Trifluoroacetic acid from degradation of HCFCs and HFCs: A three-dimensional modeling study

Atmospheric and Environmental Research, Inc., Cambridge, Massachusetts

Michael J. Prather
Earth System Science, University of California, Irvine

Abstract. Trifluoroacetic acid (TFA; CF₃COOH) is produced by the degradation of the halocarbon replacements HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123. The formation of TFA occurs by HFC/HCFC reacting with OH to yield CF₃COX (X = F or C1), followed by in-cloud hydrolysis of CF₃COX to form TFA. The TFA formed in the clouds may be reevaporated but is finally deposited onto the surface by washout or dry deposition. Concern has been expressed about the possible long-term accumulation of TFA in certain aquatic environments, pointing to the need to obtain information on the concentrations of TFA in rainwater over scales ranging from local to continental. Based on projected concentrations for HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123 of 80, 10, and 1 pptv in the year 2010, mass conservation arguments imply an annually averaged global concentration of 0.16 µg/L if washout were the only removal mechanism for TFA. We present 3-D simulations of the HFC/HCFC precursors of TFA that include the rates of formation and deposition of TFA based on assumed future emissions. An established (GISS/Harvard/UCI) but coarse-resolution (8 ø latitude by 10 ø longitude) chemical transport model was used. The annually averaged rainwater concentration of 0.12 µg/L (global) was calculated for the year 2010, when both washout and dry deposition are included as the loss mechanism for TFA from the atmosphere. For some large regions in midnorthern latitudes, values are larger, 0.15–0.20 µg/L. The highest monthly averaged rainwater concentrations of TFA for northern midlatitudes were calculated for the month of July, corresponding to 0.3–0.45 µg/L in parts of North America and Europe. Recent laboratory experiments have suggested that a substantial amount of vibrationally excited CF₃CHFO is produced in the degradation of HFC-134a, decreasing the yield of TFA from this compound by 60%. This decrease would reduce the calculated amounts of TFA in rainwater in the year 2010 by 26%, for the same projected concentrations of precursors.

1. Introduction

The long-lived fully halogenated organic compounds are being replaced by hydrofluorocarbons (HCFCs) and hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs). Because of removal by reaction with OH in the troposphere, smaller tropospheric accumulations for these chemicals are expected [World Meteorological Organization (WMO), 1990; Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), 1990; Rodríguez et al., 1993; Kanakidou et al., 1995], leading to smaller global ozone depletion potentials and global warming indices. Another criterion for the acceptability of the substitute HCFCs/HFCs pertains to the impact of these compounds or their degradation products on ecosystems. Trifluoroacetic (TFA; CF₃COOH) is produced from the atmospheric degradation of HFC-134a (CF₃CH₂F), HCFC-124 (CF₃CHFCl), and HCFC-123 (CF₃CHCl₂). It is highly soluble in water and expected to be removed from the atmosphere mainly by washout. Globally averaged concentrations of TFA in rainwater (µg/L) r_TFA can be easily estimated from mass-balance considerations. Adopting molar yields for TFA of 33% yield from HFC-134a (see discussion in section 5.6 for impact of other possible yields) and 100% for HCFC-123 and 124, a global rainfall rate of 5 × 10¹⁷ L yr⁻¹ [Jaeger, 1983] and an emission scenario for the HCFC/HFCs provided by D. Hufford (1993), the global average r_TFA concentrations for the year 2010 is about 0.16 µg/L, assuming that washout is the dominant loss mechanism for gas phase TFA.

Local r_TFA values deviate from the global averages due to inhomogeneities in OH concentrations and precipitation rates, as well as the long-range transport of gas phase. TFA and its precursors. Evaluation of the impact of these processes requires models ranging in scales from global to regional. The global distribution of TFA in rainwater produced from HFC-134a alone has been previously studied with a two-dimensional (2-D) model [Rodríguez et al., 1993]. Kanakidou et al. [1995] modeled the fate of a series of CFC replacements, including TFA precursors, with a 3-D model using monthly average wind fields and full chemistry.

In this paper we present the global distribution of TFA in the gas phase and in precipitation produced by the degradation of HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123 using a coarse grid chemical transport model (CTM), but including synoptic scale weather patterns, diurnal boundary layers, and wet and dry convective plume mixing processes derived from a general circulation model (GCM). Observed climatological values of
cloud cover and rainfall were used to calculate hydrolysis and washout rates. On an annual average basis in midnorthern latitudes, rTFA concentrations are 0.15–0.20 µg/L in specific grid boxes, but for particular months they are as large as 0.3–0.45 µg/L. Modeling uncertainties due to assumed liquid water and precipitation patterns are also presented.

No deleterious effects have been identified for the expected water concentrations of less than 0.5 µg/L. Concerns have been raised about the long-term accumulation of trifluoroacetic acid in certain aquatic environments. Since TFA seems to be remarkably stable in the biosphere/hydrosphere, Tromp et al. [1995] suggested that accumulation of TFA in certain closed aquatic systems over several decades could increase TFA concentrations to factors of 100 times rainwater concentrations. The study presented in this paper provides values for rainwater concentrations averaged over areas of the order of 800 × 1000 km. This information can be used to assess the effect of long-term accumulation by obtaining more information on the local hydrological conditions, atmospheric degradation of TFA precursors, and the local deposition fluxes and the local concentrations in rainwater of TFA. Individual aquatic environments in a suspected impact area must be studied by using hydrological models with the drainage basin characteristics of the area.

The degradation pathways for the precursor HFC and HCFCs are discussed in section 2. A brief description of the chemical model, input data sets used for rainfall and cloud cover, and approximations used for calculating cloud and precipitation processes are presented in section 3. Section 4 presents the results of the simulations. Sensitivity calculations for noted uncertainties are discussed in section 5. Conclusions and recommendations for further research are found in section 6.

2. Degradation Pathway for HFC/HCFCs

Our simulation of TFA concentrations in rainwater requires calculation of the net yield of TFA in the degradation of HCFC/HFCs, which has been the subject of intense research for the past decade. Schemes originally proposed in analogy with those of fully saturated hydrocarbons [WMO, 1990] were proven correct by numerous kinetic measurements [e.g., NASA, 1994]. We review here the degradation of the three TFA precursors, HFC-134a, HCFC-123, and HCFC-124, whose main atmospheric sink is initiated by reaction with OH in the troposphere. Stratospheric removal occurs also through photolysis and less so by reaction with O(1D).

Figure 1 shows our current understanding of the degradation pathways for HFC-134a [Franklin, 1993]. Analogous degradation mechanisms have been described for HCFC-123 and 124 [see WMO, 1990]. Consideration of the degradation pathways in Figure 1 indicates that the TFA rainout is a major pathway for final removal of the trifluoroacetyl fluoride, CF3C(O)F, from the troposphere. The actual yield of TFA will depend on the competing photochemical pathways for the degradation of alkoxy radical (CH3CHFO). One option is that the complete photochemical scheme be included in a 3-D CTM; however, transport will affect the geographical distribution of TFA only through its impact on those intermediate products whose lifetimes are longer than a few days in the lower troposphere, where most of the rainout occurs. Thus we simplified the chemical scheme and were able to carry out a larger number of sensitivity studies.

For the purposes of the TFA simulations the schemes for precursor degradation (Figure 1) were simplified to those shown in Figure 2, in which only three species with lifetimes longer than a few days in the lower troposphere are carried in the CTM as prognostic variables. These include the precursor

Figure 1. Degradation pathway for HFC-134a from Franklin [1993]. Diagram shows mechanisms that lead to the formation of TFA. CF3 radical formed in the end undergoes several other reactions, which are of no importance to the topic discussed here.

Figure 2a. Degradation pathways for HFC-134a. The reaction pathway is highly simplified and does not show many short-lived intermediate compounds. The three step TFA formation mechanism hypothesized for the 3-D simulation is shown on the left of the figure. Percentages denote the calculated molar fraction on each box degraded through the indicated channel. See text for discussion of α.
HCFC/HFC, an intermediate trifluoroacetyl halide of the form CF₃C(O)X (X = F, Cl), and gas phase TFA. Figures 2a, 2b, and 2c show the intermediate steps in the formation of TFA from HFC-134a, HCFC-123, and HCFC-124. Local photochemical steady state is assumed for all the other species not explicitly included in this scheme.

2.1. Removal of Precursor HCFC/HFC and Production of CF₃C(O)X

As indicated, in Figure 2, the removal of the precursors occurs through reaction with tropospheric OH. The reaction of HFC/HFC with OH leads to production of CF₃CXYO through multiple and rapid intermediate steps (where X = F, Y = H for HFC-134a; X = Y = Cl for HCFC-123; and X = F, Y = Cl for HCFC-124).

\[
P(CF₃CXYO, r, t) = k_{OH}(T)[OH](r, t)[HCFC/HFC](r, t)
\]  

where \(P(CF₃CXYO, r, t) \) (cm⁻³ s⁻¹) denotes the production of CF₃CXYO at each location \(r\) and time \(t\); \(k_{OH}(T) \) (cm³ s⁻¹) is the reaction rate (a function of local temperature \(T\)) of the corresponding HCFC/HFC with OH; and the local concentrations (cm⁻³) of OH and HCFC/HFC are denoted by brackets.

The rate constants \(k_{OH}\) adopted for the reaction of HFC-134a, HCFC-123, and HCFC-124 with OH are from DeMore et al. [1992].

Particular attention must be paid to the degradation of HFC-134a. The radical CF₃CFHO is produced in the atmosphere mainly via reaction of CF₃CHFO with NO. Laboratory data reported by Wallington et al. [1996] indicate that the CF₃CHFO is produced initially in an excited state \((CF₃CHF O^*)\). A fraction \(1-\alpha\) undergoes rapid dissociation through C-C fission, while the remaining fraction \(\alpha\) becomes deexcited by thermal collisions. The thermalized alkoxy intermediate CF₃CFHO can either form CF₃COF after losing the H atom through reaction with O₂ or undergo thermal fission of the carbon-carbon bond.

\[
CF₃CFHO + O₂ \rightarrow CF₃COF + HO₂ (k₂; cm³ s⁻¹) \quad (2)
\]

Taking into account the possibility of prompt dissociation of CF₃CHFO* in the atmosphere, the molar yield of CF₃COF from degradation of HFC-134a is given by

\[
y_{134a} = \frac{k₂(T)[O₂]}{k₃(T) + k₂(T)[O₂]} = \frac{K(T)}{K(T) + [O₂]} \quad (4)
\]

where \(K(T) \) (cm⁻³) = \((k₂(T)/k₃(T))\). The rates \(k₂\) and \(k₃\) have been measured by Tuazon and Atkinson [1993] and Wallington et al. [1992]. The reported values of Wallington et al. [1992] agree with those of Tuazon and Atkinson [1993] when the rate expression for \(K\) of Wallington et al. [1992] is expressed in a pressure dependent format as shown in Table 1. Wallington et al. [1996] reported a value of 0.4 for \(\alpha\). We note, however, that the calculations presented below assume a value of \(\alpha = 1.0\). The impact of the recent value of Wallington et al. is discussed in section 5.6.

By contrast, the alkoxy radicals CF₃ClO and CF₃CIFO, produced in the degradation of HCFC-124 (Figure 2b) and HCFC-123 (Figure 2c), respectively, undergo chlorine abstraction leading to the formation of CF₃COCl [Atkinson, 1989].

Figure 2b. Same as 2a but for HCFC-124. We assume that all CF₃CClFO is thermalized.

Figure 2c. Same as 2a but for HCFC-123. We assume that all CF₃CCl₂ is thermalized.
The following approximate expression for the amount of air processed by a cloud in a given grid box during a given time period At as the sum of (1) the fraction of initial amount of air processed by a cloud in the time period At. If the hydrolysis rate is sufficiently slow, we neglect the fast processes, including (1) residence time of air masses inside a cloud, (2) diffusion of the gas molecule to the liquid droplet, (3) diffusion of the molecule into the liquid, and (4) hydrolysis inside the droplet. The analysis of Schwartz [1986] shows that the timescales of interest are the hydrolysis times inside the droplets and the residence time of an air parcel inside the clouds.

We can then express the production of CF$_3$C(O)X at each model grid point using local steady state conditions:

\[ P(CF_3C(O)X, r, t) = \gamma_{HCFC/HFC}(r, t)k_{H}(r, t)[OH](r, t) [HCFC/HFC](r, t) \]

where HCFC/HFC denotes HFC-134a or HCFC-124 if X = F, and HCFC-123 if X = Cl. The yields for HCFC-123 and HCFC-124 are given in Table 1.

### Table 1. List of Reaction Rate and Hydrolysis Rate Constants Used in the Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Constant</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CF$_3$COF</td>
<td>$H = 3.2$ (M/atm) (Henry's law constant)</td>
<td>George et al. [1993]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF$_3$COF</td>
<td>$k_h = 147$ (1/s) (hydrolysis constant)</td>
<td>George et al. [1993]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF$_3$COCl</td>
<td>$H = 2.5$ (M/atm) (Henry's law constant)</td>
<td>George et al. [1993]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF$_3$COCl</td>
<td>$k_h = 200$ (1/s) (hydrolysis constant)</td>
<td>George et al. [1993]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CF3COF</td>
<td>$K(T, M) = \frac{K_d(T)M}{1 + K_d(T)M/k_a(t)}F_r^{1+[(\text{deg})/(K_d(M)/K_a(T)(T))]}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

where $K_a(T) = 1.58 \times 10^{-25} \exp(3600/T)$, $K_d(T) = 3.28 \times 10^{-14} \times 1.58 \times 10^{-25} \exp(3600/T)$, $M = \text{air density molecules/cm}^3$, $F_r = 0.6$

\[ \gamma_{123} = \gamma_{124} = 1 \]  

where $\Delta t$ is the hydrolysis time step used in the model, $f(r, t)$ is the fractional cloud volume in the grid, and $K_d$ is discussed below. A hydrolysis time step of 2 hours was used. We adopted a value of 122 hours for $\tau$ as an approximate average of the residence times for cumulus and stratus. This $\tau$ was used for the entire model domain, and no differentiation was made between upper level, midlevel, and low clouds with respect to the residence times. The sensitivity of the calculations to this assumed residence time is evaluated in section 5.3. We find this formulation to be adequate for the purpose of the present calculations and on the basis of our sensitivity tests on the timescales of hydrolysis involved.

The in-cloud hydrolysis first-order rate $K_d$ (s$^{-1}$) in (7) is calculated as follows: in the absence of mass transfer constraints the fraction of gas phase CF$_3$C(O)X that reacts per unit time by dissolving and hydrolyzing in the cloud water is given by [Kanakidou et al., 1993; Freiberg and Schwartz, 1980].

\[ K_d = C_d HRT \]

where $H$ is the Henry's constant (M/atm; $M$ is moles dissolved/liter of solution); LWC is the dimensionless liquid water content of clouds (grams of water/grams of air); $R$ is the gas constant; $T$ is temperature (in K) and $k_h$ is the hydrolysis constant in rainwater (s$^{-1}$). Solubility and hydrolysis rate constants for CF$_3$COF and CF$_3$COCl are given in Table 1. The factor $f$ denotes a correction factor to compensate for diffusional resistance inside the droplets, corresponding to values of 0.5 for CF$_3$COCl and 0.65 for CF$_3$COF [Kanakidou et al., 1995]. The hydrolysis rates calculated by (8) are of the order of 1/min in the presence of clouds. Thus the exponential term in (7) tends to zero for the hydrolysis time step considered here (2 hours), and the amount of CF$_3$C(O)X becomes directly proportional to the cloud cover fraction.

Cloud fraction and liquid water content of the clouds were estimated from the zonally averaged data described by Lelieveld et al. [1989]. This data set contains cloud cover and liquid water content of the clouds on a 10º latitude by 100 mbar resolution and has been used by Lelieveld and Crutzen [1990] to study the effect of liquid phase chemistry on ozone levels in the troposphere. The data set used has averaged information for the four seasons. The zonally averaged data were mapped onto a three-dimensional grid using the climatological monthly averaged surface rain data of Shea [1986] as a weighting factor.

Figure 3 shows the annual average and column-integrated liquid water. Large-scale features of the liquid water distribution are qualitatively consistent with observations [Prabhakara et
2.4. Production of Gas Phase TFA in the Atmosphere

Hydrolysis of CF$_3$COX in cloud water produces CF$_3$CO(O)OH (TFA). TFA is a strong acid with a $pK$ of 0.25 [Exner et al., 1992] and is expected to dissociate immediately and form CF$_3$COO$^-$. Upon cloud reevaporation this anion will probably reevaporate as gas phase CF$_3$CO(O)OH or remain a CF$_3$COO$^-$ in residual aerosol. In either case we assume that both forms will again dissociate after reincorporation into cloud or rainwater. TFA was assumed to undergo full evaporation as many times as the cloud water itself within each grid box and time step. In this case, the production of gas phase TFA in the model time interval $\Delta t$ is given by

$$\dot{P}(\text{TFA}, r, t) = - \frac{\Delta [\text{CF}_3\text{CO}(\text{O})\text{X}] (r, t)}{\Delta t} \quad (9)$$

where $\Delta [\text{CF}_3\text{CO}(\text{O})\text{X}]$ is discussed in the previous section. If CF$_3$COO$^-$ is incorporated into stable salts which do not further dissociate, the production of gas phase TFA would be much smaller than calculated below.

2.5. Removal of Gas Phase TFA

TFA is highly soluble (Henry's constant of $> 10^7 \text{M atm}^{-1}$ [Wine and Chameides, 1990]) and hence can be expected to be rained-out at a rate similar to that of HNO$_3$, which has a global average washout rate of about 9 days. We parameterized TFA washout as a continuous process, using the altitude dependent, globally averaged first-order loss rates of nitric acid [Logan et al., 1981]. To account for spatial variations, the specified washout rates were mapped onto a three-dimensional grid using the climatological surface precipitation data of Shea [1986] as a weighting factor. This approach is new with this CTM; we neglect the coupling between rainout and convective and/or large-scale precipitation (see discussion by Balkanski et al. [1993]).

Dry deposition of TFA was modeled by assuming a constant deposition velocity of 2 cm/s over land and 0.3 cm/s over ocean surfaces at rates approximately similar to those used for HNO$_3$ [Kotamarthi and Carmichael, 1990]. The deposition velocities over the ocean surface are lower as the surface roughness over the ocean is smaller, increasing the transfer resistance of the gas phase TFA to the ocean surface. Rates for the reactions of gas phase CF$_3$CO(O)OH with OH have been measured [Carr et al., 1994]. Kanakidou et al. [1995] estimated that inclusion of this process would decrease the calculated TFA in rainwater ($r_{\text{TFA}}$) by at most 5% and much less if a large fraction of the reevaporated anion takes the form of a salt. We have not included this process in our calculations.

3. Description of Model and Input Data

The 3-D CTM developed at GISS (Goddard Institute for Space Science)/Harvard/UCI (University of California at Irvine) was used for simulating the 3-D distribution of the trace species of interest. This model uses a 1 year output of wind data and convection statistics (every 4 hours) from the GISS GCM [Hansen et al., 1983]. This data set is recycled for multiple-year runs. The interhemispheric transport in this model has been previously tested through comparisons with measurements of long-lived fluorocarbons, CH$_3$CCI$_3$ and $^{85}$Kr [Prather et al., 1987; Jacob et al., 1987]. The model reproduced observations satisfactorily after corrections were applied to the transport scheme to include a horizontal diffusion term to improve the north-south hemispheric exchange [Prather et al., 1987]. Vertical transport by convection was tested through comparisons to $^{222}$Rn [Jacob and Prather, 1990]. A coarse-grid tropospheric version of the model, with a horizontal resolution of 8ø latitude by 10ø longitude and nine grid points in the vertical extending from the surface of 10 mbar was used in the present study. There are seven grid points in the troposphere and in the stratosphere.

Simulations of the concentrations of TFA in rainwater were carried out by simultaneous calculations of three sets of tracers (see Figure 2): (1) the precursor HCFC/HFC, (2) the long-lived halocarbons of the form CF$_3$C(O)O(X), and (3) gas/particle phase TFA. Production and loss of these tracers are incorporated in the model as described in section 2. The parameterizations for these processes require input of (1) emission scenarios and geographical distribution for precursors HCFC/HFCs, (2) global fields of OH for destruction of precursors in troposphere, and (3) three-dimensional distributions...
of liquid water content and precipitation to estimate rates of hydrolysis and washout.

The emissions of precursors between 1985 and 2010 were prescribed according to the scenario shown in Figure 4, which predicts HFC-134a to be in wider use than HCFC-124 or HCFC-123 during the next decade (D. Hufford, 1993). Other emission scenarios suggest that the emissions in Figure 4 could easily change by factors of 2 [Kanakidou et al., 1995]. The emissions were distributed around the globe using the electric power consumption statistics as a weighting factor following Prather et al. [1987]. This emission distribution is similar to the chlorofluorocarbon emission inventory of McCulloch et al. [1994].

A global scale OH field derived for this model, using a parameterized chemistry scheme by Spivakovsky et al. [1990], was used to calculate the loss of HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123 by reaction with OH. The above authors calculated this field based on available and assumed global distributions of H2O, CO, CH4, NOx, and NO3. The CH3CCl3 lifetime calculated by using the model is 5.8 years. This lifetime indicates that the global OH calculated in this model is about 20% lower than the latest recommendations [Prinn et al., 1995; IPCC, 1996]. The sensitivity of the calculated OH to a 20% change in the OH fields is discussed in section 5.5.

Time dependent calculations were carried out between the years 1989 and 2010 separately for HCFC-123, HCFC-124, and HFC-134a by varying the surface fluxes of these species according to the emission scenario in Figure 3. The model was initialized in 1985 with negligible mixing ratios of the precursors and degradation products CF3C(O)X and TFA. All other production and loss processes were kept constant throughout the simulation, since predicted changes in overhead ozone and tropospheric OH are not expected to change our results substantially, and we cannot reliably predict the secondary chemical effects.

4. Results

4.1. Concentrations and Distribution of Precursors

The calculated global average mixing ratios for HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123 between 1985 and 2010 are shown in Figure 5. We obtain values of 80 pptv for HFC-134a, 9.8 pptv for HCFC-124, and 1.1 pptv for HCFC-123 in 2010. Model-calculated lifetimes for HFC-134a, HCFC-124, and HCFC-123 are 14.4, 6.2, and 1.4 years, respectively. These are within the uncertainties of the latest recommendations for these species [IPCC, 1996; Prather and Spivakovsky, 1990].

The calculated surface distributions of HFC-134a for the year 2010 are shown for the month of July in Figure 6. The largest gradients are calculated near the equator and close to major sources. The southern hemisphere mixing ratios average 78 ppt during July (southern hemisphere winter) and the northern hemisphere mixing ratios average about 90 ppt. The January mixing ratios in the southern hemisphere (not shown here) are almost uniform at about 73 ppt and above 85 ppt in the northern hemisphere.

Figure 7 shows the calculated surface distribution of HCFC-
124 for the year 2010 for the month of July. The southern hemisphere mixing ratios are between 10 and 8 pptv for the winter months. Figure 8 shows the calculated surface distribution of HCFC-123 for the year 2010 for the months of July. HCFC-123 has a much shorter lifetime of 1.4 years, producing the largest gradients. The southern hemisphere mixing ratios are less than 1 ppt for July.

4.2. Distribution and Fate of CF$_3$C(O)X

Kinetic data [Wallington et al., 1992; Tuazon and Atkinson, 1993] indicate that the yields of CF$_3$COF from HCFC-124 and CF$_3$COC1 from HCFC-123 are close to 100% on mole basis, corresponding to 87 and 85% on a mass basis for 123 and 124, respectively. Figure 9 shows the calculated mass yields of CF$_3$COF from HFC-134a as a function of latitude and height. Each latitude point represents an average value for all the longitudes in that latitude/altitude level. Small yields of (~0.2) near the surface increase to larger yields (~0.8) in the upper troposphere. The calculated global-average mass yield of CF$_3$COF from HFC-134a was 0.37.

The surface distribution of CF$_3$COF (Figure 10a) shows higher mixing ratios in the tropical regions and near-source locations in western Europe and North America. The zonal mean cross section shows increasing mixing ratios with altitude. CF$_3$COF in the lower and middle troposphere is rapidly removed by hydrolysis in clouds resulting in lower mixing ratios. Figures 11a and 11b show the surface distribution of CF$_3$COC1 and its zonal average latitude-height distribution, respectively, for the month of July for the year 2010. The surface mixing ratio distribution of CF$_3$COC1 (Figure 11a) again shows features similar to those of CF$_3$COF, with maximum mixing ratios in near-source locations and in the subtropical regions. The zonal-mean cross section shows a similar behavior compared to CF$_3$COF. The mixing ratios decrease with altitude in the tropical and mid-latitude region up to a height of 700 mbar, corresponding to the maxima in cloud cover fraction climatology adopted by us. At altitudes from 700 mbar to the tropopause levels the mixing ratios increase. At altitudes corresponding to the stratosphere in the model, the mixing ratios decrease again, as the photolytic loss of CF$_3$COC1 starts controlling its distribution.

4.3. Deposition and Rainwater Concentrations of TFA

We consider two parameters which could be of interest in evaluating the effect of TFA on a given environment. These are (1) the deposition fluxes (mass/unit area) of TFA at a given location and (2) the concentration of TFA in rainwater ($r_{TFA}$). The deposition fluxes could be a useful input for estimates of accumulations of TFA over an extended period of time, particularly if we are interested in evaluating the input to a large stable water reservoir or soil. Concentrations of TFA in rainwater are more pertinent to evaluate the concentrations in "seasonal" water bodies produced each year exclusively by local rainfall and whose content is wholly determined by yearly rainfall and possible year-to-year accumulation [Tromp et al., 1995].

Table 2. Percent of CF$_3$C(O)X (Global Average by Mass) Lost Through Different Processes Modeled

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>CF$_3$C(O)F</th>
<th>CF$_3$C(O)Cl</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Photolysis</td>
<td>0.1%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surface deposition</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrolysis</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>93.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fluxes of TFA deposited by the washout process, accumulated over the period of simulation (1989–2010) in mg/m² are shown in Figure 12. Since most of the CF₃COX is formed from HFC/HCFCs in the tropical regions and CF₃COF is converted to TFA with a very short lifetime (local lifetimes of the order of hours), production of TFA maximizes in the tropics. Typical washout time constants in the tropics are 3 days. These time constants are much smaller than typical meridional transport time constants (weeks to months), and most of the TFA produced in the tropical regions is deposited in these regions. Figure 13 shows the cumulative amount of TFA deposited due to both the wet and the dry deposition processes, from 1985 to 2010. Comparison of Figure 13 and 12 indicates that our calculated dry deposition fluxes are of the order of 20% of the wet deposition fluxes.

Figure 14 shows the calculated annual average \( r_{TFA} \) concentrations (μg/L) for the year 2010. The rainwater concentration of TFA is defined as the ratio of total TFA deposition by washout over a grid box (liters/month) to the rainfall received in the grid box (liters/month). Thus \( r_{TFA} \) concentration may be inversely related to the rainfall received in a particular grid box. The maximum \( r_{TFA} \) concentrations are indeed found in the region close to maximum TFA production and receiving the least amount of rainfall. Region in southwestern United States and southern Europe have concentrations of up to 0.2 μg/L. However, as discussed below, the obtained distribution is not simply given by a balance of local production and washout of TFA; transport of precursors and gas phase, TFA also plays an important role. The global average \( r_{TFA} \) is 0.12 μg/L, and the subtropical and regions of western Asia have the highest \( r_{TFA} \) concentrations of up to 0.3 μg/L. The highest concentrations at any given location in the northern hemisphere were obtained for the month of July 2010: 0.45 μg/L at locations in southern Europe, 0.3 μg/L for most of North America and Europe, and up to 0.4 μg/L for parts of North America and southern Europe.

Because of the fairly long meridional transport time constants, 2-D model calculations have obtained concentrations of TFA in rainwater which can be approximately obtained by local balance between production and loss within a latitude band [Rodriguez et al., 1993]. This is not the case for the zonal asymmetries that show up in this CTM calculation. The annual average ratio of maximum \( r_{TFA} \) concentration obtained in a grid box to the global average \( r_{TFA} \) concentration of 0.12 μg/L for the year 2010 can be obtained from Figure 14. The maximum asymmetry is of the order of 2.5 and is obtained in western Asia. Concentrations in most of North America and southern Europe are up to a factor of 1.5 higher than the global average. In southwestern United States the \( r_{TFA} \) concentrations are up to a factor 2 higher than the global average concentrations. As a reference, Figure 15 shows the annual average rainfall amounts used in the simulation, scaled by the global mean and then inverted. In the absence of transport we would expect that the asymmetries in \( r_{TFA} \) would correlate to those in Figure 15. This is illustrated in Figure 16, which shows the calculated \( r_{TFA} \) concentrations asymmetries for a case in which the transport of TFA and CF₃COX was switched off. This results in \( r_{TFA} \) asymmetries which are in much better
agreement with the rainfall asymmetries. Thus inclusion of transport substantially “smoothes out” the asymmetries in $r_{TFA}$ expected from simple consideration of asymmetries in rainout and OH fields.

The competition between transport and local production removal in determining $r_{TFA}$ has an even larger impact on the expected variability of $r_{TFA}$ in a given geographical region. The $r_{TFA}$ concentrations calculated for the year 2010 in all the grid boxes of the model and for all the months of the year (36 longitude $\times$ 24 latitude $\times$ 12 months) are presented in the form of a box plot in Figure 17. The data were binned by the amount of rainfall received in mm/month. The vertical axis shows the concentrations of $r_{TFA}$ in $\mu g/L$. Although the median $r_{TFA}$ is fairly constant around 0.12 $\mu g/L$ for all the bins, the range in the $r_{TFA}$ concentrations at low levels of rainfall is larger compared to the bins with larger rainfall amounts. This reflects primarily the impact of transport when local removal time constants become small. We can thus expect the largest uncertainty in the calculation in regions, where many of the seasonal water bodies of concern are located. In these cases, resolution of synoptic variability in the transport is necessary for a better estimate.

5. Discussion of Uncertainties

Our approximations for both in-cloud hydrolysis and washout are very simplistic, assuming an average, continuous rate over the grid box, where in actuality these are sporadic events. A better approach would need to consider, for example, coupling to moist convection events and large-scale rain [Balkanskii et al., 1993]. Thus our calculations disregard the coupling between clouds, rainout, and transport. We have carried out limited simulations to study the sensitivity of our results to our assumption of continuous hydrolysis and washout rates versus episodic cloud and rain events as well as in-cloud residence time. By varying the cloud cover, residence time, and washout we can gain information as to the magnitude of the error introduced in this decoupling. Finally, we also consider the sensitivity to the large uncertainty in the removal rates at high latitudes as well as to the adopted concentrations of OH.

5.1. Sensitivity of TFA Production to Intermittent Cloud Cover

Observations indicate that on a global average, a given location on land can go completely cloud free between 17% and 19% of the time. Over oceans the completely cloud free time is observed to drop to 3% of the total time [Warren et al., 1986, 1988]. We performed numerical experiments, with cloud cover switched on for 24 hours every 4 days (75% cloud free) and every 7 days (85% cloud free). Loss frequencies for $CF_2C(O)X$ were, however, adjusted to yield the same average frequency over the whole period of time. All the simulations discussed below were performed for $CF_2COF$ produced from HFC-134a alone and for the year 2010 only.
In the subtropical regions, TFA production increases by an average of 30% with local increases of up to 50%. TFA production at middle and high latitudes changed by only a few percent. Thus the effect of intermittent cloud cover on annual average TFA production from the hydrolysis of CF$_3$COF can be expected to result in a maximum of 30% increase on a regional scale.

5.2. Sensitivity of TFA Washout to Intermittent Rain

The effect of intermittent rainfall on washout rates was investigated in detail by Giorgi and Chameides [1985], Thompson and Cicerone [1982], and Stewart et al. [1983] employing one-dimensional models. In general, it was noted that the increase in frequency of the rainfall shortens the washout lifetime of the species, and for the case of a highly soluble species, the washout rate is proportional to the rainfall frequency. Here rainfall frequency refers to the number of rainfall events occurring in a given time. The higher the frequency, the larger the number of rainfall events that occur, eventually leading to the continuous rainfall and continuous washout.

We studied the ratio of $r_{TF_A}$ obtained for the continuous rainfall case to a case where rain occurs once every 7 days for one full day. This is an extreme case. The washout rate and rain amount for the intermittent rainfall cases were adjusted such that the total rate for a particular month remains the same for all the cases. In locations (Indian Ocean and eastern Pacific regions) with the highest calculated $r_{TF_A}$, the new $r_{TF_A}$ goes up by as much as 30%. Increases of up to 20% are obtained in the northwestern location of South America, and up to 25% in the southwestern United States and southern Africa and China.

5.3. Sensitivity of $r_{TF_A}$ to in-Cloud Residence Time

We also examined the sensitivity of our calculations by increasing the in-cloud residence time (with a value of 1.2 hours) to 3 hours and decreasing it to 0.8 hours. The residence times will have 10–20% effect on $r_{TF_A}$ concentrations in locations receiving low rainfall (subtropical Asia, Africa, southwestern United States, and the northwestern location of South America). The effect on regions receiving high amounts of rainfall is less than 15%, and changes of the order of 1–5% were obtained over the rest of the domain.

5.4. Sensitivity of $r_{TF_A}$ to Washout South of 60°S

The washout rates from 45°S to 90°S were calculated on the basis of the climatology of Jaeger [1976]. However, values south of 60°S are very uncertain, in particular since it is difficult to distinguish between rain and snow. The influence of increased washout (rainfall) in this zonal region on $r_{TF_A}$ concentrations were examined by increasing the washout rate beyond 60°S by a factor of 2. Increasing rainfall in the southern latitudes will decrease $r_{TF_A}$ by 10% in some locations to the south of 60°S but has no significant effect over the rest of the model domain.

5.5. Sensitivity of $r_{TF_A}$ to OH Concentration

We also examined the sensitivity of our calculations to a 20% increase in the OH fields used for calculating the degradation of the TFA precursor HFC-134a. Results indicate that the lifetime of HFC-134a decreases by 16%, and the global average HFC-134a mixing ratios is reduced by 6% from the base case discussed in section 4. The global average $r_{TF_A}$ increases by 12%. Because of an increase in dry deposition over arid subtropical regions of Africa and Asia compared to the base case, local increases of the order of 2–10% are obtained in these regions.

5.6. Impact of Reduction in the TFA Yield From HFC-134a

As discussed above, recent experimental results reported by Wallington et al. [1996] suggest that the reaction of CF$_3$CFHO$_2$ with NO yields primarily vibrationally excited CF$_3$CHFO radicals. These radicals will undergo prompt thermal fission, unless they are thermalized by collisions with ambient molecules. The experiments suggest that about 40% of the excited CF$_3$CFHO$_2$ is thermalized. Since reaction with NO is expected to be primarily the channel for degradation of CF$_3$CFHO$_2$, these results suggest that the mass yield of CF$_3$C(O)F from HFC-134a is reduced from 37 to 15%.

The impact of these reductions on the total amount of TFA deposited will depend on the specific scenario adopted for the relative emissions of HCFC-123 and 124 and HFC-134a. For the scenario adopted in these calculations we estimate that the
calculated-global-averaged TFA concentrations in rainwater will decrease by 26%, i.e., from 0.12 to 0.09 g/L.

6. Conclusions

We have carried out simulations of the degradation of HFC-134a and HCFC-123 and HCFC-124, with emphasis on the production of TFA and its concentration in rainwater. The complicated degradation schemes for these precursors have been considerably simplified, taking advantage of the fact of the short chemical time constants of most intermediate species. We tested the sensitivity of the calculated rainwater concentration of TFA \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) to various parameterizations and approximations adopted in the model. Our limited sensitivity studies suggest that these approximations would not have a greater than 30% effect on the calculated \( r_{\text{TFA}} \).

Annual average \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) concentrations in the range of 0.15–0.2 \( \mu g/L \) were obtained for the year 2010 in the northern midlatitudes. The calculated \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) concentrations in July 2010 in parts of North America and southern Europe were found to be 0.3–0.45 \( \mu g/L \). Inclusion of a reduced yield for TFA formation from HFC-134a, suggested by Wallington et al. [1996], will reduce these numbers 26%. Dry deposition fluxes are on average about 20% of the wet deposition and about equal for and regions. In the absence of soil sinks, dry deposition could also contribute to accumulations in groundwater and seasonal water bodies. Assessment of this contribution would require a detailed hydrological model for the catch basins of interest.

Our simulations show the crucial role played by long-range zonal transport of gas phase TFA and \( CF_3C(O)X \) in smoothing out the chemical impact of asymmetries in the OH and rainfall fields. Transport effects become important when advective time constants become comparable to those of other transformation and deposition processes, a condition that is true most everywhere for gas phase TFA. Thus in spite of the short chemical time constants for hydrolysis and washout, simulation of the TFA distribution does require use of three-dimensional models. Transport processes are particularly important in regions, where removal rates are slower. Our results show that these regions exhibit the largest variance in the calculated \( r_{\text{TFA}} \).

The presented results here can be tested as measurements of TFA, and its precursors become available. The calculated mixing ratios of HCFC-124 and HCFC-123 for NH are 1.96 and 0.21, and global averages are 1.56 and 0.14 pptv, respectively, for July 1995. For the 1995 contributions of the three precursors to the total \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) in western Europe (0.014 \( \mu g/L \)) break down as follows: 57% from HCFC-124, 27% from HCFC-123, and 16% from HFC-134a. Thus in the short term the greatest impact on \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) could be from shorter-lived HCFC-124 and HCFC-123, and it is advisable to monitor their emissions.

Measurements of HFC-134a, starting from the year 1990 to 1995, were reported by Montzka et al. [1996] and Oram et al. [1996]. Montzka et al. [1996] report a mixing ratio of 2.33 pptv in the NH, 1.13 in the SH, and a global average mixing ratio of 1.73 pptv for the beginning of July 1995. The model-calculated mixing ratios for this period are 3.4 pptv for the NH, 1.48 pptv for the SH, and a global average of 2.44 pptv. This discrepancy is a reflection of the fact that this study used projected rather than actual emissions for this compound for the period of interest.

Measurements of TFA in natural water bodies and rainwater in the western United States were reported by Zehavi and Sieber [1996]. It is difficult to compare their measurements for natural waters, since we have not carried out a detailed study of the local chemistry, transport, and hydrology. Measured rainwater concentrations range from 0.03 to 0.09 \( \mu g/L \), a factor of 2–6 larger than our calculated values for the western United States in 1995 (0.015 \( \mu g/L \)). Measurements of \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) have been made at two locations in western Europe [Frank et al., 1996]. The measured \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) is in the range of 0.025–0.28 \( \mu g/L \) for the year 1995 at Bayreuth, Germany, and in the range of 0.04–0.08 \( \mu g/L \) at Zurich and Alpthal, Switzerland. The mean \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) for all the measurements is 0.1 \( \mu g/L \). The measured gas phase concentrations of TFA are of the order of 0.01 pptv. The gas phase TFA mixing ratios calculated in the present study are in the range of 0.007–0.005 pptv for western Europe for the year 1995. The calculated annual average \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) for the year 1995 is 0.014 \( \mu g/L \) in western Europe. These numbers would have to be rescaled when measurements of the precursors are available. In the case of HC 134a, this would imply a contribution of 0.0015 \( \mu g/Liter \), based on the measurements of Montzka et al. [1995]. Although no measurements for HCFC 123 and HCFC 124 are available, it is doubtful that the actual concentrations are higher than the calculated concentrations.

The higher \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) concentrations measured could be due to additional unknown sources as suggested by Frank et al. [1996]. We note, however, that given the limited number of samples collected and the large variability of the measurements, the reported concentrations cannot be considered a true mean for the region (i.e., our coarse grid box). Great caution should be exercised in comparing the calculated grid average concentrations and global average concentrations of \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) to a small number of local measurements. Given the sensitivity of the calculated present-day \( r_{\text{TFA}} \) to the amount HCFC-124 and HCFC-123 emitted, it would be of great value to measure these compounds in the atmosphere. A monitoring program for the concentrations of TFA and its precursors could help ascertain the actual variability of the rainwater concentrations.

Acknowledgments. This work was funded by the Alternative Fluorocarbon Environmental Acceptability Study (AFEAS) and by NASA’s Atmospheric Chemistry Modeling and Analysis Program (ACMAP). We also wish to acknowledge the support of ARC (Atmospheric Research Council) of CMA (Chemical Manufacturers Association) for funding the initial phases of 3-D model acquisition and implementation.

References


Exner, M., H. Herrmann, J. Michel, and R. Zellner, Hydrolysis rate of \( CF_3COF \) and the decarboxylation of \( CF_3COO^- \) anions, in AFEAS Workshop Proceedings: Atmospheric Wet and Dry Deposition of Car-


Franklin, J., The Atmospheric degradation and impact of 1,1,1,2-

Freiberg, J. E., and S. E. Schwartz, Oxidation of SO2 in aqueous

Hansen, J., G. Russell, D. Rind, P. Stone, A. Lacis, S. Lebedeff, R.

Intergovernmental Panel on Climate change (IPCC), Climate change 1995--Impacts, adaptations and mitigation of

George, C., J. L. Ponche, P. Mirabel, Experimental determination of

IPCC, Climate change 1995--Impacts, adaptations and mitigation of

Giorgi, F., and W. L. Chameides, The rainout parameterization in a

Jaeger, L., Selbstverlag des Deutschen Wetterdienstes, Ber. Dtsch. Wetter-

Kanakidou, M., F. J. Dentener, and P. J. Crutzen, A global three-

Jaeger, L. Monthly and areal patterns of mean global precipitation,

NASA, Report on concentrations lifetimes, and trends of CFCs,

Logan, J. A., M. J. Prather, S. C. Wofsy, and M. B. McElroy, Tropo-


Rattigan, O., R. A. Cox, and R. L. Jones, The UV absorption cross-


Wallington, T. J., M. D. Hurley, J. C. Bail, and E. W. Kaser, Atmospheric and Environmental Research, Inc., 840 Memorial Drive, Cambridge, MA 02139-3794. (e-mail: jose@aer.com)