Title

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/6h96760h

Journal
UCLA Historical Journal, 2(0)

ISSN
0276-864X

Author
Clark, Margaret M.

Publication Date
1981

Peer reviewed
zations along a spectrum with the Plains Indians and the Five Civilized Tribes of Oklahoma as the two extremes, and the Winnebagos, Sacs, and Foxes as "the slough of despond in the middle" (p. 18). By portraying Indian cultures in a linear progression from a savage to a civilized state, Hagan fails to account for the diversity of native civilizations as well as the dynamic flux of all cultures.

Like a well-intentioned reformer of the nineteenth century, Hagan fails to understand the adaptive nature of native American culture. He focuses on the assimilative results of the reservation law program, but fails to demonstrate how Indians used the law to keep their native cultures intact. While praising progressives for accepting farming, education, and white dress, he denigrates so-called conservatives like Sitting Bull, who preferred a traditional life. Hagan's analysis is ill-served by this strict progressive/conservative dichotomy. As he himself acknowledges, by the 1890s, many tribesmen had a foot in each camp. They accepted the outward trappings of white society but managed to keep a separate cultural identity. Comanche Judge Quanah Parker was one example: Hagan tells us that Parker drew praise from whites as an effective lawman. The judge aided civilization efforts by helping agents enact the land allotment program. At the same time he was a pioneer in the dynamic peyote cult. What the author does not reveal is that in 1908, Parker used his law experience successfully to defend this native religion against white efforts to ban it. Other tribesmen used their legal experience to fight infringements on native dances and ceremonies, to prevent white encroachment on their lands, and to ensure government conformity to treaty agreements. Hagan, however, does not discuss those efforts that served to strengthen Indian cultural integrity.

*Indian Police and Judges* is one of few works that address the subject of reservation legal systems. With the revision demanded by fifteen years of subsequent scholarship, it could have been a valuable book. As it stands now, this interesting subject still awaits adequate treatment.

Joseph B. Herring
University of Maryland


Griswold del Castillo's history of the Mexican community during the first decades of the "American era" has as its focus the active participation of the Mexican population in the shaping of its own culture and society. The author's intent is to draw attention away from the concepts of "barrioization" and "proletarianization" as explanations of Chicano history. Recent Chicano historians have argued that the very nature of imperial colonization of non-white peoples by the Anglo-Americans determined the course of the Mexican community's history and culture. Griswold del Castillo's social history of the Los Angeles barrio concentrates on the mechanisms which the community adopted as it was confronted by changes in the economic structure of the region, the in-migration of Anglo-Americans as well as Mexicans, and by the effects of racial segregation on the community.
Following the methodology of New Urban historians Stephen Thernstrom and Richard Sennett, Griswold del Castillo analyzes statistical data found in manuscript census schedules, tax lists, city directories, church documents, and birth and death records. From these he derives occupational structures, population growth charts, and patterns of social and occupational mobility. He deals with problems of statistical accuracy and margins of error in appendices to the work.

During the Spanish and the Mexican eras of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, Mexican society in California consisted of a number of small, tightly-knit communities. Traditional pueblo values served to unite communities and to reinforce the hierarchical social structure as the communities evolved from subsistence farming economies to commercial ranching. Political and social leadership was concentrated in the hands of the wealthy Californio landowners by the end of the Mexican era. Yet even as the political structure became more authoritarian, it retained its populist base.

Griswold del Castillo argues that the economic decline of the Mexican community began before the middle of the century, before the "American era." By measuring the rates of persistence among property owners, he shows that although certain occupational changes occurred as the community adapted to the commercialization of the agrarian economy, the occupational structure did not alter sufficiently to include the Mexican community in the region's economic expansion. Instead, the occupational structure was generally stagnant, the population transient, and the community isolated from the developing Los Angeles economy.

In the third and perhaps strongest chapter of the book, the author focuses on the family as that institution which "absorbed the brunt of economic and cultural shocks that marked the transition from national to ethnic status" (p. 62). He observes changes in the size and structure of the family between 1850 and 1890. The female-centered family became a significant institution at a time when changes in the traditional property laws weakened the woman's economic and social status. By 1880 families had become smaller, and, whereas prior to the American era extended families accounted for seventy-one percent of families, the proportion of extended families to nuclear ones fell during the period of 1850 to 1890, despite the superior performance of the extended family in economic and social mobility (pp. 98-102).

In view of its changing relationship to traditional sources of cultural leadership--the institutional Church and the wealthy Californios, both of which tended to ally with Anglo-American interests--the main body of the Mexican-American community developed new sources of cultural expression. This "emerging ethnic consciousness," based in a Mexican nationalism, was reflected in incidences of racial violence within the barrio, judicial and political discrimination within the Anglo-American community, and repatriation to Mexico, on the one hand; and by the growth of Spanish-language newspapers, community schools, and the mutualistas (agencies which provided the barrio with social and economic services formerly provided by the Church and the social elites), on the other. Griswold del Castillo sees the emergence of these institutions as a response to the social and political realities of racial, occupational, educational, and political discrimination. The development of an ethnic consciousness provided psychological advantages to the community, which in turn gave meaning to an otherwise bleak existence within the barrio. Griswold del Castillo has interpreted that element of ethnic consciousness as an expression of vitality, a vitality the community needed in order to survive the cultural and social changes brought about not so much by the "Americanization" of
the region, but by the forces of rapid economic growth.

Griswold del Castillo's study of the Los Angeles barrio contrasts sharply with those works which focus on the proletarianization and the barrioization of the Chicano community. He does not deny the community was a working class one, nor that the barrio imposed certain limits upon it. Rather, he has attempted to show what mechanisms the Mexican community adopted in the face of economic and social changes. His study does not deal specifically with the inherent structural limitations of the new capitalist socio-economic system in which the community had hopes of participating. The limitations are revealed, however, in his evidence of the community's economic isolation. This study of the Los Angeles barrio provides a balance to Chicano historical literature. Its aim is to reveal the history of a community undergoing rapid social and economic change, not to write the history of one society's domination of another.

Margaret M. Clark
University of California, Los Angeles


Lagemann's educational biography offers historians of social and women's history an important interpretation of the process whereby female social reformers gained access to public power and influence during the Progressive Era. By broadly defining education as "a continuous, cumulative, essentially lifelong process of growth," Lagemann has provided a framework to evaluate the life experiences of American women who were self-educated at a time when women were restricted from access to formal professional training.

Biographical essays illuminate the lives of five individuals: Grace Hoardly Dodge, Maud Nathan, Lillian D. Wald, Leonora O'Reilly, and Rose Schneiderman. Lagemann suggests the life cycles of the five historical actors she has evaluated were influenced by two factors: strong parental pedagogy and the influence of important mentor/protegé relationships. Utilizing the methodology of comparative biography, Lagemann makes a persuasive argument for the importance of continuous self-education in the lives of the activists she has examined.

Lagemann describes the extraordinary accomplishments of public leaders which were uncharacteristic of the life experiences of the majority of American women. The five biographies depict women who held public positions and influenced the course of social change both individually and collectively through cross-class associations. The historical contributions of these women in a variety of reform programs, from trade unionism and suffrage to peace organizations and consumerism, reflect the broad reform activism of the period. The question remains, however, whether Lagemann has given enough attention to the larger social changes influencing the lives of the women she has described.

Emphasizing the influence of parents, mentors, and colleagues in the education of the five reformers, Lagemann maximizes her evidence regarding the individual experiences of the women. At the