STUBBORN, GREENING, and RELATED DISEASES

J. M. Bové and P. Saglio

Stubborn disease has been increasingly studied in the last 10 years, but it still remains one of the major threats to citrus (2, 33). Most studies have dealt with transmission and indexing of the disease, culminating in the demonstration that very young leaves from affected seedlings were good sources of the pathogen that was causing high percentages of infection. This finding suggested that the stubborn pathogen was present in the functioning phloem of young, growing leaves (3), and opened the way for further studies on phloem as a favorable site for the causal agent.

With the discovery of mycoplasmalike bodies in the phloem tissues of plants affected by diseases hitherto considered to be virus maladies (10), the possibility emerged that these microorganisms, rather than virus particles or infectious nucleic acid molecules, represented a new class of causal agents of yellows-type diseases of plants.

It is known that plants affected by stubborn disease show a number of symptoms characteristic of both yellows and greening disease. Similarities between stubborn and greening diseases have often been stressed (3). Transmission patterns of the pathogens of the two diseases are also similar. Thus several lines of evidence, including symptomatology, phloem tissues as the site of the pathogen, and failure to find virus particles in the affected plants, prompted the search for mycoplasmalike bodies (MLB) in plants affected by stubborn and greening.

MYCOPLASMALIKE BODIES IN SIEVE TUBES OF PLANTS AFFECTED BY STUBBORN AND GREENING

Mycoplasmalike bodies were first described in the sieve tubes of greening-affected plants (21). It was soon realized that these structures were more filamentous than were ordinary MLB (22) and later their envelope was found to be 150 to 250 Å wide—too large to be a simple-unit membrane (30). These structures were observed not only with South Africa greening disease, but also in association with Reunion greening and India citrus decline (22), Philippines leaf mottling (30) (fig. 1), and Taiwan likubin (5).

The appearance of their envelope system, which resembles a wall (31), makes it difficult to consider the greening structures as representative of the Mycoplasmatales. They might very well represent a new type of phytopathogen (23).

The association of MLB with greening immediately suggested treatment of diseased trees with tetracyclines. Injections of antibiotics in the trunks of greening-affected trees were started with apparently beneficial effects (34).

Mycoplasmalike bodies were also observed in the phloem elements of citrus seedlings affected with stubborn disease
Fig. 1. Mycoplasmalike structures in the sieve tubes of Madam Vinous sweet orange seedlings infected with stubborn strain C 189, compared with structures observed in phloem elements of sweet orange seedlings infected with greening (South Africa), citrus decline (India), leaf mottling (Philippines), and Reunion greening (Reunion).
(19, 20). These findings were confirmed by Laflèche and Bové (22). In 1971, Zelcer et al. (35) showed the association of MLB with little-leaf disease of citrus in Israel. In doing so they added one more argument in favor of the common identity of stubborn disease and little leaf.

A clear-cut difference exists between the MLB associated with stubborn and the structures observed in greening; the former are surrounded by a true-unit membrane approximately 100 Å thick, similar to that of true mycoplasmas, whereas the latter have an envelope system twice as thick, suggesting the presence of a cell wall in addition to a cytoplasmic unit membrane (31) (fig. 1). By the end of 1970 the first experimental evidence was obtained showing that the causal agents of stubborn and greening were not viruses but MLB or phloem-confined microorganisms. That the etiological agent in both diseases appeared to be a microorganism could easily explain the long-noted similarities between the two diseases. It may also explain the differences, since the respective causal microorganisms also differ from one another. To fully ascertain the role of microorganisms in the etiology of stubborn and greening, it will be necessary to cultivate them.

**ISOLATION AND CULTIVATION OF MLB ASSOCIATED WITH STUBBORN DISEASE**

By 1970, survival and perhaps even multiplication of plant mycoplasmas in liquid medium had been inferred from indirect evidence (4, 14). Claims for isolation and cultivation of these organisms, however, were not sufficiently substantiated by the published evidence (7, 18, 24, 26).

In attempts to isolate and cultivate the agent associated with stubborn disease, great care was given to the choice of plant material. Very young, but not mature, citrus leaves, from greenhouse-grown, stubborn-affected sweet orange seedlings were the favored tissues for transmitting the stubborn pathogen (3). The number of MLB in the sieve tubes of such leaves was also much higher when seedlings were grown at 32°C than when grown at 24°C (22). The specific effect of high temperatures on expression of stubborn symptoms was noted earlier (1, 27).

Using very young leaves from stubborn-affected Madam Vinous sweet orange seedlings grown at 32°C for 16 hrs and 27°C for 8 hrs, Saglio et al. (29, 30) were able to isolate and grow a mycoplasmalike organism in liquid broth as well as on solid medium. Their conclusion that the cultured mycoplasma was not the result of contamination by an animal or human mycoplasma was based on the following: (1) the organism was obtained only from stubborn-affected citrus leaves, never from similar healthy control leaves growing next to diseased material; (2) the organism was consistently isolated and grown in 17 independent experiments with stubborn-affected leaves, but not in 11 experiments with healthy material (30) (22 out of 28 experiments finally gave positive results (31)); (3) uninoculated liquid or solid media controls never showed any signs of microbial growth; and (4) the optimal growth of the isolated organisms was close to 32°C, clearly different from that of animal mycoplasmas.

Concurrently, workers in California isolated and grew a MLB from stubborn-affected young leaves of Madam Vinous sweet orange seedlings (11, 12). They reported the same small, fried egg-type colonies (diam 0.1–0.2 mm) similar to those described by Saglio et al. (29, 30). In California, however, cultures also contained spherical cells of undetermined relationship, averaging 0.6μ diam and enclosed temporarily in wall-like coatings 55–90 nm thick.
A pure culture of the MLB was also obtained from aborted seeds of diseased fruits of various citrus cultivars (12).

The MLB grown by Saglio et al. (29) were isolated from Madam Vinous sweet orange seedlings affected by a California isolate of stubborn (C 189) supplied by Dr. E. C. Calavan, and was the same isolate used by the California group (12). A MLB was also isolated from stubborn-affected, field-grown Washington navel trees in the Tadla area of Morocco (strain R8 A2) (30, 31).

The belief that both the California and Morocco isolates were mycoplasmas was based on the fried egg colony morphology on agar, ultrastructure of the organisms, their resistance to penicillin and sensitivity to tetracyclines, the absence of reversion to walled forms after 10 passages in penicillin-free medium, and isolation and cultivation in the total absence of any antibiotic (12, 30, 31).

CHARACTERIZATION OF THE MICROORGANISM ASSOCIATED WITH STUBBORN

It was found necessary to further characterize the microorganisms isolated from stubborn-affected plants serologically, biochemically, biophysically, and ultrastructurally. This characterization revealed that the stubborn organism possesses unique properties which justify its designation as Spiroplasma citri, a new genus and species.

So far we have not been able to cultivate the structures associated with greening disease by using the same techniques and media as those used for stubborn. Ghosh et al. (13) report having succeeded in growing the greening organism. Published evidence does not yet support this claim.

Morphology. One of the most striking properties of the stubborn organism is its morphology in liquid culture. The structures are essentially filamentous, with a beaded appearance at various places (12, 31). Filaments were sometimes seen to be connected to irregularly shaped main bodies (12). Branching of filaments was also observed (12, 31). Recent studies show the filaments to be helical in form, and motile (6). The helices can be seen by dark-field microscopy of living preparations (fig. 2A) and

Fig. 2. Helical morphology of the stubborn organism in liquid culture as seen by: (A) dark-field microscopy; (B) preparations negatively stained with ammonium molybdate; (C) electron microscopy of freeze-dried preparations.
Fig. 3. Helical morphology of the stubborn organism in sieve tubes of an affected sweet orange seedling.
by electron microscopy of freeze-dried preparations (fig. 2C) and of those negatively stained with ammonium molybdate (fig. 2B). Ammonium molybdate preserves the helicity, while phosphotungstic acid does not (6). The helical filaments are similar in appearance to those observed previously in juice expressed from stunt-affected corn plants (8). Helical filaments have been detected within the sieve tubes of thick ultrathin sections of stubborn-affected citrus material (fig. 3). Some indication of helicity can be seen in previous electron micrographs. Comparing the stubborn structures with those present in greening-affected phloem tissues, the former were described as being “sinusoidal” (32, plate 11 B). The presence of helical filaments both in culture and in situ within the sieve tubes of diseased material is one of the strongest arguments for believing that the cultured organism is from the diseased plant. Except for the corn stunt agent, no other helical MLB have been described.

**Motility.** The helical filaments show two types of motility (6), a rapid rotary motion and a slow undulation and bending of filaments. The organism has no flagella, axial filaments, or other organelles that might account for its motility. The capacity of the organism for independent motion is unexplained.

**Ultrastructure.** Previous studies showed that the stubborn organism was bounded by a cytoplasmic unit membrane without a definite cell wall (12, 29, 30). More recently, negatively-stained preparations have shown that the organism has a layer of surface projections adhering to the cytoplasmic membrane (nap) (6). This nap has some resemblance to the outer surface of the triple-layered outer envelope (perioplast) that surrounds the protoplasmic cylinder of many spirochetes. The analogy with the spirochetes can be extended further. Filaments have been observed on which certain regions were free of both the outer nap and an innermost layer, exposing what could be remnants of the protoplasmic cylinder associated with spirochetes.

It should be added at this point that the stubborn organism has been found to be gram-positive (32), whereas all members of the Mycoplasmatales have hitherto been found to be gram-negative.

**Bacteriophage infection.** Both the California and Morocco strains of the stubborn agent isolated in Bordeaux have been shown to be infected with a tailed bacteriophage of type B morphology (fig. 4) (6). The phage was seen in the cultures after 21 serial passages. Subcultures cultured in Bethesda continued to show abundant phage for about 10 passages. After 50 more passages, however, phage could not be detected in either culture at Bethesda or Bordeaux. The phage was especially common in the Morocco strain. Complete phage occurred either free or attached to filaments. Within filaments or within round bodies, it was seen to be incomplete (empty heads). Polyheaded tubules were also detected. The phage head was usually hexagonal in profile, and measured 47–50 nm in its greatest diameter.

Fig. 4. Features of the bacteriophage associated with *Spiroplasma citri.*
The phage tail was unsheathed, apparently noncontractile, measured 75 to 85 nm in length and was 8 nm wide. A slightly wider base plate was present from which an undefined number of short filaments or spikes appeared to originate.

The presence of classic, tailed bacteriophage attaching to and developing within the stubborn organism is completely new for mycoplasmas. Among mycoplasmas, only a few viruses of entirely different morphology have been described (15, 16, 17, 25, 28).

Serology. Growth inhibition, metabolic inhibition, and plate immunofluorescence antibody tests were used to serologically identify the stubborn organism (31, 32). They showed that: (1) the California and Morocco strains are closely related serologically; and (2) none of the antisera to over 50 human or animal mycoplasmas either inhibited growth or stained colonies of the two stubborn strains. The absence of a serological relationship between the stubborn organism and known human or animal mycoplasmas is further proof that the cultured organism is not a contamination.

GROWTH CHARACTERISTICS

Optimum temperature for growth was found to be 32°C. Broth and agar media used to isolate and obtain pure cultures of the California and Morocco isolates were conventional mycoplasma media containing yeast extract and 20 per cent (v/v) foal serum, to which sorbitol 7 per cent (w/v), tryptone 1 per cent (w/v), sucrose 1 per cent (w/v), fructose 0.1 per cent (w/v) and glucose 0.1 per cent (w/v) were added (sorbitol medium, or SMC). The stubborn organisms grew well on this medium, but growth was dependent on the presence of serum (32). When serum was replaced by albumin (0.5 per cent), 10 mg/ml palmitic acid, and 0.01 per cent Tween 80, no growth occurred unless cholesterol was added (32). Cholesterol in amounts of 5 to 10 µg/ml enhanced growth; larger amounts (20 µg/ml) were inhibitory. Fudl-Allah et al. (12) also obtained excellent results with a slightly modified SMC medium.

Fried egg colonies were obtained with both strains when the broth cultures were transferred to SMC agar plates. Growth on solid media always seemed greater when the plates were maintained in an anaerobic environment (5 per cent CO₂ in nitrogen). Walled bacterial forms were not observed even after 50 passages in broth or agar in the absence of penicillin. Failure to revert to bacterial form, and the need for cholesterol argue against classification of the stubborn organism as an L-phase variant.

EFFECT OF ANTIBIOTICS AND OTHER CHEMICALS

Both the California and Morocco strains showed the same reaction to antibiotics and other chemicals (32). Both were resistant to penicillin, but highly sensitive to tetracycline. Amphotericin B at concentrations of 20 µg/ml or higher gave 90 per cent inhibition, an effect that seems to be in agreement with the sterol requirement of the organisms.

Both California and Morocco strains of the stubborn organisms were sensitive to 5 per cent sodium polyanethol sulfonate. Concentrations of digitonin at, or above, 30 µg/ml inhibited growth.

BIOCHEMICAL AND BIOLOGICAL PROPERTIES

Table 1 summarizes results from various biochemical and biological tests. Identical reactions were recorded for both strains of the stubborn organisms with one exception: The California strain hemadsorbed some guinea pig
TABLE 1
BIOLOGICAL AND BIOCHEMICAL PROPERTIES OF THE CALIFORNIA AND MOROCCO STRAINS OF SPIROPLASMA CITRI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test</th>
<th>California strain</th>
<th>Morocco strain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dextrose fermentation (acid)</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mannose fermentation</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arginine hydrolysis</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urea hydrolysis</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemolysis (guinea pig RBC)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hemadsorption (guinea pig RBC)</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phosphatase activity</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesculin fermentation</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tetrazolium reduction</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serum digestion</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film and spots</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cholesterol requirement</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pigmented carotenoids</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broth cultures</td>
<td>Both produced marked turbidity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agar cultures</td>
<td>Both produced classical mycoplasma colonies, at times with fried egg appearance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred atmosphere</td>
<td>Both prefer 95% nitrogen, 5%CO₂</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cell-protein electrophoretic pattern</td>
<td>Identical, but distinct from patterns of other Mycoplasma and Acholeplasma spp.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Erythrocytes, but had a negative tetrazolium reduction test; the Morocco strain failed to hemadsorb, but exhibited a positive tetrazolium reduction test. Electrophoretic cell-protein patterns of the two strains were identical, but each was clearly distinct from the pattern for other known mycoplasmas.

PROPERTIES OF STUBBORN ORGANISM DNA

The G+C content of the DNA from the stubborn organism was found to be 26.35 ± 1.45 mole per cent as determined from buoyant-density studies and the melting temperature (31, 32).

The genome size of the stubborn organism was determined by comparison with that of known mycoplasmas, through renaturation kinetics. Both strains had a genome size of the order of 10⁶ daltons, similar to that of Acholeplasma spp., even though the citrus organism does require sterol for growth (32).

SPIROPLASMA CITRI, THE MICROORGANISM ASSOCIATED WITH STUBBORN DISEASE

Studies reviewed above show that the California and Morocco isolates of the stubborn agent are very closely related. On the other hand, the stubborn organism is clearly distinct from recognized Mycoplasma spp. and Acholeplasma.
spp. since many of its properties are not characteristic of other representative cultures of the Mycoplasmatales, including helical morphology, rotary motility, presence of an outer nap, gram-positivity, evidence of a protoplasmic cylinder, and tailed bacteriophage infection. The serological results support and confirm the unique nature of the stubborn organism in that no serological relationship to any of the known mycoplasmas or acholeplasmas could be determined.

The stubborn organism does have some properties in common with the known representatives of the Mycoplasmatales, however, including colonial morphology, filterability, cultural properties, apparent lack of a cell wall (as judged by electron microscopy), lack of bacterial reversion, absolute resistance to penicillin, inhibition of growth by antibodies, and DNA characteristics.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The discovery and subsequent isolation, cultivation, and characterization of the stubborn organism, *Spiroplasma citri*, opens a new line of research in the study of the disease, with many problems remaining to be solved. Even though *S. citri* has been characterized, proof that it is actually the causal agent of stubborn disease is still lacking. Koch's postulates are yet to be fulfilled. The problem has been unexpectedly complicated by the discovery of bacteriophage infection. Has the phage a role in pathogenicity? The fact that the phage *in vitro* seems to multiply at certain times and to be undetectable at others might throw new light on the behavior and distribution of the pathogen in the plants. However, no phage particles have been detected within the plants.

Studies on stubborn have progressed more rapidly in recent years than have those on greening disease, because it has been possible to culture the stubborn organism. Accurate identification of the two diseases is now possible because the respective cell boundaries of the causal organisms show distinctive differences.

Apart from the phytopathological interest, work with the stubborn organism has unequivocably shown, for the first time, that it is possible to isolate and culture the mycoplasmalike bodies seen in sieve tubes of diseased plants. It has resulted in the discovery of a new type of microorganism, the study of which will undoubtedly result in refinement of the classification of the Mycoplasmatales and a better understanding of such a basic phenomenon as the control of shape and function by membrane structure. Two microorganisms of the Spiroplasma type are reported, *Spiroplasma citri* and the corn stunt agent, which is yet to be cultured *in vitro*. The future will tell if more plant mycoplasmas will be of the Spiroplasma type.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We wish to thank Dr. R. L. Steere, USDA, for fruitful discussion and for supplying the electron micrographs showing the helical morphology of freeze-dried specimens of Spiroplasma citri; Dr. R. M. Cole, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, for supplying the illustration of bacteriophages; and Dr. R. E. Davis, USDA, for permitting us to see his manuscript before publication and for his contribution to the naming of the stubborn organism. This work was aided in part by a grant-in-aid from Institut Français de Recherches Fruitières Outre-Mer (I.F.A.C.).

LITERATURE CITED


2. CALAVAN, E. C.

3. CALAVAN, E. C., F. O. OLSON, AND D. W. CHRISTIANSEN

4. CHEN, T. A., AND R. P. GRANADOS

5. CHEN, M. L., T. MIYAKAWA, AND C. MATSUI


7. COUSIN, M. R., T. STARON, A. FAIVRE-AMIOT, AND J. P. MOREAU


9. DAVIS, R. E., AND J. F. WORLEY

10. DOI, Y., N. TERANAKA, K. YORA, AND ASUYAMA


14. GIANNOTTI, J., C. VAGO, G. KUHL, AND D. CZARNIECKI

15. GOURLAY, R. N.
16. GOURLAY, R. N.

17. GOURLAY, R. N., J. BRUCE, AND D. J. GARWES

18. HAMPTON, R. O., J. O. STEVENS, AND T. C. ALLEN

19. IGWEGBE, E. C. K., AND E. C. CALAVAN

20. IGWEGBE, E. C. K., E. C. CALAVAN, AND A. FUDL-ALLAH

21. LAFLÈCHE, D., AND J. M. BOVÉ

22. LAFLÈCHE, D., AND J. M. BOVÉ

23. LAFLÈCHE, D., AND J. M. BOVÉ

24. LIN, S. C., C. S. LEE, AND R. J. CHIU

25. LIS, A., AND J. MANILOFF

26. LOMBARDO, G., AND P. PIGNATTELLI

27. OLSON, E. O., AND B. ROGERS

28. PLOAIE, P. G.

29. SAGLIO, P., D. LAFLÈCHE, C. BONISSOL, AND J. M. BOVÉ

30. SAGLIO, P., D. LAFLÈCHE, C. BONISSOL, AND J. M. BOVÉ


33. SCHWARZ, R. E.

34. SCHWARZ, R. E., J. N. MOLL, AND S. P. VAN VUUREN

35. ZELCER, A., M. BAR-JOSEPH, AND G. LOEBENSTEIN