions among American and Tanzanian NGO educators and how knowledge is then delivered during informal educational sessions about reproductive health in rural Tanzania. I will demonstrate that this multilingual context presents a paradoxical situation where those participants with superior epistemic status and access (Heritage, 2012) are positioned low in the social hierarchy precisely because of their superior knowledge of the language and context. I will argue that the epistemic stance of American educators as more knowledgeable is systematically constructed and actively sustained by both American and Tanzanian educators in a collaborative manner.

4.1 Introduction

The data for this chapter come from ethnographic observations, as well as audio and video recordings conducted in two settings: first, training sessions for future educators; and secondly, the educational sessions led subsequently by them in rural communities. I observed that in Tanzania the practice of co-teaching by foreign and local educators is wide-spread. In the following I will discuss typical educational sessions that were led by a group of two to eight educators. Each group included American college students with very limited knowledge of Swahili paired with Tanzanian college students proficient in both Swahili and English. Rural residents of northwestern Tanzania—from school children, to out of school youth, adult community members—who speak little to no English were the target audience of this teaching.

I will suggest that the outlined setting presents an extreme case of asymmetric linguistic competences (Müller, 1989, p. 736) and asymmetric epistemic access (Heritage, 2012; Heritage & Raymond, 2005; Stivers et al., 2011). Asymmetric linguistic competences refer here to
unequal proficiency in languages, and asymmetric epistemic access—to relative knowing or unknowing of the subject of conversation among the co-participants of interaction. Besides speaking both Swahili and English, Tanzanian educators in the observed NGOs proved to have an extensive knowledge about the location, as well as prior work experience and relevant higher education in community development and teaching. Nevertheless, they were expected to primarily provide translation services to the monolingual American educators who knew far less about the country and the region, and who had only limited relevant work experience in community development and education. The membership categorizations used by some of the observed NGOs reflects the unequal roles among the local and foreign educators: while Tanzanian co-educators were called teaching partners, Americans were called instead volunteers, which undermines the default semantics of partnership.

I will demonstrate that during training sessions Tanzanian educators are socialized in competing roles of educators and interpreters. The interaction between co-educators during teaching sessions is characterized by rapidly changing footing, where the Tanzanian speakers quickly shift between the roles of educator and interpreter. As a result, transition-relevance places—that is, the place of the first possible completion of a turn (Sacks et al., 1974, p. 703)—become a major resource and also an obstacle for conducting a successful teaching session. The failure to smoothly coordinate the transition of the floor between the educators may result in loss of trust and lead to conflict between them.

I will conclude this chapter by suggesting that despite multiple problematic points in the design of such educational interventions, co-teaching may be particularly beneficial for reaching the NGO agenda, especially as a factor for overcoming stigma associated with HIV/AIDS and discussing taboo topics, such as condom use.
4.2 Theoretical background

This chapter deals with the following set of questions: how speakers display their status as knowing or not-knowing about some issue; how they index the source of this knowledge, and how they negotiate whose knowledge has a higher value. In linguistic research, this question has been addressed in terms of evidentiality (e.g. Aikhenvald, 2003; Dendale & Tasmivski, 2001; Nuckolls & Michael, 2014; Plungian, 2001) and epistemic modality (Coates, 1987, 1995; Eagan & Weatherson, 2011). Aikhenvald (2003, p. 2) defines evidentiality as “stating the existence of evidence for some information” including “stating that there is some evidence, and also specifying what type of evidence there is.” According to Coates (1995, p. 55), “[e]pistemic modality is concerned with speaker’s assumptions or assessment of possibilities, and in most cases it indicates the speaker’s confidence or lack of confidence in the truth of the proposition expressed.” These definitions show that linguistic research focuses on the grammatical resources afforded to the speaker regardless of the interactional context.

For co-participants in talk, evidentiality and epistemic modality may be among the most relevant resources for negotiating epistemic authority, that is, “determining whose view is more significant or more authoritative with respect to the matter at hand” (Raymond & Heritage, 2005, p. 15). In research on social interaction and talk as a form of social action (Heritage, 2012; Heritage & Raymond, 2005; Stivers et al., 2011; Stivers & Rossano, 2010), knowledge is constructed and sustained through interaction, and the question of access to a particular domain of knowledge correlates directly with the issues of morality of this access, rights and responsibilities associated with knowing or not knowing something. The area of knowledge at stake is then defined as an epistemic domain (Stivers & Rossano, 2010, p. 8), and epistemic status refers to the relative access to this domain between the co-participants in interaction.
Epistemic stance is then the display of relative epistemic status in interaction, or as stated by Heritage (2012, p. 6), “the moment-by-moment expression” of social relationship defined by the epistemic status. In a mundane conversation, speakers have a variety of resources to display their epistemic stance and negotiate their epistemic status, such as questions, assessments, and repairs. But in an institutional setting, the respective institutional roles may predefine the interaction, resulting in a limited range of epistemic stances to be displayed. For example, in traditional news interviews, an interviewer is the one who has the task of interrogating and by so doing displaying a less knowledgeable status than the interviewee (e.g. Heritage, 2002; Heritage & Clayman, 2010).

While there is an abundance of research on talk in a variety of institutional settings, such as courtroom interactions, call centers, doctor-patient interactions, and classroom interactions (Drew & Heritage, 1992; Heritage, 2005; Heritage & Clayman, 2010; Hirsch, 1998; Peräkylä, 1995; Silverman & Peräkylä, 1990; Silverman, 1997), most of these studies focus on the dyadic provider-client relationship, presupposing a clear distribution of roles based on relative epistemic status. Despite a large body of research on interactions between teachers and students, little is known about the organization of talk between multiple teachers co-present during educational sessions. The main focus of such studies has been from the perspective of educational studies and planning, especially in regard to accommodating disabled students (e.g. Davison, 2006; DelliCarpini 2014; Friend, Cock, Hurley-Chamberlain, & Shamberger, 2010; Rytivaara & Kershner, 2012; Villa, Thousand & Nevin, 2013; Wilson & Blednick 2011). As for multilingual co-teaching interactions, the majority of studies focus on second language learning classrooms, especially English as a second language (e.g. Carless & Walker, 2006; Jeon, 2009; Park, 2014). The setting of the present study, namely classes in which non-professional educators conduct
content-based instruction in two languages, has not been analyzed yet. In co-taught language classes, local and foreign educators have a clearer role distribution and expectedly different competencies than in the context of the observed classes. Teaching activities that are complicated by the ongoing process of role negotiation is a productive site for studying interactional practices and social organization in a post-colonial context.

The instructional interaction I describe here can also be approached as another type of institutional talk, that is, related to translation, interpreting, and language brokering (Bolden, 2000; Haffner, 1992; Orellana, 2009; Tse, 1995, 1996). Working within the conversation analytic tradition, Müller (1989, p. 715) suggests approaching turn-taking in situations where non-professional multilingual speakers mediate knowledge transfer as the “translatory mode” of interaction. Müller points out that in comparison to professionals, non-professional translators treat their mediatory turns as “a resource for more elaborated and complex formulation work” (p. 737). This means that due to superior language competence in relation to other co-present participants of interaction, a non-professional translator may and does change the original message. While concluding that “[t]he translator’s role of influencing and reshaping conversational interaction can be a quite powerful one—and it can pass unnoticed” (p. 716), Müller points out that this role is co-constructed by all participants of interaction. Analyzing interactions involving professional interpreters, Wadensjö (1995; 1998) applied Goffman’s notion of participation framework (Goffman, 1981) and demonstrated that the distribution of responsibilities among speakers contributes to the progression of talk. Similarly to Müller (1989), Wadensjö (1995; 1998) argues that the dialogical approach to interpreting is crucial for providing an adequate account of cases where interpreters go beyond the professional ethical rules that require comprehensive and neutral delivery of information. I suggest, however, that
these types of “epistemic brokering” interactions (Raymond, 2014), do not relate directly to the particular practices of multilingual co-teaching that I address, specifically because of the attempt to establish equal institutional roles between the co-educators and the higher epistemic status of the local educators in comparison to the foreign educators who require the service of translation. I argue that the epistemic paradox, namely the incongruence of the epistemic status and the epistemic stance of American and Tanzanian co-educators, is characteristic of developmental interventions. Finally, this study adds to the growing body of research about the organization of interaction in African languages, such as Swahili, as well as in multilingual communication involving former colonial and local languages.

4.3 Training sessions for Tanzanian and American educators

I begin introducing the data with the analysis of training sessions that are the first sites of contact for Tanzanian and American educators. The observed training sessions were 5-7 days long during which the trainees stayed in the same location, sharing rooms and meals. Every day the trainees participated in lectures on topics ranging from HIV biology to gender roles in Tanzania, and were required to perform numerous micro-teaching sessions that were then evaluated by other trainees and trainers. Experienced staff of the hosting NGO, local and foreign experts—medical practitioners, affiliates of international development organizations, former educators—were invited to train the future educators. The majority of Tanzanian trainees had prior experience working for some NGOs, as well as college-level training in community development or education. In order to join the NGO, Tanzanian trainees underwent a rigorous selection process where they were tested for English skills, knowledge about HIV and reproductive health, public speaking skills, and the ability to talk in a direct and encouraging
manner about such sensitive topics as condom use. Tanzanians did not have to pay any fee for participation; in fact, they received room, board, and a stipend in exchange for their work.

American volunteers were college students and recent college graduates from various majors; the selection process was based primarily on essays describing applicants’ motivation and on the commitment to pay the participation fee, which varied depending on the length of stay from $3,000 to $10,000 plus the airfare. On a regular basis there were more vacancies for Americans than applications. During their stay in Tanzania, Americans received the same room, board, and stipend package as the Tanzanian educators, which were afforded by the participation fees paid by Americans. At the onset of the training session, most of both the American and the Tanzanian trainees were unaware of such distribution of financial resources; in the course of program, however, the financial matters added to the conflict based on the unclear understanding of institutional roles.

4.3.1 Constructing ideal teaching-translating situation

Besides instructing the trainees on the content of their teaching, the training sessions aimed to introduce the format of co-teaching and explain the collaborative working environment. In the following example, two experienced educators, Adeline and Lomayan, are modeling for the future educators the “ideal” teaching situation. Adeline, an Asian American, has been working as a volunteer and also a staff member at this Tanzanian-American NGO for several years, but she does not speak Swahili. Lomayan, a Tanzanian, has a college degree in community development and work experience in a different NGO; he is fluent in Maa, Swahili, and English. With the mock teaching on the topic of puberty the experienced educators have the goal of showing the trainees how to coordinate teaching and translation effectively. In their demonstration, Adeline and Lomayan use paper flip charts with schematically drawn human male and female bodies as a
tool for engaging the audience. For the mock teaching situation, the audience, that is, the trainees, is asked to perform as if they were school students—which they accomplish, for example, by giggling when the “teachers” announce sexual body parts. As a teaching technique, the educators ask the audience about physical and psychological signs indicating that a girl or a boy undergoing puberty. They evaluate responses from the audience and draw a corresponding image on the paper chart. The following excerpt illustrates how in response to the educators’s question about changes during puberty (line 01), a female trainee suggests *kuona aibu* ‘feeling shy’ (line 02). Note how the educators negotiate whether to take this contribution as a relevant one:

**Excerpt 4.1**
2012-09-23 [00:02:34.18]
TRAINEE – female Tanzanian trainee, speaks Swahili and English; LOMAYAN – male Tanzanian trainer, speaks Swahili and English; ADELINE – female American trainer, speaks English.

01 ADELINE: So: what are some physical changes that happen during puberty.

02 LOMAYAN: Je ni ma-badiliko yapi ya kimaumbo amba-yo
INT COP PL-change which of bodily that-REL
So what physical changes that

03 ya-na-weza ka-tokea sasa
they-PRS-can CONSEC-come.out now
can happen then

04 kwa huyu msichana yetu MZUri kabisa Tina.
for this girl out nice very PN
for this girl for our pretty Tina.

05 Ehe. Ya-na-weza ka-tokea ma-badiliko gani a-na-po-kua.
INTRJ they-PRS-can CONSEC-come.out PL-change which she-PRS-when-grow
Okay. The changes of what type can happen when she (Tina) is growing?

((about 1 min later after other trainees made their contributions))

06 TRAINEE: Ku-wa na aibu.
INF-be and shame
Being shy.

07 LOMAYAN: ((to Adeline)) To be shy.

08 ADELINE: ((to trainees)) M:hm? ((surprised)) I doubt that.

09 LOMAYAN: ((to trainees)) A’ha. Hiyo ni badiliko la kiaKIli? (in very high pitch)
no this is change of mind
((to trainees)) No. Is this a mental change?
This is a typical example showing the structure of the interaction between the audience and the co-teachers. Adeline starts the question-answer sequence directed to the audience; in the following turn Lomayan translates and also expands the initial question by contextualizing the question and eliciting engagement from the audience. First, Lomayan transforms an impersonal question by introducing as a character the girl who undergoes puberty (line 04): The trainers have drawn a simple image of this girl on a paper chart in front of the trainees, asked them to give the character a name, and the name ‘Tina’ was selected. Secondly, Lomayan requests a response from the audience with the interjection Ehe (line 05) and then with the reformulated question (line 05). When an audience member replies in Swahili (line 06), Lomayan does not

---

6 The trainees selected the particular name to joke about the co-present American director of the NGO. Later trainers instructed that in a real classroom situation the educators must avoid the situations where the characters drawn for explanation of some material would have a potential namesake among the audience. This resulted in selection of American names, such as Bob for male characters and Kim for female. Such names were regularly mispronounced, for example, Babu/buh:boo/ instead of Bob, Kimu/kee:mo/ instead of Kim. In my observation, primary school students displayed some confusion in recognizing these names as such.
evaluate the response as right or wrong and instead translates the response to the American educator (line 07). The American educator provides an evaluation of the answer (line 08); Lomayan continues translating, contextualizing, eliciting engagement from the audience in Swahili (line 09-10) and subsequently explaining his actions to the American educator in English (line 11-13).

The American educator, Adeline, is presented in this interaction as more authoritative despite the fact that Lomayan is more knowledgeable, and this distribution of roles is achieved collaboratively. Adeline does not understand the entry in line 06 until Lomayan translates it to her. Serving primarily the needs of the American educator, Lomayan does not attend to his role as a teacher which is visible in the lack of an evaluative response from him to the trainee who made the contribution about feeling of shame as a sign of going through puberty. In line 08, Adeline disqualifies this entry, but does not provide an explicit account for that yet. When Lomayan takes the floor in line 09, with a simple A’ha ‘No’ he assesses the initial entry as incorrect and poses an alternative question in order to direct the audience to the explanation why it is so. Lomayan uses the extremely high pitch in -a kiaKILI ‘mental’ to project the preferred answer. By providing Adeline with an interpretation of what he said to the audience (lines 11, 13), Lomayan then displays his awareness that she does not understand what he has said and that his words were more than just a mere translation. Adeline acknowledges this information (line 12) and aligns with the statement made by Lomayan made in Swahili by outlining the course of the lesson; Lomayan translates her words.

The trainer organized the interaction in Excerpt 4.1. in the outlined way in order to model the co-teaching situation preferred by the NGO. The Tanzanian educator deliberately avoids presenting himself as a teacher who has equal authority with the American educator. Lomayan does not evaluate the trainee’s entry right away and although his contribution in lines 08-09 does
not originate in Adeline’s words. The sequential position of Adeline as the first speaker creates
the impression that her words is the source of the information that Lomayan is delivering in
Swahili. Finally, by providing concluding statements, making a transition to another topic, and
outlining the class structure, Adeline does not leave space for Lomayan’s question to be
answered. By aligning with Adeline’s actions, Lomayan contributes to devaluing his teaching
role.

The trainees are expected to replicate the presented co-teaching situation in multiple
micro-teaching sessions. The micro-teaching is followed with the evaluative feedback by other
trainees and experienced educators that adds to socializing Tanzanians with respect to the
competing roles of educators and translators. For example, in the following excerpt, the
experienced Tanzanian educator, Lomayan, instructs Tanzanian trainees that they should strive
to present themselves as competent educators, not just translators. Lomayan admits, however,
that this is the golden standard (line 02).

Excerpt 4.2
2012-09-25 [00:03:32.21]
LOMAYAN – male Tanzanian trainer, speaks Swahili and English.

01 Lomayan: but (0.2) something like (.) to be improved-
02 but I think it will be (golden standard though)
03 is like- I know we are doing translation.
04 But it’ll be like-
05 If you can make some movements,
06 and try to see all the persons of the audience,
07 and show that something you are translating=
08 =you are really knowable about it,
09 it will make like easier for people to ask you question about.
10 Not the volunteers.
11 But they’ll think it’s something you really know.
12 Not like about you just translated.
13 But I think. It’ll be good like (2sec) emotional movement a bit,

According to Lomayan, the audience assumes that it is only the volunteers (line 10) who have
the expertise on the subject, or who are knowable (line 08), by which he means
“knowledgeable.” Lomayan suggests that Tanzanian trainees make an effort to overcome the role
of mere translators by actively engaging with the audience. Body language and explicit display of emotions are offered as performative means for claiming epistemic authority (lines 05-06, line 13). Lomayan does not address his suggestions to Americans implying that they do not have to claim their epistemic status and that they are treated as a legitimate source of information by default.

In contrast to Lomayan, in the following example another experienced Tanzanian educator, Eman, specifically criticizes a trainee for exceeding the primary role of a translator.

**Excerpt 4.3**
2012-09-25 [00:23:42.27]
EMAN – male Tanzanian trainee, speaks Swahili and English; LENA – female American trainer, speaks English.

01 EMAN: I think a:h Ha- Halima before li:ke-
02 you try to answer anyone’s question
03 you like- t- to talk to- to your partner first
04 before like- doing. Just coz’ we are having conversation.
05 (not) without- she didn’t know what- what’s going on.
06 So-
07 LENA: Right.
08 EMAN: be patient. But before answering like-
09 talk to her and like- tell her ((() )
10 “Can I do this? Can you do this?”
11 Make her like- knowing what you are doing.

In this excerpt, Eman recalls the episode when during a micro-teaching, Halima, a Tanzanian trainee, and Ruth, an American trainee, received a question from the audience and Halima volunteered to answer it *without she [the American volunteer] didn’t know what’s going on* (line 05). Eman instructs that before engaging with the audience, a Tanzanian educator should first perform as a translator (line 02-03) and negotiate the right to perform as a teacher (line 09-10). In this way, the proficiency in both Swahili and English creates opportunities for criticism directed to Tanzanian educators; American volunteers are not denounced for their inability to interact.
Following Eman, Lena, a female Asian-American experienced NGO worker, supports his understanding of the role distribution between the co-educators and reinforces the translation-limited function of Tanzanians.

**Excerpt 4.4**

2012-09-25 [00:24:11.18]

LENA – female American trainer, speaks English.

01 LENA: U:hm so: you know one- one strategy and you guys can do whatever you u:h=
02 =think it is appropriate but just when someone asks a question,
03 in the community who is u:hm Tanzanian=
04 =then the teaching partner will just (. ) tell them
05 "I'm going to translate your question", (1s)
06 {(to Tanzanian trainees)) Translate the question,
07 and you can mirror me I'll discuss a little bit,
08 translate it-
09 And you- and you can do it in chunks. (1s) Back and forth.
10 Just that you kinda know- Everybody knows what's going on.

Lena states that after receiving a question from the audience, a Tanzanian educator should not respond to it, but first translate to the American volunteer. Lena suggests that the Tanzanian educator announce to the audience the act of translation (line 05), which indirectly conveys to the audience the inability of the Tanzanian educator to respond to the question without the assistance of a foreign educator. These directions contradict the recommendations to overcoming a mere translator’s role suggested, for example, by Lomayan during the same training session (Excerpt 4.1). Lena goes further to propose the preferred order in responding to a question from the audience, namely that the Tanzanian educator *mirrors* the American (line 07). The particular *back and forth* order (line 09) that puts Americans in the position of first speakers is determined, however, by their inability to “mirror” Tanzanians. The asymmetric linguistic competences add to the construction of the epistemic stance of the American educators as more knowledgeable than Tanzanians.

Although it happened rarely, Americans were sometimes directly criticized for their teaching methods and skills, including language knowledge. In the next example from another
micro-teaching evaluation session, the Tanzanian trainee, Zukhra, was complimented for her
translator’s skills specifically as a way of pointing out the flaws in the presentation by the
American trainee, Quan.

Excerpt 4.5
2012-09-25 [00:49:07.23]
PHIL – male American trainer, speaks English; LENA – female American trainer, speaks
English.

```
01 PHIL: It was really good that Zukhra was able like- (0.2)
02     listen for a while and then (. ) translate?
03     But I mean like- Quan you go in this kinda like lo:ng
04  LENA: Yeah.
05 PHIL: lo:ng strings of like- (. ) talking, (2s)
06     But I was really impressed at that Zukhra you were able to (1s)
07     like really understand everything, you know, Quan was saying=
08     =for a long ti:me and then translate it but-
09  LENA: Right.
10 PHIL: And Quan, just make sure that- ((cuts himself off))
```

Phil, an experienced American educator, notes that Quan was delivering his lesson in long
uninterrupted sequences (line 03-05); Phil praises Zukhra on being able to translate after Quan
(line 01, 06). Phil’s positive assessment of Zukhra’s skills, namely that it was really good (line
01) and that he was really impressed (line 06) with her translation, is, however, problematic.
First, the micro-teaching evaluated here by Phil was not a spontaneous interaction, but prepared
and practiced by Quan and Zukhra in advance. When Phil states that he was impressed that
Zukhra was able to like really understand everything (line 06-07), he implies that Zukhra did not
know the material herself and her presentation was a mere translation. Secondly, Phil also does
not speak Swahili and, therefore, cannot assess the quality of Zukhra’s translation. Phil’s praise
of Zukhra’s translation is, therefore, a covert critique of Quan’s performance. By framing
Zukhra’s words as merely a skillful translation, Phil devalues her contribution to the teaching
session. As for Quan, Phil selects to leave his critique incomplete and simply cuts off after just
make sure that- (line 10).
In this section I demonstrated that during training sessions, future educators are socialized into unequal roles, where Americans have the chance to actively present themselves as experts and Tanzanians are required to provide them with support in sustaining this epistemic stance. In the following I will analyze how American and Tanzanian co-educators organize their interaction during in-class teaching sessions. I will point out multi-modal resources as a crucial means for the organization of turn-taking and as well as structural grounds contributing to the unequal epistemic stance. I will conclude by suggesting some benefits of American-Tanzanian co-teaching on reproductive health issues in rural Tanzania.

4.4 Resources of gaze and body for turn-taking in multilingual co-teaching

NGO-educators usually prepared for teaching ahead of time by reading information on the selected topic and the teaching instructions in the NGO-provided manuals that were often available in Swahili and English. The educators were usually familiar with most of the topics from training sessions, micro-teaching practices, and previous teaching experiences. Americans invested more time in class planning, from selecting the topic for the particular class to preparing posters on paper flip charts provided by the NGO, than Tanzanians. The text on posters which depicted such information as graphs about HIV biology, human reproductive physiology, or motivational messages, was also written by Americans who asked Tanzanian co-educators or English-speaking members of home-stay families for help in translating into Swahili. Due to little involvement of Tanzanian teaching partners in class planning, Americans regularly made errors when copying translated sentences, which resulted in misspelled or ungrammatical Swahili writing on the posters. For example, in Figure 4.1 the word *hujue* is a misspelled version of *ujue* ‘you should know’, and *huulinde* is misspelled from *uulinde* ‘you should protect it’. The fact that the posters with ungrammatical writing were used in the classroom indicates the low
involvement of Tanzanian educators in the preparation of visual aids and class planning in general.  

**FIGURE 4.1 UNGRAMMATICAL WRITING IN NGO POSTERS**

![Poster with ungrammatical writing in Swahili](image)

*Elimu ni Nguvu* ‘Education is Power’  
*Ujue mwili wako ili uulinde* ‘Know your body to protect it’

While in the classroom, Tanzanian educators simultaneously attended to different roles. They translated and explained information and questions between Americans and the audience, they contributed to teaching on the class topic, and they engaged in managing the classroom. In such an environment, despite class preparation, the actual flow of teaching can be characterized as rather spontaneous. Students, who were allowed and encouraged to actively interact with the educators also contributed to unpredictable diversions from the initial class plan. Unable to understand Swahili, American educators fully relied on the actions of Tanzanian educators for navigating through the multi-dimensional interaction and accomplishing their teaching projects.

4.4.1 Gaze and mutual orientation

When in a teaching session, educators seek for the most efficient way to facilitate coherent information flow. In the absence of the shared medium between the Tanzanian audience

---

7 Currently I have no data on how these errors were interpreted.
and American educators, Tanzanian educators employ multimodal resources to signal transition-relevance places by re-positioning their bodies and gaze toward the next speaker. Quite literally, turn-taking is accomplished by Tanzanian educators with turning back and forth between the audience and the American educators. In the following example, two Tanzanian and two American educators conduct an introductory class on HIV awareness for primary school students. In the selected episode, Annie, an American, and Eman, a Tanzanian, are announcing the motto of their NGO to the students, that is Tuko pamoja kushinda UKIMWI ‘We are together in defeating AIDS’.

Excerpt 4.6
2012-11-13-Msingi Clip 1 [00:02:17.10]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; KIDS – male and female Tanzanian primary school students, speak Swahili.

01 ANNIE: Yeah. So: ((unfolding the poster)) we are here u:hm to do one thing.
02 which i:s? ku-shinda UKIMWI. Right? ((Sabra helps Annie to hold the poster))
    INF-win AIDS
    which i:s? defeating AIDS. Right? ((Sabra helps Annie to hold the poster))
03 Let’s all read this together.
04 EMAN: Sema kwa pamoja.
    IMP.say for together
    Say it all together.
05 KIDS: ((reading from the poster)) Tu-ko pamoja ku-shinda UKIMWI.
    we-LOC together IMP-win AIDS
    ((reading from the poster)) We are together in defeating AIDS.
06 EMAN: E:h. ((off camera))
    INTRJ
    Oka:y. ((off camera))
07 ANNIE: That’s right. [Very good.
08 EMAN: [Tu-ko pamoja ku-shinda? ((toward students))
    [we-LOC together INF-win
    [We are together in defeating? ((toward students))
09 KIDS: UKIMWI.
    AIDS.
10 EMAN: Na tuko pamoja ninyi, sisi, (0.5) wa-zazi vi-jiji-ni, and
    we-LOC together you.PL we PL-parent PL-village-LOC
    And we are together you all, we, (0.5) parents in the villages,
11 nyumba-ni kw-enu huko.
house-LOC LOC-your.PL there at your homes there.

12 Kila mtu u-na-ye-on ni tu-ko pamoja ku-shinda?
every person you-PRS-who-see COP we-LOC together to-win
Everyone who you see is together with us in fighting?

13 KIDS: UKIMWI.
AIDS.

14 EMAN: Ehe:. ((turning to Annie))
INTRJ Right. ((turning to Annie))

15 ANNIE: Because together we can prevent HIV from effecting our community. Right?

16 EMAN: Kwa ku-wa ((turning to students)) pamoja?
for INF-be together
By being ((turning to students)) together?

17 Tu-na-weza tu-ka-shindana na tu-ka-shinda virusi vya UKIMWI
we-PRS-can we-CONSEC?-fight and we-CONSEC-win virus of AIDS
We can wrestle and defeat HIV

18 kwa (ku-athiri) wa-tu we-? wa-tu wengine. Sawa eh?
for (INF-impact) PL-person PL-person other equal INTRJ
from (infecting) other pe-? other people. Right eh?

19 KIDS: Ndiyo.
EMPH Yes it is.

20 ANNIE: ((looking at EMAN))

21 EMAN: Tu-ka-wa pamoja tu-ka-weza ku-piga na athiri
we-CONSEC-be together we-CONSEC-can INF-beat with effects
Being together we can fight the effects

22 i-si-end-e ku-fanya nini? I-ka-athiri jami-?
it-SBJV.NEG-go-SBJV IMP-do what it-CONSEC-affect society
so that it doesn’t do what? Affecting soci-?

23 Jamii yetu. Sawa eh?
society our equal INTRJ
Our society. Right eh?

24 KIDS: Ndiyo.
EMPJ Yes it is.

25 EMAN: E:h. ((turning to Annie))

26 ANNIE: But only? Together. That’s why we say tu-ko pamoja.
we-LOC together
But only? Together. That’s why we say we are together.

27 EMAN: ((turning to students)) Lakini hii i-na-wezekana tu-? tu-ki-ungana
but this it-PRS-be.possible we-SIM-unite
((turning to students)) But this is possible if-? if we unite

28 wote pamoja, (tu-na-weza) tu-ka-fanya?
all together (we-PRS-can) we-CONSEC-do
all together (we can) do what?
Tu-ka-fanya hicho kitu. Si ndiyo eh?
we-CONSEC-do this thing NEG EMPH INTRJ
Do this thing. Isn’t it so, eh?

KIDS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes, indeed.

This excerpt illustrates how Eman is using his body for mediating the interaction between Annie and the students. When Annie talks, Eman orients his body and eye gaze toward her:

**FIGURE 4.2 TANZANIAN EDUCATOR ATTENDING TO AMERICAN EDUCATOR**

When addressing the students, Eman turns away from the co-present educators in order to face the students (lines 08, 16, 27):

**FIGURE 4.3 TANZANIAN EDUCATOR ADDRESSING STUDENTS**
As soon as Eman is ready to give the floor to Annie, he turns away from the students in search of eye contact with her (lines 14, 25). Annie carefully monitors Eman’s moves to notice the next transition-relevance place (line 14) which is especially problematic for her as Eman’s translation does not correspond in duration to her own words. Indeed, Eman tends to elaborate on every statement produced by Annie by contextualizing it in images of Tanzanian life that may be relevant to students. For example, Eman expands the formulaic *tuko pamoja* ‘we are together’ by explaining the reference of “we” as the present students, their parents, families, and neighbors (lines 10-12).

The coordinated use of body orientation has, however, the crucial relevance in one direction only, namely when transition occurs from Swahili to English. American educators without sufficient Swahili knowledge depend dramatically on the embodied markers of transition-relevance places. In the case of transition from English to Swahili, the coordination of body and gaze is less prominent.

4.4.2 Intonation

It would be inaccurate, however, to present American educators as fully unable to control the turn-taking during the co-teaching sessions. Tanzanian educators tend to perform instruction in a highly conventional way that appears to be typical of Tanzanian school education. The characteristic feature of such instruction is, for example, the choral completion of the teacher’s turn. In Excerpt 4.6, lines 08 and 12, Eman reiterates the statements he has just announced but leaves the final word unpronounced. Instead, he completes the turn with a question-like rising intonation inviting students to complete the turn (lines 09 and 13 respectively). Usually the incomplete utterance is a close repetition of the immediately preceding statement, and the teacher clearly projects the expected response, while simultaneously controlling students’ attention (cf. Hirsch, 1998, pp. 149–150; Maw, 1992; Maw & Kelly, 1975, p. 45).
In the cases when students fail to complete the teacher’s question-line statement, for example, in lines 17 and 20, Excerpt 4.6, the teacher finishes the statement and immediately follows with the question-like request for confirmation or receipt, such as Sawa eh? ‘Right eh?’ in lines 18 and 23, and Sindiyo eh ‘Isn’t it so, eh?’ in line 29. The sequence of the teacher’s statement with rising intonation and the students’ choral response is a regular strategy for completing a thematic point in Tanzanian teacher-student interaction. My data demonstrate that over time, American educators not only learn to recognize this pattern as a marker of the potential transition-relevance place, but also carefully attend to the interaction between the Tanzanian educators and the student in search of these prosodically distinct transition-relevance places. The multilingual co-teaching sessions, therefore, represent an interactive environment with the organization extremely dependent on collaboration from all three parties involved: educators, translators, and the audience.

The following excerpt from a class on HIV biology vividly illustrates how turn-taking is accomplished through the coordinated exchange of body movements and the American educator’s monitoring for the prosodically marked transition-relevance places. In this excerpt the American educator, Quan, is lecturing on cell types, such as CD-4 and B-cells, and the Tanzanian educator, Eman, mediates the information delivery to the audience, Tanzanian secondary school students in Form 3 and Form 4.

Excerpt 4.7
2012-11-14-Clip2-Sekondari [00:33:03.00]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili.

01 EMAN: ((toward students))

02 Kwa hiyo seli ya CD4 a-na-mw-ambia
or this cell of s/he-PRS-him/her-tell
Therefore a CD4-cell tells

03 ((pointing at the chart))

04 hiyo seli B a-tengenez-e askari.
that cell s/he-make-SBJV soldiers
that B-cell to create soldiers.

05 Lakini wale askari jukumu lao kubwa
but those soldiers responsibility their large
But those soldiers their great responsibility
In this episode, Eman finishes teaching about CD4-cells—their function is to signal to B-cells that some bacteria or viruses have entered the body and protection needs to be created (line 01-06). Eman contextualizes the biology instruction by providing a parallel between the immune system of humans and a defensive military system in a country (line 05-06). While delivering this information, Eman positions himself away from Quan.

**FIGURE 4.4 MUTUAL POSITIONING OF EDUCATORS**
The unfinished dining hall where the NGO-educators conduct their class is occupied by about 300 hundred students, and the educators are situated in the middle of the students’ circle; at any time of teaching in this setting, the educators face some of the students and simultaneously stand with their backs toward other students. Eman, however, specifically situates himself in regard to Quan, avoiding eye contact with Quan while interacting with the students in Swahili.

In Excerpt 4.7 Quan does not seek eye contact with Eman until after line 06, where Eman utters an unfinished statement with question-like intonation.

FIGURE 4.5 RECOGNITION OF POSSIBLE TURN COMPLETION

By turning to Eman, Quan demonstrates his understanding of the projected transition-relevance place. Indeed, Eman completes the sequence with the final *Sawa eh? ‘Right eh?’* (line 09) and turns to Quan in order to give him the floor.

FIGURE 4.6 TURN COMPLETION WITH EYE GAZE
Quan acknowledges this opportunity by turning away from Eman and toward the paper chart displaying HIV biology, and continues instruction.

**FIGURE 4.7 BODY ORIENTATION WHEN CHANGING TURNS**

By directing his eye gaze toward the chart and away from the students (line 10), Eman is carefully attending to Quan’s explanation. In line 13, another mutual repositioning of eye gaze and body direction among the co-educators signals shifts in footing.

**4.4.3 Misleading linguistic cues**

With no sufficient knowledge of Swahili, the American educators rely heavily on the Tanzanian educators. In the classroom, there is rarely an opportunity where a Tanzanian educator can consistently translate from English to Swahili to the students and then retell the translation from Swahili to English to the leading instructor. The American educators are, therefore, often left to guess to what extent their Tanzanian partner diverges from the original statement. By initiating the turn, American educators are presented as having higher epistemic access and a greater role in delivering the class material than Tanzanian educators have. At the same time, the dependance on embodied markers of transition-relevance places, namely eye contact between the educators and the prosodically marked choral question-answer sequences between Tanzanian educators and students, leaves the control over the interaction in the hands of the Tanzanian educators. The following Excerpt 4.8—a direct continuation of the same class on HIV biology as
in the previous Excerpt 4.7—shows how the Tanzanian educator strategically avoids eye contact with the American educator so as to preserve the floor. During this interaction, Quan and Eman are teaching, and a Tanzanian female educator Sabra is assisting them by holding an educational poster in the middle of the room.

**Excerpt 4.8**

2012-11-14-Clip2-Sekondari [00:33:41.29]

QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili.

01 QUAN: Right. So: ((pointing at the paper chart, looking away from EMAN))

02 CD4 cells also direct CD8 cells to: destroy infected cells.

03 EMAN: ((turning away from QUAN)) Hii s- s- seli: ((turns to the chart))

*This c- c- cell ((turns to the chart))

04 seli: seli ((turns away from the chart)) B

ce:ll cell ((turns away from the chart)) B

05 QUAN: ((looks to EMAN, turns to the chart, turns back to EMAN))

06 EMAN: i-ki-sha-tengenezwa [wale: wale wale kinga za mwili, it-SIM-PRF-produce-PASS [those those those barrier of body when those those those [antibodies have already been produced

07 QUAN: [((turns to Eman with reaching hand))

08 EMAN: [wakati wa-na-enda ku-pambana na yule adui, sawa eh? [time they-PRS-go INF-fight and that enemy equal INTRJ

[when they go to fight that enemy, right eh?

09 QUAN: [((keeps looking at EMAN))

10 EMAN: wakati yule adui a-na- [po-ingia ndani ya mwili, time that enemy s/he-PRS-[when-enter inside of body when that enemy [when he is entering the body

11 QUAN: [((turns away from EMAN toward the chart))

12 EMAN: ( ) (adui) wa- wa virusi wa UKIMWI wa-na-po-ingia (( ) (enemy) of of virus of AIDS they-PRS-when-enter (when the enemy) of HIV v- viruses when they enter

13 ndani ya mwili. Jukumu lake kub[wa ni kw-enda inside of body responsibility its bi [g is INF-go the body. Its (i.e. the B cell's) big responsibility is to go

14 QUAN: [((turns to EMAN, looks at students))

15 EMAN: ku-zii- ku-zii- ku-zii-vamia zile kinga zako. Si ndiyo eh? INF- INF- IFN-them-rush those barrier your NEG EMPH INTRJ to- to- send forward those antibodies of yours. Isn't it so eh?

16 Kwa hiyo seli s- s- seli [B i-na-tengeneza for this cell [B it-PRS-produce Therefore th- th- cell [B produces
17 QUAN:  
18 EMAN: kinga zaidi ili (ile) kufanya nini?  
barrier more for (that) INF-do what  
more antibodies in order to (that) does what?  
19 ijabokuwa askari wa-na-kufa,  
even though soldiers die,  
18 EMAN: [lakini ku-na askari wengine wa-na-fanya nini?  
but LOC-have soldiers other they-PRS-do what  
but there are other soldiers doing what?  
19 QUAN: [((turns away from EMAN, goes to the poster held by SABRA))  
20 EMAN: [lakini ku-na askari wengine wa-na-fanya nini?  
but LOC-have soldiers other they-PRS-do what  
but there are other soldiers doing what?  
21 QUAN: [((faces Sabra while pointing at the chart on the poster))  
22 STUDENTS: E:h.  
Yes.  
23 EMAN: Kwa hiyo ile s– seli ya CD4 pia i-na-mw-ambia  
for this that cell of also it-PRS-him/her-tell cell  
Therefore that c- CD4-cell also tells the 8-cell  
24 QUAN:  
25 EMAN: seli namba nane, a-ka-fanya usafi…  
cell number eight s/he-CONSEC-do cleaning  
the cell number eight, to do sanitation…  

Here, Quan continues explaining about CD-4 cells; he has just finished talking about B-cells (see Excerpt 4.7), and now by saying So: CD4 cells also direct CD8 cells... (line 01) announces a transition to the next part of the lesson. While following closely Quan’s teaching, Eman does not provide a mere translation in his turn. In line 04, Eman turns to the paper chart summarizing the cell biology and instead of talking about CD8 cells, continues talking about seli B ‘B-cells’.

FIGURE 4.8 TEACHING POSTER DEMONSTRATING IMMUNE SYSTEM BIOLOGY
Quan carefully monitors Eman’s actions and eye gaze (line 05) and displays his understanding of *seli B* as an error; Quan reaches his arm to Eman in attempt to repair.

**FIGURE 4.9 EMBODIED ATTEMPT OF REPAIR**

![Embodied Attempt of Repair](image1)

Meanwhile, Eman avoids eye contact with Quan and by so doing prevents an interruption. In lines 13 and 16, Quan makes new attempts to take the floor and correct Eman, especially when Eman again mentions *seli B* ‘B-cells’, but his efforts remain unattended by Eman. Finally, Quan ceases his attempts to take the floor and steps to the poster held in front of class by another Tanzanian educator, Sabra, and one of the students. In the video recording it is visible how Quan points at the chart on the poster giving Sabra some explanations or directions:

**FIGURE 4.10 MISCOORDINATION IN CO-TEACHING**

![Miscoordination in Co-Teaching](image2)
Eman’s talk in this excerpt, however, may not be interpreted as the result of his lack of understanding or careless translation. Instead of following word by word after Quan, Eman is pursuing his own project. In the previous Excerpt 4.7, he started to illustrate various functions of blood cells by comparing those to soldiers with different tasks. When Quan moves on from CD-4 cells and B-cells to CD-8 cells, Eman has not completed his explanation yet. As he gets the floor at line 3 in Excerpt 4.8, Eman selects to continue his explanation of B-cells that Quan may have understood as an error. When Eman does the transition to the topic of CD-8 cells, Quan displays no recognition of this. At this moment Quan is preoccupied with repositioning the poster, and does not notice *seli eight* ‘8-cells’ announced by Eman (line 25).

This example illustrates a problematic point that on a regular basis disturbed the co-teaching flow. The insufficient Swahili skills of American educators caused their lack of trust toward Tanzanians. The subsequent absence of validation of Tanzanian educators as skillful and knowledgeable teachers in their own right ultimately contributed to damaging their interpersonal relationship and resulted in the overall dissatisfaction from the completed tasks by both parties.

4.4.4 Touch

In the multilingual interactions where embodied practices are crucial markers of transition-relevance places, touch becomes the ultimate resource for grasping speaker’s attention and by so doing, claiming the floor. In the previous Excerpt 4.8, Quan attempts to employ touch (line 06, 16), but never actually does so. In the following example, Quan does use touch to change the direction of Eman’s actions:

**Excerpt 4.9**

2012-11-13-Msingi-Clip3—[00:03:43.19]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; KIDS – male and female Tanzanian primary school students, speak Swahili; QUAN – male American educator, speaks English.
EMAN: ((toward students)) Sawa. Tu-na-onana juma ngapi? equal we-PRS-see.each.other week.day which Okay. We meet again on which day?

KIDS: Ijumaa. Friday.

EMAN: Tu-na-onana juma ngapi? we-PRS-see.each.other week.day which Which day?

KIDS: Ijumaa. Friday.

EMAN: ((lifting his arms as a sign of the end of class))

QUAN: ((touching EMAN at his shoulder))

EMAN: ((turning head to QUAN while still body is directed to students))

QUAN: So, thank you, thank you all for listening, for participating today.

EMAN: Kwa hiyo tu-na-sema asante kwa wote. for this we-PRS-say thank.you for all Therefore we say thank.you to all.

In this excerpt, Eman is closing a class for primary school students and is ready to step out of the classroom. He positions himself toward the students in front of Quan. Eman elicits a choral response from the students to reassure their attention; in line 03, Eman uses an unfinished utterance with noticeable question-like intonation, which is recognized by Quan as approaching the end of the sequence. Eman does not turn to Quan in order to give him the floor and Quan employs touch to change the direction of Eman’s actions. Quan takes the floor to conclude the class in the desired way.

The following excerpt is another example showing that touch is an important strategy available to American educators to claim their right to speak. This excerpt is from a class on HIV biology for secondary school students. The American educator, Annie, is leading the lecture, and Eman is assisting her.
Excerpt 4.10
2012-11-14-Clip2-Sec [00:43:40.15]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili.

01 ANNIE: ((to students)) But it’s really important
02 to know what exactly HIV does in your body.
03 EMAN: (((looks at Annie))
04 ANNIE: ((inhales to begin talking, looks at students))
05 EMAN: (Causes then you can fight it. ((turns away from the students))
06 EMAN: ((turns to students)) Kwa hiyo ni muhimu
07 ((turns to students)) Therefore it’s important
08 i-\-li-kuwa ni muhimu sana hi- hili somo ili
09 it-PST-be COP imporatnat very thi- this lesson so
10 thi- this lesson it is very important
11 mu-w-e m-me-elewa kwamba yule virusi vya UKIMWI
12 You.PL-be-SBJV you.PL-PRF-understand that that virus of AIDS
13 You should have understood that HIV
14 a-na-po-pambana na mwili wa mwanadamu
15 s/he-PRS-when-fight and body of human
16 when he (the virus) is fighting the human body
17 pia a-na-fanya-je. (0.8)
18 also s/he-PRS-do-INTRG
19 what is he (the virus) doing. (0.8)
20 ANNIE: ((turns to EMAN))
21 EMAN: Je, tabia yake ni nini. ((not looking at ANNIE))
22 INTRG character its COP what
23 So, what is his (of the virus) nature. ((not looking at ANNIE))
24 ANNIE: (((to students)) So-
25 EMAN: [Kazi ya\[ke ni nini, sawa eh?
26 work his COP what equal INTRJ
27 [How \[it (the virus) functions, right?
28 ANNIE: (((touches Eman’s shoulder))
29 STUDENTS: [Mhm.
30 ANNIE: [So we’re going to answer your questions, ((continues))

When lecturing, Annie directs her gaze to the students; Eman meanwhile is monitoring her words and actions in search of a transition-relevance place. As soon as Annie concludes her
utterance in line 2 with a falling intonation, Eman prepares to talk: he starts taking a breath and bringing his arms up to attract students’ attention. Annie, however, keeps looking at the students and then adds on to her conclusion an incremental clause accounting for the purpose of the teaching about HIV (line 05). By adding to the complete utterance, Annie interrupts Eman, who already displayed his readiness to take the floor. By turning away from her audience (line 05), Annie demonstrates that she has completed her turn and allows Eman to talk.

Eman’s turn is longer than Annie’s, but instead of carefully attending to Eman’ eye gaze and body orientation, Annie engages in side play with some students. She, however, recognizes the point when Eman mentions UKIMWI ‘AIDS’ (line 08) and immediately starts walking toward him. Eman meanwhile avoids eye contact with Annie. In lines 09-10, Eman concludes his utterance with the falling intonation followed by a 0.8 sec pause. Although he still does not look at Annie, she interprets the pause as a transition-relevance place and immediately begins her turn with So (line 13) that comes in overlap with Eman’s utterance (line 12). As Eman does not stop talking, Annie approaches him and grips his forearm.

FIGURE 4.11 TOUCH AS RESOURCE IN TURN-TAKING
While still not looking at Annie, Eman immediately moves to conclude his talk with the adjacency pair *Sawa eh?* ‘Right eh?’ - *Ndiyo!* ‘Yes, it is’, lines 14 and 16 respectively; Annie continues holding the touch until students’ closing response in line 16. As soon as Annie takes the floor in line 17, Eman turns away from the students orienting himself toward Annie.

### 4.5 Failed transitions

When a system works, the rules that organize the system become invisible to both participants and observers. A functioning social group is a system in itself, and it was the sociologist Harold Garfinkel who suggested that the rules organizing a society—in his terms, ethnomethods—can be revealed by creating situations—or breaching experiments—where the rules are violated (Garfinkel, 1967; Heritage, 1984). In the previous sections I addressed some of the rules that allow American and Tanzanian NGO-educators to co-teach about reproductive health in Tanzanian primary and secondary schools. In this section I will discuss examples of systematic failures, namely misunderstandings between educators, missed transition-relevance places, failed transitions, as an ethnomethodological perspective on the organization of multilingual multicultural classroom interaction.

The following excerpt comes from a class for secondary school students on HIV biology and pathogens. Students may understand the English-speaking educator, Quan, to a large extent because all textbooks in Tanzanian secondary schools, including biology, are in English. Eman, the Tanzanian educator, still co-teaches and translates after Quan from English into Swahili. In this particular episode the educators talk about typhoid. The interaction in lines 09-13 is particularly relevant for understanding the mechanics of turn-taking in co-teaching.
Excerpt 4.11
2012-11-14-Clip2-Sec-[00:27:15.12]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak English.

01 QUAN: So: another type of pathogen is typhoid. =
02 =You guys have heard of typhoid, right?

03 EMAN: Kwa wa-kimelea⁸ mwingine ni ni- ni- dudu a-na-ye-sababisha for PL-parasite another COP COP COP creature s/he-PRS-REL-cause
As for parasites, another one is- is- is- the creature that causes
04 homa ya matumbo, au typhoid. ((looks at QUAN))
fever of guts or
typhoid, or (in English) typhoid. ((looks at QUAN))

05 ((2sec))

06 QUAN: ((turns away from students to EMAN))

07 ((0.5s eye contact EMAN and QUAN))

08 QUAN: Has ((gaze to students)) anyone heard of typhoid?

09 EMAN: ((turns away from QUAN)) Sio tu-na-jua homa ya matumbo. Neg we-PRS-know fever of guts
Don't we know typhoid.

10 STUDENTS: E:h.
INTRJ
Yes.

11 QUAN: ((turns away from EMAN to students))

12 EMAN: ((toward students)) Au tu-na-jua kwa jina la typhoid.
or we-PRS-know with name of
Or we know it by the name typhoid.

13 QUAN: [((turns to EMAN)) Right? ((turning away from EMAN))

14 EMAN: [((looking at students))

15 STUDENT: ((inaudible toward educators))

16 QUAN: [So: ((turns to EMAN))

---

⁸ To translate pathogene, Eman uses a neologism *kimelea* derived from the verb *-mea* ‘to grow as a vegetable or plant’ (Johnson, 1939/1967, p. 274). The regular meaning of *kimelea* is ‘a plant which grows of itself, a self-grown plant, generally applied to a vegetable parasite’ (Johnson, 1939/1967, p. 274). In the new English-Swahili dictionary released by the Institute of Kiswahili Research, University of Dar es Salaam in Tanzania, *kimelea* is suggested as the sole equivalent for *parasite* (TUKI, 2000, p. 576). It is interesting that Eman uses the prefix of *wa-* in *wakimelea* ‘parasites’: this prefix is used to form plurals from human nouns; he also uses human-class agreement concordance for *dudu* ‘insect’. By anthropomorphizing pathogens, Eman is able to ascribe agency to external forces and the human body in and of itself, and also to engage students by creating a narrative-like delivery of biology lesson.
EMAN: (((to students)) Ndo ndo homa ya matumbo. Si ndiyo? EMPH EMPH fever of guts NEG EMPH (((to students)) In fact it’s typhoid. Isn’t it so?)

STUDENTS: Ndiyo. EMPH Yes indeed.

EMAN: Au ni-ko safi? or I-LOC clean Or am I correct?

STUDENTS: Safi! clean Correct!

EMAN: Ni-ki-kosea m-na-ni-rekebisha. Sawa eh? I-SIM-offend you.PL-PRS-me-repair equal INTRJ If I make an error you repair me. Right?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo. EMPH Yes, we will.

EMAN: Ni-me-soma biology muda mrefu sana. ((turns head to QUAN)) I-PRF-study period long very I studied biology a very long time ago. ((turns head to QUAN))

((still gaze to students)) Na-taka (( )) ((turns completely to QUAN)) I-PRS-want ((still gaze to students)) I want (( )) ((turns completely to QUAN))

QUAN: ((meeting EMAN’s eye gaze)) So: ((turns away from EMAN))

EMAN: ((still gaze to students)) Na-taka (( )) ((turns completely to QUAN))

QUAN: ((meeting EMAN’s eye gaze)) So: ((turns away from EMAN))

This excerpt begins when Quan announces the next topic in human immune biology, that is, typhoid as illness-causing bacteria (line 01). Quan attempts to check for students’ understanding (line 02); later, when after Eman has completed his translation (line 04), there is no clear uptake from students during about 2 seconds (line 05), Quan treats it as a lack of understanding and a teachable moment. Quan restates the question about whether students are familiar with the term typhoid (line 08); Eman in translating reformulates the question as a negative yes/no question (line 09) and by so doing, actively pursues a “yes”-response from students (cf. Heritage, 2002). In the translation, Eman first suggests the Swahili name for typhoid, namely homa ya matumbo ‘fever of guts’ (line 09) and then switches to English typhoid (line 12). Quan is carefully monitoring Eman’s talk in search of a transition-relevance place which is visible in how he turns
to Eman after hearing *typhoid* (line 12). Expecting Eman to merely translate his question that had the final word *typhoid*, Quan after hearing this word may assume that the translation is completed. By positioning himself toward Eman, Quan makes himself available for taking the next turn and even attempts to take the floor with *Right* with falling intonation that marks the completion of the previous turn (line 13). By avoiding eye contact with Quan, Eman meanwhile preserves the floor, resulting in Quan cutting-off his turn-initial *So:* (line 16). Eman continues talking until in line 17 he projects the end of his turn with *Sawa eh? ‘Right eh?’* addressed to the students, and after receiving an agreement token from the students (line 22), he begins repositioning himself toward Quan (lines 23-24). This time Quan waits to establish eye contact with Eman, and only after their eyes meet does Quan continue the lecture.

The following excerpt is another example demonstrating a failed transition resulting from the failure of educators to monitor each other’s eye gaze. Here Annie and Sabra are lecturing on reproductive physiology using paper posters attached to the wall. Charts on the posters demonstrate female and male reproductive organs and also a list of *majimaji na milango* ‘fluids and doors’ participating in HIV transmission. Due to the large size of the classroom, all charts are duplicated and positioned across a wall in order to allow students on both left and right sides of the classroom to see the visual aids. Each educator operates with one set of charts.

**FIGURE 4.12 UNAVAILABILITY OF TOUCH FOR TURN-TAKING**
Excerpt 4.12
2012-11-19-Sek-3 [00:25:41.03] Are you done?

ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 ANNIE: So this is part of ((turning from one chart to another)) the reasons that when we talk ((turning to students)) about fluids and doors, ((turning to chart, pointing at chart)) e:h when we say vagina mucosa and membranes ((gaze to students)) around the ((gaze to the chart)) vagina ((gaze at SABRA))

07 SABRA: Ndo ((pointing at the chart)) maana tu-na-jifunza nini? This ((pointing at the chart)) is why we learn what
EMPH tu-na-ifunza hii mi-lango ((gaze to students)) sawa? we-PRS-learn these PL-doordoors equal we learn about these doors ((gaze to students)) right?

09 Amba-yo uke⁹ ((pointing at the chart)) ni mojawapo amba-yo hapa that-REL vagina COP one.of that-REL here Among which the vagina ((pointing at the chart)) is one of those that here

10 ((points at another chart)) pia u-po. also it-LOC ((points at another chart)) is also present.

11 ((turns to students)) Si ndiyo? (0.5) NEG EMPH ((turns to students)) Isn’t it so? (0.5)

12 ANNIE: ((turns from SABRA to students) And this [is ((points at the chart))=

13 SABRA: [Na- ((turns to ANNIE)) [And- ((turns to ANNIE)]

14 ANNIE: =((gaze to SABRA)) also- Sorry. Are you done?

15

16 SABRA: Na huu ((turns to chart)) uke huu u-me-zunguka and this vagina this it-PRF-surround And this ((turns to chart)) vagina is surrounded

17 na ngozi laini. ((gaze to students)) Sawa? and skin thin equal with thin skin. ((gaze to students)) Right?

18 Kwa hiyo ni rahisi kwa mwanamke ku-fanya-je? (1sec) for this COP easy for woman to-do-INTRG Therefore it is easy for a woman to do what? (1sec)

---

⁹ uke is derived from the root -ke ‘female’ (Krapf, 1882/1964. p.133) and literally means ‘feminineness’. This term is, therefore, a euphemism for ‘vagina’, commonly used in both mundane and medical discourse. The more literal term would be kuma ‘vagina’ (Johnson, 1939/1967, p.226), ‘the female pudenda, vagina, vulva’ (Krapf, 1882/1964, p. 177). In a report on Swahili slang from Tanzania, kuma means ‘queen, nancy’ (Ohly, 1987, p. 44).
Ku-pata maambukizi ya virusi vya UKIMWI.

To get infection of virus of AIDS
To get infected with HIV.

ANNIE: Yeah. This is also the reason why here in Tanzania? (.)

60 percent (. of people that are living with HIV are women.

To account for talking about sex and sexual organs, Annie points at the chart listing “doors” for HIV, including the vagina (line 03), and then shows a vagina on the chart with a female body (line 04). Sabra keeps her eye gaze at Annie until they establish eye contact (line 06) and by so doing, change turns in speaking. When translating, Sabra uses her set of charts to point at the vagina as one of the HIV “doors” (line 09-10). In line 11, Sabra addresses students with the question Si ndiyo? ‘Isn’t it so?’ to check for their attention and understanding. Students produce no clear uptake; Annie treats the noticeable pause as a transition-relevance place and attempts to occupy the turn (line 12). Sabra, however, treats her turn as not completed and proceeds with additional explanations in overlap with Annie. This overlap resulted with Annie failing to appreciate Sabra’s eye gaze directed to students in line 11 as a sign of the incomplete turn.

Without sufficient knowledge of Swahili, Annie did not recognize that the lack of a hearable receipt token from the students after line 11 may be treated by Sabra as a request for additional explanation of the topic. At the overlap point, Sabra turns from students to Annie, and their eye gaze meets. Annie then verbally asks for clarification about the transition, and gives the floor back to Sabra. This excerpt demonstrates that without explicit instructions and training to attend carefully to the partners’ eye gaze, educators in the multilingual teaching environment fail to appreciate the crucial role of eye gaze in turn-taking during co-teaching. Instead, they still depend on markers of a transition-relevance place, such as verbal cues, intonation, and pauses, that are primarily relevant in same-language interactions, but are less reliable in a multilingual context.
4.6 Structural grounds for unequal epistemic status

We have seen that Americans and Tanzanian educators are trained in the manner that supports unequal distribution of responsibilities, where Tanzanians have to perform the less prestigious role of translators. At the same time, American educators remain fully dependent on Tanzanian educators for functioning in a Swahili-speaking teaching environment. Tanzanian educators receive mixed messages from the NGO-officials who require them to be enthusiastic teachers, but remain in the shadow of Americans. The organization of classroom interaction, where Tanzanian and American educators co-teach Swahili-speaking primary and secondary school students, reflects a challenging search for balance between the co-teachers. On the surface level, American educators appear to have higher epistemic status than Tanzanians simply by initiating turns. Sequentially, all information uttered by Tanzanians is presented as a mere translation. If looking deeper at the level of turn-taking, however, Tanzanian educators have control over the actual mediation of information. For example, by avoiding eye contact with American co-teachers they can hold a turn for as long as they prefer. Tanzanian educators regularly occupy longer turns to diverge from the lecturing mode employed by American educators. By contextualizing the information with story-telling, metaphors, and examples, they also engage students in repetitive question-answer sequences to secure their attention and check their understanding. I argue that besides the underlying institutional aspects of the role distribution within an NGO, during co-teaching interactions Tanzanian educators actively contribute to the construction of the particular epistemic stance of Americans as more knowledgeable and authoritative than themselves. While controlling the flow of the interaction within the ongoing teaching session, Tanzanians avoid participating in decision-making about
the overall structure of classes, including selecting class topics, and preparing tasks and activities.

The next example demonstrates that American educators exclude Tanzanian educators in making decisions about the class progression, and that Tanzanian educators comply with this order. The excerpt comes from a class on HIV history and biology for secondary school students co-taught by four educators: two Americans, Quan and Annie; and two Tanzanians, Sabra and Eman. Here Annie finishes responding to students’ questions by promising an answer at the end of the session. While Sabra translates, Annie turns to Quan to negotiate the class plan.

**Excerpt 4.13**

2012-11-14-Sek-Clip 2 [00:24:38.15]

ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; QUAN – male American educator, speaks English.

01 ANNIE: But they are really good questions and we will come back to them.

02 ((walks to Quan))

03 SABRA: ((toward the student who asked the question)) (kwa) (vuta ya) jibu. response

04 ((toward the student who asked the question)) (will respond)

05 Baada ya ku-fundisha hii sehemu. ((turns to Quan))

after of INF-teach this part. After teaching this class. ((turns to Quan))

06 QUAN: ((to Annie)) You wanna shorten this?

07 ANNIE: ((head shake, inaudible))

08 QUAN: Okay. I wanna do ((looks at his wrist watch)) ten minutes biology. ((   ))

09 ((turns away from ANNIE))

10 ANNIE: ((to students, away from EMAN and SABRA)) So now Quan is going to talk about the biology of HIV.

11

12 SABRA: Quan a-ta-ongelea kuhusu biology ya nini? ya virusi vya UKIMWI, sawa? he-FUT-talk about biology of what of virus of AIDS equal Quan will talk about biology of what? of HIV, right?

This example shows that American educators are oriented toward each other and exclude Tanzanian co-teachers from the discussion. Sabra and Eman stay a step away from the Americans and are not addressed by them. American educators do not invest time into
establishing eye contact with Tanzanian co-teachers and proceed with the teaching plan without their approval. Annie simply turns to the students to announce the following speaker, namely Quan; as expected by Annie, Sabra provides a translation for her statement.

With respect to teacher-student interaction, Tanzanians actively engage in disciplining and eliciting students’ attention. In the previous examples we already observed that Tanzanian educators regularly check for understanding with unfinished question-like utterances that are then completed by students. In the situations where students ask a topic-related question, however, Tanzanians position themselves as subordinate to American educators, namely by soliciting from the American educators permission to give the floor to a particular student and, more importantly, by avoiding direct assessment of students’ comments and contributions and placing American educators in the authoritative position of those who provide evaluations. For example, in the following excerpt, Annie and Sabra are teaching secondary school students about the human reproductive health system. They use drawings on paper flip charts attached to a wall as visual aids. Annie addresses the class with a question about the relevance of knowledge about male and female reproductive organs; a male student responds.

**Excerpt 4.14**
2012-11-19-Sek-3 [00:11:45.20]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili.

01 ANNIE: So why is it important to talk about this. When we are talking about HIV.

02 SABRA: Kwa nini ni muhimu katika (ku-ji-soma) for what COP important in (INF-self-study) What for is it important (to learn)

03 (((pointing at the paper charts on the wall)) hivi vi-tu. these PL-thing (((pointing at the paper charts on the wall)) these things

04 Hii mi-choro (( )) hii kama huu these PL-drawing these as this These drawings (( )) these like this one

05 (((walks to paper charts on the wall))
INHERENTLY, she is speaking at the side of woman. NEG EMPH
Let’s take these here (( )) from the female side. Isn’t it so.

STUDENTS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes, indeed.

SABRA: Hii mi-wili hapa. ((pointing at the paper charts))
these PL-body here
These bodies here. ((pointing at the paper charts))

M-na-jua ni kwa nini tu-na- tu-na-fundisha.
you.PL-PRS-know COP for what we-PRS- we-PRS-teach
Do you know why we- we teach this.

Ni- ni umuhimu gani amba-yo (tunafanya) mpaka
COP COP importance which that-REL (we-PRS-make) until
Wh- what is the importance that (brought us) (until)

(sababu) (( )) tu-me-simama hapo tunafundisha.
(reason) we-PRF-stand here we-PRS-teach.
what is the reason) (( )) we’ve been standing here and teaching this.

Kwa nini tu-na-fundisha hivi vi-tu?
for what we-PRS-teach these PL-thing
Why do we teach about these things?

((looking around for a student to answer))

((points at a student)) U-na-weza u-ka-jaribu?
you-PRS-can you-CONSEC-try
((points at a student)) Can you try?

STUDENT: Tu-na-jifunza kwa sababu ndiyo njia kuu
we-PRS-learn for reason EMPH way main
We are learning this because in fact these are the main ways

zi-na-zo-ruhusu UKIMWI ku-ingia kweny mwili.
they-PRS-that-allow AIDS INF-enter in body
that allow AIDS to enter the body.

SABRA ((translated inaudibly to ANNIE, then steps back))

ANNIE: That’s right. Because HIV- the majority of cases in Africa? (0.2)
HIV was transmitted sexually.

In her translation of Annie’s utterance Why it’s important to talk about this (line 01), Sabra elaborates on the reference of this by pointing at the paper charts showing in particular female reproductive organs. After a student selected by Sabra responds (line 15), she translates her entry to Annie. Sabra does not evaluate the student’s response, but gives this opportunity to Annie. Such sequential delay of assessment and leaving Annie the chance to evaluate the student
contributes to the display of the epistemic stance of American educators as more knowledgeable and authoritative than Tanzanian co-educators.

4.7 Space for conflict

The outlined organization of co-teaching sessions creates grounds for the incongruence of epistemic status and displayed epistemic stance between the foreign and local educators. Such interactional environment is a fragile working space, prone to misunderstandings and conflicts among all the parties involved. The following example from a class on reproductive physiology to secondary school students, Annie and Sabra face a conflict when Sabra does not fully comply with the role of a mere translator.

Excerpt 4.15
2012-11-19-Clip-3-[00:30:59.02]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili.

01 ANNIE: Once she becomes mature, right,
02 uhm she'll start having her monthly period, that's the blood
03 that comes out of vagina, (((looking away from SABRA))

04 SABRA: (((looking at ANNIE))

05 (0.8)

06 ANNIE: ((turns to Sabra, meeting eye gaze))

07 SABRA: ((turning to students)) Ngoja ni-rudi-e kwenye hii ((points at chart))
wait I-repeat-SBJV at this
Wait let me repeat about this ((points at chart))

08 sehemu ya gameti uke. part of gamete vagina
part about ovaries.

09 ((turns to ANNIE)) I have to: just like explain (( )) (about gamete)(() )

10 ANNIE: Oh yeah so: ((points at chart)) the ovaries are where the eggs are stored.

11 SABRA: Hapa ((pointing at chart)) kwenye gameti uke ((turns to students))
here at gamete vagina
Here ((pointing at chart)) at the ovaries ((turns to students))

12 ni kama vile kuna begu. Sawa?
COP like those there.is seed equal
It’s like there are eggs. Right?

13 STUDENTS: Ndiyo. EMPH
Yes it is.
SABRA: Kwa mfano kama vile kuna begu, for example like those there is seeds For example like there are eggs

kwa hiyo i-ki-wa kule pale, zi-na-enda ku-zi-tia kwa pale, for this it-SIM-be those there they-PRS-go INF-them-put.in for there so if right there, they (the eggs) go put them there

amba-zo zi-ko kwa huyo mwanamke that-REL they-LOC for that woman those (eggs) which are there for that woman

ndiyo ku-wa (ku-pandisha) nini? (0.2) (Lishaje.) EMPH INF-be (INF-raise) what ( ) for what? (indeed for growing what? (0.2) )

Tu-na-elew-ana? we-PRS-understand-RECIP Do we understand each other?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo. EMPH Yes, we do.

SABRA: ((turns to chart)) Kwa hapa ((points at chart)) for here ((turns to chart)) So here ((points at chart))

i-na-k- mi-firija hii- mi-firija hii hapa it-PRS- PL-tube these PL-tube these here there're these tubes- these tubes here

i-na-kuwa kazi yake ni ku-ru- nani? ((turns to students)) they-PRS-be job its COP to- uhm their job is to- what? to ferti- uhm ((turns to students))

Ku-rutubisha na ni ku:- ku-rutubisha yai. Sawa? INF-make.fertile and COP to- to-make.fertile egg equal? To make the egg fertile. Right?


((turns to ANNIE))

ANNIE: ((eye gaze to SABRA)) (0.8) So ((looks at chart, points)) once a month the ovaries are releasing egg, it'll go down the fallopian tube and into ((turns to students)) the- uterus.

((turns to Sabra))

ANNIE: ((turns to Sabra))

SABRA: I did that.

ANNIE: Oh you said that?

SABRA: Yeah.

ANNIE: I was gonna say that. ((forced smile, head shake)).

((turns to chart, to students)) Okay, and in the ut- inside the uterus...
The excerpt begins with Annie talking about *monthly period* (line 02) and Sabra instead of translating Annie’s words suggests that additional explanation of the previously mentioned *gameti uke* ‘ovaries’ is needed (line 07-09). Annie agrees with Sabra’s suggestion to provide more information on this point, but disregards Sabra’s offer to perform the teaching herself. Instead, Annie begins a teaching sequence herself (line 10). When Sabra gets the floor, she, however, follows her initial agenda and for the next 30 seconds provides an elaborate, if not entirely accurate, explanation of the function of ovaries (lines 11-24). Because of the class arrangement, Sabra and Annie are standing on the opposite ends of a large classroom, making touch as a strategy for taking the floor unavailable for Annie here. With no access to talk in Swahili, Annie cannot comprehend Sabra’s input, and as soon as Annie gets the floor, she continues her lecturing from the very point where she stopped it in line 10. Annie organizes her talk in a coherent manner, and by so doing she disregards any possible contributions to teaching made by Sabra. After finishing her utterance in line 28, Annie is expecting Sabra’s translation, and when no translation occurs, she turns to Sabra in search of the account. Sabra then explains that she *did that* (line 32), meaning that Annie’s point is redundant. Annie reacts to this violation of her primary institutional role in a clearly frustrated manner—with a forced smile and a headshake—but then still proceeds with her explanation of the very same topic that Sabra has already covered. In the course of this teaching session, Sabra does not diverge from the expected role anymore, instead providing translation without delays. Excerpt 4.15 illustrates not only that American educators devaluate teaching contributions made by Tanzanians, but also that Tanzanians try to satisfy the expectations of Americans and by so doing, usually avoid conflict.

So far, I have focused on analyzing the organization of co-teaching sessions on reproductive health conducted by foreign and local NGO-trained educators. I have demonstrated
that although local educators have relevant knowledge on the subject of their teaching, as well as better understanding of the context, including cultural norms, information needs and expectations of their audience, and most importantly, the shared medium, that is, Swahili, foreign educators who lack the above mentioned elements of epistemic access, are still positioned as more knowledgeable than locals. I argued that this epistemic stance is collaboratively achieved by both parties through a particular turn-taking system where foreigners always initiate turns requiring second actions in form of translation, exclude locals from the negotiation of lesson structure, and reserve the right to evaluate questions and comments from the audience. Foreign educators, however, would not be able to sustain the outlined interactional organization without being actively accommodated by local educators. By actively attending to the foreign educators, providing them with multimodal markers of transition-relevance places, deliberately avoiding direct engagements with the audience, local educators contribute to the construction of the incongruent epistemic stance.

4.8 Benefits of co-teaching

The presence of foreign educators in NGO-organized reproductive health classes certainly adds to ideological, interpersonal and logistic struggles. When addressing highly prohibited topics, however, the multicultural educators’ team does have some benefits, especially as an excuse for violating language taboos. American educators show little hesitation in talking about sex-related issues, including intercourse, masturbation, female genital mutilation, and condom use. Tanzanian educators have the ultimate access to the information about these topics in both English and Swahili and use their language skills and understanding of cultures to modify the information coming from American educators by adjusting vocabulary, omitting translation, and providing culture-relevant examples. Tanzanian educators benefit from the presence of
foreign educators because they create an open discursive space, allowing discussions on intimate
issues but leaving foreigners morally responsible for culturally inappropriate talk.

Instructions on condom use are an example of a discursive taboo violation. NGO-
educators, for example, are not allowed to mention condoms as an option for either HIV or
pregnancy prevention in classes for school students. The possession of condoms by students on
school premises is subject to punishment. Condom demonstration was allowed in the teachers’
college because students were considered not only adults, but also future educators; that appears
to be a relevant categorization when it comes to the subject at stake. Knowledge about condoms
and the skill of talking freely and positively about condom use is considered an asset exclusively
in the context of training sessions for future educators. The next excerpt comes from a class on
reproductive health for Tanzanian students of a teachers’ college. During this class, two
American female educators, Deborah and Sammie, use rubber models of penises to demonstrate
the steps of condom use; Lomayan, a male Tanzanian educator, assists them. Lomayan avoids
not only touching the condoms or the rubber models, but also displaying direct epistemic access
to knowledge of condom use.

**Excerpt 4.16**
2012-11-26-Condom Race-Clip1-[00:20.23]
DEBORAH – female American educator, speaks English; LOMAYAN – male Tanzanian
educator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 DEBORAH: ((holding penis model at her stomach)) So the next step is to:
02 carefully remove it ((removing the condom)),

03 LOMAYAN: Baada ya sasa tendo la ndoa,
after of now action of marriage
Now after the marriage act (sex)

04 i-na-fuata hatua nyingine sawa ku-i-toa
it-PRS-follow step another equal INF-it-take.off
there is the next step of taking off

05 ((gesture as removing a condom)) kondom kwa usahihi.
condom for accuracy
((gesture as removing a condom)) the condom accurately.
This excerpt illustrates how an American female educator uses her body and a rubber model to demonstrate the actions of a male.

FIGURE 4.13 AMERICAN EDUCATOR DEMONSTRATING CONDOM

The Tanzanian male educator limits his role to translating by repeating gestures and referencing her as the primary source of his knowledge (line 05-06, 10, 13-14).
By so doing, the Tanzanian educator presents himself as not responsible for the talk about a taboo topic initiated by the foreign educators.

After the condom demonstration, educators continue the class with a “condom race,” a competition—with valuable monetary incentives—during which students practice putting condoms on the rubber model, followed by a role play where students negotiate condom use, and finally with a question-and-answer section. The observed class on condoms attracted not only college students, but also their male professors and administrators, who took an active part in challenging the educators with questions suggesting that abstinence is the only legitimate method for protection against unwanted pregnancy and HIV transmission. Although the American female educators were the primary recipients of questions, by giving the audience members a chance to respond to the posed questions, they managed to create an interactive environment. By so doing, they successfully involved the co-present male and female college students and faculty in a vivid discussion of cultural norms and expectations regarding gender roles and the stigma associated with condom use. During the discussion, the educators justified the open discursive space with the special role of the co-present participants as educators who should spread—discretely—the relevant knowledge to their communities. The presence of foreigners allowed the
Tanzanian educators to regularly construct their own talk as reported speech and avoid presenting themselves as experienced condom users.

4.9 Conclusion

In this chapter I have demonstrated that in the setting of a developmental intervention conducted by local and foreign educators, multimodal resources become crucial for organizing the interaction. The primacy of gaze and touch as markers of transition-relevance places can be explained by the foreign educators’ lack of Swahili. The hierarchically unequal roles of foreign and local educators are conditioned, however, not only by their asymmetric linguistic competence, but also by collaborative communicative efforts from both parties. Local educators deliberately refrain from displaying their epistemic status, surrendering their role as educators and thereby avoiding conflict with their foreign colleagues. Despite the fact that the co-presence of foreign educators poses logistic obstacles, it also creates discursive spaces that allow discussions on sensitive topics. In the following chapters I will discuss how NGO-organized classes become sites for socializing students in particular ideologies about sexual desire and sexual behavior with regard to prevention of sexually transmitted diseases and unwanted pregnancy. I will demonstrate that in the observed interventions, the benefits of co-presence of foreign and local educators for reproductive health education were, however, not appreciated fully. Irrespective of their personalities, ideologies, or intentions, the educators were forced to perform rigid institutionally stipulated roles resulting invariably in a fragile, conflict-prone work environment.
CHAPTER 5: LANGUAGE SOCIALIZATION AND SEXUAL DESIRE

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter I analyze how during classes on puberty and reproductive physiology, American and Tanzanian NGO-volunteers socialize primary and secondary school students into becoming sexually aware subjects. Specifically I will attend to discourses emerging during classes on puberty (*kubalehe* in Swahili) as in the course of my fieldwork, I have observed that mutually independent NGOs that provide education about reproductive health include this topic in their curriculum. I will demonstrate that the educators tend to explain puberty in negative terms, similar to a disease which causes undesired, but inevitable, transformations in the child’s body and, more importantly, in the child’s mind and behavior; the emergence of sexual desire is presented as the main outcome of puberty.

The question of desire, including sexual desire, is of interest for both socio-cultural studies and research in the field of public health. Desire is a central term in the studies on language and sexuality (Eckert, 2001; Kulick, 2003), as well as in identity-centered research within queer linguistics (Bucholtz & Hall, 2004). Kulick (2003) proposes the study of desire in psychoanalytic terms of subjective “dimensions of sexuality” (p. 119) along with fantasy, repression, and the unconscious, and it is a similar approach that becomes generally adopted in the public health studies on sexual relationships and practices among various populations (e.g. Plummer & Wight, 2011). Eckert (2001) warns that this approach may “bring mystification into the study of sexuality” (p. 100), and suggests that research instead focus on “the social mediation of desire” (p. 100), linking desire and emotion as socially induced constructs. The recent research on language and interaction demonstrates how children learn to demonstrate emotions as a stance (Goodwin, Cekaite, & Goodwin, 2013), which supports the interest in studying desire
from a language socialization perspective (Kulick & Schieffelin, 2004; Schieffelin & Ochs, 1986). Although Kulick (2003) mentioned language socialization as a strand of language and desire research, his examples do not relate to the questions of sexual desire (Bucholtz & Hall, 2004). The research by Thompson (2011a) on the socialization of Muslim Swahili women in East Africa in avoiding talk about their sexual desires is one of the few studies in the field. With the present chapter I will add to our knowledge on how sexual desire becomes a topic of language socialization. I will demonstrate that like emotions, desire is a socially constructed concept.

5.2 Puberty in school- and NGO-curricula

Before analyzing the data I collected during participant observation, it is relevant to discuss what background knowledge on puberty is available to school students and NGO educators. For this purpose, I analyze two documents, a governmentally approved primary school textbook Sayansi: Shule za Msingi 6 (Sayansi 6) ‘Science: Primary School 6’ published by Oxford University Press in Dar es Salaam (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012), and a curriculum of the NGO called Support for International Change (SIC) which is available for download from their website in English and Swahili versions (SIC, 2008a; SIC, 2008b). I have selected the textbook because it was used on a regular basis in the primary school I have visited during my fieldwork. The SIC curriculum, which was followed by some of the observed educators, represents a compilation from various widely used sources, such as the United States Peace Corps, UNESCO/UNAIDS, Tanzanian Commission for HIV/AIDS (SIC, 2009, p. 2), and thus, can be treated as a typical example of NGO materials. In accordance with the Tanzanian school system, Sayansi 6 is published in Swahili. Like that of other NGOs, the SIC curriculum was initially written in English by SIC volunteers and staff, and later the organization had the
curriculum translated into Swahili. With the analysis of the selected documents I will demonstrate that the school textbook offers an evaluative, and often negative, stance toward adolescent body and mind, while the NGO materials are rather neutral. The textbook, however, represents the common sense knowledge shared among Tanzanian primary and secondary school students and Tanzanian educators.

In *Sayansi* 6, approved by the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training of Tanzania (MOEVT), puberty is discussed twice, in the beginning and at the end of school year, as a part of two different topics. The first topic is “Reproduction,” lesson 4, which includes the discussion of pregnancy and sexually transmitted diseases. The second topic is “Growth,” lesson 10, where puberty is presented as a stage in becoming a fully developed human. In both lessons the definition of puberty is identical, namely as *hatua ya kuka kuelekea utu uzima* ‘a stage of growing towards adulthood’ (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012, p. 26, p. 111). The textbook states that the passage to adulthood involves changes in physiology, behavior, and mental aptitudes. The ability to conceive is mentioned in both lessons as one among various outcomes of puberty. When discussing reproductive readiness, the authors select the words *msichana* 'girl' and *mvulana* 'boy' to refer to the youth involved, and in the Tanzanian context such word choice invokes age and social status marked as inappropriate for becoming parents. My observations from sexual education classes conducted by various NGOs suggest that Tanzanians, however, regularly use *mwanamke* ‘woman' and *mwanamume* ‘man’¹⁰ as default categories for female and male persons undergoing puberty. For example, in the following excerpt from a class on puberty

---

¹⁰ Katrina Daly Thompson suggests that Swahili native speakers from Zanzibar may use *mwanamme* and *mwanamke* only in reference to a married man and woman (personal communication, December 2013). This could be due to the difference between Swahili first and second language speakers, as well as religious affiliation.
led jointly by American and Tanzanian educators, girls' breasts (line 01) are translated as with kifua cha mwanamke ‘the chest of a woman’ (line 02):

**Excerpt 5.1**
2012-11-02 [00:59:30.05]
SUE – female American educator, does not speak Swahili; JUMA – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; GIRL – female secondary school student, speaks Swahili.

01 SUE: What happens to: girls' breasts?

02 JUMA: Nini i-na-tokea kwenye kifua cha mwanamke? (3sec)
What it-PRS-come.out at chest of woman

03 ma-tokeo kwenye kifua cha mwanamke a-na-ye-balehe? ((inaudible))
PL-outcome at chest of woman she-PRS-who-reach.puberty

04 GIRL: Ma-titi.
PL-breast
Breasts.

As in this example, in my data the words msichana 'girl' and mvulana 'boy' are used significantly less often than mwanamke ‘woman’ and mwanamume ‘man’ to specifically point out at the differences and limited social abilities of a person undergoing puberty in comparison to an adult, such as in the following excerpt:

**Excerpt 5.2**
2012-11-02 [01:38:27.06]
PETER – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – secondary school male and female students, speak Swahili.

01 PETER: Kwa sababu nani yu-ko tayari ku-oa?
for reason who s/he-LOC ready to-marry
Because who is ready to marry?

02 STUDENTS: Hamna.
None.

03 PETER: Nani yu-ko tayari ku-ole-wa?
who s/he-LOC ready to-marry-PASS
Who is ready to be married?

04 STUDENTS: Hamna.
None.

((Peter continues explaining, 15 sec later))

05 PETER: Na wewe mvulana u-ki-m-weka msichana mimba sasa hivi, and you boy you-SIM-her-put girl pregnancy now these
And you boy if you make a girl pregnant right now,
Here, in line 05, the educator emphasizes that *mvulana* ‘boy’ and *msichana* ‘girl’ are socially not ready to become parents yet.

These examples suggest that the use of *msichana* ‘girl’ and *mvulana* ‘boy’ in *Sayansi 6* is not random, but rather specific for addressing the underage readers and presenting the issues of puberty separately from pregnancy and sexually transmitted diseases which are portrayed as relevant to adults and unspecified humans, or *binadamu*.

In the first part of *Sayansi 6* along with the description of the human reproductive system, the physiology of menstruation and pregnancy, and the types of sexually transmitted diseases, the topic of puberty is presented in association with negative social outcomes. Being *watukutu* ‘mischievous’, engaging in risky behaviors, such as *kujaribujaribu* ‘trying’ tobacco, drugs, alcohol, and sex, joining gangs, and most importantly showing *kiburi* ‘haughtiness’, are named as the outcomes of puberty (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012, p. 26). The textbook does not offer examples or an explanation for these behaviors. Stambach (2000) in her research on the role of schooling in socio-cultural changes among the Chagga people in Northern Tanzania, mentions that in secondary schools students again are instructed on the topic of puberty, namely in the home economies course, Form 2, and similarly to the primary school textbook, adolescence is presented as a psychologically and socially dangerous period (pp. 54–55).

The second lesson where puberty is discussed, namely within the topic of becoming a fully-grown human, invokes sexuality and desire as additional aspects of psychological and behavioral transformations. The same inappropriate behaviors that were already mentioned in the first lesson on puberty are called here *athari* ‘negative effects’ (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012,
The textbook states that *vijana hujipenda sana na kuwapenda watu wa jinsi tofauti na kupendelea kujifunza mambo yao* ‘young people usually like themselves and persons of the opposite sex, and are eager to learn about them’ (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012, p. 112). In this passage the verb *kupenda* meaning ‘to love’ or ‘to be attracted’ can refer to both psychological and physical attraction. The word *mambo* ‘matters,’ ‘affairs,’ ‘things’ (TUKI, 2001, p. 184) here vaguely refers to sex-related issues. According to the textbook, the feeling of *aibu* ‘shame’ comes along with the attraction to persons of the opposite sex (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012, p. 112). Finally, the textbook states that puberty *huleta uhusiano mpya kati ya mwanamke na mwanamme* ‘usually brings a new relationship between a woman and a man,’ (Kilama & Kalugula, 2004/2012, p. 112). Here *uhusiano mpya* ‘a new relationship’ can mean both a sexual and romantic relationship, and in comparison to the previous chapter on puberty in the same textbook the participants of such “a new relationship” are referred to as a woman and man, rather than a girl and a boy.

It is relevant to point out that grammatically, through the choice of the gnomic present tense *hu-* , the textbook often presents the changes brought by puberty as matter of fact\(^\text{11}\) (Ashton, 1944/1966, pp. 38–39; Rieger, 2011, pp. 120–122). Linguistically the youth undergoing puberty are constructed as lacking agency (cf. Ahearn, 2001; Ehrlich, 2001) and not responsible for sexually-motivated behavior. Namely, it is not the woman and the man who engage in the “new relationship,” but *mabadiliko huleta* ‘the changes usually bring’ such relationship. In this way,

\(^{11}\) Rieger (2011) states that nowadays the gnomic present “mostly occurs in proverbs” (p. 122) and notes that the gnomic present is typical in impersonal use with no expressed agent. The action in the sentence with the *hu-* marker can be conducted by “one or many persons, by magical, natural or divine agency, and the sentence may alternatively be understood as a reflexive or passive” (p. 122).
sexual desire and sexual behavior are staged as a normative outcome of the physiological changes that is experienced during puberty by boys and girls with regular development.

Similarly to the primary school textbook, the selected curriculum of the NGO Support for International Change (SIC) places puberty within the topic of human physiology, which includes a description of male and female reproductive organs, menstruation, pregnancy, and sexually transmitted diseases. In the SIC curriculum, the topic of reproductive health is included in chapter 4, after the introduction to HIV, progression of HIV in the body, and HIV testing, which reflects the focus of the organization exclusively on HIV/AIDS education. In the curriculum, chapters on different types of transmission, including the discussion on living with HIV/AIDS and caring for persons with HIV/AIDS, follow the chapter on reproductive health. The curriculum suggests that the typical presentation of female and male organs and a list of physical changes experienced by boys and girls during puberty is elicited from students with interactive brainstorming and accompanied with a question-answer session. The curriculum contains a section on frequently asked questions called Swali Box ‘Question Box’, or Sanduku la Maswali ‘Box of Questions’ in the Swahili curriculum. These questions range from what is virginity to whether masturbation\(^{12}\) is harmful, and how sex and pregnancy are connected. In general, the manual leaves the impression of equal and neutral representation of male and female physiology in the time of puberty. For example, the curriculum lists not only menarche, but also “spermarche” (SIC, 2008a, p. 21), and mentions breasts as not an exclusively female prominent feature, but also that “boys may experience tenderness of the nipples” (SIC, 2008a, p. 21). The manual emphasizes the normalcy of various physiological and psychological experiences that

\(^{12}\) Masturbation as a discursive topic in reproductive health classes will be discussed in detail further in this chapter.
boys and girls may have while undergoing puberty, for example, later or earlier puberty onset, presence or absence of some puberty signs, and others. The manual mentions “increased sexual desire” (SIC, 2008a, p. 21), as well as erection in boys (SIC, 2008a, p. 22). While there is no discussion about the nature of sexual desire, the manual states that sex is not a way “to control erection” (SIC, 2008a, p. 22) and later that masturbation is “a safe way of responding to the feeling of wanting to have sex for both girls and boys” (SIC, 2008a, p. 28). Thus the experiences of puberty, including sexual desire, are presented in a neutral way, equally affecting boys and girls. In this way, the NGO curriculum differs from the school textbook Sayansi 6, which takes a more explicit evaluative stance toward youth undergoing puberty.

In comparison to the public school curriculum, in manuals of NGOs, including SIC, discussion of behavioral changes resulting from puberty is used for teaching about stadi za maisha ‘life skills’ and kujitambua ‘self-esteem’. The life skill education is designed to empower students with communicative strategies for overcoming peer pressure and negotiating terms of romantic relationships; role-plays with a number of suggested scenarios usually accompany the teaching manuals of NGOs (e.g. Peace Corps, 2001). During my fieldwork I noticed that the word kujitambua ‘self-esteem’ was often mentioned within the educational sessions, I have, however, observed no classes in which role-play scenarios outlined in the manuals were used directly. The neglect of the explicit life skills component in the training sessions of NGOs can be explained with the shift to a biology-heavy curriculum, which makes it similar to the Tanzanian school curriculum where life skills and reproductive health are separated between two different subjects: civics and biology. NGO educators generally present the dissemination of information about as the crucial weapon for fighting HIV and teenage pregnancies. Life skills, such as self-esteem and successful communication were addressed rather indirectly, through hypothetical
stories, metaphors, and jokes, and invoking self-reliance with words containing the -ji- ‘self’ morpheme, such as kujitambua ‘self-esteem’, kujijua ‘self-knowing’ and kujilinda ‘self-protecting’. Self-reliance was declared as the crucial strategy for nation building within the the history of ujamaa, that is, Tanzanian socialism (Nyerere, 1968); “self” here referred to the people of independent Tanzania as the main resource for achieving economic prosperity. In the NGO discourse, the concept of self-reliance substitutes the collective self with the individualistic self (more on this in Chapter 6).

My comparison of the government-approved and NGO texts outlines the context of puberty classes I have observed in primary and secondary schools. Sayansi 6 represents the normatively accepted knowledge and it is noticeable that the NGO curriculum to a large extent replicates it. I argue that classes on puberty and reproductive physiology organized by NGOs result not solely in improving students’ knowledge on the topic, but in students’ exposure to the discourses of sexuality and desire, traditionally considered a taboo topic in Tanzania (e.g. Plummer & Wight, 2011; Thompson, 2013, 2014).

The following sections present how puberty is topicalized for primary and secondary school students in educational sessions organized by different NGOs, and how the students are socialized into a certain perspective on sexual desire as one among the other negative outcomes of physiological transformations resulting from puberty.

5.3 Puberty and the body: emphasis on negative changes

5.3.1 ‘Weird places’: puberty for primary school students

The data for this section come from a six-week long HIV-awareness campaign in a primary school situated in a village in northwestern Tanzania. The educators, young American and Tanzanian recent college graduates who were living with home-stay families in the same
village, were delivering one-hour long classes on HIV awareness twice a week after-school.

Students’ participation in these classes was optional. About 100 students in the age of 9-12, both male and female, were present at each class. Prior to the beginning of teaching, the NGO volunteers obtained permission from the school headmaster, who reviewed the NGO curriculum and restricted topics for teaching. The headmaster insisted on going not ‘too deep’ (*sio kwa undani sana*), which a Tanzanian educator translated to his American teaching partners as “*no condom*.”

I observed and video-recorded a class on puberty led by two male educators, the Tanzanian, Eman and the Asian-American, Quan. Only students from Standard 5 and 6 were allowed to participate. The Tanzanian educator, Eman, controlled that younger students did not enter the classroom. The class was situated in a regular classroom on the school premises; it was attended by about 120 students; male and female students were sitting together, four to five persons per desk, facing the blackboard.

**FIGURE 5.1 NGO EDUCATORS IN A PRIMARY SCHOOL SETTING**

---

13 The observation was conducted in November, and at this time of school year students from the final grade, Standard 7, had already been dismissed from classes in preparation to the national examinations. The results of these exams are decisive for admission to secondary school.
During teaching, Quan stayed at the blackboard in front of the students. As teaching tools, he used paper posters attached to the blackboard and marker pens. Eman was moving around the classroom, attending to students’ questions, policing misbehaving students, and translating students’ commentaries and contributions to Quan, who had very limited proficiency in Swahili.

**FIGURE 5.2 TANZANIAN NGO EDUCATOR MANAGING CLASSROOM**

The topic of puberty, as mentioned earlier, is included in the regular curriculum for Standard 6, so the information presented by the educators was not necessarily new for all students. In the observed classroom, several students had the *Sayansi* 6 textbook and they used it as the information source when interacting with the educators. The educators discovered only at the end of the class that the students used the textbook and called it cheating (lines 06, 07):

**Excerpt 5.3**

2012-11-20-Clip7-[00:05:56.09]

KID – male primary school student, speaks Swahili; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; QUAN – male American educator, speaks English.

01 KID: (ku-toa mbegu za kiume.)
    To-produce seeds of male
    *(Producing sperm.)*

02 EMAN: ((translates to Quan, then turns to the students))

03 U-na-soma wapi? ((Walking to the student, looking at his desk))
    You-PRS-read where
    *Where are you reading from?*

04 ((Takes *Sayansi* 6 from the student away and looks inside the book))
Students readily helped the educators to locate the lesson on puberty in the textbook, displaying that they had already been exposed to this topic.

In the beginning of the class, however, Quan and Eman assumed that their lesson was new to the students. The educators began the discussion of puberty by presenting the contours of, first, female, and then, male, bodies drawn on paper charts and attached with tape to the blackboard. The students were asked to brainstorm about the changes happening with the bodies while kubalehe ‘reaching puberty’. After Eman translated students’ responses, Quan would add the information on the paper chart with a marker pen. Figure 5.3 shows how the drawings representing a boy and a girl undergoing puberty looked at the end of the exercise.

FIGURE 5.3 NGO DRAWINGS OF YOUTH UNDERGOING PUBERTY
Compare these drawings to the illustration showing “youth approaching puberty” from *Sayansi 6* in Figure 5.4.

**FIGURE 5.4 SCHOOLBOOK IMAGE OF YOUTH UNDERGOING PUBERTY**

*Mvulana na msichana wanaokaribia kubalehe* ‘Boy and girl who are approaching puberty’ (copyright Walter Lema, Kilama & Kalugula, 2004: 112)

In the textbook the children approaching puberty are portrayed as young adults, while the changes associated with reaching adulthood are indexed with the characters’ clothes, namely no school uniform, and wayward posture where the boy is holding his hands inside the pants pockets and the girl on her hips, both standing with chest out and displaying a “defiant stance” (Goodwin, Cekaite, & Goodwin, 2012, p. 28). In comparison to these images, the drawings from the NGO-organized lesson on puberty are focused on the display of physiological changes, and therefore, the bodies are naked. For these naked characters, Quan and Eman specifically selected non-Tanzanian names, *Kaka Bob* ‘Brother Bob’ and *Dada Kim* ‘Sister Kim’, so that the students would not associate them with any real person. In the training sessions I observed, the educators were specifically advised to avoid Tanzanian names to prevent mocking.
In their lesson, Eman and Quan elicit changing voice, growing taller, pubic hair, and hair in armpits as common signs of puberty in boys and girls; growing breasts and hips, as well as menstruation, were added to Dada Kim’s image; facial hair, growing muscles and body odor were drawn on Kaka Bob’s picture. Emotional changes, a topic which I will discuss in greater detail below, were marked by the American educator with the questions and heart marks above the heads of both characters.

The students were given a chance to contribute to the presentation of puberty and by so doing, to display their epistemic status, namely what they know and what they do not know (Heritage, 2012), as well in order to show their attitudes to the described issues through word choice and non-verbal behavior, primarily laughter. Yet the extent to which children contributed to the construction of the concept kubalehe ‘reaching puberty’ was limited because the teachers were selective about what and how to translate, what to put on the board, and what to leave unheard and unspoken. For example, at one point Quan asked about the changes that happen to girls’ skin during puberty and the students responded that it becomes nyororo ‘soft’. While engaging with students, Eman fails to translate this response, and Quan in line 6 produces his own response, pimples, and draws those on the chart. Eman drops the previous question about what happens to the skin and substitutes it with “what comes out on her face” (line 09), and by so doing contextualizes Quan’s actions for students.

**Excerpt 5.4**
2012-11-20-Clip6 [00:02:35]
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speak Swahili and English; KIDS – Tanzanian primary school students, speak Swahili.

```
01 QUAN:    And her skin changes.
02 EMAN:    Hata ngozi yake i-na-ni:- hapapa ((showing his own arms)) nini?
            even skin her it-PRES- here what
            Even her skin it is what’s ((showing his own arms)) here?
```
03 KIDS: I-na-badilika.  
It is changing.

04 KIDS: I-na-kuwa nyororo.  
It is getting soft.

05 EMAN: I-na-kuwa nyoro-?  
It is getting so-?

06 KIDS: Nyororo. ((Some say nyororo in high pitch indexing feminine voice))  
Soft.

07 QUAN: So she might get acne on her face ((touching his face)), pimples.  

08 ((Moves to the board and draws pimples))

09 EMAN: Uso-ni a-na-tokea na nini?  
What comes out on her face?  

10 KIDS: Chunusi. ((Following with laughter as Quan is drawing))  
Pimples. ((Following with laughter as Quan is drawing))

11 EMAN: Sasa mbona mmesahau?  
Now why you.PL-PRF-forget  
Now why have you forgotten?

The students’ response chunusi ‘pimples’ (line 09) can be characterized as an ongoing commentary on the actions of the educators, and not necessarily as a display of their own knowledge. With his question in line 11, Eman places the responsibility for the incoherence in the interaction on the students who “have forgotten” to mention the answer expected by the American educator.

In comparison to this negative presentation of the adolescent body as acne-prone, in the following example, children mention kuwa safi ‘being clean’ as a characteristic of a boy undergoing puberty:

**Excerpt 5.5**
2012-11-20-Clip7 [00:05:01.24]  
BOY – male Tanzanian student, speaks Swahili; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; Quan – male American educator, speaks English; KIDS – Tanzanian students, speak Swahili.

01 BOY: (Kuwa msafi) (( )).  
(Be clean) (( )).
Here, the child’s contribution was unexpected by the American educator who by posing the follow-up question problematizes the idea of “being clean” (line 05). From the various responses, Eman selects for translation *harufu mbaya* ‘bad smell’ (line 10); Quan validates this answer as the correct one (line 11). The educators, therefore, contextualized the idea of ‘being clean’ as related to ‘odors’ and highlighted the latter in the drawing.

In addition to emphasizing pimples and body odor, the American educator characterizes body parts undergoing changes during puberty as *weird* (line 04), which contributes to creating a negative imagery of adolescent body.

**Excerpt 5.6**
2012-11-20-Clip7 [00:04:22.05]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; KID – male primary school student, speaks Swahili, QUAN – male American educator, speaks English.
These examples demonstrate how the educators selectively bring to students’ attention negative aspects of physiological changes associated with puberty and disregard students’ existing knowledge about becoming adults.

5.3.2 Puberty for secondary school students

The data in this section come from classes on reproductive health and HIV in various secondary schools, as well as from training sessions for youth educators organized by unrelated NGOs. The setting for secondary school classes is very similar to the primary school described above. Male and female students in these reproductive health classes were from Tanzanian Form 1, 2, 3, ranging from 13 to 20 years old. The broad range in students’ age is because some students have to wait to join secondary school due to lack of space or money for tuition, uniform, or boarding expenses (Plummer & Wight, 2011; Stambach, 2000). One to two hundred students were present during each teaching session I observed. The setting of training sessions for youth educators was different from classes for primary and secondary school students: Here, a small group of 10-20 male and female young adults in the age of 19-25 were educated about reproductive health issues by a diverse group of experienced NGO workers and later trained to deliver this information in rural settings.

In the classes on reproductive health organized by NGOs for both secondary school students and young adults, puberty remains a relevant a topic within the lesson on reproductive health.

---

14 Similar to Standard 7 primary school student, at this time of the year, in November, secondary school students from the final Form 4 were excluded from classes due to preparation to the national examinations.
anatomy, or via vya uzazi in Swahili. The imagery used in these classes is different from classes for younger students, as there are no pictures of a boy’s or girl’s body, only male and female genitalia.

**FIGURE 5.5 NGO DRAWINGS OF MALE AND FEMALE BODIES**

As in the reproductive health classes for primary school students, secondary school students are also reminded of the physiological changes during puberty. Consider the following excerpt from the class led by four American female educators in their early twenties, all not speaking Swahili, and four male Tanzanian educators in their mid-twenties. A Tanzanian male peer education coordinator and a Tanzanian female training coordinator, both in their late twenties, supervise the teaching. As in the primary school classroom discussed in Excerpt 5.4, in this excerpt a female American educator, Sue, receives an answer from students stating that skin becomes softer during puberty.

**Excerpt 5.7**
2012-11-02 [00:53:41.16]
SUE – female American educator, speaks English; BOY – Tanzanian male student, speaks Swahili, may speak and understand some English.

01 SUE: Who can tell me what happens to our skin when we go through puberty.
((No response from the students. Three Tanzanian educators restate the question, encouraging the students to engage for approx. 1 min.))

02 BOY: Kwa upande wa wasichana ngozi i-na-kuwa nyororo.
For side of girls skin it-PRS-be gentle
For girls, their skin becomes softer.

((The response is translated to Sue. Students and educators engage in side-talk for approx. 3 min.))

03 SUE: Eh okay do you think it’s- Who said smooth skin?
04 Because our skin doesn’t really- it- our skin doesn’t really get
05 smoother. It gets more oily. And then we get acne. So that’s
06 actually what gets sm(h)oo(h)th. (0.3) I just don’t want them
08 be confused. They don’t get smooth skin.

As in the primary school class, Sue rejects the potentially positive image of a body undergoing puberty. By searching for the failing student with “Who said” (line 03) and using declarative sentences, Sue performs her role of the ultimate source of information. She presents the negative outcome of puberty as unavoidable and compulsory.

In the classes for secondary school students, educators display more comfort in talking about emotional changes experienced by the youth during puberty. The “weird” body, as in Excerpt 5.6, is actively represented as the cause for thoughts and deeds of a sexual nature. In the following example, an older experienced Tanzanian educator, Babu, is leading a training session about reproductive health for future NGO educators and emphasizes that adolescence is a pivotal time specifically due to the physiological development of sexual desire. Here, a female Tanzanian trainee in her early twenties, Helena, mentions majimaji ‘fluids’ as a sign that a girl undergoes puberty; Babu elaborates on this entry:

**Excerpt 5.8**
2013-02-22-CLIP2-[01:04:25]
BABU – male Tanzanian educator; HELENA – female Tanzanian trainee; ALL – male and female Tanzanian trainees; all speak Swahili and English.

01 BABU: Ni majimaji gani ya-na-anza kutoka. (U-we) specific kidogo.
COP fluid which it-PRS-start to-exit () little
Which fluids begin to come out? (Be) a little specific.

(Several lines omitted)
HELENA: (ute) kutoka sehemu za siri. saliva from parts of secret
The fluid from private parts (vagina).

BABU: ehe.: On. Provocation. (0.4) On touch.

HELENA: M:hm.

BABU: Sawa eh? Lakini ha-i-tok-i bure. equal INTRJ but NEG-it-exit-NEG free
You agree, right? But it doesn’t appear without cause.

BABU: Tena mtoto a-ki-wa mdogo u-ki-mw-ogesha
Again child s/he-SIM-be little you-SIM-him/her-bathe
Also when a child is little if you bathe him/her

((touching pants at crotch)) ni senseless. (1.0)

((touching pants at crotch)) Is senseless. (1.0)

Sio? Wa kiume na wa kike.
Not of male and of female
Isn’t s/he? Both male and female.

lakini a-ki-sha-fika adolescence u-ki-gusa (( ))
But s/he-SIM-PRF-arrive you-SIM-touch
But if s/he is already at adolescence if you touch (( ))

ALL: ((collective laughter))

BABU: (( )) i-na-ruka
It-PRS-jump
(( )) It gets erect.

((moves the arm from crotch perpendicularly imitating erect penis))

ALL: ((collective laughter))

BABU: Kwa mtoto wa kike u-ki-shika shika a-ta-kuwa na wet.
For child of female you-SIM-grab grab she-FUT-be with
For a girl if you touch and touch she will have wetness.

(A-ka-wa) wet kidogo.
(Sh-CONSEC-be) little
(Sh-CONSEC-be) a little wet.

Here the physical response of arousal is presented as a major outcome of developing adult
“sensitivity” in adolescents as opposed to the child’s “senseless” (line 07) body.

The presented data show that NGO-organized classes to a large extent replicate the
Tanzanian school curriculum in terms of representing physiological processes occurring during
puberty. The educators, especially Americans, tend to emphasize negative changes and disregard
students’ entries on positive aspects of acquiring physical maturity. In the following section, I
will discuss in detail how, similarly to Excerpt 5.8, sexual desire is presented as the major emotional outcome of the physiological transformations and how educators evaluate it in negative terms.

5.4 Puberty and the mind

5.4.1. Emotions for primary school students

The talk about psychological changes experienced during puberty is most relevant as an instance of discursive construction of desire. As pointed out in the previous sections, the Tanzanian school curriculum and also NGO educators present emotional changes as an outcome of physiological development, which, however, has different implications for boys and girls. In this section I will demonstrate that while boys are perceived as having little control over their sexuality and limited responsibility for engaging in sexual behaviors, girls are socialized into the notions of regret and fear associated with sexual activity. The constructed discourses of desire predictably differ in terms of depth in primary schools and among older students. In primary schools, educators focus on abstract romance and love. In secondary schools, the educators are allowed to address delicate topics in a broader and more direct way which they use for portraying sexual desire as a strong force causing self-sabotaging behavior. When comparing classes conducted by American and Tanzanian educators, it is a noticeable that the former tend to frame sexual desire as an irrational romantic feeling and the latter treat it as a concrete sensation, easily recognizable and localized within specific body parts. So, in the puberty class in the primary school introduced previously, the American educator, Quan, simply mentions “emotions” as another change brought by puberty to females; he depicts it with question signs above the character’s head on the drawing.
First, in this excerpt there is a discrepancy in the translation between emotions (line 01) and fikra ‘thoughts’ (line 02): the Tanzanian educator may be consciously avoiding the word hisia\textsuperscript{15} ‘feelings, emotions’ because of its direct sexual connotations. Second, neither educator makes an efforts to contextualize the produced information and both drop the topic until later, when during the discussion about changes occurring during puberty with males, a student makes an entry about kujamiiiana ‘to copulate’ (TUKI, 2001, p. 114):

\textbf{Excerpt 5.10}

2012-11-20-Clip7 [00:04:35.01]
BOY1 – male Tanzanian student; EMAN – Tanzanian educator, QUAN – American educator

\textsuperscript{15} hisi “feel, recognize, perceive, sense” (Johnson,1967 [1939], p. 134); hisia “feelings, emotion, passion” (TUKI, 2001, p. 104).
BOY1: (( )) (hamu ya kujamiiana).
Desire of to-have intercourse
(( )) (Sexual desire).

EMAN: Eh. (( )) feelings,
INTRJ Yeah (( )) feeling,

QUAN: Feelings, yes! U:h ((drawing question marks above the character’s head and a heart sign)). Emotional changes! Right?

EMAN: Sawa. ((Selecting another student to speak)) equal
Right. ((Selecting another student to speak))

In his translation, the Tanzanian educator, Eman, chooses to translate *hamu*°°* ya kujamiiana* ‘sexual desire’ with feelings (line 02), which Quan transforms even further into emotional changes (line 04) and indexes these changes in the drawing with question marks in the same way he did for the female character. The video recording captures, however, that the student, BOY1, is reading directly from the *Sayansi 6* textbook, which has the following statement: *Hamu ya kutaka kujamiiana hujitokeza* ‘The desire to have intercourse reveals itself’ (Kilama & Kalugula, 2010 [2004], p. 26, p. 111). A couple of minutes after the entry of BOY1, another child, BOY2, produces a very similar utterance about *kujamiiana* ‘to copulate’ (line 01) which BOY1 restates subsequently (line 08). The educators do not register that the students are using the textbook as their source of information.

**Excerpt 5.11**
2012-11-20-Clip7 [00:07:48.15]
BOY1, BOY2 - male primary school students; EMAN - male Tanzanian educator; QUAN - male American educator.

BOY2: (( )) hamu ya ku-jamiiana.
desire of to-copulate
(( )) desire to have intercourse.

°° *hamu* “longing, yearning, anhieity, love, desire, for something (either good or bad)” (Johnson, 1967 [1939], p. 126); “longing, hankering, desire for sth, hunger for” (TUKE, 2001, p. 98).
EMAN: Yeah. Feelings. (They want) to have sex.

QUAN: Yeah! Love. (Reading the teaching manual at the same time, not looking at students)

EMAN: Yeah. Tayari (pointing at the drawing). already Yeah. Already there (pointing at the drawing).

QUAN: Attraction.

EMAN: ((pointing at another student to speak))

BOY1: (hu -jaribu-jaribu na) hamu ya ku-jamiihana (GNO-try-try and) desire of to-copulate (experimenting with) sexual desire

EMAN: So you have the habit of tasting everything ((smiling))

QUAN: Tasting everything? ((confused))

EMAN: Yeah. Everything like ((smiling)) having sex.

Sometimes.((Turning to students)) Tayari, tu-mesha-andika hapo. already we-PRF-write there

Sometimes.((Turning to students)) We’ve already written it here.

The repetitive utterances produced by BOY1 and BOY2 in these two examples can be explained as either an attempt to get an acknowledgement from the educators, or as an indirect challenge towards the educators who seem to be reluctant to talk about delicate issues with students of younger age.

In Excerpt 5.11 Eman and Quan jointly transform the entry from the textbook about kujamiihana ‘to have intercourse’ into feelings, sexual desire, and finally, love and attraction (lines 02 03, 04). The participant frameworks constructed by the educators and the ideologies about sex and age shared by the educators and the audience can account for this transformation. While the Tanzanian educator in line 02 orients toward his role as a translator and provides Quan with a contextualized interpretation of the student’s utterance, latter in lines 03 and 06, he orients towards students in the role of a teacher and mitigates the student’s entry translated by Eman as feelings and they want to have sex (line 02) in the romantic terms of love and attraction (line 03). Simultaneously, while producing this verbal response, Quan adds a visual sign of heart on board.
By so doing, Quan transforms the talk from being about sex to being about emotions. This example shows how the physiological sexual desire is substituted with the imagery of emotional involvement, which has its focus not within the person who is experiencing it, but rather outside, directed to the other person who is the source of attraction.

In the same Excerpt 5.11, line 08, the student BOY1 mentions *kujaribujaribu* ‘experimenting’ in addition to repeating *kujamiiana*. The textbook *Sayansi* is most probably is the source of this entry.¹⁷ When translating the student’s entry about *kujaribujaribu* ‘experimenting’ (line 08), Eman first formulates it as *tasting everything* (line 09) which causes a complete confusion for Quan. The word *kujaribu* ‘to experience, make trial of, test, prove’ – only incidentally with any idea of trying, in the sense of ‘do one’s best’ (Johnson, 1967 [1939], p. 150) does not have the initial food association. The food metaphors for sex that is made by Eman with *tasting everything* (line 09) are typical for Swahili speakers. With a somewhat embarrassed smile, Eman explains to Quan the reference of “everything” as sex. This interpretation may result from the student’s juxtaposition of *kujaribujaribu* ‘experimenting’ and *kujamiiana* ‘to copulate’ in line 08. As soon as Eman finishes translating and without waiting for Quan’s response, he turns to students and performs his teacher’s role to shut down any further discussion about this delicate topic (line 12). By equating *kujamiiana* ‘to copulate’ and *kujaribujaribu* ‘to experiment’

¹⁷ The textbook by Kilama & Kalugula (2010 [2004], p. 112; also p. 26) provides the following explanation of experimenting as a result of puberty:

01 Vi-jana hu-wa na tabia za ku-jaribu-jaribu vitu kama vile:
   PL-youth GNO-be with habit of to-try-try things like those
   Youth usually have the habit of experimenting with things like these:

02 kuvuta sigara, bangi, dawa za kulevya na ngono.
   smoking cigarettes marijuana drugs of intoxicating and extramarital sex
   smoking cigarettes, marijuana, intoxicating drugs and extramarital sex.

By using gnomic tense *hu*- in *hu-wa na* ‘usually have’ (line 01), the textbook presents the inevitable nature of the negative outcomes.
with *feelings, love, attraction*, visually indexed with hearts, and *emotional changes*, visually indexed with question marks, the educators reduce the negative connotations of psychological changes triggered by puberty, but at the same time bring emotions into line with sex.

### 5.4.2 Feelings for secondary school students and young adults

In secondary schools, the focus on emotional changes and sexual desire is more prominent than in reproductive health classes for primary school students. In the following excerpt from a class in a secondary school, a Tanzanian educator Paul talks about puberty as *kipindi hatari* ‘a dangerous period’ (line 11). Paul compares sexual feelings to various misfortunes that a young person is particularly prone when undergoing puberty:

**Excerpt 5.12**

2012-11-02 [01:15:10.16]
BRITTANY – female American educator; PAUL – male Tanzanian educator; STUDENTS – Tanzanian male and female secondary school students.

01 BRITTANY: It’s also normal during puberty to become more aware of the opposite sex or start having more sexual feelings.

03 PAUL: Na: kwa wakati huu yaani ni kitu cha kawaida sana ku-wa na and for time this namely COP thing of usually very to-be with A:nd at this time namely it is a very normal things to

04 hisia za kimapenzi SAna. feelings of sexual very feel VErY sexual.

05 Ndo kile kipindi (kiko m-na-weza ku-angalia) kama EMPH that period you.PL-PRS-can to-watch like Indeed this period (you can observe that)

06 mzee fulani a-na bastola u-na-weza u-ka-pig-wa. elder some he-has gun you-PRS-can you-CONSEC-hit-PASS some older guy with his gun you can get shot

07 Tu-na-ona eh? We-PRS-see INTRJ We see right?

08 U-ka-chom-wa na mwiba you-CONSEC-sting-PASS with thorn You can get pricked by thorns\(^{18}\)

---

\(^{18}\) *kuchomwa na mwiba* is a Swahili idiom that means ‘to get in trouble’, ‘to be deceived’ (Ndalu & King’ei, 1989, pp. 13, 127).
au ku-fanya nini au ku-gong-wa na gari
or to-to what or to-hit-PASS and car
or something or hit by a car

to

Maana u-na-end ((si jui moto)
Namely you-PRS-go (you-PRS-him/her-separate) (NEG.I-know fire)
Namely you go and (( I don’t know you get into fire.

(mvuke) haraka haraka kwenda (( )).
fast fast towards
(( quickly while going to )).

Kwa hiyo kipindi hiki ni hatari sana.
for this period this COP dangerous very
That’s why this period is very dangerous.

STUDENTS: ((laugh collectively))

In addition to presenting puberty as a dangerous period, this Excerpt 5.12 is a striking, yet
typical example of how utterances produced by foreign educators become transformed by the
local educators. It is relevant to point out the discrepancy between what American educators and
Tanzanians (both students and educators) understand as “emotional changes.” The following
Excerpt 5.13 illustrates how the American educator conveys a Western ideology about emotions
triggered by puberty:

Excerpt 5.13
2012-11-02 [01:12:01.12]
BRITTANY – female American educator, speaks English; PAUL – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

BRITTANY: What other emotional changes happen during puberty? Have you-
has anyone found themselves feeling a little bit more weird
than usual, or quicker to be angry? Or anxious, or depressed?

PAUL: Jamani (ha-m-taji) kuna vitu vingi.
guys (NEG-you.PL-mention) there are things other
Guys (you don’t say anything) There are many things.

Yaani kwa- ku-na hasara yaani
Namely for there-have.PR-anger namely
Namely for- there is anger namely

labda mtu a-na-kuwa- kwa nini ha-m-taji?
Maybe person s/he-PRS-be for what NEG-you.PL-mention
Maybe a person is- why don’t you say anything?

Mtu a-na-pat-wa na hasira,
Person s/he-PRS-get-PASS with anger
A person gets swept with anger,
Brittany talks about puberty in negative terms of feeling *weird* (line 02), *angry*, *anxious*, *depressed* (line 03). The translator Paul does not provide a close equivalent for these concepts in Swahili except for talking about anger as *mtu anapatwa na hasira* ‘a person gets swept with anger’ (line 07). By using passive voice suffix -wa in the verb *anapatwa* (line 07), Paul talks about anger as not an emotion actively experienced by a person, but as a powerful force overriding the person’s agency.

The American educator continues constructing the negative concept of the effect of puberty on a person’s psyche:

**Excerpt 5.14**
2012-11-02-[01:13:49.24]
BRITTANY – female American educator, speaks English; STUDENTS – Tanzanian male and female secondary school students, speak Swahili and some English; PAUL – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

BRITTANY: You may feel sad or depressed sometimes, and not even really completely know why,

PAUL: Na: saa nyingine u-na-weza u-ka-kosa amani kabisa, And hour another you-PRS-can you-CONSEC-lack peace absolutely And sometimes you can lack peace completely,

na yaani u-ka-kosa kidogo u-ka-kosa amani, And namely you-CONSEC-fail little you-CONSEC-lack peace ‘And namely you lack a little bit you lack peace,’

halafu u-na: hiyo- u-na-ji-uliza kwamba Then you-PRS this you-PRS-self-ask that Then you: like you ask yourself that

---

19 For *anxiety* Johnson (1995 [1939], p. 24) offers “mashaka, wasiwas, hangaiko, kiherehere, fadhaa, haraka.”

20 For *depression* Johnson (1995 [1939], p.144) offers “huzuni, uzito, unyogovu, unyong’onyevu, majonzi.”
Here, the Tanzanian educator, Paul, with repetitions and self-repairs displays that he struggles to translate Brittany’s entry with a hypothetical story. He attempts to express depression as -kosa amani ‘to lack peace’ (line 04), but gets no signals of understanding from students. Finally, Paul poses a direct question for checking the students’ understanding (line 07). When the students confirm that they do not share the experiences of emotional changes as presented by the educators, the translator asks the students whether they have not reached puberty yet (line 09). By posing this question, Paul achieves two ends simultaneously. First, by re-entextualizing the cause of unintelligibility of such concepts, as depression and anxiety (excerpt 14) in terms of students’ immaturity, Paul manages to save his and Brittany’s positive face: it is not that the educators are talking nonsense, but that the students are not quite developed yet. Second, Paul along with the other co-present educators socializes the students into a negative vision of puberty. The lack of participation indicated by the translator, for example, with his exclamation Kwa nini hamtaji ‘Why don’t you say anything?’ (Excerpt 5.13, line 06), as well as presenting themselves as lacking epistemic access for the talk about emotional changes (Excerpt 5.14, line 10), may be interpreted as students’ display of resistance to the socialization practices performed by the NGO educators.
While Tanzanian educators experience difficulties in translating information about emotional changes from English, American educators struggle with responding to students’ questions about sexual desire, such as in the following Excerpt 5.15:

**Excerpt 5.15**
2012-11-02-[01:29:06.26]
STUDENT – male Tanzanian secondary school student, speaks Swahili and some English; ROSE – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili and some English; JAMES – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; EDUCATORS – Tanzanian and American male and female educators; SUE – female American educator, speaks English.

01 STUDENT: Samahani.
   Excuse
   Excuse me.

02 ROSE: Bila samahani. Haya.
   Without excuse INTRJ
   No excuse needed. Go on.

03 STUDENT: M-na-sema kwamba kwa ku-balehe u-na-badilika
   You.PL-PRS-say that for to-reach.puberty you-PRS-change
   You say that through puberty you change

04 ki-jinsia. U-na-pata hisia za mapenzi. Siyo?
   ADV-sex you-PRS-get feelings of love no
   With regard to gender. You get get sexual feelings. Don’t you?

05 Kwa mfano si ndiyo u-na-pata zile hisia za mapenzi.
   For example not EMPH you-PRS-get those feelings of love
   For example isn’t it true that you get those those sexual feelings.

06 I-na-shauri-wa ni-fany-e?:
   it-PRS-advice-PASS I-do-SBJV
   Is it advised that I should do it?

07 Au {{ }},?
   Or {{ }},?

08 STUDENTS: ((laughter))

09 JAMES: Eh swali zuri sana a-na-uliza. Swali zuri.
   INTRJ question nice very he-PRS-ask question nice
   Well a very good question he asks. A good question.

10 ?ROSE: Eh kabisa.
   completely
   Ye:ah totally.

11 ROSE: ((translating to Americans, mostly inaudible)) The question is {{ }}
12 emotional changes, and like get (attracted) {{ }} to sex, {{ }}
13 For example someone is undergoing puberty
14 (what do you advise them to do) {{ }}

15 JAMES: ((toward the educators)) To sex or?
In this excerpt, the male student poses a challenging question about how to act when experiencing sexual arousal which he calls *hisia za mapenzi* ‘sexual feelings’, where *mapenzi* ‘love, liking, inclination, desire’ (Johnson, 1939/1967, p. 373) is a euphemism regularly used in Tanzania to refer to sex. With the modal *inashauriwa* ‘it is advised’ and the personal prefix *ni-* ‘I’ in *nifanye* ‘I should do’ (line 06), the student designs the question in such a way that the educators are presented as taking responsibility for this student’s actions. With a burst of laughter, other students display their understanding of the provocative nature of the question (line 08); the educators also laugh when they get the question translated (line 14). Later, a
Tanzanian educator shows her understanding of this question as not serious because the students *wako tayari wanajua kitu cha kufanya* ‘already know what to do’ (line 24-25). Sue, the American educator who takes the challenge of responding to the question, admits that it is not a simple one. Her response, however, not only redirects the responsibility for one’s sexual actions on the person him- or herself, but also, by substituting “feelings of love” with the example in which she *yelled at my mom* (line 29), Sue delivers her response in rather evasive manner. Sue displays that she is uncomfortable talking about sex and cautiously frames momentary impulses as causes of regret (line 32).

Tanzanian educators register the irrelevance of Sue’s response and offer alternative strategies, such as the following:

**Excerpt 5.16**
2012-11-02 [01:33:30.20] *Useksi au huseksi? ‘To have sex or not to have sex?’*

JAMES – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 JAMES: Niaje? (0.2) Kwa mfano: huyu u-na-sema labda: greeting for example this you-PRS-say maybe What’s up? (0.2) For example this student you say maybe:

02 u-na-sema kwamba u-ki-tokea na hali kama hiyo, (0.4) you-PRS-say that you-SIM-come.out and state like that You say that if you happen to be in this state (of sexual desire) (0.4)

03 Je, u-seksi au u-si-seksi? (0.2) INTR you-sex.SBJV or you-NEG.SBJV-sex Should you have sex or should you not have sex? (0.2)

04 Kwa: ku-na njia nyingi za (ku-zuia). for there-have way many of (to-suppress) For there are many ways to suppress (the desire).

05 Pamoja na hizo zi-li-zo-ambi-wa together and those they-PST-which-tell-PASS Together with those which were discussed

06 ku-na njia nyingine nzuri. there-have way other nice there are other good ways.

07 Wangapi wa-na-pigia mazoezi hapa? (0.6) Mazoezi? How many they-PRS-beat exercises here exercises How many are exercising here? (0.6) Exercises?

08 Play football, (0.4) netball, volleyball, basket sometime
Hiyo i-na-weza ka-ku-saidia wewe (0.2) ku-weza ku-punguza zile nini? this it-PRS-can CONSEC-you-help you to-can to-lower those what this can help you for you (0.2) to be able to lower those what?
(Mukhtari) za mapenzi. (0.8) option of love (Chances to have sex. (0.8)
(() ku-ji-weka bize. it-has to-self-put busy (() keeping oneself busy.

Here the Tanzanian educator James focuses on male students, which is encoded in the grammatical form of the English noun sex used here as a transitive verb -seksi ‘to have sex’ (line 03). As a strategy to cope with sexual desire, James suggests kujiweka bize ‘to keep oneself busy’ (line 11) through exercising and sports as a way to cope with the desire.

5.5 Unequal need for sex and its implications

5.5.1 Hisia kali sana ‘very strong desire’: Male desire

In the observed classes on puberty, sexual desire is framed as an outcome of physiological changes. Educators also socialize students into the idea of different sexual needs for males and females, where for males sex is presented as a physiological necessity. In classes on reproductive health organized by NGOs, menstruation and sperm production are among regular topics of discussion. While menstruation is generally discussed as a normal cyclic process, the daily production of sperm is presented as a potentially painful process in men, with sexual intercourse as the only natural relief. In the following excerpt from a class for secondary school students, a Tanzanian educator, Eman, is telling the students how many sperm a man produces per day, which elicits a remarkable response from the audience:

Excerpt 5.17
2012-11-19-Sec Clip 3 [00:44:25.00]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students; BOYS – male Tanzanian secondary school students.
EMAN: Na (huu) kazi ya korodani ni ku-tengeneza nini? And (this) work of testicle COP to-produce what

EMAN: and (this) work of testicle COP to-produce what

STUDENTS: Sperm.

EMAN: Ku-tengeneza? to-produce Producing?

EMAN: Ku-tengeneza? to-produce Producing?

STUDENTS: Mbegu. Sawa eh?
seed equal INTRJ Sperm. Right eh?

STUDENTS: Mbegu. Sp[erm.

EMAN: [Mbegu. (0.2) [Sperm. (0.2)

EMAN: [Mbegu. (0.2) [Sperm. (0.2)

EMAN: Na kwenyе ma-saa ishirini na nne kwa mwanamme- and in PL-hour twenty and four for man And in twenty four hours a man-

EMAN: Na kwenyе ma-saa ishirini na nne kwa mwanamme- and in PL-hour twenty and four for man And in twenty four hours a man-

STUDENTS: Ishirini na nne. twenty and four Twenty four.

EMAN: A-na-weza ku-tengeneza mbegu milioni mia moja hamsini. he-PRS-can to-produce sperm million hundred one fifty He can produce 150 million sperm.

EMAN: A-na-weza ku-tengeneza mbegu milioni mia moja hamsini. he-PRS-can to-produce sperm million hundred one fifty He can produce 150 million sperm.

STUDENTS: ((laughing, uttering exclamations, smiling for about 20sec))

EMAN: Tu-endele-e basi, tu-endele-e. we-continue-SBJV enough we-continue-SBJV Enough let’s continue, let’s continue.

BOYS: Milioni ngapи? ((writing down in notebooks)).

BOYS: Milioni ngapи? ((writing down in notebooks)).

EMAN: Mia moja hamsini. hundred one fifty One hundred fifty.

EMAN: Mia moja hamsini. hundred one fifty One hundred fifty.

EMAN: Milioni? million (How many) millions?

EMAN: Milioni? million (How many) millions?
The educator delivers the facts about sperm production\textsuperscript{21} in absolute terms, implying that all men are naturally remarkably prolific. Students, especially boys, treat this information as particularly relevant, which they display with clarification questions and taking notes (line 15). Students accompany this interaction with loud exclamation in expression of surprise; girls hide their smiling faces in their hands, displaying discomfort and embarrassment regarding the talk about male physiology. Later during the same class, a female student poses a question about the danger of abstinence for men. She uses her facial expression and repeating hand shake to portray a male suffering from being overloaded with sperm.

**FIGURE 5.6 PORTRAYING DISCOMFORT FROM ABSTINENCE FOR MEN**

\[\text{FIGURE 5.6 PORTRAYING DISCOMFORT FROM ABSTINENCE FOR MEN}\]

Eman uses reported speech to pose the girl’s question to the whole class. He responds to this question by stating that abstinence is not harmful, but offers no explanation about what happens to sperm within the body:

\[\text{\textsuperscript{21} The NGO curriculum on which this class is based specifies that each testis produces 150 million sperms every 24 hours.}\]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian students.

01 EMAN: Swali lake li-na-kuwa a-na-uliza hivi. (0.2) Sawa eh? question her it-PST-be she-PRS-ask this.way equal INTRJ Her question is as following. (0.2) Right eh?

02 Tu-na-sema mwanamume (0.2) we-PRS-say man
We say a man (0.2)

03 kwa siku (0.4) a-na-zalisha mbegu milioni ngapi? for day he-PRS-cause.to.bear sperm million how.many in one day (0.4) how much sperm does he produce?

04 STUDENTS: Milioni mia hamsini. million hundred fifty. Hundred fifty millions.

05 EMAN: Mia moja? hundred one One hundred?

06 STUDENTS: Hamsini. Fifty.

07 EMAN: Mia moja hamsini milioni. (0.2) hundred one fifty million One hundred fifty million. (0.2)

08 Je a-ki-kaa muda mrefu bila ya ku-jamiiiana (0.2) INTRG he-SIM-sit period long without of to-copulate So if he for a long time had no intercourse (0.2)

09 ha-i-wez-i ku-wa? (0.2) tatizo? (0.2) NEG-it-can-NEG to-be problem couldn’t it be? (0.2) a problem? (0.2)

10 Ha-i-wez-i ku-wa? NEG-it-can-NEG to-be Couldn’t it be (what)?

11 STUDENTS: Tatizo? A problem?


13 Ha-i-wez-i ku-wa tatizo. (0.4) NEG-it-can-NEG to-be problem It cannot be a problem. (0.4)

14 Ha-i-wez-i ku-wa? NEG-it-can-NEG to-be It can’t be (what)?


16 EMAN: Tatizo. Sawa eh? problem equal INTRJ A problem. Right eh?
STUDENTS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes it is.

EMAN: U-na-(( )) (ndoto) za usiku. Si ndiyo eh?
you-PRS-{( )} (dreams) of night NEG EMPH INTRJ
You (get) night (dreams). Isn’t it so eh?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo. (0.2)
EMPH
Yes it is. (0.2)

EMAN: Tu-na-zi-jua?
we-PRS-them-know
Don’t we know them (the wet dreams)?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes we do.

EMAN: Kwa hiyo kuna njia nyingi amba-yo zi-na-weza zi-ka-toka.
for that there are way many that-REL they-PRS-can they-CONSEC-come.out
Therefore there are many ways in which they (sperms) can come out.

Sawa eh?
equal INTRJ
Right eh?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes there are.

EMAN: Kuna ndoto za usiku.
there are dreams of night.
There are night dreams.

Na pia zi-ki-endelea ku-kaa, ha-zi-wez-i ku-wa nini?
and also they-SIM-continue to-sit NEG-they-can-NEG to-be what
And also if they (the sperm) remain (inside), they cannot be what?

Ha-zi-wez-i kuwa tatizo. Sawa eh?
NEG-they-can-NEG to-be problem equal INTRJ
They cannot be a problem. Right eh?

Sio lazima? (0.2) Sio lazima zi-tok-e. Sawa eh?
not necessity not necessity they-come.out-SBJV equal INTRJ
No need (for what)? (0.2) No need for (sperm) to come out. Right eh?

Kwa hiyo (. ) ha-i-na shida. (0.2)
for this NEG-it-have hardship
Therefore (. ) there is no problem. (0.2)

Kwa hiyo sio (katika) kibofu ki-na-pasuka. Ha-ki-pasuk-i.
for this not in bladder it-PRS-burst NEG-it-explode-NEG
Therefore the bladder\textsuperscript{22} doesn’t get burst. It does not burst.

\textsuperscript{22} The original question asked by the student is not audible on the recording; the word choice of kibofu ‘bladder’ for a container of sperm may be the direct reported speech.
After repeating that sperm *haiwezi kuwa tatizo* ‘cannot be a problem’ (lines 13, 14-15, 27), Eman states that sperm leaves the body naturally through *njia nyingi* ‘many ways’ (line 22), but names only *ndoto za usiku* ‘wet dreams’, or literally ‘night dreams’ (lines 18, 25), as the only way. While providing no specific explanation, Eman also discards the students’ idea about the “bladder” exploding from sperm (line 30-31). The Eman’s choice of the word *kibofu* ‘bladder’ as the place where sperm is stored is the reported speech of the original question asked by the student. This word choice is relevant for understanding the common belief about the urgent need to relieve oneself from the sperm. While *kibofu* is a medical term for ‘bladder’, the word literally means something like a balloon or a container for liquids. Although the educators have introduced the medical meaning of *kibofu* during the lecture on reproductive health and through the posters depicting male and female reproductive systems (cf. Figure 5.5), the student’s question demonstrates the lack of understanding about human anatomy. Based on the belief that sperm is stored somewhere where the urine comes from, the feeling of not being able to hold the sperm is conceptualized very similar to the urge to urinate. The educators do not treat this question as a teachable moment and thus perpetuate the belief that abstinence is life threatening for men.

Such presentation of sexual processes in men, first emphasizing the remarkable number of sperms produced daily and then providing no sufficient information about how a body deals

---

23 Thank you to Katrina Daly Thompson for this commentary.
with unused sperm, becomes a subject of doubts for students, which can be illustrated with
another excerpt from the same class on reproductive health. In a small group question-answer
session that immediately followed the class, a group of female students returns to the question
about harmful effects of abstinence in men. The students address the question to a male
American educator, Quan, and a female Tanzanian educator, Sabra.

Excerpt 5.19
2012-11-19-Sec-Clip 5-[00:02:22.00]
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator,
speaks Swahili and English; GIRL – female Tanzanian student, BOY – male Tanzanian student,
ALL – male and female students, all speak Swahili and some English.

01 GIRL: Je, mtu a-ki-piga punyeto i-na madhara?
      INTR person s/he-SIM-beat masturbation it-has harm
      So if a person masturbates is it harmful?
      ((several lines omitted, Sabra translates to Quan))

02 QUAN: No. Masturbation is quite normal.
      ((several lines omitted, Sabra translates to the girls))

03 GIRL: Mbo- mbona kwenye filamu fulani tu-me-angalia wa-ka-s-
      wh- why in movie some we-PRF-watch they-CONSEC-s-
      Wh- why in a movie that we’ve watched they s-
      a-ka-enda hospitali-ni-
      s/he-CONSEC-go hospital-LOC
      (a guy) got to the hospital-

04 A-li-kuwa a-na-piga masturbation
      s/he-PST-be s/he-PRS-beat
      He was masturbating

05 kwa sababu mke wake a-li-(kuwa) (a-na shida) hivi.
      for reason wife his she-PST-be (she-has trouble) this.way
      because his wife (she had troubles) in this way.

06 SABRA: ((asking a clarifying question from the girl, inaudible))

08 GIRL: Yeah!. A-ka-enda (( )) hospitali-ni a-kaambi-wa
      he-CONSEC-go hospital-LOC he-CONSEC-say-PASS
      Yeah! He went (( )) to the hospital and was told (that)

09 mi-shipa (ya-) i-na-yo-shika uume i-me-regea.
      PL-vein (of) they-PRS-which-hold penis they-PRF-be.weak
      the veins (of-) that hold the penis became weakened.

10 SABRA: Oh! It’s like a:h- She say that she was u:h watching movie, and say
      that: the guy was u:h was (in) masturbation
      because h- her his wife wasn’t there.

13 QUAN: Ok(h)ay.
14 SABRA: So the guy was affected by masturbation, and reduce the chance to to be STRONG in sex, ((laughs))
15 QUAN: [((laughs))]
16 GIRLS: [((laugh))]
17 QUAN: U:hm, (0.4) O:h man this is a funny question. U:hm
18 QUAN: ((to Quan)) It ain’t going to affect. I don’t know? What do you think?
19 BOY: It does.
20 GIRL: Ha-ju-i. ((smiling voice)) He doesn’t know. ((smiling voice))
21 ALL: [((laugh))]
22 SABRA: [((laugh))]

In this excerpt, Quan states that there is no harm caused by masturbation (line 02). Female Tanzanian students challenge this answer. The girl who is asking the question builds on the knowledge she and other girls have from watching a movie. In the movie, the man who was for some reason prevented from having sex with his wife ended up in the hospital. The implied cause of this accident is the natural inability of men to abstain from sex and the belief in the harmful effect of masturbation on mishipa inayoshika uume ‘veins holding the penis’ (line 09). Sabra translates the problem named by the girl, namely that mishipa imeregea ‘veins became weakened’ (line 09), as reduced chance to be STRONG in sex (line 15). Instead of addressing the issue of the inadequate knowledge about male reproductive system, with his laugh tokens Quan displays his discomfort about the topic (line 13, 18). The question remains unanswered, and students agree that the American educator simply lacks the information (line 22).

The students’ story about a man who got hospitalized due to masturbating corresponds with a widespread belief in Tanzania that men need to ejaculate, and that masturbation is harmful
and, therefore, cannot substitute for sexual contact with a woman. The implication is thus that men should pursue sex rather than masturbation, and therefore are unable to abstain.

5.5.2 Hisia tofauti ‘different desire’: Female desire

This interaction about male and female sexual desire gets further development when a group of boys joins the discussion with a question about whether and how women masturbate.

Excerpt 5.20

2012-11-19-Sek-Clip 5 [00:05:08.00]

BOY1, BOY2, BOY3 – male Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English; GIRL1, GIRL2 – female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 BOY1: Ninyi hapo m-na-pigi-eni nanii punyeto, You.PL here you.PL-PRS-beat-PL masturbation
You here do you uh:hm masturbate,

02 GIRL1: ((turns from BOY1 to SABRA, opens mouth widely, raises eyebrows in expression of deep surprise))

03 GIRL2: ((turns from BOY1 to SABRA)) (kwa wasichana) (for girls)

04 GIRL1: [(p(h)ole (h) s(h)ana) [(s(h)o (h) s(h)orry)]

05 SABRA: ((covering mouth with palm)) (h)(h)(h)

06 BOY2: (Tu-me-ambi-wa) si tu-ki-zidi-wa ndo hiyo ndo (We-PRF-tell-PASS) NEG.COP we-SIM-add-PASS EMPH this EMPH We have (been told) not like it gets bigger which is in fact

07 njia yetu. Je kwa wasichana i-na-kuwa-je? way our for g [irls it-PRS-be-
Our way. So for g [irls how is it?

08 BOY1: [Kwa wasichana inakuwaje.
for girls it-PRS-be
[For girls how is it.

09 BOY3: [(jua tu-j-e hapo).
know we-come-SBJV here
[(To find it out they told us to come here.)

24 Plummer and Wight (2011, pp. 238–239) report that in rural Tanzania male potency is measured by the number of ejaculation during one sexual encounter, and the reduced ability to ejaculate is perceived as undesirable weakness.

25 In Swahili explanatory dictionary by Mohamed & Mohamed (1998), punyeto also ponyeto is interpreted as usugaji wa kutoa manii ‘rubbing for sperm discharge’ (p. 189).
The boys address the question directly to *ninyi* ‘you (pl.)’, namely the co-present girls, their classmates, and the female educator Sabra. By so doing they use the offered discursive space to not only find out the information about the issue at stake, but rather to indirectly accuse their classmates of masturbating, and explore how experienced they are in matters of sex. In a way, this interaction resembles the discussion on dirty jokes by Sacks (1995) in which he states that “dirty jokes can be a vehicle for passing information which is intendedly restricted” (p. 486).

With the laughter, girls and Sabra display their affiliation in assessment of the posed question as obscene. The boys who are asking the question resist laughing, which allows them pursue the answer. Girls do not take the challenge in responding to the question; they laugh, turn their faces away from boys, and look at the educators. Quan states that as a male, he “wouldn’t know actually,” leaving the question open to Sabra, which she addresses in the following way:

**Excerpt 5.21**

2012-11-19-Sek-Clip 5 [00:03:39.06] *Hawana hisia* ‘They don’t have feelings’

SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; BOY1, BOY2, BOY3 – male Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English; GIRL1, GIRLS – female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English.

01 SABRA: Kusema la ukweli mimi na- ni-ki-onan
to-say of truth me I- I-SIM-see
To tell you the truth I- what I think

02 na-soma-ga vitabu vingi.
I.PRS-read-GNO books many
I usually read many books.

03 Na-onsa tu wa-na-o-taji-wa ni wa-naume
I.PRS-see only they-PRS-who-mention-PASS COP PL-man
I see just that those who are mentioned are men

04 lakini wa-nawake ha-wa-taj-w-i. Sawa?
but PL-woman NEG-they-mention-PASS-NEG equal
But women are not mentioned. Okay?

05 BOY2: I-na maana
it-has meaning
It means

06 BOY1: Kwa hiyo i-na-maanisha yaani labda
for that it-PRS-mean in.other.words maybe
Therefore it means in other words probably that

07 BOY2: wa-nawake ha-wa-na: ((makes a shaking move with the hand))
PL-woman NEG-they-have
Women don’t have ((makes a shaking move with the hand))
In her response, Sabra builds on the information taken from written sources (lines 02-04) and by so doing, she presents herself as one not engaging in masturbation. Based on Sabra’s answer, the boys draw the conclusion that women hawana hisia ‘don’t have feelings’ (line 07, line 09).
Sabra does not confirm this statement by emphasizing that as binadamu ‘humans’ (line 10), both men and women have hisia ‘feelings’, but these feelings are different (line 17). In line 12, Sabra finishes her response with a laugh token in line 13 implicating that her talk about women experiencing sexual desire is troublesome, and the girls display their affiliation with laughter (Jefferson, 1985). Boy2 elaborates on Sabra’s answer by evaluating the sexual desire experienced by females as sio kali sana ‘not very strong’ (line 18).

Sabra reuses the question posed by Boy2 to formulate a returning question directed ninyi ‘you (pl.)’, namely to the group of interrogating boys. By so doing, Sabra turns the question into a face-threatening statement accusing the boys of experiencing troublesome strong sexual desire. When the discursive weapon is turned against them, the boys who so bravely began this interaction about a delicate topic and who actively pursued the chance to embarrass female co-participants, prefer not to answer. Boy2 laughs in response to Sabra’s question, which ultimately shuts down the discussion.

This excerpt shows that sexual desire is conceptualized differently for men and women in terms of its intensity and the resulting behavior. It is asserted that boys may, and even need to, engage in sexual behavior for health reasons; masturbation is believed a poor alternative to sexual intercourse. Sexual desire in girls is presented as tofauti na wavulana ‘different from boys’ (Excerpt 5.21, line 17), namely sio kali sana ‘not too strong’ (Excerpt 5.21, line 18). The existent sexual ideology is being replicated in this interaction where both Tanzanian and American educators resist talking about female sexuality and present factually wrong information about female sexual practices as truth. The discrepancy in the intensity of sexual desire implies the natural difference in sexual behaviors in boys and girls, as well as the moral
value of such behavior. While it is unavoidable for males to be sexually active, female can easily abstain, and when they do not, it is their choice, even a whim.

5.5.3 Sex as a danger for girls

In comparison to men, women are portrayed as lacking a strong need for sex; therefore, it is women who are perceived as morally responsible for engaging in sex. In classes on reproductive health, women are also presented as the main victims of HIV/AIDS and unwanted pregnancies. In the following excerpt, Peter, an experienced Tanzanian educator in his mid-twenties employed by an NGO as a peer education coordinator, warns students about the negative consequences of *hisia* ‘feelings’, that is, sexual desire.

**Excerpt 5.22**
2012-11-02
PETER – male Tanzanian peer education coordinator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 PETER: na ile penseli yake i-ko tayari kuchora,
and that pencil his it-LOC ready to-draw
And that pencil of his is ready to draw,

02 U-na-m-wekea karatasi,
you-PRS-him-put paper
You put in front of him the paper,

03 mara a-na-andika karatasi i-na-toboka
time he-PRS-write paper it-PRS-be.soiled
right away he draws (and) the paper is soiled

04 U-na-pata mimba. Saa hizi u-ta-end wapi?
you-PRS-get pregnancy hours these you-FUT-go where
You get pregnant. Now where will you go?

05 Na wewe mvulana u-ki-m-weka msichana mimba sasa hivi,
and you boy you-SIM-her-put girl pregnancy now these
And you boy if you make a girl pregnant right now,

06 U-ta-fanya nini eh?
you-FUT-do what INTRJ
What will you do eh?

07 Si hamna kitu cha kufanya?
no there.is.no thing of to-do
Isn’t it the case that there isn’t anything to do?

08 Sana sana u-na-weza u-ka-ishia
very very you-PRS-can you-CONSEC-finish
In the extreme you can end things

09 Ku-ji-nyonga, ku-nywa sumu.
to-self-hang to-drink poison
By hanging yourself, drinking poison.
To warn about outcomes of sex, Peter uses euphemisms for male and female reproductive organs used by students during the class: *penseli* ‘pencil’ for penis (line 01), *karatsi* ‘paper’ for vagina (line 02), *kuchora* ‘to draw’ for copulating (line 01). Peter directs his message to both boys and girls, but his linguistic choices indicate girls as the ones who are responsible for getting pregnant, such as in line 02 where the girl is the one who is putting herself for a male as a paper in front of a pencil. Peter avoids mentioning courting behavior, intimacy, or sex explicitly, substituting these with metaphors. The knowledge which is alluded to with this euphemistic language concerns, however, life and death decisions, especially for girls who ‘get soiled’ (line 03), and then ‘hang themselves’ or ‘drink poison’ (line 09).

In another class for secondary school students, a female American educator states that not only female anatomy makes women more susceptible to HIV infection, but also their position in the society:

**Excerpt 5.23**
2012-11-19-Sec-Clip3-[00:27:20.21]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English.

01 ANNIE: So: not only do women are more naturally susceptible to HIV,
02 but you know in many cases women also have much less control over their
03 sexual lives as well.
04 SABRA: Yaani sio sababu tu kwamba kwa sababu yaani ngozi yao-
05 namely not reason only that for reason namely skin their
Namely it’s not only because of their (women’s) skin
06 kwa sababu yaani ngozi yao- (ya-me-ongele-wa ya-lipo)
for reason namely skin their (it-PRF-discuss-PASS it-LOC)
because namely their skin is (as we discussed it)
In this excerpt, the American educator, Annie, talks about the control over their sexual lives (line 02-03). The Tanzanian educator, Sabra, takes this statement further: instead of giving a direct translation, she avoids the word sex, and provides a context-relevant example. In this example, Sabra tells a hypothetical story about a woman who was approached by a man wanting to engage in *tendo fulani* ‘a certain act’ (line 14), a common euphemism for sexual intercourse. Sabra states that the woman’s consent, her *sauti* ‘voice’ (line 14), is not regarded as relevant in this situation. Sabra talks about the coercive nature of sexual relationships in universal terms, expressed through the use of the all-inclusive *wanawake* ‘women’ (line 8) and *mwanamke* ‘a woman’ (line
11), with the copula *sio* ‘are not’ in *wanawake ... sio watu wanaofanya maamuzi* ‘women are not the ones who make decisions’ (line 08), and the copula *ni* ‘is’ *ni ya mwingine* ‘the voice is of another’ (line 14). Moreover, Sabra uses a non-Standard habitual suffix -*ga* in *wanakua-ga* (women) usually are’ (line 08) and modal verbs in present tense, such as *hawezi* ‘she cannot’ in *mwanamke hawezi akasema mie hapa sitaki* ‘a woman cannot say I don’t want now’ (line 11). In comparison to Sabra’s statement in which she embraces all women, Annie with *in many cases* and *much less control* (line 02) leaves the possibility that in *few* cases women *do* have the decision power, or at least *some* control, over their sexual lives. The juxtaposition of the medical truth about the predisposition of females to HIV with the selected social factors of females’ lives supports the ideology of natural reasons for gender inequality.

5.6 Conclusion: Desire and agency

In this chapter my goal is to demonstrate reproductive health classes organized by NGOs in Tanzanian primary and secondary schools use topics of puberty and reproductive biology to create negative and gender-specific notions of sexual desire. Sexual desire is portrayed as the unfortunate outcome of physiological processes triggered by puberty. Educators tend to highlight unpleasant changes in the human body during puberty and then juxtapose those with emotional changes, which cause risky behaviors with dangerous outcomes. By presenting sexual desire experienced by men and women as of different intensity, the educators provide a naturalistic explanation for gender inequality, where boys need to have sex for health reasons, while girls' sexual activity is the sign of poor moral choices.

These discourses of puberty contribute to the construction of a gender-specific idea about agency, where agency is understood as ‘the socioculturally mediated capacity to act’ (Ahearn, 2011, p. 278; also Ahearn, 2001). The instructions provided by the educators are examples of
meta-discourses about agency, where sexual desire is syntactically and semantically presented as
an actor in and of itself. Capps and Ochs (1995) discussed similar discursive strategies used by
an agoraphobic woman for constructing herself as a non-agentive sufferer of overwhelming
feeling. In a study on rape trials, Ehrlich (2001) showed how a male defendant in a rape trial was
able to invoke ‘the interpretive frame of the male sexual drive discourse’ (p. 60) and present
himself as innocent by discursively obscuring and eliminating his agency. The same ‘hegemonic
masculinity’ (Connell, 1987, p. 185) is invoked by both Tanzanian and American educators in
their lectures about changes in body and mind during puberty, with conveying the female-
focused sense of regret over allowing emotions to lead actions (eg. Excerpt 5.15). This ideology
about sexuality sends conflicting messaging about pregnancy and HIV prevention, which places
the responsibility for self- and other-protection on females. The discourses of sexuality and
prevention, specifically on abstinence, condom, and the calendar method, evolving in NGO-led
reproductive health classes, will be analyzed in the chapter to follow.
CHAPTER 6: DISCOURSES OF SEXUALITY AND PREVENTION

6.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I analyze the messages of sexuality and prevention produced by Tanzanian and American educators in classes on HIV-awareness and teenage pregnancy. In the previous chapter, I discussed how primary and secondary school students are socialized in the idea that sexual desire is a negative psychological outcome of puberty, similar to such negative physiological changes as hair growth in “weird” places, pimples, or body odor. In these classes, sexual desire was presented as the cause of behaviors that in public health discourse are evaluated negatively, for example, experimenting with alcohol, drugs, and sex. In these classes the educators also conveyed the idea that sexual desire is realized more strongly in men than in women. In this chapter, I demonstrate how building upon the presented information about human physiology and sexual desire, educators breach the traditional discursive normativity that forbids talk about sex in public. While engaging students in open talk about various sexual practices, the educators still support traditional social norms about the unequal responsibility among males and females for HIV transmission and unplanned pregnancy. The discourse of prevention, in particular talking about condoms, appears to be a new taboo in NGO-organized classes. I will demonstrate how educators substitute information about prevention methods with the promotion of HIV-testing, calendar method for fertility control, and the appeal for education. While the educators use linguistic means that present desire and emotions as powerful agents that direct a person’s actions, they actively promote individualistic messages of education for enlightenment and by so doing, convey that the responsibility for these actions is a subject of moral judgment. The prevention discourses are, therefore, contradictory, and also add to stigmatizing the most vulnerable population, that is, young women.
6.2 From desire to sex: constructing a negative image of sexuality

The setting of public health intervention creates a discursive space where co-participants are required to overcome the prohibition on talking about sex-related topics. Sex becomes, however, a technical term for human-to-human transmission of HIV or pregnancy, indicating a tendency to medicalize talk about sex. Similarly to the negative image we saw in the previous chapter of sexual desire overpowering a child’s mind during puberty, the educators convey a negative moral stance toward sex which I interpret as a covert abstinence message. In the following excerpt from an HIV awareness class in a rural boarding secondary school, a female American educator, Annie, states that sex is a dangerous activity:

Excerpt 6.1
2012-11-19-SEC-3-[00:12:12.07]
ANNIE – female American educator, speaks English; SABRA – female Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili and some English.

01 ANNIE: The majority of cases in Africa? (.)
02 HIV was transmitted sexually.
03 SABRA: Kwa sababu kwa kawaida kwa Tanzania njia kuu kwa (( ))
For reason for custom for Tanzania way main for
Because usually in Tanzania the main way for (( ))
04 kwa maambukizi ya virusi vya UKIMWI ni njia ya nini?=
for infection of virus of AIDS is way if what
for infection with HIV is by what means?=
05 =Ya ngono. Sawa?
of sex equal
=By sex. Right?
06 STUDENTS: Ndiyo.
EMPH
Yes it is.
For translating Annie’s *sexually* ((line 02), the Tanzanian educator, Sabra, selects the word

ngono\(^{26}\) (line 07), a lexical item with negative connotations which suggests primarily an out-of-marriage sexual relationship.

Later in the same class, another American educator, Quan, adds to the construction of a negative image of sex by emphasizing the prevalence of intercourse as a mode of HIV transmission worldwide:

**Excerpt 6.2**
2012-11-19-CLIP3-[00:50:20]
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian secondary school students, speak Swahili and some English.

01 QUAN: Like Annie said earlier, sex is responsible for eighty percent of transmission (0.2) in the world. HIV transmission.

02

03 EMAN: Na ku-jamiiina ni njia ambay-yo ni asilimia themanini (0.6) and to-copulate is way that-REL COP percent eighty And copulating is the way which counts eighty percent (0.6)

04 Kati ya maambukizi ya kutoka mtu mmoja kwenda kwa mtu? center of infection of from person one toward for person among transmission from one person to?

05 STUDENTS: Mwingine. Another.

06 EMAN: Kwa mtu mwingine. Kwa hiyo asilimia themanini ya maambukizi for person another for this percent eighty of infection For another person. Therefore eighty percent of transmission

07 ya-na-tokana na nini? it-PRS-have.origin.in and what has origin in what?

---

\(^{26}\) ngono – “bed-fellowship of a concubine in her turn, i.e., when the turn comes to her to go to her master’s bed” (Krapf, 1964 [1882]; “sexual intercourse, sleeping-turn, a wife’s turn or time for sleeping with her husband” (Johnson, 1967 [1939], p. 117); “wife’s turn to sleep with a husband in a polygamous marriage; intercourse, sex” (TUKI, 2001, p. 244). Kamusi ya shule za msingi ‘Dictionary for primary school students’ (Kiango, Lodhi, Ipara, & Naasir, 2008) explains ngono as kitendo cha kufanya mapenzi kati ya mwamume na mwanamke ‘act of having sex’ [literally ‘making love’] between a man and a woman’ (p. 227) and illustrates it with the example which positions ngono in line with HIV: Ngononi isiyo salama inaweza kuleta magonjwa hatari kama vile UKIMWI ‘Unprotected sex can cause dangerous diseases such as AIDS’ (p. 227).
Quan phrases his message that *sex is responsible* (line 01) in impersonal terms with the copula *is* and by doing so, presents sex as a powerful natural force in charge of human suffering across the world. In his translation, Eman engages students in a question-answer sequence: he asks them about the origin of transmission (line 06-07) and the students reply *kujamiana* ‘copulating’ (line 08). In comparison to the word *ngono* for talking about sex (cf. Excerpt 6.1, line 05), the term *kujamiana* ‘copulating’ is a derived from a nominalized verb -*jamii*\(^\text{27}\) ‘to copulate’ with the reciprocal suffix -*ana* ‘each other’. This term implies the presence of actors equally engaging in the act, it has no negative connotations per se, and is regularly used in current textbooks and technical literature. By stating that *maambukizi yanatokana na kujamiana* ‘the transmission originates in copulating’ (line 06-09), Eman presents sex as the origin of the disease and adds to the negative ideology about sex.

Although during my fieldwork I observed no explicit teaching about abstinence as a method for prevention of unwanted pregnancy or sexually transmitted diseases, both Excerpts 6.1 and 6.2 demonstrate how educators create a negative perspective on sexuality, which I interpret as a covert abstinence message. The American educators draw on facts and numbers to associate sex with danger, and the Tanzanian educators deliver a negative stance toward sex with

\(^{27}\) Krapf (1964 [1882], p. 112) lists *jam* ‘to have connection with, to copulate’ as a separate lexeme from -*jamia* (or *jamii*) ‘to assemble, to gather’; Johnson (1967 [1939], pp. 148–149) suggests a connection between the meanings of *jamii* as ‘collect together’ and ‘to copulate’. Johnson (1967 [1939], p. 149) and Kiango et al., (2008, p. 110) describe *jamii* as a transitive verb with the male as the subject and female as the object, e.g. *Ni kosa la jinai kujamii mwanamke bila ruhusa yake* ‘It is a crime to copulate with a woman without her permission’ (Kiango et al., 2008, p. 110).
a particular word choice emphasizing the illegitimate nature of sexual relationships which result in HIV. The educators, especially the Tanzanians, actively engage students in the reproduction of the displayed negative stance by producing half-finished sentences (Excerpt 6.2, line 4; line 07) and using requests for confirmation with such final questions, as sawa eh? ‘Right eh?’ (Excerpt 6.1, line 7; Excerpt 6.2, line 09).

6.3 Sex in talk: changing discursive norms

While sex remains a taboo topic in public spaces in Tanzania (e.g. Plummer & Wight, 2011, p. 129), examples, such as the following excerpt, demonstrate how NGO-educators encourage students to overcome the taboo. Here, a male student names oral sex as a method of HIV transmission. While some students, especially girls, sound surprised and disapproving of such talk, the educator justifies it.

Excerpt 6.3
2012-11-15-Sek-Clip 3-[00:19:19.00]
PETER – male Tanzanian peer education coordinator; BOY – male secondary school student; GIRL – female secondary school student; STUDENTS – male and female secondary school students.

01 PETER: Ni njia gani amba-zo zi-na-tu-gawia UKIMWI?
          COP way which that-REL they-PRS-us-share.wit AIDS
          What ways bring to us AIDS?
          ((several lines omitted))

02 BOY: Oral seksi.
        Oral sex.

03 PETER: (Hapa) jamaa a-na-ambia oral seksi. Oral seksi (sio kwa damu)
          (here) kinsman he-PRS-say sex sex NEG for blood
          (Here) someone says oral sex. Oral sex (not through blood)

04 (si-ju-i kwani,) ((inaudible))
   NEG.I-know-NEG because
   (I don’t know because,) ((inaudible))

05 STUDENTS: ((laughter))

06 PETER: Oral seksi ni (hali yapi)?
          sex COP state which
          Oral sex is (like how)?

07 BOY: Ku-nyonyaga uchi. (0.4)
        to-suck nakedness
        Sucking sexual organs. (0.4)
In the beginning of this short excerpt the educator, Peter, allows himself to tease the student by acting as if he does not understand what oral sex is (line 03-04). Peter requests that the boy clarify his entry, which the boy does by directly translating oral sex into Swahili (line 07). Peter continues with friendly teasing of the boy, but only until some of the students display their disapproval of the boy, such as the girl who with her loud high pitch YUPI? ‘which one?’ searches for the initiator of the delicate talk (line 11). At this point Peter makes an effort to support the boy and justify the talk about uneasy issues by stating that the students are in a special setting of darasa la ukweli ‘a classroom for truth’ (line 13) and that the traditional discursive discretion associated with the concept of aibu ‘shame’ can be harmful (line 14). While most students agree with Peter (line 16), there are still voices of disapproval (line 17).
In general, students readily take the opportunity offered by the educators to display awareness of, and the need for more information about, sex, from masturbation to same-sex intercourse. For example, in a class on reproductive physiology in a secondary school, after the educators have finished talking about the vagina, penis, anus, and mouth as the four *milango* ‘doors’ for HIV transmission, a student volunteers with a clarifying question. Eman announces the question to the whole class:

**Excerpt 6.4**
2012-11-19-[00:57:01.00]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator; STUDENTS – male and female Tanzanian students.

01 EMAN: Ku-na swali li-li-po-uliz-wa pale. There is question it-PRS-where-ask-PASS there There is a question asked there.

02 A-na-uliza, tu-me-sema njia ya haja kubwa ni mlango. Si ndiyo eh? s/he-PRS-ask we-PRF-say way of need big is door NEG EMPH INTRJ S/he is asking (that) we’ve said that the anus is a door. Haven’t we eh?

03 STUDENTS: Ndiyo. EMPH Yes we have.

04 EMAN: Njia ya haja kubwa? way of need big The anus?

05 STUDENTS: Ni mlango. COP door Is a door.

06 EMAN: Kivipi? (0.4) how How (is it so)? (0.4)

07 Nani a-na-weza a-ka-saidia? who s/he-PRS-can s/he-CONSEC-help Who can help?

08 Tu-me-sema njia ya haja kubwa we-PRF-say way of need big We’ve said that the anus

09 ((turns to the charts with male and female reproductive organs, selects female body chart, points at the female anus on the chart))

28 During asking the question, the student and the educator who received the question were off frame, therefore, it is not possible to say whether the student was male or female. The reference *a-* in *anauliza* ’s/he is asking’ (line 02) is gender neutral; there is no grammatical gender in Swahili.
njia ya haja kubwa ni mlango.  
way of need big COP door  
anus is a door.

Kati ya ile mi-lango i-na-weza ka- ka- nini?  
center of those PL-door they-PRS-can CONSEC- CONSEC- what  
Among those doors which can to- to- what?

Ka-husika kwenye maambukizi ya nini?  
CONSEC-be.involved in infection of what  
Be involved in the transmission of what?

STUDENTS: Ya UKIMWI.  
of AIDS  
Of AIDS.

EMAN: Ya virusi vya UKIMWI, sawa eh?  
of virus of AIDS equal INTRJ  
Of HIV, right eh?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo.  
EMPH  
Yes it is.

EMAN: M-mesha-sikia-ga swala la watu wa-na-o-ingia wa- wa- 
you.PL-PRF-hear-GNO question of PL-person they-PRS-who-enter they- they- 
You’ve already heard the question about the people who penetrate they-

wa-na-ingi-ana kinyume na maumbile. Si ndiyo, eh?  
they-PRS-enter-RCPR opposite and created.state NEG EMPH INTRJ  
they penetrate each other opposite to the natural way. Isn’t it so eh?

STUDENTS: Ndiyo.  
EMPH  
Yes it is.

The Tanzanian educator, Eman, first uses reported speech to announce the question asked by the student to the class; he then turns to the charts on the wall to answer this question. For talking about anal sex, Eman specifically selects the chart showing the female reproductive system, but by using the reciprocal verb -ingiana ‘enter one another’ (line 18), he refers to both hetero- and homosexual intercourse. The students’ response ndiyo ‘yes it is’ (line 19) and the lack of laughter or exclamations may be interpreted as the display that the information about such sexual practices is relatively ordinary to them.

Students appear to be comfortable not only asking questions about sex but also responding to such questions and by so doing, demonstrate their elaborated knowledge on the
topic, as in the following example from another secondary school. Here a girl is asking whether it is possible to become pregnant from anal sex.

**Excerpt 6.5**
2012-11-15 Sek-Clip 3-[00:14:18]
GIRL – female secondary school student; BOY1, BOY2 – male secondary school students; STUDENTS – male and female secondary school students, PETER – male Tanzanian educator.

01 GIRL: Je, (0.2) mwanamke akifanya mapenzi kinyume na maumbile

INTR woman she-SIM-do love opposite and created.state

So, (0.2) if a woman has sex in the way opposite to the natural

02 ki-na-wezekana kupata mimba?

it-PRS-possible to-get pregnancy

is it possible for her to get pregnant?

03 STUDENTS: ((laughing, some raising hands to respond))

04 PETER: (Na-omba) ni-saidi-e (( ))

I.PRS-request I-help-SBJV

(Please) help me (( ))

05 BOY1: Ah’a ha-i-wezekan-i (( )) Ha-wez-i ku-pata (( )). no NEG-it-be.possible-NEG NEG.she-can-NEG to-get

No. It is not possible (( )) She cannot get (( )).

((several lines omitted, inaudible))

06 BOY1: Uwezekano wa ku-pata mimba ha-u-po.

ability of to-get pregnancy NEG-it-LOC

The ability to get pregnant is not there.

07 PETER: Kwa nini?

for what

Why?

08 BOY1: Kwa sababu (0.2) zile mbegu zinapotoza zin-a-endia

for reason those seed they-PRS-when-come.out they-PRS-go

Because (0.2) those sperms when they come out they go

09 kwenye: kwenye zile ovari. Kwa ajili ya kufanya ile (mimba).

toward toward those ovaries for sake of to-do that (pregnancy)

toward toward those ovaries. In order to start that (pregnancy).

10 Lakini ha-i-wezekan-i kinyume na maumbile.

but NEG-it-be.possible-NEG opposite and created.state

But it is not possible in the unnatural way (of sex).

((several lines omitted))

11 BOY2: ((standing up, turning to the GIRL to respond.))

12 Sehemu pekee ya mwanamke (0.2) au sehemu pekee ya mwili

part alone of woman or part alone of body

The only part of a woman (0.2) or the only part of the body
In this excerpt, two students volunteer to respond to the girl’s question; they demonstrate not only knowledge about the human reproductive system, but also the skill of talking about various intimate practices with great ease. When talking about sex, the students tend to avoid colloquial language and use medical terms instead, including *ovari* (line 09), *kijusi* (line 13). The students also use impersonal constructions that frame the talk about sex as an abstract discussion about agentless facts of life. For example in line 06, BOY1 uses the noun *uwezekano* ‘the ability’

---

29 Johnson (1967 [1939]) gives two possible translations of *kijusi*: 1) a small lizard (p. 193) and 2) an act of defilement (p. 492). The second meaning derives from the Islamic concept *ujusi* ‘natural defilement of childbirth as affecting both mother and child and everything that comes into contact with them until both have been washed ceremonially according to Mohammedan usage seven days after the birth of the child’ (p. 492). In the modern standard Swahili, *kijusi* is a technical term for ‘fetus’ (TUKI, 2001, p. 141).
derived from the verb -weza ‘to be able’ when stating that uwezekano wa kupata mimba haupo ‘the ability to get pregnant is not there’.

The excerpts discussed in this section illustrate how the educators and students actively engage in breaking taboos on sex talk. In the discursive space that allows for sex talk, students display that they have sophisticated knowledge about sex and demonstrate their readiness to talk about delicate issues. These observations indicate a change in the traditional language ideology with the discursive prohibitions on sex talk in public places. In the following sections, I will show that while the very context in which sex and desire are at center of discussion has the potential to transform the existing sexual ideology, still the educators reproduce it by directing the responsibility for unwanted outcomes of sexual behavior on females.

6.4 Prevention methods

The analysis of the interactions in the classes about reproductive health reveals the avoidance of talk about prevention methods; the universally promoted Abstinence-Be faithful-use Condom (ABC) message was not mentioned explicitly. School administrators and NGO employers specifically forbade the educators from talking about condoms to school students. The only method for fertility control that the educators discussed with students was the calendar-based method.30 As for HIV prevention, educators promoted the idea of kujijua ‘self-knowing’ as the only method for self-protection. ‘Self-knowing’ means not only learning about HIV and human physiology, but, most importantly, it entails regular HIV-testing with the goal of early onset of antiretroviral (ARV) therapy.

---

30 Detailed instructions for the calendar method can be found, for example, on http://www.plannedparenthood.org/health-topics/birth-control/fam-calendar-method-22139.htm For predicting ‘safe’ and ‘unsafe’ days, a woman is advised to track her menstruation cycle for at least nine months and then perform several mathematical operations. According to the website, if the method is used correctly, there is still about 10% chance that a woman will become pregnant.
6.4.1 Calendar method

Both local and foreign NGO educators receive information about the calendar method during training sessions prior to going to the field. The trainers, experienced Tanzanian and American educators, and even medical professionals, tend to convey the information about the calendar method in absolute terms, namely that all women have a 28-day cycle, and that ovulation regularly happens on the 14th day. Male and female trainees often lack clear ideas about which day to start counting from: the first day of a calendar month or the first day of the menstrual cycle. The directions for the calendar method, such as in the following Excerpt 6.6, only add to the confusion:

Excerpt 6.6
2013-02-22-TPB-3-2-[01:43:24.03]
Trainer – experienced Tanzanian male educator.

01 TRAINER: Ndo natural? ways za family planning.
  EMPH of
These are natural? methods of family planning.
02   Kwamba you avoid sexual contact from (10 to) 72 hours
  that
Namely you avoid sexual contact from (10 to) 72 hours,
03   before the 14th day, and mpaka 5th day.
  until
before the 14th and until the 5th day.

Later when performing as educators, young adults trained in such sessions use inaccurate information about the calendar method when informing students about prevention methods. In the following example, the Tanzanian educator, Peter, introduces the calendar method during the class on puberty for secondary school male and female students. Peter states that he has no doubts that many students are sexually active and warns them that pregnancy is particularly undesirable for school girls. To help the students to control their fertility, Peter explains the calendar method; both male and female students display their interest in this information.
Excerpt 6.7
2012-11-09-Sek-Clip 2-[00:42:40.00]
PETER – male Tanzanian educator; STUDENTS – Tanzanian male and female secondary school students.

01 PETER:  Hiyo siku ya kwanza amba-po wewe u-na-anza ku-onahabisa
   This day of first that-LOC you you-PRS-begin to-see absolutely
   this day when you begin to see with certainty

02 ni siku zangu. Hiyo ni siku ile ile ku-fanya nini? (0.2)
   COP day my this COP day that that-to-do what
   “This is my menstruation.” This is the very day to do what? (0.2)

03 Ku-kaa na ku-anza ku-weka math.
   To sit down and start with the math.

04 Leo, ha-i-ja-ishi ni tarehe ngapi?
   today NEG-it-PRF-finish COP date how many
   “Today it (the menstruation) hasn’t finish yet what is the date?”

05 Kwa hiyo u-na-hesabu siku ya ngapi?
   Therefore you count which day is this?
   for this you-PRS-count day of how many

06 STUDENTS: ((inaudible))

07 PETER:  Ya kwanza hiyo (sasa) (hapa) ule-
   f first this now here that
   As the first day (right there).

08 Kwa hiyo hapa ni siku ya kwanza. (0.5)
   Therefore this is the first day. (0.5)
   for this here COP day of first

09 Amba-yo u-na-weza u-ka-endene-ka-endene kwewe hiyo ya hali:
   From which you can start doing the following (counting)
   that-REL you-PRS-can you-CONCES-go you-CONSEC-go to that of state
   day of first of second of three of four of five of six of seven
   “The first day, the second, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, seventh.” (2.0)

10 Siku ya kwanza, ya pili, ya tatu, ya nne, ya tano, ya sita, ya saba. (2.0)
   day of first of second of three of four of five of six of seven
   “The first day, the second, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, seventh.” (2.0)

11 U-nya-kesabu tu hiyo siku sawa?
   equal you-PRS-count just this day equal
   You just count that day, right?

12 Sasa hiyo yote acha-na na-yo. Hiyo ni siku amba-zo (( ))
   now this all leave-REC and-it that COP day that-REL
   Now all of that put it aside. That shows the days that (( ))

   there you-LOC fresh
   Therefore you are fine.

14 Wakati huu u-ki-fanya mapenzi=
   During this period of time if you have sex=
   time this you-SIM-do sex

15 =yaani sio vizuri (.)
   in other words NEG nicely
   in other words it’s not good (.)
Peter explains how to *kuweka math* ‘to set the math’ (line 03): he states that during the first seven days from the beginning of the menstruation cycle a woman is *freshi* (line 13), that is, safe from getting pregnant. While giving these instructions, Peter does not forget to remind the students that being sexually active is *sio vizuri* ‘not good’ (line 15), but does not elaborate this moral stance further.

In another class in a secondary school, it is female secondary school students who approach female educators after class and ask them about the calendar method. Although Annie, the American educator is co-present, the Tanzanian educator Sabra takes the lead when giving these instructions.

**Excerpt 6.8**

2012-11-19-Sek-Clip5-[00:08:26.07]

SABRA – female Tanzanian educator.

01 SABRA: Kwa mfano ni-ki-sema ni-me-anza leo- leo, tarehe ngapi hii? for example I-SIM-say I-PRF-begin today- today date how.many this
For example if I say my period started today- today, what is the date?

02 Kumi na tisa. Ishirini, ishirini na moja. Siku tatu.
ten and nine twenty twenty and one day three
The nineteenth. Twentieth, twenty first. Three days.

these you-PRS-them-count until nine they-PRS-be COP
These days you count. Until nine. These days are safe.

04 Then (( )) mbali za hapo i-na-kuwa ku-na tano mbe- za mbele.
far of here it-PRS-be there-is five of front
Then (( )) after that there are the five next days.

05 Zi-na-kuwa ni hatari.
they-PRS-be COP danger
These days are dangerous.

---

31 The subject marker *-u* in *ha-u-tashika mimba* ‘it will not catch pregnancy’ (line 15) can refer to the noun wakati ‘time, period’ (line 14) or maybe a dialectal reference to the second person singular you. In the standard Swahili, the negative prefix *ha-* and the subject prefix *u-* ‘you.SG’ contract into prefix *hu-* which would result in the form *hu-tashika mimba* ‘you will not catch pregnancy’.
In Excerpts 6.6, 6.7, 6.8 all educators— who work in different schools and for different NGOs—presented information that is factually inaccurate. The calendar method directions in this Excerpt 6.8, for example, differ from those in Excerpt 6.7: according to Peter, only the first seven days of the cycle are safe; Sabra, however, counts the first nine days of the period and all the days after the day 14 as safe.

Sabra nevertheless displays her awareness about the flows of the calendar method; she warns that a woman can get pregnant any time:

Excerpt 6.9
2012-11-19-Sek-Clip 5-[00:07:21.19]
SABRA – female Tanzanian educator.
09 U-si-fanya-je? Mie ni-na-po-kuwa ni-na-ongea hapa
you-NEG.SBJV-do-INTR I I-PRS-when-be I-PRS-speak here
What shouldn’t you do? I- when I am talking here

10 u-si-chukuli-e moja kwa moja
you-NEG-take-SBJV one for one
you should not take (what I say) word for word

11 kama darasa-ni i-me-ongea hivi,
as class-LOC it-PRS-talk this.way
like when I talk during class,

12 kwa hiyo mie nitakuwa na-fuatiliza hivi.
for this I I-FUT-be I.PRS-follow.after this.way
and then you would follow what I say directly.

13 (Simo). Si-ju-i ka-ni-letea mtoto nyumba-ni kwangu.
(( )) NEG.I-know-NEG CONSEC-me-bring.for child house-LOC my
(No!). I don’t want anyone bringing a child to my house.

14 GIRLS: ((laughter))

Sabra delivers an accurate message about the unreliability of the calendar method while insisting that girls should stay *makini* ‘attentive’ (lines 03, 08); she does not tell them to abstain from sex and still gives no further directions on how to perform *attentiveness in sex*. Sabra expresses concern about the responsibility for talking to the girls about the calendar method; she insists that the students should not take the information *moja kwa moja* ‘directly’ (line 10) and in a joking form refuses to be accountable for any child born because of girls’ following her instructions (line 13).

After finishing the instruction, Sabra reports to Annie on what she told to the students.

Annie expresses the same ambivalence about the calendar method:

**Excerpt 6.10**

2012-11-19-Sek-Clip5-[00:10:17.13]

Annie – female American educator; Sabra – female Tanzanian educator.

01 ANNIE: But for older women when their period is regular, they know themselves
02 better, but like– for like teenagers like you guys
03 it just makes me feel nervous.
04 SABRA: ((translates to students))
The information about the calendar method, however unreliable it may be, was eagerly sought by students and also presented by educators as a modern and responsible approach to sexuality. By talking about the calendar method, students and educators displayed the shared understanding about sex as an inherent part of young people’s life; full abstinence was not considered a possibility. The calendar method allows young people to have the sense of control over their own life while preserving privacy: the acquisition of condoms and hormonal contraceptives requires an interaction with a middleman, such as hospital, drugstore, or NGO personnel. On the one hand, the calendar method may also promote a sense of shared responsibility in avoiding pregnancy among the sexual partners, thus more gender equality: in the observed classes boys were particularly attentive during the explanations, took notes, and asked follow-up questions. On the other hand, boys may have interest in this method because it requires no condom of them. This method gains its credibility through the association with schooling—it requires knowledge about human physiology, learning the exact procedure and doing the math. The fact that this counting is based on such a highly unreliable factor as period length, remains underemphasized. The calendar method, therefore, perpetuates blame for unwanted pregnancy on the woman as not being “accurate,” not careful enough, or not smart enough to “do the math” correctly.

6.4.2 Absence of the ABC message

During my fieldwork, I observed no direct mentioning of the Abstinence-Be faithful-use Condom (ABC) message in NGO-organized classes in primary and secondary schools. While the negative image of sexuality together with the threats with possible outcomes of sex do indirectly promote abstinence, the educators still operate on the assumption that sex, especially for males, is unavoidable. The absence of “B”—be faithful—part of the message can be explained by the
belief that it is applicable only in marriage. With regard to “C”—condom use—my analysis suggests that not only the idea of using condoms, but also the acts of talking about condom use and pronouncing the word itself are highly stigmatized. The internal NGO context, such as staff meetings, job interviews for potential educators, or training sessions, is the only space where the ability to talk about condoms, and also to actively display a positive stance toward condom use, is treated as a valuable skill.

During the training sessions, the future educators are specifically taught to avoid talking about condoms on the school premises:

**Excerpt 6.11**
2012-11-23-Clip4-[01:41:43.12]

TRAINER – female Tanzanian NGO trainer

01 TRAINER: Kwenye shule ya sekondari, m-si-ende na kondom.  
In a secondary school, don’t go there with condoms.

02 Sawa eh? Bado mtaala wa serikali ha-u-ruhusu  
Right eh? The governmental guidelines still don’t allow

03 kondom zi-gai-w-e? Ma-shule-ni.  
condom they-distribute PASS-SBJV PL-school-LOC  
condoms to be distributed (where)? In schools.

04 Kwa huu m-ta-pata matatizo.  
for thus you.PL-FUT-get problems

This warning follows immediately a training session on condom use, and in response to the trainer, one of the male Tanzanian trainees later states that *Watoto wa siku hizi sio watoto* ‘These days children are not children’, but the trainer still strongly discourages any mentioning of condom in the presence of school students. The statement about the governmental curriculum forbidding talk about condoms, such as in line 02, is factually inaccurate. Even the primary school textbooks, for example *Sayansi 6* discussed in detail in Chapter 4, mention condoms in the class on STIs and HIV/AIDS, and even include photographs of male and female condoms.

In the classroom setting, instead of the *ABC* message, the educators offer *talk* as the method for overcoming sexual desire and avoiding sex. The following excerpt is from an NGO-organized class on HIV transmission for female and male secondary school students; the students attending the class were members of the school “Health Club.” A biology teacher, who was specifically trained by the NGO to supervise it, mentored this club. The teacher, a male Tanzanian in his early 30s, concludes the discussion on HIV transmission by emphasizing the value of talking about sex:

**Excerpt 6.12**

2012-11-15-Sek-Clip 4-[00:26:07;08]
TEACHER – male Tanzanian school teacher; GIRL – female Tanzanian student; BOY – male Tanzanian student.

01 TEACHER: Kwa hiyo kiukweli si kwamba tu- tu-na-encourage kufanya ngono. 
for this truly NEG that we- we-PRS-to-do sex
Therefore truly it’s not like we- we encourage having sex

02 (ile) mahusiano ya- kukaa pamoja tu-ka-ongea na mimi 
that relationship of to-sit together we-CONSEC-talk and I
but rather the relationship when we sit together and you talk with me

03 (ki-na-ongolea) nini? Yale mambo ya ku-fanya nini? 
it-PRS-discuss what those issues of to-do what
about what? (About) those issues of doing what?

04 GIRL: Mapenzi. 
love 
Sex.

05 TEACHER: Mapenzi. Sawa? Ni ukweli hiyo-?
love equal COP truth
Sex. Okay? It is truly this-?

06 BOY: Uwazi. 
Openness.

07 TEACHER: Uwazi. 
openness 
Openness. Don’t (( ))

08 U-sio- Kwamba- Si (kwamba wengi) tu-fany-e ngono. 
you-NEG that NEG that many we-do-SBJV sex 
You shouldn’t (( )) That it’s not like “let’s do sex.”
Here the teacher suggests discussing sex (line 09) as a method for overcoming hamu ‘that desire’ (line 11): by pronouncing sex (\textit{-tamka maneno yo:te}:, line 10), the sexual desire becomes kitu \textit{cha kawaida} ‘a usual thing’ (line 12), ordinary and unexciting. As an example, later the teacher compares talking about sex to watching foreign pornographic movies that, according to his judgement, demystify sexual intercourse and nakedness, and by so doing, lessen sexual desire.

The instructions about talk as a way to cope with sexual desire and prevent unwanted outcomes of sex indicates that ideology about sex talk in this setting differs from dominant societal ideologies. Instead of being a discursively prohibited topic and a publicly offensive behavior, talk about sex is presented here as a powerful method for prevention. The NGO-organized “Health Club” becomes as a legitimate space for public talk about sex. The ideology of education as enlightenment validates sex talk in this setting.

Thus far I have demonstrated that in NGO-organized classes on reproductive health students are left with little, if any, knowledge about prevention methods. In the next section it will be discussed how local and foreign educators appeal to the slogan \textit{knowledge is power} as a means to protect oneself from sexually transmitted diseases and unwanted pregnancy; this ideology about education has its grounds in the self-reliance message originating in Julius Nyerere’s educational politics.
6.5 *Elimu ni Nguvu* ‘Knowledge is Power’

6.5.1 *A surrogate for prevention methods*

In her work on the role of formal schooling on gender roles, family, and social order in the northwestern Tanzania during the 1990s, Stambach (2000) discusses the impact of the socialist ideology outlined in Julius Nyerere’s speech “Education for Self-Reliance” (1967) on the school curriculum, especially in home economics lessons with their focus on training girls for housework and mothering. While Nyerere’s initial idea was to build an independent self-sustainable nation of educated farmers, the concept *kujitegemea* ‘self-reliance’ underwent a number of transformations that reflect demands of post-socialist politics. Stambach (2000, p. 101) writes:

Not only has the national government been revising the meaning of “self-reliance” (the emphasis now is on the market forces rather than socialism to move the nation toward economic development); so, too have *individuals* toyed with the meaning of self-reliance. The “self” in question no longer refers to national advancement but to individual gain.

In the modern Tanzania, the belief in education translates as the “faith in the value of educational credentials” (Watkins et al., 2012, p. 304) that becomes a subject of commodification in the market economy; the quantity of private educational institutions delivering certificates of all sorts is growing. Billings (2011; 2013) is particularly critical when pointing out the essential inequality perpetuated by the Tanzanian educational system, especially the unsatisfactory instruction of English: students are encouraged to invest money and get more education; in the case of the poor performance, it is students who become the subject of blame, not the institutions that provide inadequate education.
During my fieldwork I observed that NGO educators use the concept of *kujitegemea* ‘self-reliance’ paired with the appeal to education as power to achieve two goals: first, as a justification for classes on reproductive health, and secondly, as the main method for prevention of undesired outcomes of sex. I argue that educators present information about human physiology, the biology of HIV, and modes of sexual intercourse as *elimu* ‘education’, and by so doing, gain permission to overcome discursive prohibitions. While the scope of the information remains inadequate, the educators repeatedly state that education is the ultimate means for preventing HIV, such as in Excerpt 6.19:

**Ex 6.13**  
2012-11-20-Msingi-Clip5 [00:14:35.26]  
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; KIDS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili.

01 QUAN: Another reason why we tell you about AIDS is that  
because ((pointing at the poster on the board)) knowledge is power.

03 EMAN: Sababu nyingine za (ka-patia) ni ili tu-u-shind-e UKIMWI. Si ndiyo eh?  
reason other of CONSEC-get COP for we-it-defeat-SBJV AIDS NEG EMPH  
Other reasons for getting (educated) is to defeat AIDS. Right eh?

04 Halafu sababu nyingine elimu ni nini?  
then reason other education COP what  
Then another reason (is that) education is what?

05 KIDS: ((reading from the poster on the board)) Nguvu.  
((reading from the poster on the board)) Power.

06 EMAN: Elimu ni nini?  
eduction cop what  
What is education?

07 KIDS: Nguvu.  
Power.

08 QUAN: Knowledge about AIDS gives you the power to fight against AIDS.

09 EMAN: Sasa hivi m-na-elewa virusi vya nini?  
now this you.PL-PRS-understand virus of what  
Now you understand the virus of what?

10 KIDS: Vya UKIMWI.  
Of AIDS.

11 EMAN: Kwa huu m-na nguvu ya ku-pambana na nini?  
for this you.PL-have power of to-fight with what  
Therefore you have the power for fighting against what?
The Tanzanian educator, Eman, in his translation changes Quan’s *knowledge* (line 02) into *elimu* ‘education’ (line 04). The poster *Elimu ni Nguvu* ‘Education is Power’ (Figure 6.4) used during this class was prepared by the American educator with help from Eman. Both Tanzanian and American educators displayed no signs of recognizing the conceptual difference suggested by the words *elimu* and *knowledge*.

**FIGURE 6.1 POSTER “ELIMU NI NGUVU” “EDUCATION IS POWER”**

The educators continue the class by telling the students that the information provided during the class will empower them as the weapon for fighting HIV. While contributing to the transformation of discursive ideology, this and other observed classes on reproductive health provide, however, little factual information on prevention methods or empowerment strategies. In the absence of talk about ABC, students are repeatedly introduced to *-elewa* “understanding” (eg. Excerpt 6.13, line 09) and *knowing* (eg. Excerpt 6.14, line 08) as a prevention method. In
Excerpt 6.14, the educators rationalize the purpose for talking about body changes, sexual organs, and sexual desire as the method for fighting HIV/AIDS as follows:

Excerpt 6.14
2012-11-20-Msingi-Clip 7 [00:10:09.04]
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; KIDS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili.

01 QUAN: When they become adults, they engage in behaviors that can transmit HIV.

02 EMAN: Kwa mtu a-na-po-kuwa a-me-balehe a-na-ingiza for person s/he-PRS-when-be s/he-PRF-reach.puberty s/he-PRS-allow.entry (Because when someone is reaching puberty s/he enters)

03 katikati ya mazingira (ambayo) a-na-weza ku-pata virusi vya? center of environment which s/he-PRS-can to-get virus of into an environment (where) s/he can get the virus of?

04 KIDS: UKIMWI. AIDS.

05 EMAN: Sawa. equal Right.

(several lines omitted)

06 QUAN: So the message for today, know your body to protect your body.

07 EMAN: U-ju-e mwili wako ili u-u-lind-e. you-know-SBJV body your for you-it-protect-SBJV Know your body to protect it.

(several lines omitted)

08 QUAN: So now that you know what your body is going through to become an adult you can protect yourself from- (h)e when you become an adult.

Although Quan mentions behaviors that can transmit HIV (line 01), students are not offered an opportunity to discuss these behaviors. In his translation, Eman changes the talk about behaviors into mazingira ‘environment’ (line 02), adding to the presentation of adolescence as a dangerous, but unavoidable, space and time.

Instead of providing practical knowledge about reproductive health methods, the educators elaborate on self-focused concepts, such as kujijua ‘self-knowing’: Tanzanian educators regularly employ linguistic resources and create terms with the -ji- ‘self’-morpheme adding to the vocabulary of self-reliance, which includes such words as kujijenga ‘self-building’,
kujitambua ‘self-recognizing’, kujiamini ‘self-believing’, kujitolea ‘self-giving’, kujielemisha ‘self-teaching’, kujiepusha kwa maambukizi ‘self-distancing from infection’, kujilinga ‘self-protection’, kujijenga ‘to build oneself’. Educators and students creatively modify the meaning of these terms depending on the topic of discussion. For example, the meaning of kujijua ‘self-knowing’ ranges from sexual organs (Excerpt 6.15, line 03; Excerpt 6.16, line 02-03) to HIV status (Excerpt 6.17, line 03, line 07).

**Excerpt 6.15**
2012-11-20-Msingi-Clip 7 [00:09:29.11]
EMAN – male Tanzanian educator.

01 EMAN: Sababu kuu ambacho tu-na-soma hizi mambo si ndiyo? mambo za balehe reason main that-REL we-PRS-study these issues NEG EMPH these issues of puberty The main reason why we learn about these issues right? the issues of puberty

02 si ndiyo eh? ili tu-pamban-e na virusi vya UKIMWI NEG EMPH INTRJ for we-fight-SBJV with virus of AIDS right eh? so that we fight with HIV

03 lazima tu-ji-ju-e. necessary we-self-know-SBJV it is necessary that we know ourselves.

**Excerpt 6.16**
2012-11-19-Sek-Clip 3 [00:01:13.09]
ANNIE – female Tanzania educator, speaks English; EMAN – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English.

01 ANNIE: Today we’re gonna be talking about the fun stuff. And that I mean sex.

((Eman asks for students’ attention, several lines omitted))

02 EMAN: Leo kila mtu a-ta—ji-ju today every person s/he-FUT-self-know

03 Kama ni dada utajijua, kama ni kaka u-ta-fanya nini? If COP sister you-FUT-self-know if COP brother you-FUT-so what

If a girl, you will know yourself, if a boy you will do what?

32 Usually used in the meaning ‘volunteering’, but does not apply for international volunteers. The latter are regularly referred to with the English borrowing kuvolontia ‘volunteering’.

33 Also used in the meaning ‘peer education’.
In Excerpt 6.16 Annie announces the topic of reproductive physiology as the *fun stuff*, that is *sex* (line 01). By this time students have not taken their seats yet, and Eman invests his time into organizing the classroom before he proceeds to translation. Instead of talking about sex, Eman announces that the lesson is about *-jijua* ‘self-knowing’ (line 02-04). By using such self-referential terms, the educators charge students with the responsibility for their bodies and health.

6.5.2 Testing as prevention

The educators provide students with information about HIV-testing as an optimal way to achieve *self-knowing*. In the next example from a primary school, the American educator, Quan, reasons that testing is an important method to protect oneself:

Excerpt 6.17
2012-11-20-Msingi-Clip 5 [00:16:27.08]
QUAN – male American educator, speaks English; Eman – male Tanzanian educator, speaks Swahili and English; BOY1, BOY2 – male Tanzanian students, speaks Swahili; KIDS – male and female Tanzanian students, speak Swahili.

01 QUAN: Alright. So why is it important that people get tested for HIV?

02 EMAN: Kwa nini muhimu mtu a-ka-pim-e?
   for what important person s/he-CONSEC-test-SBJV
   Why it is important for anyone to get tested?

((EMAN repeats the question several times encouraging students to respond))

03 BOY1: Ili a-ji-ju-e kama a-na UKIMWI.
   for s/he-self-know-SBJV if s/he-has AIDS
   So that everyone knows for him/herself if s/he has AIDS.

((EMAN continues calling on students to elicit other responses))

04 BOY2: Ili a-ju-e afya yake.
   for s/he-know-SBJV health his/her
   So that everyone knows his/her health.

((EMAN translates to QUAN and then continues eliciting other responses for about 30s))

05 QUAN: Alright. So, HIV testing is important
06 because there is no other way to know your status.
EMAN: Kwa huu ku-pima afya yako ni muhimu kwa sababu ndo njia pekee for this to-test health your COP importand for reason EMPH way only Therefore getting tested is important because it’s in fact the only way

EMAN: i-na-yo-ku-saidia ku-ji-jua?
it-PRS-which-you-help to-self-know which helps you knowing about yourself what?

KIDS: Afya yako. health your Your status.

EMAN: Afya yako. Si ndiyo eh? health your NEG EMPH INTRJ Your status. Right eh?

KIDS: Ndiyo. EMPH
Yes it is.

((QUAN continues lecturing; some students misbehave, EMAN interrupts lecturing in order to manage the classroom for about 2min))

QUAN: Alright so: getting tested is important because if you get- If you test positive, you can protect yourself. You can take drugs. ARVs.

EMAN: Kwa hiyo pia u-mesha-jua afya yako i-na-ku-saidia we for this also you-PRS-know health your it-PRS-you-help you Therefore also you already know your status it helps you

KIDS: Dawa. The medicine.

EMAN: U-ka-pe-wa dawa. Si ndiyo eh? Vi-donge hivyo. you-CONSEC-give-PASS medicine NEG EMPH INTRJ PL-pill those You will be given the medicine. Isn’t it so eh? Those pills.

QUAN: Alright. So: So why are people afraid to get tested?

EMAN: Kwa nini wa-tu wa-na-ogopa ku-pima?= for what PL-person they-PRS-be.afraid to-test Why people are scared of testing?=

=Kwa sababu u-ki-sha-pima, u-ka-jua u-me-athirika for reason you-SIM-PRF-test you-CONSEC-know you-PRS-be.effected =Because if you got tested and you know that you are infected

u-ta-pe-wa dawa because i-ta-ku-saidia. Si ndiyo eh? you-FUT-give-PASS medicine it-FUT-you-help NEG EMPH INTRJ you will be given the medicine because it will help you. Isn’t it so eh?

Lakini kama u-na-ji-jua hu-ja-athirika pia? but if you-PRS-self-know NEG-PRG- be.effected also
But if you know yourself that you haven’t been infected yet then also what?

You will be given advice on what you should do

or you-NEG.SBJV do-SBJV what shouldn’t in order to what?

So you can do what?

To protect yourself.

In this excerpt, Quan states that HIV testing is important for the timely onset of the ARV therapy (line 12-13). In these instructions, only one possible testing result—that is, the positive HIV status—is discussed as the relevant result for self-protection. ARV therapy is presented as the sole mode of prevention. While ARV therapy is explained in details throughout the NGO educational campaign, the other possible test result, namely that a person does not have HIV, is mentioned only briefly, such as in Eman’s instructions in lines 24-28. Eman refers to ushmani ‘counseling’ (line 25) but it remains unclear who would provide the counseling and what it entails.

Similarly to Excerpt 6.16, the NGO educators in Excerpt 6.17 display great comfort in talking about living and caring for HIV-positive people, but not about the methods for preventing the infection. By so doing, the educators contribute to normalizing the disease and lessening the stigma surrounding sick people, but at the same time they do little to prevent new transmissions. It is not AIDS that is presented as the cause of death, but not knowing the HIV status. By juxtaposing self-knowing with HIV-status, the educators slip into a fallacy presenting the result “positive” as ultimately expected.

While insisting on testing, the observed educators were comfortable when talking about only one possible outcome, namely when a person is tested as HIV-positive. For this cases educators suggest ARV therapy, which they elaborated on at length in biology-grounded lessons. In the case of the alternative outcome, namely if a person is tested as HIV-negative, the educators do not talk about prevention methods. Instead, they insist on repeating the testing,
basically until the result is positive. The diagram in Figure 6.5 corresponds to the “test-treat-retain” continuum proposed by WHO (2012, p. 34). Indeed, the international development community started promoting ARV therapy as the ultimate strategy for eliminating HIV epidemics (WHO, 2012): it appears that the more people would take ARVs, the less HIV transmission would occur. HIV/AIDS in this context would change its status from an epidemic to a chronic illness. In Tanzania ARVs are distributed free of charge and this factor is believed to have changed the stigma surrounding the disease. The cost of ARVs that are produced outside of the country may, however, perpetuate the country’s dependency on donors.

Meanwhile, according to Tanzanian laws, school students under 16 year old, however, are not allowed to undergo HIV testing without co-presence of their parents or written parental consent in a written form (National AIDS Control Program, 2005). In addition to age constraints, testing facilities are unavailable to most students. In a context when children are often sexually active from pre-pubescent age (Plummer & Wight, 2011), the described educational interactions prevent students from acquiring the relevant information for self-protection.

6.6 Conclusion

The analysis of talk about sexuality and prevention presented in this chapter illustrates that the discourses meant to empower youth to place the responsibility for harmful outcomes of sexual activity on those who are HIV+ and by so doing, may solidify stigma associated with teenage pregnancy and HIV transmission. These findings correspond with the longitudinal research on sexual literacy in Uganda by Jones and Norton (2007), who demonstrated that information alone does not change the environment in which young people live, and therefore, their behavior remains risky. The incomplete information, as in the discussed reproductive health
classes, is also misleading for students, creating additional barriers for changing their sexual practices.

In addition to the lack of talk about protection methods from NGO educators, in my observations students display their alignment with the official ideology that creates taboo on information about condoms. In the following Excerpt 6.18 from a student-led peer club discussion, a secondary school female student who displays good understanding of the role and function of condoms still argues that sexual education can be harmful for children’s morality. This peer club was started by an NGO in a boarding secondary school situated in a village close to Arusha. The NGO completed an awareness campaign led by American and Tanzanian educators in this school, after which a group of about twenty secondary school students volunteered to start a peer club to pass what they learned to new-coming students. The peer club received permission from the school administration to conduct weekly meetings for educating other students about HIV/AIDS. The students were meeting during a school-wide physical education class in the unfinished building of the school canteen. In one of these meetings, the students brainstormed about their informational needs and the value of sex education. With no teachers or NGO educators in the room, students were talking about condoms as well:

Excerpt 6.18
2013-03-12-clip1-[00:30:34.00]
GIRL – female secondary school student; STUDENT – a co-present student.

01 GIRL: Mimi na-sema kwamba saa nyingine elimu ya jinsia i-na-weza ku-haribu
   I.I.PRS-say that hour other education of sex it-PRS-can to-harm
   I say that sometimes sex education can be harmful.

02 Kwa sababu gani? U-na-weza u-na-kuta mam-angu a-me-ni-ambia kwamba
   for reason which you-PRS-can you-PRS-meet mother-my she-PRF-me-tell that
   Why? You can imagine that my mother has told me like

34 During this interaction I was the only adult in the room.
In this excerpt, the student suggests that the information about condom can be harmful for the behavior of young people (line 01). The student provides a hypothetical story as an example of

In a private conversation, an experienced Tanzanian NGO educator explained to me that the verb -pekua ‘to be curious, prying’ has the meaning -kufanya ngono ovyo ovyo ‘to engage in random, hazardous sex’.

---

35
how a girl would treat this information as the encouragement to “sleep around” (line 13). In this story, the mother who simply says that condom protects from pregnancy and HIV (line 03-04) ratifies the dangerous behavior in her child. The student implies that the information about condom use that is not supported by teaching about morality of sexual behavior and, possibly, abstinence, does not suffice the needs of young people. This story can be interpreted as an indirect critique on the bio-medical approach to reproductive health education promoted by the NGO that worked with this student group. Although the NGO avoided any talk about condom use, the students knew that this method prevents both unwanted pregnancy and STIs. With the constructed story the student displayed her need to have not only the information, but also the moral guidance about prevention methods.

Although the NGO-organized classes on reproductive health indeed change the traditional discursive normativity and allow open talk about sex, the use of the created spaces is not adequate for the students’ needs. While encouraged to discuss various sexual practices, students are left with no clear instructions about methods preventing unwanted outcomes of sexual activity, or how this information fits moral norms. Along with creating new discursive spaces for talk about sex, the educators imply the naturalistic justification for gender inequality, and the few mentioned methods, namely the calendar method and ‘self-knowing’ place the responsibility for pregnancy and sexually transmitted diseases on women.
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION

7.1 The politics of knowledge in action

This dissertation offers a sociocultural linguistic perspective on educational campaigns for raising awareness about sexually transmitted diseases and unwanted pregnancies among young people living in an economically challenged post-colonial context. In previous work, the value of knowledge in such contexts has been mainly addressed from the macro-perspective of state policies, globalization, and debates on neo- and post-colonialism. From this perspective, knowledge or rather “knowledges” are treated as given entities situated in the ongoing struggle with one another. Applied linguists, especially working in post-colonial context, have pointed out that when approached from a micro-perspective, such as classroom interaction where the social life of local and global languages becomes observable, the knowledge, its forms and values appear in a dynamic, mutually constituting relationship. Educational development work operates on the assumption that present knowledge—or the target population’s local knowledge—is wrong or limited. The power of market, state, colonial legacy, and the international donor community support the evaluation system underlying educational development work. As Canagarajah (2002) points out, the “right” knowledge that is supposed to replace the “wrong” local knowledge is a local knowledge elsewhere, and the scale of localities depends on the perspective taken. If approaching language as a component of knowledge, then language choice, language policy, and multilingualism are all outcomes of the struggle between global and local knowledges and power. When analyzing the role of English in the post-colonial contexts of Tanzania and Kenya, Higgins (2009) draws on on Bakhtin’s notions of heteroglossia and multivocality, and suggests understanding of this struggle as the work of centripetal and centrifugal forces. The former result in “linguistic imperialism" and “counter-narratives to
colonialism” (Higgins, 2009, pp. 8–10), the latter—in “localizing and appropriating English” (Higgins, 2009, p. 13).

Appropriation of language and knowledge is rather unnoticed in research about development work. This dissertation adds to our understanding about the politics of knowledge as it unfolds in everyday interactions triggered by educational campaigns; it offers an insight into the ongoing creation of a “third space” (Bhabha, 1994; Higgins, 2011; Kramsch, 1993) or a “third culture” (Useem & Useem, 1967) in the intersection of traditional ideologies about language, sex, and gender and the “enlightenment discourse” (Higgins, 2010b, p. 70) of Western biomedical rationalism.

The role of talk as a form of social action and of language as the main medium of knowledge transfer remains underestimated in development work. Language—in the form of local languages, the national language of Swahili, and the global English—is treated as an obstacle in delivering the development agenda, yet language is a powerful means for transforming and for preserving a social order, and talk remains the most utilized technique by NGOs worldwide (Watkins et al., 2012). This dissertation addressed talk in interaction in two main contexts of development work: training sessions for future NGO educators and teaching sessions conducted by NGO volunteers for the target population. Three themes were explored: 1) how epistemic status and authority is co-constructed in interaction; 2) how the shared understanding of knowledge needs is created; and 3) how the knowledge needs are addressed. I found that regarding the goals of the observed educational campaigns, the informational needs of the target audience remain unmet: NGO educators provided little instruction about prevention methods. These campaigns, however, influence significantly local discursive norms and lead to the commodification of language.
7.2 Development talk as a ritualized interaction

Watkins and Swidler (2013, p. 208) compare teaching activities in AIDS prevention campaigns in Africa to a Catholic Mass: both events are highly ritualized through the use of a particular set of equipment, a predictable sequence of actions that they entail, and the use of certain vocabularies. The format is a product of negotiations between donors, intermediary organizations, that is, NGOs, and their target populations driven by the assumption that knowledge transfer is the sole method for behavioral and societal change. The ritualization of educational development efforts can be interpreted as the result of appropriation of the global knowledge in the local spaces; its actors remain unaware of the recursive nature of their actions and their religious mission of converting the audience to the donor-sanctioned message. In education about reproductive health, language socialization that entails learning the modern vocabulary of sex, disease and prevention, and by so doing learning a particular ideology of sexuality and gender is the central process of knowledge appropriation.

The politics of knowledge is particularly evident in the socialization of newly recruited NGO volunteers into educators. In Chapter 5 I discussed how young Americans and Tanzanians are trained to serve as NGO educators, and how they then negotiate epistemic authority during co-teaching. I argued that the institutional structure accounts for the unequal power distribution among local and foreign participants, which leads to the presentation of the latter as more knowledgeable. Although the unequal language competence (that is, the inability of foreign educators to speak and understand Swahili) contributed to the devaluation of local knowledge, it allowed the local educators to pursue their agenda more effectively. In the translatory turns in co-teaching, Tanzanians were able to significantly modify the initial utterance produced by Americans, while still presenting them as morally responsible for talk about intimate issues.
7.3 Manufacturing the knowledge needs

While NGOs rarely assess knowledge needs in the target population, the concept of knowledge needs is the essence of development work. Educational campaigns are justifiable only through a perceived and recognized need for more information. In Chapter 6, I demonstrated how NGO educators construct puberty as a teachable subject, as the source of ambivalence about one’s own body and the cause of ill-informed behaviors. In Chapter 7, I demonstrated that this knowledge need remains largely unsatisfied. The educators do not provide students with comprehensive information about methods that prevent sexually transmitted diseases and unwanted pregnancies. Instead, they preach the gospel of education (cf. Grubb & Lazerson, 2009): that students need to “know themselves” better by means of learning biology and their own HIV status. Billings (2011; 2013) points out that although the ideology of “education as the key for life” is ubiquitous in Tanzania, it is deceiving. This ideology promotes the quantity of education, not its quality: when failing exams, for example, students are usually blamed for not learning good enough or long enough. Meanwhile teachers and the educational system are not questioned for providing no relevant information for passing the exams or succeeding in life overall.

7.4 Language as a commodity

Although students learn little about prevention methods, there is still a tangible learning outcome, that is, the acquisition of the development register as a commodity. The understanding of language as a commodity is developed in regard to language policy, planning and teaching in a globalizing world (Rassool, 2007; Tan & Rubdy, 2008). This dissertation adds to the research demonstrating that not only a language, but also its registers—particular vocabulary,
interactional practices, and language ideologies (eg. Agha, 2011; Carr, 2010; Jackson, 2013)—can be a recognized by speakers as a valuable asset.

NGOs create a novel site for socialization into sexuality and gender, especially in their relation to health and societal ills, and by so doing contribute to changing the traditional discursive normativity that restricts talk about intimate issues in public. Educational campaigns led by NGOs create a discursive space where talking about sex is actively encouraged in the target population, and required in NGO workers. NGOs provide “licensing” for transgressing discursive prohibitions, which, however, may or may not translate in changing sexual behaviors or ideologies about sexuality and gender. The message conveyed by the observed NGOs remains gender-unequal: females are presented as morally accountable for the negative outcomes of sex; the perceived natural need for sex in males mitigates their responsibility. The prevention talk produced by NGOs addresses not sexual, but social, behavior: by attending NGO classes on reproductive health, undergoing HIV testing, learning and using medical vocabulary referring to sex, the participants linguistically construct and index their identities as modern, educated, and potentially employable by NGOs.

Talk is the main technique in the development organizations (Watkins et al., 2012). As an industry that does not produce much besides talk, they define supply and demand: being able to break traditional discursive taboos in a persuasive, self-assertive manner has a value in and of itself. This process is a good example of what Fairclough (2010, p. 552) calls *semiotization of commodities*, meaning that discourse “becomes open to processes of economic calculation” and “it comes to be designed for success on markets.”
7.5 Language as a lens to knowledge needs

Along with changing discursive norms, the commodification of language impacts local power structures, in particular by devaluing teaching as a profession. NGO educators present themselves as experts through ritualized discursive practices and by indexing the affiliation with development work; proficiency in English is among the main resources to display high epistemic status. Local schoolteachers who underwent no NGO training do not fit into this market place, which undermines the value of their education. Although research worldwide shows that to reach a significant improvement of sexual and reproductive health in young people, comprehensive sexuality education needs to be integrated into school system, NGOs prefer relying on cheap labor of volunteers.

Uncertainties that are in the core of NGO life have causes and consequences inherent to the globalized world: long-term plans of local NGOs are often shattered by a short-term notice from donor organizations; donors’ agenda changes due to political and ideological transformations in the global West; individual altruists, such as American college students, make decisions about volunteering based on the perceived benefits for future employment. By preferring foreign self-financed volunteers to professional local teachers, NGOs particularly harm the local economy and convey a contradictory message about the value of education. Trapped by the donor-dependency, NGOs refocus their activities from serving local communities to satisfying the donors, for instance, by writing reports or providing volunteers with exotic, but safe experiences, all of which affirm the donors’ sense of mission.

Language use, with the changing of discursive taboos about topics like sex and condoms, is an important outcome of these uncertainties, and one that reflects the ambivalence of moral values conveyed by NGO-led education about reproductive health. Fossilized in NGO
guidelines, teaching manuals, and success reports, ritualized linguistic practices in these educational campaigns index that the development industry fails to recognize the changing context of their work. NGO talk about sex does not happen in a vacuum: Tanzania, like the rest of the world, experiences a dramatic change in information access afforded by new technologies and media; research on behavior, disease, and prevention yields new results; finally, those who once were learners in the NGO-set classrooms will eventually become parents themselves. Ethnographic research that focuses on language as a form of social action provides a critical perspective on how context defines knowledge needs, and how the target audience responds to the educational campaign message.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


S. Fleischman (Eds.), *Modality in grammar and discourse* (pp. 55–66). Amsterdam; Philadelphia: John Benjamin’s Publishing.


Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. (1995). Writing ethnographic fieldnotes. Chicago,
Ill.: University Of Chicago Press.


Pennsylvania Press.


180


Irvin, A. (2000). *Taking steps of courage: Teaching adolescents about sexuality and gender in*


Oxford University Press.


Lloyd, C. B. (2010). The role of schools in promoting sexual and reproductive health among adolescents in developing countries. In S. Malarcher (Ed.), *Social determinants of sexual
and reproductive health: informing future research and programme implementation (pp. 113–132). Geneva: WHO.


Pomerantz, A. (1979). Agreeing and disagreeing with assessments: Some features of preferred/dispreferred turn shapes. In J. M. Atkinson & J. Heritage (Eds.), *Structures of


Stivers, T., Mondada, L., & Steensig, J. (2011). Knowledge, morality and affiliation in social interaction. In T. Stivers, L. Mondada, & J. Steensig (Eds.), The morality of knowledge in


Thompson, K. D. (2014). Swahili talk about supernatural sodomy: Intertextuality, the obligation to tell, and the transgression of norms in coastal Tanzania. *Critical Discourse Studies,*
11(1), 71–94.


UNESCO. (2013). Young people today. Time to act now: Why adolescents and young people need comprehensive sexuality education and sexual and reproductive health services in


_Afrikanistische Arbeitspapiere: Schriftenreihe Des Kölnner Instituts Für Afrikanistik_, (51), 135–149.


_Swahili Forum, 18_, 97–113.