Title
Genetic variation in circadian regulation of nocturnal stomatal conductance enhances carbon assimilation and growth

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/98j055fh

Authors
Resco de Dios, V
Loik, ME
Smith, R
et al.

Publication Date
2015

DOI
10.1111/pce.12598

Peer reviewed
Genetic variation in circadian regulation of nocturnal stomatal conductance enhances carbon assimilation and growth

Víctor Resco de Dios*1,2, Michael E. Loik3, Renee Smith1, Michael J. Aspinwall1 & David T. Tissue1

1Hawkesbury Institute for the Environment, University of Western Sydney, Richmond, New South Wales 2753, Australia, 2Department of Crop and Forest Sciences - AGROTECNIO Center, Universitat de Lleida, 25198 Lleida, Spain and 3Department of Environmental Studies, University of California, Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA

ABSTRACT

Circadian resonance, whereby a plant’s endogenous rhythms are tuned to match environmental cues, has been repeatedly shown to be adaptive, although the underlying mechanisms remain elusive. Concomitantly, the adaptive value of nocturnal transpiration in C3 plants remains unknown because it occurs without carbon assimilation. These seemingly unrelated processes are interconnected because circadian regulation drives temporal patterns in nocturnal stomatal conductance, with maximum values occurring immediately before dawn for many species. We grew individuals of six Eucalyptus camaldulensis genotypes in naturally lit glasshouses and measured sunset, predawn and midday leaf gas exchange and whole-plant biomass production. We tested whether sunrise anticipation by the circadian clock and subsequent increases in genotype predawn stomatal conductance led to rapid stomatal opening upon illumination, ultimately affecting genotype differences in carbon assimilation and growth. We observed faster stomatal responses to light inputs at sunrise in genotypes with higher predawn stomatal conductance. Moreover, early morning and midday stomatal conductance and carbon assimilation, leaf area and total plant biomass were all positively correlated with predawn stomatal conductance across genotypes. Our results lead to the novel hypothesis that genotypic variation in the circadian-regulated capacity to anticipate sunrise could be an important factor underlying intraspecific variation in tree growth.

Key-words: adaptation; anticipation hypothesis; biomass enhancement; circadian clock; CO2; gas exchange; genotype; memory; nocturnal transpiration; stomata.

INTRODUCTION

The circadian clock is an endogenous timer of metabolic processes that regulates transcriptional activity over time in the cells of plants and other organisms. There is ample evidence indicating that such circadian regulation is adaptive (Dodd et al. 2005; Johnson & Kyriacou 2006; Resco et al. 2009b; Yerushalmi & Green 2009; Vaze & Sharma 2013). Circadian resonance, whereby a plant’s endogenous rhythmicity is finely tuned to match environmental cues, leads to increased fitness, and, conversely, fitness suffers from increasing circadian dissonance (Went 1960; Green et al. 2002). However, understanding the processes by which circadian regulation confers a fitness advantage has proven more challenging. Earlier hypotheses discussed the role of circadian regulation in shifting photosynthetic processes, such as DNA replication or cell division, to the night-time period (‘escape from light’ hypothesis; Pittendrigh 1993) or the separation of mutually incompatible metabolic processes, such as photosynthesis and nitrogen fixation in cyanobacteria (Mitsui et al. 1986). Alternatively, the ‘anticipation’ hypothesis, whereby circadian regulation anticipates highly predictable environmental cues and prepares cellular metabolism accordingly, remains the most common explanation for the growth and fitness advantage provided by circadian clocks. However, direct tests of this hypothesis are rare (Goodspeed et al. 2012) and, as previously noted by Johnson & Kyriacou (2006), ‘like many other evolutionary ideas that are eminently reasonable – remains just a good idea’.

Circadian regulation, in conjunction with direct physiological responses to vapour pressure deficit and other environmental drivers, is involved in the exchange of water vapour and carbon dioxide between leaves and the atmosphere, through the regulation of stomatal conductance and photosynthesis (Hennessey et al. 1993; Resco de Dios et al. 2012). An unresolved question is whether circadian regulation, which enhances water loss throughout the night, could be adaptive because there is no carbon assimilation in the dark (Bucci et al. 2004; Dawson et al. 2007; Resco de Dios et al. 2013b). Indeed, the temporal pattern of nocturnal stomatal conductance, largely driven by circadian rhythms, is often characterized by decreased stomatal conductance in the first hours of darkness, followed by significant increases later in the night, and reaching a peak immediately before dawn (Hennessey et al. 1993; Resco de Dios et al. 2013a, 2015).

One of the mechanisms hypothesized to be involved in the endogenous rise of nocturnal conductance is the availability of starch because starch deficient Arabidopsis mutants did not show enhanced predawn stomatal conductance (Lasceve et al. 1997). Indeed, nocturnal stomatal conductance has been
reported to increase in response to elevated CO₂ (Zeppel et al. 2012), which is contrary to the daytime trend, and increases in starch availability under elevated CO₂ could be the mechanism underlying such positive response of nocturnal stomatal conductance to CO₂ (Easlon & Richards 2009). However, the generality of this observation is still under examination (Resco de Dios et al. 2013b), and recent studies question the relevance of carbohydrates for regulating the endogenous rise in stomatal conductance (Resco de Dios et al. 2015).

There is ample evidence of genetic variation in nocturnal stomatal conductance and transpiration within species (Christman et al. 2008; Phillips et al. 2010; Schroppach et al. 2014). The cause and fitness implications of intraspecific variation in nocturnal water use remain uncertain, but associations between circadian-regulated night-time water use, daytime gas exchange rates and plant fitness proxies across genotypes may provide insight into the mechanisms and evolutionary/ecological significance of variable nocturnal leaf gas exchange within species.

Here, we tested whether circadian increases in predawn stomatal conductance promote increased carbon assimilation and enhanced growth across six different Eucalyptus camaldulensis genotypes. We first tested whether the different genotypes varied in predawn stomatal conductance. We then hypothesized that genotype predawn conductance would be positively correlated with daytime stomatal conductance (Christman et al. 2008; Drake et al. 2013) and that the time to respond to early morning radiation inputs would be shorter when stomata are ‘primed’ prior to sunrise. Finally, we tested whether genotypic variation in stomatal priming was related to genotype fitness by examining the relationship between genotype predawn conductance and three fitness proxies: carbon assimilation, leaf area and total biomass. Experiments were conducted under two CO₂ concentrations (ambient and elevated), to test whether higher predawn conductance under elevated CO₂ is correlated with changes in the availability of carbohydrates (Easlon & Richards 2009; Zeppel et al. 2012). Although environmental conditions of CO₂ or other environmental drivers may alter the magnitude of nocturnal conductance (Barbour & Buckley 2007, Rosado et al. 2012), its temporal pattern and predawn values are driven by circadian regulation (Hennessey et al. 1993; Resco de Dios et al. 2013a, 2015).

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Plants and growing conditions**

Seedlings from six different genotypes of E. camaldulensis ssp. camaldulensis were prepared from clonal hedges by the Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organization (see Supporting Information Table S1 for full details on provenances). The hedges were half-sib seedlings originating from provenances representing different geographic and climatic origins. After reaching an average height of 24.6 cm (±0.97; SE) and a basal diameter of 1.86 mm (±0.07), genotypes were transplanted into 6.9 L cylindrical pots and grown at the naturally lit (with 20% reduction of incident radiation) glasshouse facilities of the University of Western Sydney in Richmond, New South Wales, in south-eastern Australia. Each pot contained 7.5 kg of coarse-textured soil (supplied by the Australian Native Landscape, Richmond NSW, Australia), with a pH of 6.5. To ensure that no nutrient limitations occurred, the plants were fertilized every fortnight with a commercial liquid fertilizer (500 mL Aquasol, at 1.6 g L⁻¹; 23% N, 4% P, 18% K, 0.05% Zn, 0.06% Cu, 0.013% Mo, 0.15% Mn, 0.06% Fe and 0.011% B; Yates Australia, Padstow, NSW, Australia). Plants were grown in ambient (400 µmol mol⁻¹) or elevated (640 µmol mol⁻¹) CO₂ concentrations and were randomly assigned to one of two glasshouse bays per CO₂ treatment, within a randomized block design. Pots were rotated between (monthly) and within (weekly) glasshouse bays to further reduce potential glasshouse bay effects on plant performance. Air temperatures (25±17 °C, average day:night) and relative humidity (45:60%) were representative of average summer values in Richmond. The pots were daily watered to field capacity (until water drained from the bottom of the pot). Further details on glasshouse design and set-up are given by Ghannoum et al. (2010). No differences in height and diameter occurred between genotypes at experiment initiation [with $P > 0.05$, analysis of variance (ANOVA)].

**Measurements and statistical analyses**

Leaf gas exchange was measured with four cross-calibrated portable photosynthesis systems (LI-6400XT, Li-Cor Inc., Lincoln, NE, USA) 2 months after treatments were started in the glasshouse. Nocturnal gas exchange was measured during periods of 1 h centred at 2230 h (early night) and 0345 h (predawn). Natural dawn and dusk occurred at approximately 0600 and 1800 h, respectively. Conditions inside the LI-6400XT cuvettes were set to match the growth conditions previously described. Importantly, there were no significant differences in relative humidity [ANOVA, degrees of freedom (d.f.) = 1, 46, $F = 1.91$, $P = 0.17$], temperature [ANOVA, d.f. = 1, 46, $F = 1.91$, $P = 0.17$] or vapour pressure deficit [ANOVA, d.f. = 1, 46, $F = 1.25$, $P = 0.27$] in the glasshouses during periods when ‘early night’ and ‘predawn’ measurements were conducted. Genetic variation in nocturnal conductance was assessed by linear mixed models that included sampling time, CO₂ concentrations, genotype (with $n = 3$–6 in each combination) and their interactions as fixed variables, and with glasshouse bay nested within CO₂ concentration as random variables. These analyses were performed after examining whether the data conformed to assumptions of homoscedasticity and normality.

To test relationships between nocturnal and early morning stomatal conductance, we monitored gas exchange briefly after dawn by logging, every 15 s, the responses to 300 µmol m⁻² s⁻¹ of photosynthetically active radiation (PAR) during 5 min and the subsequent responses at 800 µmol m⁻² s⁻¹ PAR for 5 more minutes. While 5 min is generally not sufficient for steady-state stomatal responses, it is sufficient to test hypotheses regarding the time to react, and values should be correlated with those at steady state. We established whether stomatal priming led to higher early morning stomatal conductance by correlating predawn values with the maximum values at each PAR level, using mixed models that included CO₂ concentration as a random factor.

To test whether stomatal priming would also lead to faster stomatal responses, we calculated the time constant (τ, the time to reach 63% \([1 - e^{-1}]\) of the maximum response at each PAR level; Woodward 1987) and determined its relationship with predawn stomatal values using mixed models that included CO2 concentration as a random factor. PAR for gas exchange measurements was provided by the red–blue light-emitting diodes of the LI-6400XT (with a 7–13% blue fraction, according to the manufacturer).

To examine the relationships between genotype stomatal conductance and growth, we developed mixed-model regressions of genotype predawn conductance as a function of total plant carbon assimilation (also measured in the early morning) and total plant leaf area and biomass. These analyses included CO2 concentration as a random factor.

Total plant leaf area was determined during harvest using a leaf area metre (LI-3100C, Li-Cor Inc.), and whole-plant gas exchange was determined by multiplying leaf carbon assimilation by total plant leaf area, assuming a ‘big leaf’ model structure. It is well known that big leaf scaling approaches are fairly limited, especially within complex canopies, given that leaf gas exchange is heterogeneous within canopies and varies as a function of factors such as leaf position or age (De Pury & Farquhar 1997), and this variation could also be under genetic control. These problems would have been minimized within our design, because the plants were less than 3 months old, and little time had elapsed for complexity in the canopy structure to be developed.

Total biomass (including above-ground and below-ground) was collected 2 weeks after gas exchange measurements and determined after oven drying until constant mass (48 h at 70 °C). Immediately after removing leaves for measurements of leaf area, the stem was cut and dried prior to assessing its biomass. The soil was then washed, and a 3 mm sieve was used to preserve the fine roots. Roots were subsequently dried and weighed. Although extreme care was taken to minimize root losses, we acknowledge some root biomass may have been lost using this technique. However, all plants were treated the same way, and any mass losses originating from this technique would have affected equally all plants, regardless of their genotype or CO2 growth concentration.

Based on the results from this correlative approach, and as a further complement to those results, we employed a path model to directly test for the hypothesized mechanisms underlying relationships between predawn stomatal conductance and biomass (Wright 1934). While correlative approaches allow us to test for the significance of relationships between two variables, with path models, we were able to directly assess the significance of the hypothesized mechanisms across more complex routes. The potential routes to be tested included direct effects of predawn stomatal conductance on the values of early morning stomatal conductance and on the time for stomata to respond, which, in turn, would affect early morning carbon assimilation that would affect whole-plant biomass.

We additionally measured the concentration of soluble carbohydrates and starch to understand their relationship with potential CO2 effects on stomatal conductance. A 1 cm² round piece of leaf was collected at dusk and flash frozen in liquid nitrogen and analysed following previously described methods (Mitchell et al. 2013).

All analyses were performed in the R software environment using base packages, lme4 (Bates et al., 2014), car (Fox & Weisberg 2011), influence.ME (Nieuwhuis et al. 2012) and lavaan (Rosseel 2012). \(R^2\) in mixed models was computed following Nakagawa & Schielzeth (2014).

**RESULTS**

Night-time stomatal conductance was higher at predawn than at early night (Fig. 1 and Table 1), and there was significant variation in nocturnal stomatal conductance across genotypes. While there was no CO2 effect and no CO2 × genotype interaction, there was a significant time × CO2 interaction, such that conductance was higher under elevated CO2 but only at predawn (Fig. 1a and Table 1). The effect of CO2 on nocturnal stomatal conductance was not driven by carbohydrate availability, as we observed no CO2 effect on starch, soluble sugars or total non-structural concentrations (only total non-structural carbohydrates shown, Table 1).

Genotypic variation in predawn (but not in early night) stomatal conductance was associated with subsequent daytime processes. For instance, genotype predawn stomatal conductance was strongly associated with early morning stomatal conductance and assimilation at both PAR levels and across CO2 treatments (linear mixed model, \(P < 0.01\), \(0.35 \leq R^2 \leq 0.37\), Fig. 2). However, there was no relationship between genotype stomatal conductance in the early night and stomatal conductance and assimilation in the early morning (linear mixed model, \(P \geq 0.13\).

\(\tau\) showed a negative correlation with predawn stomatal conductance (linear mixed model, \(P = 0.04\), \(R^2 = 0.3\), Fig. 3a), indicating that the response time to morning light decreased as predawn conductance increased. Moreover, genotypes with more rapidly opening stomata (smaller \(\tau\) had higher leaf carbon assimilation (linear mixed model, \(P < 0.0001\), \(R^2 = 0.60\), Fig. 3b).

Concomitantly, genotypes with higher predawn stomatal conductance showed significantly higher plant carbon assimilation (linear mixed model, \(P < 0.0001\), \(R^2 = 0.67\)), as well as significantly higher leaf area (linear mixed model, \(P = 0.033\), \(R^2 = 0.29\)) and marginally significant higher plant biomass (linear mixed model, \(P = 0.098\), \(R^2 = 0.19\), Fig. 4). However, there was no significant relationship between genotype early night stomatal conductance and morning carbon assimilation, or leaf area (linear mixed model, \(P > 0.4\)).

Finally, the path model (Fig. 5) indicated that the mechanism explaining the higher biomass for genotypes with higher predawn stomatal conductance was associated with the effect of predawn stomatal conductance on early morning conductance (at \(P < 0.10\)). Additionally, we also observed that the relationship between predawn stomatal conductance and early morning assimilation was mediated by \(\tau\) (\(P < 0.05\)). In turn, this early morning increase in carbon assimilation led to higher biomass (\(P < 0.05\)).
DISCUSSION

We observed genetic correlations between nocturnal stomatal conductance and genotype fitness, quantified as morning carbon assimilation, leaf area and biomass, in *E. camaldulensis* (Figs 4 and 5). These relationships between nocturnal stomatal responses and carbon metabolism were only apparent for conductance at predawn (Figs 2 and 3), but not at early night (Supporting Information Fig. S1). The stronger relationships between predawn and daytime processes (rather than early night and daytime processes) indicate that it is not nocturnal conductance *per se* that affects daytime responses, but rather the magnitude of nocturnal conductance immediately prior to dawn. The temporal pattern of nocturnal stomatal conductance is predominantly driven by circadian regulation, which leads to gradual increases in stomatal conductance through the night period (Hennessey *et al.* 1993; Resco de Dios *et al.* 2013a, 2015). It thus follows that strong circadian regulation, with increasing stomatal conductance until predawn, fostered higher daytime carbon assimilation and plant growth in *E. camaldulensis*, consistent with the anticipation hypothesis.

© 2015 John Wiley & Sons Ltd, *Plant, Cell & Environment*
Circadian regulation of nocturnal conductance and plant fitness

The circadian clock is known to ‘orchestrate’ the temporal pattern of transcription (Michael et al. 2008). Indeed, important differences in the transcriptome of wild-type Arabidopsis, relative to those in arrhythmic mutants where circadian regulation has been impaired, were observed 1 h before dawn, and those included differences in the activation state of genes related to abscissic acid and stomatal behaviour (Legnaioli et al. 2009). Additionally, circadian rhythms in root hydraulic conductivity could also provide the mechanistic basis for the endogenous rise in predawn stomatal opening (Caldeira et al. 2014). Here, we show that the capacity of the stomata to anticipate sunrise then fostered stomatal responses to morning light, decreased diffusion limitations to photosynthesis and, ultimately, was genetically correlated with enhanced growth.

Many previous studies have documented that circadian resonance increases fitness (Dodd et al. 2005; Yerushalmi & Green 2009; Yerushalmi et al. 2011), and these studies had attributed, but not directly tested, that such increases in fitness were dominated by the clock-driven capacity for anticipating environmental cues. As far as we are aware, our genetic correlations may provide some of the first direct evidence linking this circadian-driven stomatal ‘anticipation’ (i.e. opening before dawn) with fitness (as indicated by C assimilation, leaf area and biomass). Circadian regulation is demonstrated by self-sustained oscillations with a 24 h period, a step we did not take here because our previous work demonstrated that circadian regulation was the main driver of predawn values of stomatal conductance (Resco de Dios et al. 2013b, 2013a, 2015).

We move beyond previous studies that showed that the level of predawn conductance was related to early morning conductance (Drake et al. 2013), by additionally showing that the time for stomata to respond to light inputs is also related to predawn conductance, and that this process increases carbon assimilation across genotypes. This observation could provide a mechanistic explanation for previous studies where relationships between nocturnal water loss and traits that confer fast growth had been observed across multiple species (Daley & Phillips 2006; Marks & Lechowicz 2007; Rohula et al. 2014) or across multiple genotypes within a given species (Christman et al. 2008).

More detailed studies will be needed to describe the mechanisms underlying the observed genetic correlations between predawn stomatal conductance, early morning photosynthesis and total plant leaf area and biomass. In particular, the link between early morning photosynthesis and biomass is based on correlations and should be considered as a hypothesis requiring further testing (Fig. 5). For example, early morning photosynthesis may have a limited impact on whole-day C gain,
and early morning assimilation may be correlated with assimilation at other times. In addition to ‘stomatal priming’ mechanism leading to more responsive (after sunset) stomata and to an enhancement of C gain, stomatal priming could also be part of a trait syndrome that confers enhanced growth and indirectly increases plant fitness. At any rate, we have shown that variation in stomatal priming is an important factor underlying intraspecific variation in growth. 

In response to a decrease in predawn relative humidity, Auchincloss et al. (2014) observed a decline in predawn stomatal conductance, but no change in subsequent daytime carbon assimilation in sunflower. The authors interpreted this result as proof that predawn stomatal regulation does not affect early morning photosynthesis; however, our results provide an alternative explanation to this finding. The circadian clock regulates the temporal pattern of transcription based on the conditions experienced in the previous days (Graf et al. 2010). Therefore, the application of a ‘pulse’ of low relative humidity, which leads to immediate reductions in predawn stomatal conductance, would not have altered circadian regulation. The stomata exposed to low humidity would have been pre-conditioned to respond to early morning radiation inputs and would have done so at the same rate as stomata exposed to high humidity, following the removal of the environmental constraint of high vapour pressure deficit.
CO₂ effects on nocturnal stomatal conductance

The positive effect of CO₂ growth concentration on stomatal conductance was only significant at predawn (Table 1 and Fig. 1). Earlier work hypothesized that the positive effect of CO₂ on stomatal conductance, when occurring, could be attributed to increases in carbohydrate concentrations, as carbohydrates provide some of the osmotictant and C-skeletons for ATP production necessary to regulate stomatal opening (Easlon & Richards 2009). However, we are not aware of previous studies directly testing this hypothesis by measuring carbohydrate concentrations and nocturnal conductance under elevated CO₂. Our data did not support this hypothesis because we did not observe a change in carbohydrate concentrations under elevated CO₂. Alternative mechanisms could be driving this response, including changing stomatal sensitivities to abscisic acid under elevated CO₂ (Levine et al. 2009).

Implications and outlook

Eucalyptus camaldulensis is a riverine species, with relatively low values of nocturnal conductance, compared with species from drier environments. We did not have enough data to meaningfully test for associations between water availability at the genotype’s origin and nocturnal conductance. However, it is tempting to hypothesize that our findings provide an explanation for a major conundrum in nocturnal water research, which is why the rates of nocturnal conductance and water loss are typically highest (up to 25% of daytime water loss or more) in species growing in deserts (Ogle et al. 2012), savannas (Ogle et al. 2012) and Mediterranean ecosystems (Barbeta et al. 2012), which are some of the driest environments on Earth. The period for carbon assimilation in C₃ or C₄ plants in water-limited ecosystems is very narrow, typically only a few hours in the early morning, before the daily onset of strongly desiccating atmospheric conditions (Huxman et al. 2004; Resco et al. 2009a). Therefore, it would be adaptive to have high predawn stomatal conductance in water-limited ecosystems, which would lead to rapid stomatal response to early morning light coincident with lower vapour pressure deficit; this strategy would maximize carbon assimilation before environmental conditions cause stomatal closure. Although E. camaldulensis grows in riparian environments, seedlings lacking groundwater access will still be exposed to intermittency of water availability.

Perhaps the next major challenge will be to understand why predawn stomatal conductance varies amongst genotypes and species, instead of being always high, and whether this is due to differences in the strength of clock regulation, the degree of clock resonance or local site factors. Differences in circadian period and intensity have often been related to differences in photoperiod. Genotypes of E. camaldulensis came from different provenances (Supporting Information Table S1), and the distance between provenances may have been large enough to drive major clinal variation in photoperiod (Hut et al. 2013). Moreover, variation in the perception of blue light across genotypes may have contributed to the predawn stomatal response as well (Taiz & Zeiger 2006).

It is important to note that high nocturnal conductance may conflict with other demands for water during the night. Decreasing nocturnal conductance and water loss are necessary to reduce xylem tension and thus favour leaf expansion and growth (Müller et al. 2014), stem refilling and cavitation repair (Daley & Phillips 2006) and hydraulic lift (Neumann et al. 2014). Additionally, increasing nocturnal water use may decrease daytime water availability. Future work could address how these multiple trade-offs for water allocation overnight interact across genotypes and species, ultimately affecting fitness across a wide range of environmental stress intensities and types.

More broadly, the finding that genotypes with higher predawn conductance show higher daytime gas exchange and productivity may represent an important mechanism by which intraspecific variation in plant growth occurs, where genetic variation in the capacity for anticipating sunrise would be an important trait underlying differences in C uptake and growth. This novel hypothesis on the mechanisms driving intraspecific variation deserves further testing. Our results thus contribute to the up and coming field of ecological memory (Ogle et al. 2015), by demonstrating the selective advantage of plants using information from the recent past to prepare plant metabolism to respond to predictable changes in the environment.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We gratefully acknowledge funding from the Australian Science Industry and Endowment Fund (SIEF grant RP04-122) to D.T., a Ramón y Cajal Fellowship to V.R.D. (RYC-2012-10970) and a Research Exchange Program Grant from the Hawkesbury Institute for the Environment at the University of Western Sydney to M.L. We remain indebted to comments from T. O’Grady, J. Voltas, J.G. Alday, R. Norby, K. Mott and an anonymous reviewer on earlier versions of this manuscript and to G.D. Farquhar, S.G. Southerton, M. Battaglia, L. Pinkard and the full team behind the SIEF grant.

REFERENCES


**Fig. S1.** Early night stomatal conductance ($g_s$) is not positively correlated with the maximum $g_s$ (a, b) and carbon assimilation ($A$, c, d) measured in response to 300 (b, d) and 800 $\mu$mol m$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$ (a, c) of photosynthetically active radiation in the early morning. Values indicate the mean ($n=4$, ±SE) for each genotype under each CO$_2$ concentration. $P$-values reflect the results of Wald tests on linear mixed model that included CO$_2$ concentrations as a random factor.

**Table S1:** Origin for each of the six genotypes of Eucalyptus camaldulensis used in this study.